



Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: January 29, 2020

Council Chambers
250 Hamilton Avenue
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

6:04pm

Chair Riggs: Alright I think we're ready to get started. Good Evening.

Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Take roll and then (interrupted)

Chair Riggs: So welcome to the first Planning Commissioner meeting of the year for the City of Palo Alto on January 29th, 2020. We'll do a... well where's Vinh? We'll do a roll cal. You're going to do it? Alright so.

Ms. French: (calls roll)

Oral Communications

The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

Chair Riggs: Alright the first item is if anyone has any... I don't have any speaker slips but if there is one... anyone that wants to communicate on things that aren't on the agenda they can speak to that now. Seeing no one jumping right up.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 [note – Oral Communication was reopened after approval of the meeting minutes]

2

3 Chair Riggs: I'm going to reopen the Oral Communication for things not on the agenda. Thank
4 you for being here Ms. Wares [note – phonetics], you've got 3-minutes to tell us what you
5 want.

6

7 Ms. Wares [note – phonetics and no first name was given]: Great, sorry for missing the Oral
8 Communication (interrupted)

9

10 Chair Riggs: No worries, no worries, don't worry.

11

12 Ms. Wares [note – phonetics]: Thing earlier. So, I'm a resident of Palo Alto and I was just
13 coming here because I wanted to raise an issue on the traffic light timing on University Avenue.
14 So, when you're coming or entering off the Bayshore Highway there's two lights, there's one
15 there and then there's one 200-feet beyond that at Woodland. And there... the timing of those
16 two lights is very poorly timed so that not enough cars can get through and because it's such a
17 short space only a couple of cars can fit there. So, what happens is since the lights aren't timed
18 there's a long backup either on University Avenue or on the other side of the highway. And I
19 just wanted to raise to see if anything can be done about that. Thank you.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Riggs: That's great. Thanks for coming out, we appreciate that.

2

3 Ms. Waress [note – phonetics]: Alright, thanks.

4

5 Chair Riggs: Ok, if you're good so I'll close the hearing now again on I think (interrupted)

6

7 Vice-Chair Alcheck: [unintelligible - off mic]

8

9 Chair Riggs: No but (interrupted)

10

11 Vice-Chair Alcheck: [unintelligible – off mic]

12

13 Chair Riggs: No, we cannot.

14

15 Ms. Waress [note -phonetics]: (speaking from the audience) Thank you.

16

17 Chair Riggs: Sorry we can't respond to that but Staff will. I think this is the point is that we've
18 heard you. Thank you for being here.

19

20 Ms. Waress [note -phonetics]: (speaking from the audience) Thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 [note – the Commission moved down to approval of the meeting minutes]

2 **Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions**

3 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

4 Chair Riggs: We will move on. So, I don't have any suggested additions, deletions from the
5 agenda. We're light today so I guess we'll turn it over to Staff with reports, meeting schedules,
6 assignments.

7 **City Official Reports**

8 1. Assistant Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments.

9 Chair Riggs: And I think Amy, we... some of this may... just in full disclosure. Some of this... we
10 have an election tonight so some of this may get flushed out after we have a new Chair but I'll
11 turn it over to you.

12

13 Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Great, Racheal Tanner is not available tonight. She
14 gave me something to report out during this segment and I believe I left it on my desk so shame
15 on me. Basically, here we are, we have some interesting items coming up in the upcoming
16 months. I spoke with our Transportation Official today. It looks like they're moving forward on
17 the position for Parking Manager. And so, looking towards coming back with a study session on
18 the RPP Program and so that would be towards the end of February.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 We have some other items that will be of interest including the update on the Comprehensive
2 Plan Implementation and Housing Element Implementation. How are we doing on our goals
3 and Policies and Programs? That's coming forward.

4
5 Let's see, there was another thing that was happening as well. Well, certainly we'll be coming
6 back with the permanent ordinance for Accessory Dwelling Units. The Council recently adopted
7 an urgency Interim Ordinance on January 13th to address state law that became effective
8 January 1st. So, the Planning and Transportation Commission will be involved in that process in
9 the next several months this spring.

10

11 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Can I ask you a quick question (interrupted)

12

13 Ms. French: Sure.

14

15 Vice-Chair Alcheck: About the... is there a designated individual who's the brains for all
16 questions for ADUs? I feel like I've gotten so many questions about ADUs that I'd love to be able
17 to be like contact so and so.

18

19 Ms. French: Well there's... I'm not sure they're the brains but they're the bronze maybe that
20 will be collating and processing additional nuances and questions. For the January 13th

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 ordinance that was adopted that's effective until January 31st of 2021, that was the work of our
2 City Attorney's Office and some Staff help to surgically make sure that we're not out of
3 compliance with the state law. Going forward there'll be again, some teamwork there. You're
4 welcome to send folks to me and I can filter that down. We'll (interrupted)

5

6 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I was going to suggest maybe an FAQ Page because I'm sure maybe some of
7 the questions are pretty repetitive but I don't know.

8

9 Ms. French: Yes, yes, so yeah, we're working on some outreach. We're going to have a webpage
10 that's going to have some information there and as we move forward with the permanent
11 ordinance where there's some nuances that will be discussed further. That will be coming
12 forward. Let's see (interrupted)

13

14 Chair Riggs: So maybe I can chime in because I think I talked through some of these with Ms.
15 Tanner as well. I think there's the co-working office model that we're going to schedule as well
16 as SB-50 update. Those are in the agenda packet but also, I think we've talked about seeing the
17 Cubberley project again. I didn't... I haven't heard an update on that and also, I think this
18 Commission has expressed a desire to get the San Antonio... there's been a couple San Antonio
19 projects. To get them back in and so keeping us apprised of when we can expect those would

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be really, I think, of interest to all of us. At least when we heard those the first time there
2 were... there was a lot of interest in those.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: I had a follow-on question.

5

6 Chair Riggs: Yeah, Commissioner.... yeah?

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: Just we had the first Transportation Committee or sorry, Commission...
9 whatever he's called now? Office, sorry. First Office of Transportation presentation to us in
10 August where they reviewed the 35 recommendation that had gone to them to be kind of pre-
11 processed and come back to us. And haven't heard a thing since our August 28th meeting on
12 that and I think it went to Council on sort of April-ish. So, we're coming up on 9-months since
13 the Council said PTC has to look at this. So, if we could figure out where that is that would be
14 great.

15

16 Chair Riggs: Alright seeing no other lights I'll just note that we do need... we have our meeting
17 schedule on Page 6 in the Packet. And one of the things that we'll be refining and I validated
18 this with Ms. Tanner yesterday was that we would be refining some of the 2020 Council
19 assignments so once we have new leadership. Any other questions or comments? Ok.
20 Commissioner Lauing?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lauing: In that regard, someone pointed out to me that 4/8 is the first day of Pass Over so.

Chair Riggs: So, we'll leave that to the new... to new leadership to massage the schedule.

Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, just wanted to point it out.

Chair Riggs: Sure. Any other questions? Any other questions? Comments from other Commissioners? Ok.

[note – this item was continued after hearing Item Number Two]

Ms. French: Through the Chair, I have my piece of paper for... if it's possible to do Director's Report item because I don't want to let that get lost in the shuffle to do backwards.

Chair Riggs: To go backwards, ok.

Ms. French: Yeah.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Riggs: Of course.

2

3 Ms. French: I just didn't want to miss an opportunity. Sometimes sensitive (interrupted)

4

5 Chair Riggs: Awesome, go ahead, go ahead.

6

7 Ms. French: Thank you so much. So, we're back on Director's Report to finish up there. You're
8 invited to participate in the Urban Land Institute's Urban Plan for Communities. This will take
9 place on Wednesday, March 18th, 2020 and is hosted by the City of Cupertino. Urban Plan is a
10 workshop on real estate and land use. The workshop introduces its participants to the trade-
11 offs and risks at play in the entitlement and the negotiation process associated with real estate
12 development; especially in public-private partnerships. This will be an interactive, all-day
13 training beginning at 8:30 am, registration and breakfast, until approximately 4:30 pm.
14 Breakfast, snacks, and lunch will be provided. So, if you're interested we can accommodate
15 signing you up and all of that so let us know. The deadline to confirm it is this week so time-
16 sensitive. Please let me know if you have an interest in attending and we'll handle the
17 registration. So, have a look at your calendars maybe during the meeting and let me know if
18 you can at the end of this meeting or tomorrow give us a call.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 A couple more items on the looking ahead, I neglected to mention changes to the Wireless
2 Ordinance. There's been a couple of correspondences that you've received. The Council did
3 make changes in December 2019 to our standards and we're going to be bringing forward this
4 ordinance for Planning Commission's consideration and recommendation. That's coming up in
5 the spring.

6
7 I think there was another one about... oh yes. We're going to have the results of our study
8 examining our Below Market Rate Policy in the City. Also, we'll be having a study session on the
9 North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan to bring the Planning Commission up to date on the draft
10 alternatives.

11
12 Finally, we are continuing to work to fill vacancies. We posted a Land Use Planner position this
13 week. That's in the Data Team section for Mapping and Data Analysis. I know data and maps
14 are what we need so I thought you might be interested to hear about that. Thank you.

15
16 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Can I make a quick comment?

17
18 Chair Riggs: Can... sorry, Commissioner [note – Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah so just really quickly I want to add this planning... the event that Ms.
2 French mentioned tonight. At the same event last year former Mayor, currently Councilwomen
3 Kniss, myself, and then Commissioner Monk attended and it's exclusively for appointed and
4 Elected Officials. So, I sat at a table... we each sat at a different table. I sat at a table with
5 Planning Commissioners from Menlo Park, Planning Commissioners from San Mateo, Mayors of
6 various Cities, Redwood City and I think Belmont. And so, it's actually a really... if you're
7 considering it or you're on the fence it's really, really great. You'll meet... you'll network with
8 people all over the peninsula and you'll be... you'll participate in a program where you're
9 assigned one of several roles. You could be a community member, you could be a decision-
10 maker, you could be a developer in a staged event and you have to grapple with many issues
11 that... don't play the role of Planning Commissioner. You know branch out but anyways so I
12 really... it was very, very productive. The City paid for us to attend, it was really great.

13

14 Commissioner Templeton: I went last year too. It was amazing, I highly recommend it.

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: I'm signed up.

17

18 Commissioner Roohparvar: I'm signed up.

19

20 Chair Riggs: Excellent, ok. Ok, enough to chat, let's move on.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Ms. French: And then... I'm sorry, one more which is the Housing Work Plan, forgot to mention that. February 3rd this is going to City Council. It had appeared on the Council agenda but was not considered a week ago but if you're interested hopefully have that Staff report.

Chair Riggs: Alright, we're going to fast forward now back to where we were in the agenda. Thank you, Ms. French.

[note – The Commission moved down to approval of the Meeting Minutes]

Study Session

Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.1,3

- 2. Study Session to Review and Consider Amendments to the Palo Alto Municipal Code Chapters 18.52 and 18.54 to Allow a Reduction in the Number of Vehicle Parking Spaces for Existing Buildings/Uses to Meet State-Mandated Parking Requirements Related to the Americans with Disabilities Act and Electric Vehicle Charging Stations, to Provide for Additional Bicycle Parking, and to Comply With Other City Standards Including Stormwater and Waste Management. CEQA: Not a Project. Zone District: Citywide.

Chair Riggs: So, with that said I think we will move to our study session and before we do that I believe we have a presentation from Staff. And just to remind Commissioners, this is a... this is... there's no action on this item. This is... we've seen this before, there won't be any action and we will be seeing this again. So hopefully we can make it efficient both times so with that said take it away.

