



Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: May 8, 2019

Council Chambers
250 Hamilton Avenue
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

6:03 pm

Chair Riggs absent

Vice-Chair Alcheck: [video started mid-sentence] order the 8th Planning and Transportation Commission meeting. We don't have a secretary so I'll just quickly call roll. [Note - called roll]

Oral Communications

The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

Vice-Chair Alcheck: I don't have any oral communications cards but if you're here to speak on any of the items just hand the card to Director Lait if you have one.

Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions

The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Are there any agenda changes, additions, or deletions Director Lait? Nope, ok.

City Official Reports

1. Assistant Directors Report, Meeting Schedule, and Assignments

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: And then do you want to do the Director's report quickly?

2 Mr. Jonathan Lait, Director of Planning: Yeah, I actually don't have much to report. There hasn't
3 been a lot of planning really activity in front of the City Council since our last meeting. But we
4 had passed out – maybe some of you had a chance to review this online already. On Monday
5 the City Council is going to discuss an evaluation of the Residential Permit Parking Program. And
6 maybe toward the end of our agenda in other sorts of announcements or future items we may
7 want to have a discussion about a comment in here about the Planning Commissioner roll in
8 possibly, it's a review of the programs. So, we don't have to talk about it now and we probably
9 can't have much of a conversation later but I think it's worth letting the Planning Commission
10 have a dialog.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: This is the Staff report?

13

14 Mr. Lait: That's correct.

15

16 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok.

17

18 Mr. Lait: Ok, so that's the main thing to report this evening. Thank you.

19

20 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 **Study Session**

3 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.1,3

4

5 2. Study Session: Chair Riggs and Vice Chair Alcheck Have Invited Evan Goldin to Make a
6 Presentation to the Planning and Transportation Commission (PTC) Regarding his
7 Experience with Innovative Parking Strategies; the Commission may Discuss a Variety
8 of Parking Solutions Following This Presentation.
9

10 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I am going to kick us off here with our study session. I am going to invite
11 Evan Goldin to approach. I'll give you a quick intro. It's unfortunate that Commissioner... Chair
12 Riggs isn't here today because as our Chair and as our transportation in house expert I think he
13 would have been excited to introduce this study topic. But really quickly for those members of
14 the public, this study session is... came about as an effort by our Chair, Commissioner Riggs, and
15 myself working to invite individuals to participate in a discussion with the Commissioners.
16 Basically, to give both the community, our Staff, and our Commission more exposure to things
17 that are happening in the planning environment that we might want to know about or
18 understand and somehow incorporate into our review of other items that come to us by way of
19 application.

20

21 Tonight's topic I think is one close to Chair Riggs's heart but our goal is to include or incorporate
22 opportunities to get more exposure to topics that sort of range everything from environmental
23 impact and housing needs and transportation solutions as well as parking innovations like the
24 one that we might hear about today.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ok so with that Evan Goldin is going to have... what I'd like to do is sort of – the idea here was
3 to have sort of a half an hour to have you present a little bit about this area of expertise you
4 have. Then I imagine that this can be sort of an informal question and answer process. I will use
5 the light ups to figure out who will go first but because we only have half an hour what I'll try to
6 do is give people somewhere between 3 a 5-minutes to ask questions. So that everybody can
7 ask and if you don't want to ask questions just let me know. Ok, does that work? Do you have a
8 presentation? Awesome. The floor is yours.

9

10 Mr. Evan Goldin: Great and I really appreciate the opportunity to speak here. Let me just full
11 screen this. Sorry, it's cut off on it. Oh, there we go. Alright, I really appreciate the opportunity
12 to be here tonight and I do promise to keep this short. I have my own Menlo Park Complete
13 Streets Commission meeting at 7:00 so you won't be hearing from me for too long.

14

15 But very excited to be here to talk about what I'm doing here today because what I'm doing
16 today really started here from Palo Alto. I grew up here, I went to Pally, one of my first summer
17 jobs after high school was actually working for the Public Works Department here in this
18 building... well actually, not in this building but over on Bayshore. Doing the initial data study
19 for what is now the Residential Permit Parking Program in downtown Palo Alto. Literally waking
20 up at 4:00 am in the morning, driving down the street counting every single car on every single

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 block and figuring out what the impact was going to be of a Residential Permit Parking Program.
2 So, you could say my interest in parking really started here and has yet to end. Hopefully, it
3 never will.