- 1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
- 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
- 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Ms. Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Introduce... this is Samuel Gutierrez who will be presenting the report.

Mr. Samuel Gutierrez, Project Planner: Good evening to the PTC. Tonight, we have a presentation on Staff suggestions for changes to the Municipal Code Chapter 18. 52 which involve parking regulations. Again, the purpose here is to get input from the PTC on five aspects of parking regulations. Originally, we were seeking to draft an ordinance and bringing that to you but there were some changes with state laws of January 1st that required Staff to adopt that path that we were on. And also, we wanted to present what the state law requires now which wasn't presented to the PTC previously when you discussed this back in March of last year. So, focusing on the project steps again, this is a draft ordinance in code changes. We seek to return to the PTC in February for consideration before recommendation to Council and then we will present that recommendation to Council following that future hearing in February.

Here's an overview of what we're going to focus on tonight. Again, the five aspects of proposed changes to parking lot regulations. One involves ADA parking spaces, these are the accessible spaces, to involve the EVSE and ADA combined together. And again, that is a state law tweak that happened at the first of this year and we had to kind of change direction per that state law. The next one has to do with EVSE retrofitting so this is separate from ADA. It has to do with just

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 EVSE charging parking spaces for standard stalls. The next one is substitution of bicycle parking
2 for vehicular spaces and finally restriping and maintenance of existing parking lots.

3
4 So, jumping ahead here to the accessible spaces, this... again, this is just standard accessible
5 spaces not electric. Staff is proposing to bring new code language to formalize the current
6 practice of allowing reductions in of required parking spaces to existing sites to allow
7 compliance with state requirements and that would be within the PC [note – PAMC?] 52.030
8 [note – 18.52.030?]. The proposed language is shown here which is also shown in the Staff
9 report. This would be inserting a new language to just show that the City which again we've
10 been doing in practice is constant with state law, and we would allow a reduction in existing
11 parking lot even if they're not compliant per parking ratio to become compliant as far as
12 accessibility requirements because that is, of course, coming from a higher authority than the
13 City to require those.

14
15 The next code suggestion is EVSC and ADA spaces. Now, this focuses on the code language that
16 we had to modify because of state law that was effective January 1st of this year. The state law
17 requires that we count EV ready and EV installed accessible spaces, they're van accessible, as
18 two parking spaces. This is sourced from Assembly Bill 1100 by the state. The state found that
19 per the state goals of having a lot of electric vehicle infrastructure throughout the state to
20 promote the switch from fossil fuel vehicles to electric vehicles. A lot of jurisdictions were not

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 counting these accessible spaces. They were deducting it from the total because the van
2 accessible area results in a loss of a standard stall. So, what the state did was require all
3 jurisdictions within the state of California to count them as two parking spaces towards the
4 requirement so we had to adjust that in our draft ordinance. Also, there's state law that says
5 we have to count a standard parking stall or excuse me, a standard EV parking stall, so not
6 associated with accessible, as one space. In Palo Alto, we've always done that. We've never
7 differentiated whether it's an electric vehicle parking stall or a gas vehicle parking stall. It's one
8 to one, they're apples to apples. But again, in compliance with state law, we wanted to
9 formalize that with some language so it's clear in the code to everyone who reads our code.
10 And here's a snippet of the proposed language that suggests counting accessible spaces twice
11 and of course counting standard electric vehicle spaces as one parking stall towards the
12 requirement.

13

14 When... now we're moving long to retrofitting, so this is purely separate from the accessible
15 spaces. When existing sites are seeking to retrofit there's a lot of problems that come with that.
16 The existing sites you have property owners or new tenants that are moving into spaces,
17 they're upgrading the facilities to meet their needs now or even state requirements per Green
18 Building Code, and they have to accommodate electrical vehicle chargers on their site. Often
19 the problem is these sites are legal non-conforming grandfathered in from long ago and they're
20 not meeting today's standards. So, to introduce a new element to these parking lots is difficult

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 for Staff and for the applicants because there is no room, physically no room. The other
2 problem that you run into if there is room for these chargers to fit in, the sites are often under
3 capacity in terms of their electrical service. So, when they have to upgrade that electrical
4 service on-site that means a new transformer has to come or other associated utility
5 equipment. And then that equipment also, where do you put that? So, it becomes an issue
6 again and the current code language does not allow for any increase in non-compliance or
7 creation of non-compliance. So, to resolve these issues and line up with the law of our Comp
8 Plan Policy and Goals, Staff is suggesting some changes to the code. But to get in great detail
9 here you can see this is just a mock-up of an existing parking lot. This is in the Staff report but I
10 wanted to be clear to show you what happens here. So, in the blocked area you have these
11 wheel stops. Previously they're located here in the hashed area and then they have to be
12 adjusted because they're introducing new equipment here. This would be the chargers and
13 that's blown up here. So, you can see the chargers and they need bollards for collision
14 protection. When you do that you can notice here the existing wheel stop was here before and
15 then got pushed back so they could not collide with the EV equipment and the bollard. The
16 issue with that is the wheel stop isn't the full extent of how we count a parking stall because of
17 this factor. The wheel stop actually stops the car but the vehicle overhangs and if you introduce
18 this element here which is a mock-up of EV equipment with the bollards, typically the bollards
19 go here. So, if you have a vertical implement introduced here, then that car sticks out of the
20 space more, and then again if everything is to the minimum standard it's a domino effect down

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the row. And that's where Staff struggles to accommodate these required EV equipment. So,
2 with that said now we're moving to the other element. Even if we could get around the EV
3 charger and bollards, now we have these transformers which you can see in these photos
4 they're rather large. In these examples, you can see that these transformers are located in
5 areas where there's planting strips that are sizable but that's not always the case. So, if these
6 planting strips aren't there or there's a conflict with a large mature tree then they cannot go
7 there. And then we run into issues again, where do we put this upgraded service equipment?
8 So, to address that we're proposing code changes that would allow a reduction in parking
9 spaces, total parking spaces. So, then you could take that removed parking space and
10 rearrange, restripe to one, accommodate wider stalls. And then the bollards and the
11 equipment, the charging equipment, can go into that space now. And also provide an area, a
12 pad of asphalt where that use to be a parking space, for the transformer.

13

14 Moving onto the next topic, the substitution of bicycle parking for vehicle parking. We want to
15 allow bicycle parking to be installed in place of vehicle parking spaces. Up to a certain amount
16 of parking can be replaced with vehicle parking. That's what we're trying to find a ratio for and
17 this would actually mimic the language that was previously in our code but was removed for an
18 undetermined reason in 2007. So, it existed prior and now based on the current Comp Plan
19 Policies which were identified in the Staff report we need to move towards that direction again.
20 This is just an example of one bicycle or set of bicycle parking spaces in a space that was for a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 vehicle. We could mimic this or we could distribute the bicycle racks throughout the site but
2 this is just to show you one car might be removed but then you gain about eight bicycle spaces
3 in that same space. So that could have been eight possible single-occupancy vehicles but now
4 it's eight bicycles which again comply with a lot of the Policies of our Comp Plan. So again, the
5 proposed language that we're looking is a bit of a tweak on the original language that was
6 previously in the code. It allows for a long term or short-term bicycle facilities to be substituted
7 for a vehicle space up to 5 percent of the required stalls for the site or at least one space,
8 whichever is greater. The exact number of substituted bicycle facilities would be a minimum of
9 four short term bicycle parking spaces per single vehicle space. Although the Director may
10 require more than that minimum given site conditions if it allows for additional bicycle parking
11 space. I do want to be sure that it's clear that Staff was looking at this and considering smaller
12 parking lots that may not be able to accommodate that 5 percent maximum. If you do a calc
13 [note – calculation] of 5 percent and you introduce one it's really you need 20 parking spaces to
14 even reach a 5 percent maximum. So, parking lots that have 11 parking spaces could take
15 advantage of this unless we added the clause of at least one space. So at least those smaller
16 ones could also take advantage of this and that was in the thought of certain areas around Cal.
17 Ave which are very close to the train station or even downtown. Again, which is close to
18 downtown Caltrain station.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The fifth item that pertains to code changes is about restriping and maintenance of existing
2 parking lots. So regular maintenance and resurfacing of lots requires restriping. There is a need
3 to allow the Director to make adjustments when restriping for to accommodate conforming
4 parking spaces and other types of new waste management facilities and trash enclosures. Even
5 if it would result in the loss of parking space. We do have requirements for our stormwater
6 protection to have covered trash enclosures. A lot of existing sites again don't have that, they
7 just have the trash bins on the outside and that isn't meeting the regulations for the region or
8 for the City. So, if we allowed restriping of parking lots and then we may be loose three spaces
9 to create a covered trash enclosure and then be all compliant. Then that would be a good thing
10 overall. And also, there have been situations as Staff has observed, projects that have come in
11 for restriping and we see that there's non-compliances that have been grandfathered in and
12 they are problems with... we see problems with circulation. So, turning radiuses may not be
13 sufficient, we would never approve it that way today, parking stalls might be too narrow and it
14 creates a difficult situation just for visitors to those sites. So, it would be a good benefit to be
15 able to maybe lose some spaces again, that are not compliant, to create a very compliant
16 parking facility that then has better circulation overall and here's a bit of the proposed
17 language. It would allow a Director's adjustment for parking lot restriping. They... the language
18 that we seek is to allow the Director to approve a reduction of on-site parking spaces to achieve
19 compliance with state law, the City's waste management objectives, and on-site circulation or
20 to adjust the existing substandard stall dimensions to meet correct codes. This... it's important

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that we're only seeking to apply this to sites that are existing and are going to remain mostly
2 intact in terms of the existing development. So, this wouldn't be a demolition of a building and
3 then they get to keep their non-complying parking lot. In that scenario, they would need to
4 make everything compliant but these are for sites that are restriping and keeping the building ...
5 maybe re-stuccoing or something like that minor. So, with that in mind, we also are cognizant
6 of that some of these proposed code changes for this restriping and maintenance, if given to
7 the Director, could have some possible negative side effects that we hadn't foreseen. So, Staff
8 is analyzing that and we're looking to avoid that and abate that as much as we can to the extent
9 feasible. Things that came to mind are maybe long-standing existing PCs from the '70s or '80s
10 that had different code regulations and now they're not compliant or again, sites that were
11 previously approved by Major Architectural Review and normally they would go again for these
12 proposed changes. So, we're still working on how do we abate those issues. The other conflict
13 that we thought that might be there would be with the Downtown Parking Assessment District
14 and the Parking In-Lieu Fees and how we would manage these restriping and loss of parking of
15 spacing in the downtown area where you could pay for In-Lieu Fees. So, we drafted a bit of a
16 tweak of language there to kind of address that issue that we identified.

17

18 Focusing back on this discussion here and what Staff seeks as a PTC input is for the first item is
19 what is PTC's thoughts on counting the accessible spaces as two? We could apply that state
20 requirement to count the EV accessible spaces twice to just the standard accessible spaces. So,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 it's just an easy code and there's no difference between the two. We also would like to receive
2 feedback from the PTC on if we should for these other suggested code changes, lean more
3 towards Director's adjustments so we could have more a specialized adjustment per site
4 condition or should we have more fixed ratios or percentages for sites. Kind of a one-size-fits-
5 all. So, if the PTC could be so kind as to provide with some feedback and have a discussion on
6 some of these points that would be great. And that concludes Staff's presentation.