4
5 Just a little bit of background I joined Lyft, what was then Zimride, in 2012. I was the first
6 product manager there, I stayed there for about 3 ½-years designing the app, figuring out how
7 the service worked, how we scale, sort of spent a lot of time working in transportation and
8 building technology to improve mobility and how people get to places. More recently left there
9 and product management at a company called Chariot that you've may be familiar with. It was
10 an on-demand shuttle service that had a number of routes around the Bay Area. Unfortunately,
11 was shuttered about a month and a half ago, 2-years after we were acquired by Ford. But I've
12 spent a lot of time thinking about this and a lot of my interests really came down to parking.

13
14 This slide is about my interest but also about what I know you guys do every time you meet.
15 Every new development that's proposed parking is a hot topic, to say the least, and many
16 developments come down to parking. The next couple of slides will likely recap things you
17 already know but very many... very often the developments you guys review and adapt and
18 work with developers in the community on parking one of the big sources of frustration. I am
19 well aware of that and we'll get into kind of how we're helping that but I wanted to kind of
20 frame the issue a little bit. Most... you know I watch Planning Commissions here, elsewhere,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 everywhere, and generally; developers want lower parking requirements that helps their
2 developments pencil out and allows them to make development more profitable and ensure
3 that they can actually build it but in many cases neighbors want the opposite. Neighbors want
4 more on onsite parking, they want to minimize the overflow onto their streets, and ensure that
5 that new apartment building down the street isn't going to make it harder when their friends
6 and family and loved ones come to visit their home. So as a result, a lot of projects either... you
7 know I'm sure the projects you see either don't pencil out or end up with too much parking.

8
9 This was talked about a lot last year at City Council but the City of Palo Alto paid for a
10 consultant to come and do an analysis on parking utilization at a number of apartment
11 buildings around town. They did a study of these nine apartment complexes that are already
12 constructed, some of them have been around for quite a while, and tried to understand what
13 the parking utilization actually looks like. You know they hear a lot from neighbors, the
14 neighbors come to speak at these meetings and say this new development really needs more
15 parking. And the City wanted to find out well what's happened with these developments. So,
16 and this may be rehashing data. If you guys attended the City Council meeting, apologize. If it
17 came before Planning, I couldn't recall but, in many cases, we are over-parked at these
18 developments. That's not a good outcome. That means that the developer spent too much
19 money building parking and rents are likely higher as a result.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 It means that we have missed the opportunity to get parking right and these developments
2 across a number of different types. The first three you see are all affordable, the mid three are
3 market rate and the last three are focused on seniors. So, the parking rates vary wildly but this
4 is... this was a study that the consultant did at peak hours so typically weekday, late evening.
5 Even at the peak hours, there was extra parking capacity so what I've started to look at is what
6 we can do with that. And in addition, a lot of these developments and some of the ones they
7 looked at where not necessarily in commercial areas but we see a lot of developments where
8 during the day time the commercial lot down the street is packed and the residences is very
9 empty. And then late at night, we see the opposite, the commercial property has very low
10 utilization and the residential properties have very high utilization. We are trying to help figure
11 out a way to really bridge that gap. On my bike ride over here, I took a swing by a number of
12 developments downtown, 101 Alma, there's was a larger one on Bryant, all in kind of
13 downtown north area. It was about 30 to 40 percent utilization I saw at every single one. So,
14 despite this feeling that we need more parking, that we need a new parking garage, all these
15 things, capacity is there it just needs to be utilized. So, I'll tell you kind of how we try to do that.

16
17 As policymakers you have a toolbox, right? There are things that you can do to try to affect
18 these outcomes. Generally, if we want to have better utilization, we want to try to discourage
19 on-street parking and encourage better utilization of off-street parking. I took a trip to Japan
20 last year and it was a fascinating experience filled with far too many times of me just

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 photographing parking garages. But it was... oh sorry, let me jump ahead. It was fascinating in
2 its contrast to the Bay Area. In Japan, street parking is generally illegal in the entire country.
3 Very different mindset about parking that California, then the United States, and the result of
4 that is also really interesting. So, this is a photo of just your typical kind of apartment building in
5 Kyoto and this company, bobo park, adorably named, was everywhere. And what's happened is
6 because street parking is illegal there's such a demand for off-street parking that in a lot of
7 Japan, they don't have the concept of retaining private parking just for the residents. Parking is
8 open to whoever wants to pay for it; whether that person is a resident, contractor, a neighbor,
9 someone visiting an office down the street. It's very open and it changed how the streets are
10 built there. So, I'm not sure that's the outcome we want here, I don't think it is, but it's
11 certainly an interesting extreme example of how really strongly discouraging street parking has
12 resulted in very different off-street parking behavior.

13
14 So, I wanted to kind of think about how this could be applied here. I know in Palo Alto and in
15 most of California and the United States we do not want random people coming and parking
16 without our garage, with elevator access to our buildings, stairwell access. So, that's one of the
17 main things that has prevented a lot of this better utilization. This place like the Marc or any of
18 these buildings builds their parking lot, assigns there parking to residents, and there it remains.
19 It is that residents parking and nothing else is generally going to happen to that parking during

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the day, at night what have you. So that's one of the reasons that we have these overflow
2 problems is because all this parking has been assigned out and nothing happens to it otherwise.

3

4 So, we're introducing a new concept here so what we want to do... we recognize that most
5 buildings don't want random people coming and parking. That could be a policy that is pursued,
6 that could be something a building could bring up but we know in general most buildings have
7 security concerns and valid ones and want to limit parking to people they're comfortable with.

8 So, we're building a new technology that will actually allow people... allows buildings to do
9 exactly that. It allows them to curate a custom list of who's allowed to park on site and let
10 those people share underutilized parking. So, if you're a resident living at the Marc you go to
11 work from 8:00 am to 6:00 pm you would be able to rent your parking space out to someone
12 the building trusts. It may not be a random member of the public but it may be someone who
13 works at the Marc or it may be a contractor. It may be your neighbors' nanny but the idea is if
14 the building is comfortable with that person that we want them to be able to utilize that under-
15 utilized parking spot and not park on the street.

16

17 So, the who... how big that kind of network is, how widely the building wants to cast that net
18 totally up to them. We've talked to some buildings that are really only comfortable residents
19 themselves, don't even want the nannies asking for parking. They want residents to do
20 everything and they want it to do on someone else's behalf if needed. Other buildings have

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 kind of a wider... they're more open to this. Maybe they don't... it's the kind of building that
2 doesn't have a gate on their garage so they're already kind of having people walking around.
3 They can allow guests to book directly and in kind of a more... this is kind of a new use case but
4 an even more welcoming use case. We're starting to have some conversations with buildings
5 that have employees either in the building, it might be a mixed-use building, or they have
6 employees that work down the street or nearby or perhaps an employer that the building
7 owner has a relationship with and they want to open that parking up to those employees. That
8 would be something that they could do as well. So, here's kind of an example scenario is 8:45
9 Romana Street is a residence and they could partner with downtown Palo Alto KinderCare as
10 well as the Palo Alto History Museum and allow those employees... and again just those
11 employees at least for now, do park in their building. They'd have to figure out access, there's a
12 lot of questions around that that we work through. Some of these buildings don't have access
13 issues, again some don't have gates at all, but for those that do we work with them to make
14 sure that those other companies would get garage door openers or what have you to kind of
15 work through those issues.

16
17 There's a lot of good that can come from this. First and for most is cheaper housing. We, I'm
18 sure as you guys know, we have a housing crisis here. There are many ways to tackle that. One
19 is making more money off the unit that you rent or that you own. So, if you're living in a condo
20 in downtown Palo Alto and your mortgage or your HOA is just getting too expensive. Being able

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to make another couple hundred dollars a month from renting your parking space out to
2 people that your building trusts is a way for you to be able to stay in that unit longer. And so,
3 we're excited about being able to help people make a little bit more money from the housing
4 they pay for today. We've also heard from a lot of people that they like the community aspect
5 of this. People have told us they are meeting people that they never... even people within the
6 same building that they never knew their name, they kind of knew their face but finally, they
7 can connect the dots. And when they are in the elevator together, they say hey Joe, thanks for
8 that parking space last week and we start to build bonds and that's been really great to see.