7

8 Chair Riggs: Alright questions or comments from Commissioners? Oh, actually we actually have
9 public comment, don't we? Yeah, ok so I don't have any cards but if... when we... have any
10 public comments now's the time to make your voice.

11

12 [note – female from the audience:] (off mic) If I have a couple comments but not on this, do I
13 hold (interrupted)

14

15 Chair Riggs: Sorry just this item, yeah. Ok, seeing none we'll bring it back to the Commission.
16 Hearing is closed. Any Commissioners questions, comments, feedback to Staff? And actually,
17 maybe I could chime in before just to mitigate a comment, Sam. We talked before about could
18 you maybe explain the interplay with new buildings that have to meet... they already have to
19 meet certain parking space requirements based on I think you said energy efficiency yesterday
20 so maybe you can explain that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Gutierrez: Sure, so new buildings and even existing building they have to meet California
3 State Building Code Standards and that involves the Green Building Code. That's where these
4 EVs are popping up everywhere. A part of that is you have to provide a certain number per
5 threshold that you might pass for occupancy, office versus retail versus restaurant, so forth and
6 in their existing parking lot they have to provide these EV charging stations. New buildings have
7 to provide existing or excuse me, new charging stations with the new development and they
8 also have to provide EV ready. So, they kind of have to plumb or re-wire some parking spaces
9 and they're noted as EV ready. That's where the EV ready language came through in the Staff
10 report. Those are for the future because the City... the state already knows what they're going
11 to do in the next code Cycle and afterward and afterward and they're going to keep up ticking.
12 So, they thought ahead and as sites are being developed they already have these kind of
13 earmarked parking spaces that you just put a charger in basically. So, they already have the
14 capacity for them thus they're ready.

15

16 Chair Riggs: Thanks. Any questions or comments from Commissioners? Ok, Commissioner
17 Lauing.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I didn't know if you wanted the lights. So, I think you want us to
20 address this slide but I just wonder questions before that if that's ok?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Gutierrez: Sure, but I would be happy to answer any questions. This slide is just intended to kind of be an overview of what we're looking for.

Commissioner Lauing: My first one is sort of a three-part question, I'm going to ask it all at once because you can answer it however you want. So, it's sort of are there any indication from the state that they're going to give Cities individual quotas on this or not relative to the overall needs? And the second question is when you're forecasting our needs for doing this what... kind of what's the numbers consistent with the predicted overall state usage because I know we're very high? We're like the best in the state in terms of electrical usage. And then thirdly do I understand that the total number of potential grant money is \$10.8 million? The \$9.8 plus \$1 [note – million]. Was that the right number? And so, whatever it is the question is how far does that money go to satisfy all the needs that you're projecting that we have?

Mr. Gutierrez: So, I'll start with your first question which is about if the state has some type of requirement or goal. I guess similar to like housing numbers?

Commissioner Lauing: Exactly.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Gutierrez: Not that I'm aware of. The state has a goal for the entire state to have the
2 infrastructure. Meaning that they want 200,000 plus by a certain date throughout the state but
3 it's not allocated in the same way towards the Cities. What they are predicting the Cities to
4 meet that number by is this any new development that triggers a threshold in the Green
5 Building Code to then require the EV parking spaces. And then again... or even a tenant
6 improvement that exceed a certain evaluation threshold would have to now install EV chargers.
7 So, it covers new development and existing improvements to sites.

8

9 Commissioner Lauing: That's what I expected otherwise it would be mandating where electric
10 cars have to be but I just wanted to clarify that point.

11

12 Mr. Gutierrez: Right and then that's difficult because the state does know that people are
13 moving in these cars so it's a bit more organic. Where the new development is or renovation,
14 that's where cars are going to go.

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: Ok and (interrupted)

17

18 Mr. Gutierrez: And to the number forecast of your second question are you referring to our
19 forecast as in user shifting to electric vehicles?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Lauing: How... in that how many of these stations are we going to need in the
2 City by X dates?

3

4 Mr. Gutierrez: That I'm not sure about. I could try to research it and bring that back at the
5 future hearing but to the best of my knowledge, we don't have forecasts for that. I do know
6 that we are number one in the country for EV vehicle usage.

7

8 Ms. French: (off mic) In sales.

9

10 Mr. Gutierrez: In sales, excuse me, sales so anyone who walks around downtown Palo Alto can
11 see Teslas or other electric vehicles everywhere.

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: So, the answer to the third question is we don't know either because we
14 don't know how much money it's going to take since we don't know how many stations we
15 need.

16

17 Mr. Gutierrez: Correct.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: But this grant money is... is it a total of \$10.8 [note – million]? Did I read
20 that correctly?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Gutierrez: I believe so, in the Staff it is \$10.8 [note – million].

Ms. French: Where you reading that in the prior Staff report from last year’s (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: In the Packet.

Ms. French: Study session?

Commissioner Lauing: No, this Staff report. It was \$9.8 [note – million] and then they added a million so I presume that was an additive situation. So, we don’t know how that... what kind of a dent that’s going to make in our (interrupted)

Ms. French: So, you’re on Packet Page 10?

Commissioner Lauing: Yeah.

Mr. Gutierrez: (off mic) Yes, I think that’s [unintelligible - off mic]

Ms. French: (off mic) \$9.5... 8 in the next 4-years added to (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Gutierrez: Yep.

Commissioner Lauing: I don't think he knows so we can't really dwell on that.

Mr. Gutierrez: Yeah, we could research that further. I'm actually not sure of the metrics on that. The grant money is to support upgrading facilities.

Commissioner Lauing: Ok. I mean since we have to do this by state law and it takes money. Then we got to figure out where we're going to get the money and I'm just trying to figure out how close we are to solving our overall problem.

Ms. French: It's possible there's a link to the utilities' Staff report in the... on Packet Page 10 as well in that same paragraph so possibly that report could provide more data for you.

Commissioner Lauing: I'll check that and then just a quick question. Within these, either by local law or landlord, can it be restricted how long a given parked car is hooked up to the station? So, if it was 8-hours, then the next person could come for 8-hours, the next person can come for 8-hours, and so in 24-hours in one space three cars could get done. Do you do any of those kinds of calculations?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Gutierrez: So, I know that some jurisdictions do do that and the actual charging parking stall
3 is noted with that. It says once charged is complete you must vacate. We don't have that
4 practice in Palo Alto at the moment. By code requirement, it could be that for example maybe
5 the shopping center might have that but as far as the other sites where this is being installed
6 they're usually either commercial or retail spaces. So, people are parking and then getting out
7 and shopping and then they leave or they're office buildings. They're job spaces so then people
8 are there 8-hours and then they leave to go home.

9

10 Commissioner Lauing: So, I'm asking it now in the context of this new law that you're putting
11 together. Should Palo Alto have some control over how many cars can use that in a given 24-
12 hour period because you could obviously theoretically reduce the number of stations necessary
13 if you required turn over in the spot? So, that would just be something that I'd raise for your
14 consideration as to putting it into the ordinance.

15

16 Ms. French: Certainly, it's something for public parking lots that should be a conversation. For
17 private parking lots I'm not sure where that would enter in but certain we'll discuss it.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: Ok and then on one of your questions here, I don't think I'm quite in sync
20 with the substitution of bicycle parking for vehicle spaces. Particularly when you look at

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 something like ADA. It's not going to be the same user probably that uses a bike instead of a car
2 and I fully understand why we need an ADA kind of space to... for access to that driver. But it
3 doesn't seem like that's correlating with the same sort of person/user if we're just using some
4 other space for incremental bikes. I mean I understand what you're trying to do of let other
5 people "park" there although they have to park in a bike instead of a car. So, it raises all the
6 classic issues of rain and etc. etc. but I guess I just think that's a pretty loose correlation.

7

8 Ms. French: I might expand on that as far as the prior code that did include this until 2007. The
9 prior code talked about Class One which is normally a bike locker and contrary to the picture
10 where it shows a bunch of bikes kind of sitting there in one spot. The code was really utilized or
11 intended more for smaller parcels where the geometries were such that it was hard to
12 squeeze an additional... put a parking space for vehicles but there was extra usable area for
13 additional bikes beyond the required bikes that were close to the entrance of the building let's
14 say. So that in a downtown or someplace where its bicycle use near transit makes a lot of sense.
15 You could squeeze bikes in places other than the parking lot and thereby provide means for
16 folks to use the building.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: I guess my concern is that if we put out their sort of the tone of don't
19 worry we'll have more parking spaces for bikes and therefore the total parking spaces are the
20 same. They aren't so I'm just concerned (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Ms. French: Yes.

Commissioner Lauing: About being credible with the public.

Ms. French: Yes, makes sense to consider the Director’s adjustment as the method which is where it uses to be in the code was related to Director’s adjustments. And so that would have a measured consideration by the Director.

Commissioner Lauing: My last comment is just that I appreciate the awareness of and the attention to the issues of aesthetics because while we have to comply with the law and that requires a certain amount of equipment. I’m just glad that that’s part of the overall look that if all these things... just if you take down trees and put up these all over the place we’re going to have another nightmare like cell phone towers. So that should be in there somehow, you know being constantly a tentative to ways to disguise that equipment. Thank you.

Chair Riggs: Ok Commissioner Summa followed by Commissioner Roohparvar.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you. So, I have some questions but I’ll just kind of go through them in order. Definitely, I think with regards to ADA, ADA, EVSE, and ADA compliant with state

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 law, of course, we have to do that and that's all good. I am wondering about ADA spots with we
2 wouldn't want them all to be compliant with EVSE. Only so that the people that need the
3 parking closes to the entrance to buildings have more options. That was my only thought about
4 that.

5
6 And then with regards to the... putting in the code the practice already that EVSA is one space. I
7 think that's fine but in the language that you proposed you say "as at least one space". And I
8 can see how that if one space is your intention I can see how the "as at least one space" might
9 create some confusion.

10
11 Let's see so the retrofitting you referenced on Packet Page 14 18.70.090 and 080 which are the
12 general non-complying facility and maintenance repair rules but I just wanted to clarify that
13 you're not intending on changing that portion of the code.

14
15 Ms. French: It hasn't... it was not in the draft that we began to prepare for this meeting that we
16 didn't bring forward but it's something that often we have references in one part of the code to
17 another part of the code. So, to the extent that if that's needed with respect to parking lots we
18 might consider addressing that because right now non-complying facilities it's not specific to
19 parking lots or buildings so.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: So, you might consider changing it later... in 18.52 but also have an
2 exemption explicit in the general law.

3

4 Ms. French: It could be a reference in that non-compiling facilities portion of the Zoning Code
5 that refers to parking lots and it sends you to the other chapter perhaps.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: Ok, thank you. With regards to substituting bikes... vehicle parking spots
8 to bike parking spots, I would think that maybe if we're finding that we're falling short of our
9 bicycle requirements we might want to change the general requirement. I don't know that but
10 it sounds like that's where you were going. And I'm not sure that switching a vehicle one when
11 we have standards for that in areas of the City that frankly are very much in need of every
12 parking spot they have on private sites and on-street parking and City parking lots. So, the
13 substitution aspect seems a little odd for me. It seems like it would be prudent to change the
14 bicycle requirement if that is actually inadequate as people use bikes more. And I will mention
15 that the DMV data that we have and maybe we'll get new data soon doesn't show a reduction
16 in use of cars and sadly our public transportation we do show a reduction in that use. So that
17 seems like a funny trade-off to me though I would like cars to have... I mean I would like... there
18 would be an opportunity for ample bicycle parking. And for long term bike parking, I have a
19 preference for it to be accommodated inside a building or a shed or something for people who
20 are using their bike as a commuting vehicle so it just stays safe and dry.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 And the restriping I think is fine. It's just an attempt to bring... an opportunity to bring parking
3 lots in existing buildings into compliance so that seems fine with me.