9

10 Lastly, I think the third biggest is that this helps put opportunity cost on your parking spot and
11 we would like more people to be walking and biking and taking a scooter, what have you but
12 it's hard when that car is sitting in your parking spot. And there's not really a reason to get rid
13 of it, right? Its paid off the car, you're parking spot is bundled with your apartment, why not
14 keep it? Well, if you can start to make a couple hundred a month from that spot and the more
15 it's empty, the more you make. That puts a bit of an opportunity cost on keeping that car and
16 that's a way to encourage these residents to start ditching their automobiles. So that's been a
17 great win as well.

18

19 Lastly and I'm coming to the end. Another thing that's great about this kind of unifying all types
20 of parking. So, there are all kinds of different slices of parking that residential buildings have.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 They may have dedicated guest parking, they may have assigned parking to residents, they
2 have Staff parking that goes unused at night because they just don't really know what to do
3 with it, they may have or they do have parking tied to vacant units. Right, when a rental unit is...
4 as someone moves out there's typically a span of weeks or months... actually, the unit below
5 me right now is sitting empty and the parking space is sitting empty right in downtown Menlo
6 Park. That's a wasted opportunity for someone else that could be parking off street. So, this is a
7 mobile app that allows you to book all of these types of parking and we're getting into EV
8 parking as well; which is an interesting use case. Something we're talking to the Marc about of
9 if there are increasing numbers of Tesla owners in buildings that actually don't have chargers in
10 their own spots. So, our app becomes a way for people to share. You know it could be six
11 electric vehicles and two chargers in the same building and try to hopefully ensure some
12 fairness. Also maybe cover the cost of the electricity, that kind of thing. That's it. Hopefully... I
13 think I made it through pretty fast.

14

15 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I have like a thousand things [unintelligible](interrupted)

16

17 Mr. Goldin: You're going to have to keep it to a few.

18

19 Vice-Chair Alcheck: But what I'd like to is anyone if anybody wants to light up to be first that
20 would be great. No takers? Alright, I'll throw a question out there. We hear a lot about this

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 concept or I've heard a lot about this concept of sort of decoupling parking. What is... can...
2 what is... from your perspective does that help or hurt the... I guess the path towards looking at
3 parking differently?

4

5 Mr. Goldin: Yeah, I would... generally, it's going to be... if your goal is better utilization of
6 parking, the more you can put an opportunity cost on that spot the better it's going to be utilized.
7 So today we see a lot of... my own apartment, it's a bundled parking spot. I don't pay separately
8 for it and if I had to pay \$100 \$150 a month, I might reconsider that and decide to ditch my
9 automobile and do something different. So, decoupling that decision of renting that apartment
10 or buying that condo from do I actually want to store a vehicle in this spot month after month is
11 really helpful and important when it comes to better utilization of parking. And that gives the
12 landlord the ability to really maximize usage. If you take... certainly even one of these buildings
13 that have been around for 30-years and they start doing that. That could put say you have a
14 building that has 100 parking spots and all of a sudden, they start unbundling and charging
15 \$100 a month. The building itself may get ten to fifteen parking spots back under their control
16 and they can then do things with that. They could decide let's use this app and give spots to the
17 building next door, let's have our Staff park on site rather than on the street, those kinds of
18 things. So, I think generally it's a good thing.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: So, I'll... I mean while I wait for someone light up. It's interesting because I
2 think we have... as Commissioners, we have to sort of look at that idea of unbundling parking
3 but also, we have to recognize that if you, for example, I think I'm... this is antidotal which I
4 don't love to rely on. But I think there are tenants in our downtown for example who's parking
5 is unbundled and is charged as a separate rate. And for them, they forgo the interior parking
6 and use the street instead because it has there is no cost associated with is. So, I think as we
7 start to look... as communities like ours start to look at those ideas we have to understand the
8 framework. So, I think the idea of unbundling parking which sort of lends itself to better
9 utilization there's a City component to that.

10

11 Mr. Goldin: Yeah.

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: The City also has to create an incentive for people not to go ok, well I'm
14 going to pay \$150 for the spot under downstairs. I'll just park across the street in front of my
15 neighbor's house.