4

5 So, and I agree with Commissioner Lauing's comments, it would be interesting to know the
6 answer to some of those questions going forward. So that's it for now, thank you.

7

8 Chair Riggs: Commissioner Roohparvar.

9

10 Commissioner Roohparvar: So, let me give you a little bit of background as to how I'm looking
11 at this. When I think of buildings or parking I think we should take a holistic approach and think
12 not just 2-years, 3-years, 4-years ahead but more like 10, 15, 20, 30-years ahead. What's the
13 landscape going to look and we're if we're going to revise things now let's look at everything
14 bike picture. Where I'm coming at this with is from a perspective in real estate. So, in buildings
15 a lot right now I'm seeing a lot of artificial intelligence, smart devices, these sorts of things
16 getting embedded in buildings. However, then the issue that you run into is 3, 4, 5-years from
17 now or before those products are out on the market that technology has become obsolete. So,
18 when we look at something like parking, that's the lens I'm looking at it with. And I'm
19 wondering is it possible that these EV stations that we're now putting in place are going to be
20 obsolete in 2, 3, 4, 5-years? Should we think about it differently and anticipate what's coming?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And the fact that we're also trending towards more electric vehicles, get ready for that in the
2 way that we plan for the use of our space. So, I would just... I just wanted to comment let's
3 think about that stuff too. Maybe there's a way where we can be proactive about things to
4 come rather than reactive and working in piece mill fashion to fix things. That's my only
5 comment.

6

7 Chair Riggs: Commissioner Templeton.

8

9 Commissioner Templeton: I generally like most of these proposals. I had a question about the
10 restriping. Is this motivated because people want to make these changes but they would
11 become non-compliant or loose spaces and not be able to implement these... the upgrades to
12 their parking lot? Is that one of the things that's driving this?

13

14 Mr. Gutierrez: That is one. It is applicant driven and also Staff driven because we do again have
15 these code requirements for trash enclosures for example (interrupted)

16

17 Commissioner Templeton: Right.

18

19 Mr. Gutierrez: Or even trees. We have a lot of parking lots that don't meet the current
20 requirement of every 10 parking spaces you need a tree planter aisle or space. So, they're just

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 vacant of vegetation at all and that's not good for heat island effect, that's not good for
2 aesthetic purposes either. So, they're able to continuously just restripe and keep that condition
3 where we would prefer to see trees on sites to make them more aesthetically pleasing as well.

4
5 Commissioner Templeton: That's awesome. I support that and regarding the bicycle parking, a
6 place where I use to work did this. They converted, depending on the size of the parking lot,
7 one or two spaces to bike parking. And it was really effective and very satisfying to drive your
8 bike to... from building to building instead of driving your car so I'm supportive of it in general.
9 You know I share the concerns that some of the other Commissioners have brought up about
10 making sure that the tradeoffs map out appropriately but in general I think it's an interesting
11 idea. Maybe just a little bit more detail on it, the tradeoffs. Thank you.

12
13 Chair Riggs: I'm going to jump in and make comment first. So, I just... one comment I wanted to
14 chime in on was kind of similar to some of the stuff that was said but it feels to me like we
15 should be looking for some case studies or best practice on this. Particularly with regard to use
16 type and land-use intensity and that say that particularly with regard to... I think the ratios may
17 need to vary based on use type or land-use intensity. I didn't see that anywhere in the report
18 but the... also the bike... I mean clearly, you may have different levels of need for substitution
19 for bike parking based on use type, use location, use intensity. So, on that aspect, it just might
20 be good to see how other Cities in California have dealt with this and also how they may be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 varying it based on land use type. Commissioner... I'm really sorry, I don't know how to
2 pronounce your last name just yet.

3

4 Commissioner Hechtman: Hechtman.

5

6 Chair Riggs: I haven't pronounced it yet so Commissioner Hechtman. That probably was easy
7 and so I do apologize but I think... believe that's the first time I've pronounced your last name.

8 Commissioner Hechtman welcome and after that Commissioner [note - Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

9

10 Commissioner Hechtman: [unintelligible – off mic] I'll catch up. So, in effect, that's part of what
11 I'm doing on this item because I understand that the Commission has actually already seen it
12 once and provided you some comments. So, this is a refined version so if I ask about something
13 some ground that's already been plowed I apologize. So, and I'm just going to go front to back
14 through the report, the items that caught my eye.

15

16 So, I do see that the state is looking for a quarter-million of these EV stations by 2025. Do we
17 know how many EV we have currently in Palo Alto that are either existing, permitted and being
18 built or EVA ready or EVSE ready?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Gutierrez: I'm not sure of the total but I could ask other Staff like utilities may know for
2 example so I could look into that.

3
4 Commissioner Hechtman: Ok. I do think it would be a good idea for us to have a target on sort
5 of how we're doing in adding these. I ran some kind of basic math comparing our population
6 with the state population, that would give us an obligation if you will of 424 of these EVSE
7 stations. Now that doesn't account for the fact that electric vehicles are far more popular here
8 than they are at other places. So, I would say that 425 number would be our floor and that
9 realistically we're going to need a lot more than that. And as another Commissioner pointed
10 out I think in the future the proportion of electric vehicles is only going to increase. And so, I do
11 think we have to be proactive and look at those issues long term.

12
13 So, on Page 5 of the report there is some proposed language in the middle of the page that
14 would go into 18.52.040 and as one of the Commissioners pointed out a couple times we use
15 the term... the phrase at least. That if it's just an EVSE spot it will count as at least one parking
16 space. If it's an accessible space that has an EVSE component then it would be at least two. And
17 I do think that it might be useful to the public as and developers who are looking at this
18 language, give them some kind of guidance in the language. So that they would know who
19 decides what the at least is and what are the factors? So that's something that I'd like Staff to
20 think about whether there's a way to give a little more guidance in the text there.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

And then just below that paragraph in part of the Staff report it says, “several justifications have been counting charging spaces as two parking spaces for a percentage of total required parking spaces.” Is Staff referring thereto... it says charging spaces but is it really referring to these combined accessible EVSE or just straight EVSE without an ADA space?

Mr. Gutierrez: I believe it’s just the straight EVSE.

Commissioner Hechtman: Ok.

Mr. Gutierrez: No association with accessible.

Commissioner Hechtman: Alright so in a hypothetical situation there if I’ve got a parking lot with 20 spaces, I might convert those to 10 EVSE spaces, and we lose a net 10. So, I was interested... because that’s a possibility I was interested in the sentence just after that that says these jurisdictions allow for up to 10 percent of total required parking spaces. So, I’d like to ask Staff to consider as a part of this language, if we are going to count those as two then should there be some max? Maybe it’s 10 percent, maybe it's more than 10 percent because again we’re going to have more electric vehicles than a lot of other jurisdictions but I’d like Staff to give that some thought.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Let's see, in the accessible ADA compliance on Page 6 there is proposed language Staff has
3 provided toward the top of the page and the last sentence says, "this provision applies to minor
4 changes to existing buildings structures" etc. Do you see that language? So, I'm wondering if
5 there's another place somewhere in the code that will give guidance to the people who read
6 the code as to what a minor change is? Is that fleshed out somewhere else or is that going to...
7 what we don't want I think is to create a lot of debates for our Planning Director when people
8 come in thinking somethings minor that may be... is not historically what we would consider
9 minor. So, if it's not fleshed out somewhere else I'd asked Staff to think about whether it needs
10 a little more clarification here in the language.

11

12 Turning to the bicycle parking. Actually, as I read through this what came to my mind is the
13 Mid-Town Ross Road YMCA where they don't have any parking spaces that have been
14 converted into bike parking because the bike parking is off the parking lot. It's actually at the
15 entrances, you walk in right, there's bike parking to the left and to the right I think coming from
16 both ways. And so, and I think that's preferable to... where bike parking can be accommodated
17 off the parking lot. That should be the first priority so we preserve parking spaces but in the...
18 and I haven't read through the whole code and maybe that is covered someplace but if it's not
19 then I do think that if that's... I think that should be our intent. And it should be reflected
20 somewhere in our code language that the City's first priority is to find an off location, off

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 parking lot location and only if there is not one then to look at replacing a parking space with
2 bike parking. In the proposed language which is on Page 11, I didn't understand the last
3 sentence. "This adjustment is exclusive of the minimum bicycle parking requirement for the
4 site." Can you help me with that?

5

6 Ms. French: Well, so these would be the extra bike parking spaces beyond the minimum that
7 has already been met. So exclusive meaning exclusive of the ones that they should have
8 provided because they're required. These are extra bike parking spaces above the required
9 number of bike parking spaces.

10

11 Commissioner Hechtman: Ok and typically will those minimum requirements have been met off
12 the parking lot or not necessarily?

13

14 Mr. Gutierrez: That depends on how that site was configured. It could have been that they
15 allocated a space because there's a small walkway to a door and those are parking spaces
16 there. Like again the Mid-town Shopping Center or Town and Country, you have parking that is
17 directly in front of business spaces so then there are sites that already have parking, inverted
18 [unintelligible] or lockers there because that makes sense.

19

20 Commissioner Hechtman: Yes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Gutierrez: In other situations, it could be again, on the walkway off of the parking lot facility itself.

Commissioner Hechtman: Ok, thank you and then the last item is on the restriping. And I appreciated the part of the Staff report where you explained how as part of the restriping you can have this unintended consequence of squeezing a drive aisle for example and that constricts onsite circulation which is important. And so, I agree that improvements to onsite circulation should be apart of the calculus of this but what I was concerned about is the way we've listed it in the draft language here. It's a stand-alone item and so it's... it would be conceivable that a property owner could come in and say I want to restripe solely to, in my view, improve on-site circulation and we're going to lose parking spaces. And I think that's an unintended reading of this and so what I would ask Staff to think about is whether that concept of improvement to onsite circulation needs to be tied to at least one of the other factors. You're restriping to meet a state requirement for example and so it's an additional reason to provide flexibility rather than its own sole reason. So those my comments, thanks for listening to them.

Chair Riggs: Thank you so much. Commissioner [note- Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll (interrupted)

2

3 Chair Riggs: Vice-Chair Alcheck, sorry.

4

5 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, thank you. I'll be short because many of the comments I wanted to
6 make have been made. I'll echo some of them real quick. I do think having a... maybe when we
7 come back to this and definitely review it again, having some spreadsheet or table that gives us
8 an opportunity to compare what not necessarily just our neighbors are doing but any
9 jurisdictions that are maybe being more creative in general. I'm not sure if it just has to be a
10 California City, maybe something in Seattle. I imagine that California Cities are probably the
11 most at the forefront of this but so that's something that Chair Rigg's mentioned.

12

13 And then I want to echo a comment that Commissioner Hechtman said which if... I think it
14 would be useful to understand what factors should weigh into the percentages. Not just a
15 minimum or a maximum and particularly is there some data that we can rely on? This is how
16 many cars we anticipate being sold as a percentage of total car being sold which will be electric.
17 That might help us navigate... not... and I know that there's a state code compliance component
18 to this. So maybe it's not that we're raising a minimum but maybe there's some element we
19 can introduce. An incentive to... I'll give you an example. I don't think right now we require
20 single-family homes to install an EV parking spot but we do require that the parking spots be EV

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 compatible. Meaning they have to provide some 220... you know there has to be some
2 component in the breaker box dedicated to the future of electrification of the parking spot.
3 Maybe that's something we could encourage developers who are building parking to
4 incorporate so they're not necessarily dedicating more than the 10 spaces or 10 per... whatever
5 the percentage is but they are future-proofing. So that if in fact, the number of electric vehicles
6 rises substantially during the lifetime, which I imagine it will of the development, transitioning
7 to electric support parking spaces wouldn't be as cumbersome for future property owners.

8
9 I also thought about the location of the bikes. It didn't occur to me until I saw the picture of the
10 shopping center off Middlefield that you used as the example of dedicating a pre-existing spot
11 to a bicycle rack. And I'm quite familiar with that shopping center's parking lot, it's one of the
12 more precarious ones. And I too thought about whether it made sense for us to discourage or
13 encourage depending on how you look at it the location of those bike parking facilities and
14 whether it made sense to encourage people to bike through parking lots to get to a dedicated
15 parking area or whether we could encourage their location may be somewhere other than the
16 same drive aisles that cars are often backing into.

17
18 And then the last thing I thought about was the way we approach the parking stall depth
19 question and the bollard. I think I'm using that word right. I've seen... so take for example a...
20 not an uncovered parking area but a covered walled-in parking area. Frequently there's a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 bollard and there's a... and there's overhang and there's a wall that you approach. And I've seen
2 in those instances charges that are essentially wall mounted and they eliminate the concern for
3 or they eliminate the need to have separate posts. I don't know if those are also bollards but
4 those posts to protect them from a car coming into them. And I wonder if... I guess one of my
5 questions... and I just don't have the sort of full perspective here but I wondered if whether in
6 anticipating the installation of these electric charging stations we were not taking into account
7 may be other creative solutions which would make that not even an issue in terms of the depth
8 and wouldn't necessarily cause immediate drive aisle I guess infringement. And so, I wondered
9 if our... would our language be able to accommodate some flexibility in charger layout and
10 design? So that it wouldn't be too rigid and say well ok if you build an EV spot that spot has to
11 be a little deeper because we anticipate this is the only charger you're going to use. I mention
12 this because the last time I went to Tokyo I had the most insane experience where a gas pump
13 came from the ceiling. And I thought to myself like there's not even a pump on my left and
14 right. So, I anticipate that as they continue to retrofit buildings over time that we'll see more
15 and more unique executions of these chargers. And I just want whatever text we come up with
16 to have the flexibility to accommodate that... those new alternative designs.

17

18 Chair Riggs: Sorry, if we could keep it down in the audience. It's really distracting up here with
19 all the chatter so if we could keep it down a little that would be great.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, that's all my comments. I look forward to seeing this again and I can
2 commit to saying that I probably will also spend some time trying to figure out what is the most
3 cutting-edge planning strategies with respect to this. Are there garages somewhere in Europe
4 where they're just all-electric or so I think it would be interesting to find out if developers of
5 let's say luxury residential buildings are they already electrifying every spot. I think it would be
6 curious maybe if we reached out to a few of them just to see what's happening out there from
7 not just a planning perspective but from a market perspective. Ok, that's it, thank you.

8

9 Mr. Gutierrez: If I may? We've actually encountered the specific situation that you're referring
10 to with the wall-mounted chargers. Typically, those have a rope around electrical loom that you
11 use and those typically only have one charger per space. Most of the applicants that we
12 encounter who are applying to install those don't want that particular model because they only
13 get one charger cord per unit. Also, that requires a wall to be there so that isn't a situation in
14 most of the instances that we're seeing these being added. If they already have an
15 underground garage and they were to wall mount them we do allow them because they can be
16 mounted above what we call the hood clearance area. So, if they are able to be mounted 5-feet
17 up then they would clear a hood of a vehicle, even an SUV, and then that would be fine. Also,
18 with... in that scenario with the parking structure, there would be support beams at some point
19 at the start of a parking stall. You know just like downstairs in this building. So, at that point,
20 you could actually put the charger behind there and that's... those are methods that we've

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 encouraged applicants already to try because the structural support for the structure already is
2 a bollard and we don't have a Collision issue and that space is usually much larger than the
3 charger itself.

4
5 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah no I feel like I didn't want to mention this because I don't know if it's
6 true but I feel like I've read... and I'm maybe making this up about the... there's some
7 movement in the industry to create a wireless charging mat that you essentially can ride... I just
8 think that there's potentially a lot of change that we'll see in this. And I just wanted to not
9 necessarily tying you just to the wall mount ones but to encourage us to think as creatively as
10 possible about the way we draft it. So that we don't necessarily have to keep revising it in case
11 these things change dramatically but thank you for responding.

12
13 Chair Riggs: Anybody else? Good so hopefully this is a short item when it comes back to us. So,
14 thank you for the way... you got what you needed? Alright so thank you.

15
16 Mr. Gutierrez: Thank you.

17 **Action Items**

18 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
19 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

20
21 None.

22 **Approval of Minutes**

23 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 3. December 11, 2019 Draft PTC Meeting Minutes

2 Chair Riggs: So, we have two more items, first approval of the minutes. Item Three and Item
3 Four.

4 [note – the Commission moved back up to Director’s Report]

5 Chair Riggs: Alright two action items, first approval of minutes. I do not have any comment
6 cards. If you have a comment on Item Three or Four I need that comment card. Any comment
7 cards on Item Three or Four please get them in. I see something coming in, is that Item Three?
8 Ok.

9

10 [note – unknown male speaker]: [unintelligible – spoke off-mic from the audience]

11

12 Chair Riggs: Ok so (interrupted)

13

14 Vice-Chair Alcheck: (off mic) Do you want someone to make a motion to approve the minutes?

15

16 Chair Riggs: We need to see who’s got comments. I believe there may be a comment card in the
17 comment box that our colleague... thank you very much for working with us here. Alright, so I
18 really appreciate you guys submitting this so we’re going to go back to Item One.

19

20 [note – the Commission moved back up to Oral Communication for public comment]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Riggs: Alright seeing not comments on Item Three. We have out December 11th draft PTC
2 minutes. Hopefully, you had a chance to review. Do I have a motion to approve?

3

4 MOTION

5

6 Commissioner Roohparvar: I'll move to approve.

7

8 SECOND

9

10 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Second.

11

12 VOTE

13

14 Chair Riggs: So, a motion to approve, Commissioner Roohparvar, second by Commissioner [note
15 -Vice-Chair] Alcheck. All in favor say aye.

16

17 Chair Riggs: Any abstain?

18

19 Commissioner Hechtman: Abstain.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 MOTION PASSED 6(Lauing, Roohparvar, Alcheck, Riggs, Summa, Templeton)-0-1 (Hechtman
2 abstain)

3

4 Chair Riggs: Ok so approved six with one abstention.

5

6 **Commission Action:** Motion to approve by Roohparvar, seconded by Alcheck. 6-0-1 with
7 Hechtman abstained.

8 **Committee Items**

9 **Election of Chair and Vice-Chair**

10 4. Election of Chair and Vice-Chair

11 Chair Riggs: Ok moving on we have administrative item in terms of our Committee structure of
12 electing a Chair and Vice-Chair. I have three comment cards so we will hear from Terri Holzmer
13 followed by Margaret Heath followed by Ms. Winter Dellenbach.

14

15 Mr. Terri Holzmer: Good evening Commissioners. I'd like to read a short letter that has come
16 from Palo Alto citizens that we sent to you this past Monday. I'm positive that you've had a
17 chance to read it but I think it's also important that it be transparent and visible to the entire
18 community; especially those that are watching right now. We the residents of Palo Alto request
19 that all Planning and Transportation Commissioners take into account the following key
20 characteristics when nominating and voting for this year's Chair and Vice-Chair. Selfless... 1)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Selfless interest in serving the public good and carrying out the work of the people. Punctual
2 and regular attendance at meetings. Thorough preparation for each agenda item, including
3 knowledge of relevant background. The utmost respect and courtesy toward the public,
4 especially those that come out in the evening. It's right of participation and the Commissioner's
5 role to thoroughly vet items that hearing to the Commissioner's role and on the public's behalf.
6 Zero tolerance for bullying or disparaging a member of the public from the dais. Respectful
7 interactions with colleagues. A commitment to transparency, including compliance with state-
8 required, complete disclosure at the dais of any conflict of and conflict of interest and resultant
9 recusal from participation. Full compliance with disclosure requirements in quasi-judicial
10 hearings including disclosure of contact with any or all parties involved, as well as providing the
11 substance of new and pertinent information from those contacts that are not part of the public
12 record. Respectful interactions with staff in private. For example, when setting agendas as well
13 as during public meetings. Full disclosure of any interactions with staff on personal matters that
14 may overlap with the work of the commission. Managing fair, open, and productive meetings
15 by preserving order and decorum at the dais, curbing behavior that is not in alignment with the
16 highest ethical standards, allowing adequate time for members of the public to speak,
17 permitting each commissioner an opportunity to ask questions before any motions are made,
18 keeping discussions on topic, and moving by encapsulating key ideas and being as clear and
19 brief as possible, and finally seeking areas of common ground when possible.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 I urge you to look at these guidelines and consider them. Thank you.

2

3 Chair Riggs: Thank you very much. Sorry, Margaret Heath.

4

5 Ms. Margaret Heath: Good evening. Maggie Heath from College Terrace and I'm an endorser of
6 the community letter that you've received. It also listed 53 other residents' endorsers across
7 neighborhoods in the document that you received from Becky Sanders on Monday. Among
8 them are several who have served as a Council, Board, and/or Commission Member, and I'd like
9 to mention these. Emily Renzel and Joe Hirsch both were Chairs of the Planning Commission
10 before its name and purview changed in 2000. Emily Renzel, as well as another Palo Alto legion
11 Enid Pearson both, served on the City Council. Karen Holman was a two-term Chair on the
12 Planning and Transportation Commission and then Council Member and Mayor. Former City
13 Council Member and Mayor Yuriko Kishimoto, as well as former Council Member Greg Schmid,
14 are also endorsers. Jennifer Hetterly, former Parks and Recreation Commissioner and Chair has
15 endorsed; as has Greer Stone, former Human Relation Commissioner and Chair.

16

17 Since this letter, together with the initial endorsers which were sent to you on Monday, we
18 have received additional endorsements and I'd like to mention a couple of those. Among the
19 endorsers include former Planning and Transportation Commissioner and Vice-Chair Arthur
20 Keller and former Utilities Advisory Commissioner and Chair James Cook.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Thank you to all the residents who have turned up this evening to support us and stayed late
2 and thank you for listening. Thank you, bye-bye.