16

17 Mr. Goldin: One of the things that I'd reiterate too is you know you look at this parking data and
18 its been... for many of these buildings, it's been decades since they were built. And you have
19 the ability as Planning Commissioners to set guidelines or set rules that can really encourage or
20 even enforce buildings or developers to make sure they're maximizing usage of their parking lot

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 after it's built. One thing I want to instill is the job of... your tool kit doesn't end when the
2 building is built. If you can add stipulations if you can make sure that you are doing your best to
3 get that new building to maximize its usage of its parking after it's built that's a really good
4 thing. Whether that's requiring unbundling, encouraging them to use some kind of technology
5 like this or I believe part of the changes the Council made last year where allowing residential
6 buildings and commercial buildings to share parking requirements. Things like that. There are
7 ways that you can better utilize parking far after the building is built because the worse... I
8 shouldn't say the worse but a bad outcome is 30-years later the building, even at peak
9 demand... the peak demand point of the week the building has 40 percent of their parking spots
10 empty.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Waldfogel.

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: Great, thank you. Just look at my notes here. So, thanks for coming
15 tonight, I actually appreciate you're coming to us early with a platform idea since the City
16 sometimes has trouble keeping track of what's going on and platforms get ahead of policy. So, I
17 think this gives us a chance to think about policy implications.

18

19 And I generally agree with your tenant of discouraging on-street parking so I think that's a good
20 goal. I'm not 100 percent sure that your platform leads in that direction. I can give you some

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 counterexamples but it's an intriguing goal. I'm also... I believe somebody did an at base
2 residential park sharing application a couple of years ago that failed and it sounds like you are
3 aiming more at multi-family than at single-family. And I don't really remember the details of
4 why that... of why that platform failed but yeah, I think it's in the big picture going after multi-
5 family buildings may be a better place to go. Again, I mean I think this is a policy question that
6 we, City Council, other people need to take up.

7

8 In that framework, this may slightly be a question for Staff but if a parking space is required can
9 the landlord... does the landlord... so let me just walk through a couple of scenarios. Does the
10 landlord have the discretion to rent that out to some secondary use for some part of the day? Is
11 that something that would be legally permissible? Does it need a new framework or I mean is
12 that something we have to take up as a policy question?

13

14 Mr. Jonathan Lait, Director of Planning: I think this is certainly introducing us into to some new
15 sort of ways...

16

17 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic]

18

19 Mr. Lait: Yeah no but I mean this... we have standards for shared parking and how we do that.

20 And so, our code, the way it's set up and again it's been... I don't know if the Parking Standard

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 has been updated in any recent timeframe other than our recent changes to reducing the
2 number of parking spaces. But our code I think is pretty clear that when you have required
3 parking to serve a use or a building, that's intended to be used by that user or that building
4 unless there's extra parking or if there was some previously approved shared parking
5 agreement.

6

7 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok so that's an area where we would potentially have to take up.

8

9 Mr. Lait: Some policy.

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, some policy things and what about the flip side of that. What if
12 a space is assigned to a tenant, would this just be a matter between... a lease matter on
13 whether the tenant has the right to sublease that space or not or would there be any policy
14 question attached to that?

15

16 Mr. Lait: Yeah that one I'd probably want to check in with our legal counsel a little bit more to
17 understand about the City's role, if any, in sort of that situation.

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, ok, so it just sounds like these are areas where there may be
20 policy intersections. So, I appreciate your coming and raising some of these points to us early.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Yeah and I think there's a whole bunch of other... flawed questions to that but I think they're
2 more contractual than legal and policy so I'll table those.

3

4 Mr. Goldin: I guess the only thing I'd add on to that is if a developer is here and you're talking
5 over parking numbers. A question I would encourage you guys to ask is what will you be doing
6 to make sure this parking that you're going to build is actually utilized as much as possible? I
7 think that would be a helpful question to ask.