3

4 Chair Riggs: Thank you very much. Let me see, Winter Dellenbach.

5

6 Ms. Winter Dellenbach: Hi, I'm happy to be here. I just want to say while I know that mob there
7 and I like them a lot. I'm not really with them tonight. I'm speaking for myself kind of about
8 another thing. Expertise and knowledge; expertise and knowledge; expertise and knowledge.
9 That's the gold standard in Palo Alto, I think we all know that. On City Council, on our
10 Commissions, expertise, and knowledge, that's what we want. We want it for our leaders of our
11 Commissions and on our City Council. Both expertise and knowledge come with hard work and
12 overtime. I want to say I know something about this. I'm almost 75-years old and I have noticed
13 that that's how we accumulate this. It takes time and it takes hard work. I also know that it is
14 when new leadership it being elected because I sit in on a lot of City Council meetings,
15 Commission meetings or I watch them at home on TV. There's a big scramble. Every time you
16 all elect new people or other Commissions do or whatever, you all talk to each other behind the
17 scenes, we always hope the Brown Act isn't violated but who knows and people line upvotes.
18 It's kind of like survivor at Skull Island or something sometimes. It makes me very nervous. So, I
19 don't know what you all have really planned for tonight and what you have done but I like to
20 think that you all are the best and the brightest. I always keep hope alive and I hope beyond

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 hope that you have as your highest priority expertise and knowledge in your leadership votes
2 tonight. No matter what you've been talking about, if you have, for Chair and for the Vice-Chair
3 because some have more expertise than knowledge than others. You will all have it, you will all
4 get it over time, and hard work because that's how it comes. And despite political ambitions
5 and despite alliances, you make with each other to achieve your smaller goals and personal
6 goals. It's expertise and knowledge that the people of Palo Alto and the City of Palo Alto expect
7 from people on our Commissions. And we expect it from each and every one of you so please
8 do the right thing tonight. Thank you.

9

10 Chair Riggs: Thank you, Ms. Dellenbach. So, if anyone else has any comments now is the time
11 before I close the hearing. Seeing none, I like to do that. Ok, so we'll bring it back to the
12 Commission.

13

14 Just to outline the process and we had to do a little review or refresher of the By-Laws. What
15 will happen is we'll elect the Chair and then the Chair will run the election of the Vice-Chair
16 which is what we've done traditionally. It's similar to what Council does so I get to get up and
17 participate then which is great. But typically for both the process has been that we take
18 nominations, we take all the nominations. Typically, what we've done in the past is the...
19 generally, the person that's nominated can except with a simple yes/no and the nominator will
20 speak to their nomination. And that's typically what we do when we make motions, we speak

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to the motion. After we have all the nominations we'll go through rounds of voting until a
2 majority is reached and if you watched the election premier that's how the Council has done it
3 too so. If I mess up, let me know, if I mess up let me know because in theory I understand how
4 this is done but I've never run one before. So, with that said I think what I will do and we'll just
5 do it by I'll take nomination for the position (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: Question.

8

9 Chair Riggs: Questions, ok I got a light so go ahead.

10

11 Commissioner Lauing: On process (interrupted)

12

13 Chair Riggs: Commissioner Lauing.

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: I'm a little confused on Point Number Five if this is really what's
16 intended. So, I understand that... because I'm not quite sure we handle it this way but we can
17 figure out how we want to handle it. There's the nomination and then a second and then the
18 nominee says yes, I want to but what this says is that after those nominations have been made
19 and seconded and the nominees have accepted then we're going to vote immediately. And I
20 don't recall that we went immediately to a vote because, for example, Commissioner A could

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 make a nomination, Commissioner B could make the second, Commissioner C would say yes
2 and then we're done so there's no discussion that way.

3

4 Chair Riggs: I think that (interrupted)

5

6 Commissioner Lauing: This seems to disenfranchise Commissioners that want to ask questions
7 of the nominee or something like that.

8

9 Chair Riggs: I think we... for at least for my tenor on the Commission we have not done that and
10 I don't think that's listed in our By-Laws but I think what is consistent is to actually take all the
11 nominations upfront (interrupted)

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Correct.

14

15 Chair Riggs: Let the nominators speak to their nomination.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: Correct my only question is do we want to stop it after the nominees
18 have both said yes or do we want to be able to ask questions of the nominee?

19

20 Chair Riggs: I don't... I would have to consult with our... yeah, I'm sorry, have direction.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Ms. Sandra Lee, Assistant City Attorney: So, thank you Mr. Chair. So, under the Commission's rules, the Chair does have discretion to determine the procedures. However, and but the Chair can also submit it to the Commission to decide whether or not his proposed procedure is acceptable to a majority of the Commission. And if the Chair does decide on the procedure and a Member of the Commission would like to appeal that. Then you can also make a motion to appeal that and institute a different process. Is that... ok.

Chair Riggs: Well, this clearly puts me... you're putting me on the spot.

Commissioner Lauing: That wasn't the intent at all I can assure you of that.

Chair Riggs: I don't recall that we've ever done this before and I would prefer not to set a new precedent of basically putting a nominee on the spot with lots of questions. I don't know that that's fair but I would entertain... if you want to make a... if we could want to have... you know vote, do a consensus, show of hands that that's something that we want to do. I would entertain it but I would just be... say its from my perspective I don't feel like... I feel like this is setting a different standard but. (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: I don't have any hidden agenda here, Chair.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Riggs: Yeah.

Commissioner Lauing: I'm just saying that if somebody wanted to ask a question or say I... other than the person who seconding, I'd like to support it for these reasons. They're not going to be able to give their reasons and we'll never know. So that's all I was trying to kind of look at.

Chair Riggs: Commissioner Summa followed by Commissioner... Commissioner Summa followed by Commissioner [note -Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you, Chair. Tonight seems... does seem a little different to me and I remember in the past having a discussion about... publicly about why we may or may not support a particular candidate. I remember speaking to your nomination last year so I think we have typically done that and I think that's not just for us but it's also for the public. And I... usually we have... we don't usually have members of the public here for this here I don't think but we did do that last year. So... because I think it's... I think it's nice for people to hear reasoning behind the support we give each other for these leadership positions.

Chair Riggs: Commissioner [note -Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I'm prepared to make a nomination.

2

3 Chair Riggs: I'm sorry, Commissioner Becker.

4

5 Commissioner Lauing: (off mic) Hechtman.

6

7 Chair Riggs: I'm sorry, we just met. I... and for everybody out there this is so awkward for me.

8 We just met this morning and I'm (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Hechtman: We'll get there.

11

12 Chair Riggs: I'm not a table talk person so.

13

14 Commissioner Hechtman: So really a point of order, since you have the flexibility as the Chair,

15 current Chair to control this I actually had a comment that I thought should proceed the

16 nominations. It's not about a particular nominee and I was wondering if now, as we're poised

17 for somebody to make a nomination if I could make my point (interrupted)

18

19 Chair Riggs: I would welcome a comment, sure.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, thank you, thank you. So, and actually what... I wanted to
2 address the community letter that was provided and somebody was kind enough to read that
3 into the record tonight and that a number of you I think are here to support. I did receive it and
4 read it and I think it's terrific. And I want to thank all the people in our community that
5 participated in it and endorsed it and that... and supported its ideals. I do, I support those
6 ideals, and I found myself nodding my head as I... yes as I read through it but as I read through it
7 I did see what I considered to be a significant omission. And so, I just want to put that on the
8 table because I do think it should be on the list but it's not. And it really relates to characteristic
9 Number Five which says, "zero tolerance for bullying or disparaging a member of the public
10 from the dais" and I agree with that but what's missing in that statement is this. Zero tolerance
11 for bullying or disparaging a member of the public by another member of the public and zero
12 tolerance for bullying or disparaging a member of the dais... someone on the dais; whether it's
13 a Commissioner or a member of Staff by a member of the public. In other words, in this room, I
14 think every person has to be respectful of every other person regardless of your role in the
15 process. And I do think that it's the role of the Chair and the Vice-Chair to ensure that that
16 order is maintained in all of those directions. And so that's the point I wanted to make and
17 whoever our Chair and Vice-Chair are moving forward I'm confident that they will do that.
18 Thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Riggs: And I want to echo that. I really appreciate you saying that because I think... I
2 appreciated the comments as well. And I was thinking of the word civitas and thinking about
3 that we're all here to respect one another and to hear the public but also to bring out collective
4 expertise to inform how we live. So, thank you for that and thank you for the comments. I think
5 that's... those are very informative, so any other comments about process? Commissioner
6 Lauing.

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: I guess I'm still back on the same issue is I don't see any downside of
9 being able to support a motion or not. It's like we do with every other motion.

10

11 Chair Riggs: So, I don't have a problem with dialoging but I think the point here you speak... you
12 can... I don't have a problem with doing that. We'll go through rounds of nominations after you
13 all can speak to and/or questions. I'm going to limit everyone to one question. We need to keep
14 this efficient or one item of dialog but I'll be responsive to that. I think you're right, no problem.

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: Ok.

17

18 Chair Riggs: I see no other lights. We'll... I will entertain nominations for the election of Chair so
19 and we'll take as many as we need to be nominated. Commissioner [note -Vice-Chair] Alcheck.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 NOMINATION FOR CHAIR

2

3 Vice-Chair Alcheck: First let me just say welcome, probably should have done that in the
4 beginning of the meeting. Your presence is already profoundly impressive and thank you for
5 your comment.

6

7 And I'm going to make a nomination right now. It's been quite a privilege for me to serve with
8 Commissioner Templeton. I have always been impressed with her intellect and her
9 professionalize. And I like to nominate her and then I'll speak to my nomination if it gets
10 seconded.

11

12 Chair Riggs: Commissioner Templeton do you accept the nomination to start off with.

13

14 Commissioner Templeton: Yes.

15

16 Chair Riggs: Ok, do we have a second?

17

18 SECOND

19

20 Commissioner Roohparvar: Second.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Riggs: Commissioner Roohparvar seconds. Would you like to speak to the nomination Commissioner [note -Vice-Chair] Alcheck?

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, the reason why I'm nominating Commissioner Templeton is because if I could add one thing to this list or I guess if the... my sincere belief is that effective meeting management is the ultimate precursor of the success of this Commission. I think everybody here has great experience and great knowledge and I think we all operate with a range of the values that are articulated tonight. I think it's a unique quality to be able to effectively manage a group and sometimes it's not always the individual with the greatest expertise in traffic for example or law or any area that is all... that is the best meeting manager. And so, with that, I want to acknowledge that I believe Commissioner Templeton approaches the important work we do on this Commission with an exceptional level-headed method of operation and a very clear sense of empathy for all who engage in our process. And I think what is most remarkable is that she reminds me so much of the late Edwardo Martinez who served as Chair when I first joined this Commission and I remember his leadership fondly because he inspired all of us on this Commission to be our best selves. Like him, Commissioner Templeton, you are compassionate, you are thoughtful, you are measured in your analysis and commentary, and you make those who come to our meetings feel welcome, heard, and considered. And for all of

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 these reasons, I think you will make an outstanding Chair and I hope my fellow Commissioners
2 will join me in supporting your appointment.

3

4 Chair Riggs: So, Commissioner... can you speak to your second?

5

6 Commissioner Roohparvar: Yes, I'd like to speak to my second. First off, thank you for
7 submitting that letter. I did genuinely spend a lot of time thinking about the points raised in
8 that letter and really thinking about who epitomizes those characteristics and that is
9 Commissioner Templeton. I've had the honor and privilege of serving with her. And stepping
10 back what this Commission needs and what one needs of a Chair is somebody who is
11 respectful, you are organized, and who has empathy and Commissioner Templeton embodies
12 all three. I have gotten to know her both on the dais and in informal settings, during dinners,
13 behind the scenes. Never once, never once and I can honestly say this have I ever seen her be
14 disrespectful to a member of the Staff, to a fellow Commissioner Member, to a member of the
15 public. That is not in her character and speaking to the fact that she is extremely organized. I
16 don't know if people know this but she has over 20-years in experience in organizational
17 processes and running meetings and she knows what she's doing. And finally, the empathy,
18 that emotional intelligence that she brings to the table and I've seen it when she connects and
19 interacts with people who... from the public who come to speak. And it's just so thoughtful in

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the way that she thinks about and approaches issues. So, for those reasons, I seconded
2 Commissioner Templeton's nomination and I would be honored to have her as our Chair.

3
4 Chair Riggs: Thank you. We... I have more lights. Commissioner Summa, I have you but I will
5 need to know, I don't know whether or not we're taking... you have comments or not but I do...
6 I will entertain other nominations now that we've had a... if there are other nominations. So,
7 Commissioner Summa and then Commissioner Lauing. If there are no further... if you would
8 hold your questions if there are no further nominations we can go into the dialog... the
9 requested questions but if there are any other nominations I'll entertain them now. Ok,
10 Commissioner Summa followed by Commissioner Lauing.

11
12 Commissioner Summa: So, thank you very much and really thank you to the members of the
13 public who came out tonight with a lot of good advice and comments to us. And it's not always
14 easy to be perfect up here. I will be very honest I have been... this is my fourth year on the
15 Planning Commission. I was planning on throwing my hat in the ring for a lot of reasons. In
16 addition to this body I have served on several other City Commissions and Boards but I am struck
17 by the... some of the comments in the letter seeking areas of common ground when possible. I
18 am struck by the good working relationship I have had with Commissioner Templeton. I've sat
19 next to her for the whole year. I was able to help her when she was a new Commissioner and
20 wasn't sure how everything worked out. I've enjoyed getting to know her outside but I don't

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 think it would be useful, as much as I would like to serve my community by being Chair. There's
2 always Vice-Chair. I don't think it would be useful for me to throw my hat in the ring. I am very
3 touched by the reminder that alliances in politics should not prevail when we make these
4 decisions. And our newest Commissioner reminded that bullying and respect should go all ways
5 and directions in this room. And I would like to add that when you have the privilege of serving
6 on a Board or Commission and sit up here in front of the people, you take an oath, you serve
7 your... the Staff and the Council and the people of Palo Alto. You also should extend that same
8 respect outside of this room and that includes to comments made online. So, I will be
9 supporting Commissioner Templeton tonight for Chair. I just wanted to make those comments.

10
11 Chair Riggs: Ok I appreciate those. If we could... if we just keep it to questions for Commissioner
12 Templeton I think that's what we agreed too, so Commissioner Lauing.

13
14 Commissioner Lauing: Similar comment is in order now? [unintelligible] I thought you were
15 changing it up now.

16
17 Chair Riggs: That's fine, that's fine just... Commissioner Lauing.

18
19 Commissioner Lauing: Well, I think on paper in my view a second-year Commissioner is not a
20 perfect profile for Chair unless they've had prior Commission experience. For example, like

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Riggs has in a different City and why is obviously because it's a very steep learning curve.
2 We've got zoning and building complexities, we've got key issues in the City and history around
3 them. Not to mention just the good old iconic Palo Alto process. And Carrie [note –
4 Commissioner Templeton] is a second-year Commissioner and I'm supporting her fully for
5 Chair. I think she's eager to take the reins and lead the charge to make real progress on a lot of
6 multiple issues we face. She wants to get things done which I completely share that attitude. I
7 also appreciate her preparation on issues this year which shows she's very dedicated and hard
8 working to jump on that learning curve and really come up that learning curve and help us. And
9 I particularly like the... I particularly have confidence in her meeting management and I have
10 zero questions I'm happy to say about any sort of civility. And I hope that she is also mentoring
11 all of us on that and monitoring all of us on that. And in that, I would also like to just start this
12 Commission off this year with a unified vote to select a leader which is Carrie [note -
13 Commissioner Templeton] to get us going and let's go get stuff done for Palo Alto. Fully support
14 her.

15

16 VOTE

17

18 Chair Riggs: Thank you Chair... Commissioner. I want to call you Chair Lauing. Thank you. Any
19 other comments... questions? We said questions but we've... well, I'll entertain additional
20 comments as well because I think that's [unintelligible]. Any other questions or comments?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 With that said I think we're ready for a vote so all in favor of the election of Commissioner
2 Templeton as our 2020 Chair. Any opposed? Any abstentions? Alright, so the motions carries
3 seven to nothing. Thank you very much and let's switch seats.

4
5 MOTION PASSED 7(Hechtman, Summa, Templeton, Riggs, Alcheck, Rookparvar, Lauing) -0

6
7 Chair Templeton: Well thank you all. I am so touched and a little emotional right now but I so
8 appreciate the sense... the feeling that we're kicking it off as Commissioner Lauing said in a
9 sense of goodwill and sharing the spirit that the community has put forward as well. I can safely
10 say that every one of us shares the point of view that we are here to interact peacefully and
11 move forward with making Palo Alto even better than it already is. So, thank you very much for
12 that.

13
14 Alright now on to business. Any nominations for Vice-Chair? Commissioner Lauing.

15
16 NOMINATION #1 FOR VICE-CHAIR

17
18 Commissioner Lauing: Ok I would like to nominate Doria Summa for Vice-Chair.

19
20 Chair Templeton: And do you accept?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Summa: I do.

3

4 Chair Templeton: Any second?

5

6 Commissioner Lauing: Second? We need a second in order to (interrupted)

7

8 Chair Templeton: Do you second?

9

10 Commissioner Lauing: We need a second in order to debate it or discuss it.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: We need a second.

13

14 Commissioner Lauing: Need a second to the nomination.

15

16 Chair Riggs: Are you asking me?

17

18 Commissioner Templeton: No, I'm asking if there is a second.

19

20 Chair Riggs: Ok.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Templeton: And I believe you can second it. The motion (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: Is... somebody... oh, he put his light on.

Commissioner Hechtman: Am I not lighting up?

Chair Templeton: Ok, yes Commissioner Hechtman.

SECOND

Commissioner Hechtman: Alright, sorry, so I will second at least so we can have discussion and questions and comments.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you.

Chair Templeton: Alright, great, and do we have... do we back up our statements or take all nominations first?

[note – many Commissioners started talking at once off mic]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Templeton: Alright so any other nominations?

NOMINATION #2 FOR VICE-CHAIR

Vice-Chair Alcheck: I'll nominate at this time... just for clarification purposes, you can also second your own nomination in case you were worried. You can also make your own nomination.

At this time, I'd like to nomination Commissioner Roohparvar.

Chair Templeton: Any second?

Commissioner Roohparvar: [unintelligible – off mic] second?

Chair Templeton: Any second?

SECOND

Commissioner Roohparvar: I'll second myself.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Templeton: Ok. Alright, we've got two nominations. Commissioner Lauing do you want to speak to your nomination?

Commission Riggs: I'm sorry I just can't hear very well. If... down there if the mics are on.

Commissioner Lauing: [unintelligible – crosstalk]

Chair Riggs: If the mics are... if multiple mics are on it's actually hard to hear like over here if you're over there.

Commissioner Lauing: I hadn't started yet so. I just wanted to spend a couple of bullet points for everyone to understand at least my view on this Commission of what the Vice-Chair does. In the public meetings, the responsibilities are very minor and as it normally goes the Vice-Chair would only take the gavel probably once a year in the absence of the Chair. Outside of the meeting, I think the role is significant. Obviously, there's a pre-meeting and that's not just an hour every 2-weeks in City Hall up here talking with the Planning Department. The person has to be up to speed in detail on the Packet by that Tuesday. Often when I was Chair on this Commission there was a pre-meeting for the pre-meeting with the Vice-Chair so that we were really prepped and often there was a post-meeting where we synced up to make sure that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 managing the meeting would be quite efficient. There are meetings with the Chair, there are
2 meetings with the Mayor, there's interface with Staff outside of meetings, there's retreat
3 planning, and there can be assignments from the Chair depending on what she wants to
4 delegate. So just kind of get that in perspective.

5

6 So why Doria [note – Commissioner Summa]? We've seen her perform for 3-years at I think an
7 extortionary level on PTC and I would submit that that's only the tip of the iceberg because
8 that's what we see. She's really spent 20-years actively involved in the City of Palo Alto working
9 in City involved issues and I call her an advocational zoning expert because she just really knows
10 this stuff inside and out. Been president of her Neighborhood Association, a member of the
11 very difficult Comp Plan Advisory Committee that was a predecessor to us finally voting on that,
12 and takes on other tasks in addition to her PTC now such as the NVCAP; the Ventura working
13 group. So, City work is really her passion, I think it's her main thing in life, and she'll invest any
14 amount of time necessary, you know 24-hour... 24/7 in the role. I presume she sees her
15 husband occasionally. So, I'm in recruiting and so I always try to look at candidates and say
16 what's going to predict a successor? Every single meeting I've been in with her, which is all the
17 ones you've been in with her, there's evidence of just exhaustive detailed preparation and
18 evidence that she's gone to other sources to get even more information to both form her
19 opinion as well as share with colleagues so that we can make better decisions. Her questions
20 are very good and prepared in advance, her positions are well-argued at the meetings, clearly

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 articulated in a nice normal and civil way, she's an enthusiastic champion of thorough public
2 input on issues like this and like everything, a real champion of the resident, actively engaged in
3 every debate and I say that specifically because she's only missed one meeting in 3-years so
4 completely committed. Always very civil listens to call colleagues before deciding how to vote
5 and her mind is changed sometimes by that. And the last thing I just want to mention in that
6 regard is that she has very positive interactions with Staff.

7

8 A couple comments I want to make apart from... I wrote this not thinking of another candidate
9 in this regard, I just want to point that out. So, these are not candidates... on the merits of
10 either of the candidates... comments on the merits of either of the candidates. I think that
11 Carrie, now the Chair, needs a partner with lots of experience to work on the condition and the
12 City process and so on. I think this will be better for PTC and I think it's going to build
13 confidence in our total leadership team within the community which is really important. I... as
14 you know from my last year's comments, I personally don't feel that the election of the Chair
15 and the Vice-Chair should be politically based because managing the Commission's business
16 really has nothing to do with voting on issues and doesn't influence it. But others in our
17 community disagree with that promise so I think that having Doria [note – Commissioner
18 Summa] and Carrie [note – Chair Templeton] together is another benefit to the community of
19 showing balance in political perspective perhaps just as... as was just done on the Council just a
20 couple weeks ago. So, you pick up that balance as well and then 2-years ago Doria [note –

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa] stood for Vice-Chair, she was tied in a vote with Susan Monk, rather
2 than leave that meeting in a stalemate, unprovoked Doria [note - Commissioner Summa]
3 graciously postponed her stint as Vice [note – Vice-Chair] and allowed Commissioner Monk to
4 take the role. This is just what Council Member Cormack did graciously in the Vice-Mayor
5 selection a couple weeks ago with the clear promise that she would have a turn in the future.
6 So, I submit for all the reasons and particularly for the experience level that we get, now is the
7 future for Doria [note – Commissioner Summa] and the last year of her term. So, I think she’s a
8 great partner for our new Chair, they’ve worked well together in the past year, and Carrie
9 [note- Chair Templeton] will benefit enormously from the decades of experience and her work
10 ethic and at her counsel.

11

12 Chair Templeton: Thank you Commissioner Lauing. Commissioner Hechtman, do you want to
13 speak to your second?

14

15 Commissioner Hechtman: So, as I indicated at the time of the second, not realizing that a
16 nominee could self-second, I wanted to... I wanted a dialog and I wanted to hear from the
17 nominees not knowing whether or not there would be more than one.