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, well let's say you know it's a fair question. There's actually a
10 hazard... I mean something else that I think we would want to do if these things were to
11 happen is to set up a registry so we know what's happening and how frequently it's happening.
12 Because one thing that would be good to understand is if unbundled parking led to rent
13 increases. If landlords said to tenants hey you can participate in these platforms, you're going
14 to generate \$400 a month of revenue, I want \$200 of that, I think we should at least be aware
15 of those kinds of policy implications or if this is pushing tenants to say I've got an RPP permit,
16 I'm just going to rent out my space and go park on the street. I think we'd want to understand
17 those kinds of policy implications. These are just things that we'd want to be tracking so I mean
18 I think if these kinds of platforms were to emerge I think that we'd... I suspect that we'd want
19 some kind of registry, some kind of information sharing but I don't know what that would look
20 like.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think there's crossover too, this idea of shared utilization. I was just
3 reading an article about RVs using new space I think in East Palo Alto and I thought about
4 broadly the discussion that's coming... that will continue to come before us about Cubberley. I
5 thought when we see that discussion is that an opportunity for us as a Planning Commission or
6 a community or Planning Department or Transportation Department to talk about should
7 Cubberley be designed in a way that it could host overnight RV parking for those members of
8 our community that are in RVs and are on the street? For example, we wanted to provide them
9 with a safer place. So, I think these ideas of... maybe it's built for one purpose but it's used for
10 multiple purposes of members of our community is something we can start thinking broadly.
11 Ok, I have a light from Commissioner Summa. And by the way, the questions don't have to be
12 directed at Evan, they could be directed at Jonathan or anybody really. These are very broad.

13

14 Commissioner Summa: So, thank you very much for coming here tonight and these kinds of
15 parking solutions are obviously things that we want to think about and contemplate. I'm not
16 sure if you're coming this evening... I'm a little confused and I didn't know what the specific
17 topic was going to be the way that it was agendize. If you encouraging the use of your app, your
18 company's app or your encouraging policies that would make it easier to use your app? That's a
19 little up in the air for me. I think a lot of... you know there are places in the City we don't want
20 to encourage people to park on the street because they are heavily impacted and where we

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 have RPP already. We also have a policy currently that I think is pretty important, we have
2 onsite parking for residential uses, and that's a safety and convenience policy. When you think
3 about people coming home late at night or people with several young children, bags of
4 groceries, they want to be parked... they want to be as close to their front door as possible. So,
5 like my colleagues, it's intriguing to think about how we can make these things work. I'm not
6 sure I quite agree with your interpretation of our recent Fehr and Peers study. I think it didn't
7 show those kinds of surpluses and I antidotally did not notice those surpluses. I went out at
8 peak... and looked at all the buildings except one I couldn't get into at like 2:00 and 3:00 in the
9 morning. So, I didn't really notice that and then it seems like a legal issue. Incidentally, I know...
10 I think this is going on already. I mean I have no objection. If somebody has an extra parking
11 spot, especially in a garage, as long as they are following the other laws in any residential
12 neighborhood. It's... I assume this happens informally just like people rent out rooms
13 informally.

14

15 Mr. Goldin: Yeah, very much.

16

17 Commissioner Summa: And so, I assume what you would like your app to do is do it on a much
18 larger scale. And I think for anyone who has a secure parking spot, regardless of whether it's a
19 renter or a homeowner, I think that's different than encouraging a multi-family property owner
20 or manager where there was shared parking unassigned to all of a sudden sell it out from under

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 people. And I don't know how that... it seems very complicated to maintain that relationship
2 when the needs of different tenants will be very different. So, antidotally just last night I toured
3 one of our ... for something else with one of our subsidized housing projects and its family... it's
4 more... it's 1, 2 and 3-bedroom but more family. And just last night the manager, since this
5 place... this particular site opened, said they really – they're in an RPP district and they really
6 like it, the tenants. Because she said when a family... when the kids get to be teenagers and
7 they get cars then they don't have enough parking spots than what they are currently assigned.
8 So, I think anything we can do to expedite and optimize the use of parking spots where it
9 doesn't hurt residents or reduce their ability to enjoy life in the region the way same... some...
10 everybody does. And not using a car to commute or on a daily basis is easy for some but very
11 difficult for others. So those are my initial thoughts and thank you very much for coming out
12 tonight.

13

14 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Lauing, anything?

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I had one quick question that is related to what Commissioner
17 Waldfogel asked. I think I get your business plan although not the numbers. That's up to you
18 but I'm not quite sure about the intersections with the City. So, my question is what could
19 people do now? I mean if it's true that the Marc has got plenty of extra space and they decide

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to lease these things out on market days. Can they do that right now or is that constrained,
2 Jonathan?

3

4 Mr. Lait: Well I think that this kind of ties into the second question (interrupted)

5

6 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, it does.