18

19 But now I know there are two and so... and I’m looking at the community letter Item Number
20 Three, thorough preparation for each agenda item including knowledge of relative background.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And I will be candid that when I found out that this item was on our agenda tonight, my first
2 meeting, and that if there were a contest if there were more than one nominee for either
3 position I was going to be in a difficult spot because I don't have the knowledge of the relative
4 background. I don't have the background and experience of working with either of these two
5 nominees. And so, while I seconded this and I think it's important that we hear from both
6 nominees, I want to say up front that my intention is to abstain because I don't feel that I have
7 sufficient knowledge of either nominee to choose between them.

8
9 I appreciate the positive remarks from Ed [note – Commissioner Lauing] and I'm expecting to
10 hear from Mike [note – Vice-Chair Alcheck] in regard to his nominee and I expect that to be
11 equally persuasive. So, I think it will be a tough decision but I'm counting on four of my six
12 fellow Commissioners to choose one or the other.

13
14 Chair Templeton: Thank you. Commissioner [note – Vice-Chair] Alcheck, would you like to speak
15 to your nomination?

16
17 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I would, thank you. Where do I begin? I was thrilled when I heard that
18 Commissioner Roohparvar was appointed to this Commission. When I watched her interview, I
19 was struck by the profound expertise she had in the land use planning. For those of you
20 unfamiliar I'm a land-use attorney and in law school at the King Hall at Davis, I was a TA in

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 California Land Use Planning. And when I applied to law firms there was one... there's only one
2 firm when it comes to land use law in the United States and that's the firm, Miller Starr Regalia.
3 And in fact, any practicing land use attorney likely, maybe less now because of the digital age,
4 will have a set of treatises behind their desk that they rely on profoundly when dealing with
5 land use for municipal issues. And all of them have the authorship Miller and Starr, the
6 founders of Miller Starr Regalia. I mention this because not only did I not... I didn't earn an offer
7 of employment from Miller Starr Regalia despite trying very hard and interviewing with them.
8 But regardless, in my professional experience my interactions with that firm and my experience
9 with their publication... with their founder's publication was remarkable expertise. And it may
10 come as some surprise for those of you that don't know that Commissioner Roohparvar not
11 only did get an offer from Miller and Starr, she may be one of the youngest partners or if not
12 the youngest women to make partner at Miller Starr and Regalia. And I have to tell you that for
13 an attorney in land use in the area of land use to make partner in such a prestigious law firm
14 suggests that she was a star. She was a star engaging with municipal employees and she was a
15 star engaging with communities and their constituents and she was a star in helping clients
16 achieve positive results in their what are always contentious land use issues.

17

18 And so, I didn't actually know you at all when you were appointed but it was really impressed. I
19 think when the Council... I think it was... I might be wrong. I think you were unanimously
20 appointed by the Council. I think you got every vote when you were appointed which is also

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 unique and I think the reason that's the case is because there has been a realization I think
2 among our Council that expertise in the area of land use is helpful. I think the issues are getting
3 more complex and the polarization in our community is getting greater. And having individuals
4 who sort of approach these issues from an arm's length, from an antipolitical perspective, who
5 are familiar with not just the nature of the code that we consistently grapple with but also with
6 how it's often interrupted after we make our decisions. I think that's a big part of why you...
7 why the Council sought your perspective in these issues.

8

9 I think that, with Commissioner Hechtman, I may have now served with 18 Commissioners in
10 the 8 or so years I've been on this Commission. The overwhelming majority of them never got
11 to have a leadership position on this Commission. I... it's uncomfortable to have to pick
12 between two candidates and I think it's uncomfortable for a Chair, for example, to have to pick
13 between two Vice-Chair candidates. And I think that regardless of how this vote goes I think... I
14 don't think it should be treated as a personal vote of confidence or no confidence. I think that
15 the... that these are difficult and sort of tough decisions but one does not necessarily mean that
16 there's ill will. My point about the fact that the overwhelming majority of Commissioners I've
17 served with never held a leadership position is just that all the points of view on this
18 Commission are equally weighted and the role is well suited to individuals who are both
19 trustworthy and strong meeting managers. And also, I think, especially in interacting with Staff
20 and behind the scenes, individuals that can help encourage the direction of the discussion in

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 anticipation of tough meetings in a way that's most responsive to some of the important
2 elements of these decisions that we make. And so, I am equally excited that another individual
3 with tremendous experience grappling with the... with code issues has joined this Commission.
4 We use to have an architect, sometimes that's really valuable. I think we could probably benefit
5 from someone with greater exposure to development but the point is, is that the combination
6 of your organizational management skills, your compassion, and your empathy in partnership
7 with someone who has such tremendous and exceptional experience with many of the legal
8 issues I think would be profound. And I say that with all due respect to you Commissioner
9 Summa. And so, I strongly support your appointment to this position and encourage all of you
10 to support Commissioner Roohparvar for the Vice-Chair as well.

11

12 Chair Templeton: Thank you. Commissioner Roohparvar, do you want to speak to you second
13 and then Commissioner Riggs?

14

15 Commissioner Roohparvar: Yes. I would be honored to have... to be elected Vice-Chair and have
16 an opportunity to take on greater responsibility and work with Commissioner [note – Chair]
17 Templeton. Speaking... thank you so much, Commissioner [note – Vice-Chair] Alcheck for your
18 vote of confidence in me. I do have 12-years of experience in this realm as well as not only
19 having appeared before... serving on the Commission in Palo Alto but I've appeared before
20 Planning Commissions and City Councils all across California and nationally in my practice

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 outside of my appearance here. But setting aside that expertise what I vow and what I bring to
2 the table that I think would be valuable is my ability to reach across the aisle and empathy. And
3 this is why I was able to get the City Council votes and why I have had good relationships with
4 Staff because I do think that this position should transcend politics. And It's not about getting
5 up here and arguing your point and making sure you win. It's about making sure that everybody
6 is heard and has a fair chance and making sure that there is civility and decorum that's always
7 maintained. So, for those reasons, I nominated myself as Vice-Chair and I am up to the job and I
8 can do it.

9

10 Chair Templeton: Thank you. Commissioner Riggs.

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: Well, I really appreciated Commissioner Lauing's general description of
13 your service and I guess I want to echo that. I guess I have a question though because I...
14 Commissioner Summa, I really appreciate your efforts in your preparation but one thing is I
15 really struggle with in supporting you is that last year in our retreat when you chose not to
16 participate. It really... you know I had set up this event, try to build us as a team to help us
17 figure out how to work together more, and so I guess why I'm struggling with being able to
18 support your experience is that I'm not exactly sure how you would... do you recover from that
19 jester? I just don't... I mean I want to hear how you will lead differently than that. So, I mean I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 guess if you could speak to that I'd really, really appreciate it because it's weighed on me for a
2 while.

3
4 Commissioner Summa: Well you could have reached out at any time to ask me and to be
5 honest I did participate in the retreat. I stayed for the whole meeting and some of the events
6 that you planned I felt were somewhat frivolous and irrelevant to our mission and I wanted to
7 discuss how we could work together better. And in fact, the Vice-Chair apologized to me after
8 that meeting because he knew some of the little exercises we were going to do made me
9 uncomfortable. So, you know, it occurs to me that we could have talked... spoken about this a
10 year ago. A simple invitation to coffee would have been meaningful to me.

11
12 Chair Templeton: Doria [note – Commissioner Summa] did you want to say anything about your
13 nomination?

14
15 Commissioner Summa: Thank you Commissioner Lauing, that was a little over the top. I can
16 assure everyone in the room I do not think about zoning 24/7. That's just not true. I also think
17 that I have lived in this community for a very long time and worked very hard and I think I will
18 be an excellent Vice-Chair. I think I have the time to do it, I am not employed outside of the
19 home as they say and my various pursuits with the City. So, I think I'm going to be able to assist
20 you better in your role and anyone who has a job. I'm sure that anybody... anyone of us here

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 can do an excellent job as Vice-Chair. It's just a matter of who's going to do it this year so I
2 would like that to be me. I hope some of you besides Ed [note – Commissioner Lauing] will. And
3 yeah, I don't want to spend too much time on it. I do think its... the decorum is very important
4 and satisfying our responsibility to Staff and the public. And I just want to irritate something I
5 said earlier and for me, that doesn't stop in this room. Not up here or in this room or I take that
6 out into the world with me. I don't tweet things, I don't Instagram, I don't write Facebook
7 posts, I don't do things like that, and I just wanted to make that clear. I think I would be
8 excellent and I think I'll have more time to do it. To help you really because I do think it's a
9 pretty big job actually and I think you won't miss a single meeting because I don't think you do
10 miss meetings but. So, I don't think it's not for me about holding the gavel and sitting in your
11 seat. It's about actually working with you and helping you which we have done very well this
12 year. So, thank you very much.

13

14 Chair Templeton: Any other comments? I will be participating in this vote and I echo the
15 comments about how lucky we are to have two amazing nominees. I have learned a lot working
16 with Doria [note – Commissioner Summa] and I have also learned a lot working with... sorry
17 with Commissioner Summa and I've learned a lot working with Commissioner Roohparvar. So, I
18 think there are some additional considerations about the dynamic and the pairing that I... my
19 personal preference I think it would work better with Commissioner Roohparvar so I will be
20 supporting her nomination. Alright, so we're going to vote in the order of nomination so... well,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we have... do we... when it's two people do we vote one or the other do we vote up and down
2 for each candidate?

3

4 Commissioner Riggs: (off mic) Up and down for both candidates.

5

6 Ms. Lee: Each candidate.

7

8 VOTE

9

10 Chair Templeton: Great, thank you, so let's vote for Commissioner Summa for Vice-Chair. Thank
11 you. Opposed? Oh, you don't do opposed?

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: No, it's just for.

14

15 COMMISSIONER SUMMA FOR VICE-CHAIR DID NOT PASS WITH A VOTE OF 2(Lauing, Summa) -
16 4(Riggs, Templeton, Alcheck, Roohparvar)-1 (Hechtman abstain)

17

18 Chair Templeton: Ok then for Commissioner Roohparvar? Any abstentions?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 COMMISSIONER ROOHPARVAR FOR VICE-CHAIR PASSED WITH A VOTE OF 4(Roohparvar,
2 Alcheck, Templeton)- 2(Lauing, Summa)- 2(Hechtman and Riggs abstain)

3

4 Chair Templeton: Ok well thank you for being willing to serve both of you and congratulations
5 Vice-Chair Roohparvar.

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: Do we have to have four? I thoughts that what it said.

8

9 Ms. Lee: Commissioner under... no, no.

10

11 Chair Templeton: That's an excellent question.

12

13 Ms. Lee: Under the procedural rules Commissioners who abstain are not disqualified vote with
14 the majority and the majority on that vote was the three. So, it's essentially your votes go with
15 the three who voted for Commissioner Roohparvar.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: Thanks for the clarification.

18

19 Chair Templeton: Thank you. Alright, any other business or is that the last item? Alright, then
20 the meeting is adjourned at 8:14.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10

Commission Action: Templeton elected Chair. Moved by Alcheck, seconded by Roohparvar. 7-0

unanimous.

Commission Action: Roohparvar elected Vice-Chair. Moved by Alcheck, seconded by Roohparvar. 5-2 (Alcheck, Roohparvar, Templeton in favor. Summa and Lauing against. Riggs and Hechtman abstained, which counts as a Yes vote per City Attorney)

Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements

Adjournment

8:14 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas and Reports are available online: <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

Vice-Chair Michael Alcheck
Commissioner Bart Hechtman
Commissioner Ed Lauing
Chair William Riggs
Commissioner Giselle Roohparvar
Commissioner Doria Summa
Commissioner Carolyn Templeton

Get Informed and Be Engaged!

View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto> or on Channel 26.

Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs, or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.