7

8 Mr. Lait: That Commissioner Waldfoegel had asked and I think my response to that was I want to
9 consult with our legal counsel to understand that in any kind of detail. It sounds like there's a
10 relationship between the tenant of the building or the tenants in the building and whatever the
11 third-party form is. So, I don't have an answer for you on that but it's a curious question and on
12 that sort of reflects the fact that these things change quickly and our codes don't. And the
13 policy discussion supporting that change in code also is an area that lags behind some times.

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: There's nothing sort of remarkable about the problem definition which
16 is that various places at various times of day or night there is unused parking. No question
17 about that. It's just the interface and what hoops we'd have to go through to even at least test
18 market some of this stuff. So, I take your answer just kind of confer with legal on that. That's all.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think one of the interesting things that we can think about is that even if
2 we don't reduce parking standards let's say and we continue to maintain our parking standards.
3 Do we elevate other problems by still creating a policy that encourages property owners to still
4 better utilize it? I mean there's some... that's a... it's an interesting idea. Even if they don't...
5 even if we don't buy into the reduction and you go look, you're right next to this office building
6 and they don't have any parking. Maybe there's a cost-benefit analysis where we can say well if
7 you partner with this office building that's tremendously under parked the Planning
8 Department can provide you with some other benefit. I don't know. It's interesting... not
9 necessarily Shoop or whatever this parking app is called because this really isn't an
10 endorsement really of your business but just the idea that there may be solutions out there
11 that we can start to think about that could solve problems that are out there. Ok, I have a light
12 from Commissioner Roohparvar.

13

14 Commissioner Roohparvar: Thank you for coming out here today. I really appreciate learning all
15 about how this works. I think it's a really interesting idea. I had a question, what do you do with
16 secured buildings? How does that work? Does the landlord than just give extra parking or
17 garage door openers?

18

19 Mr. Goldin: It depends. So, if there's... things are very different if there's a gate and not a gate.
20 If there is a gate and honestly most of the buildings, we're working with to start have a gate.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The app is really being used for friends, family, contractors, that are coming to visit someone
2 who lives there. So, if I'm... you know I live in a building in downtown Palo Alto and my
3 contractor is coming from 10:00 to god knows when and they need a place to park. This... I
4 would use the app to see if one of my neighbors has a spot they can use and I would go... you
5 know I'm going to be home, letting them in, helping them, showing them where my unit is so
6 I'm going to go open the garage for them and show them where to park. That's kind of
7 (interrupted)

8

9 Commissioner Roohparvar: I see.

10

11 Mr. Goldin: Our initial use case.

12

13 Commissioner Roohparvar: And my only comment, not to be a Debbi downer on this, but it's
14 more of like how would this work from a liability standpoint because if you're now allowing
15 somebody else to come and park. That, to a degree, makes you responsible for their actions I
16 would think on the property and expands insurance liabilities. I'm not sure this is settled in the
17 law but it's just something to think about in terms of liability.

18

19 Mr. Goldin: Yeah, I mean I would say...

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Roohparvar: That's all.

2

3 Mr. Goldin: Yeah, you know you could easily text your neighbor, ask the same question, get a
4 yes, park them in their spot and still have the same questions. We... and the State of California
5 has a lot of requirements around minimum liability and insurance and all those kinds of things.
6 So, where there an incident to happen, everybody should be covered. The building also, I forget
7 what exactly the requirements are but most buildings also have to carry liability policies. So, the
8 parties involved should already be covered and we're just trying to make something that may
9 happen today with a lot of difficulty, a lot easier. In the same way of 10-years ago you may have
10 gotten to the airport by texting a friend. Now you open your Lyft or Uber app and go that way.
11 There are certainly liability issues there when accidents happen and you kind of sort them out
12 over time but it's a thing that kind of use to happen under the radar and now happens in a
13 much easier way.

14

15 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright I don't see any other lights. I just want to thank you for coming. I
16 think one of the things that we should continue to do as a team here, as a Commission is
17 information share. And I think if... now that we've sort of done one of these study sessions their
18 lots of areas... just listening to you talk I was thinking about the parking lifts and how many
19 times we hear about whether or not those are working or not working. And if I knew how to get
20 ahold of a parking lift operator who would be willing to come here and tell us more about it and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 sort of defending on some of the ideas. I think that would be a good session too for us but I
2 want to thank you for coming. I really appreciate it. I know Chair Riggs is... would have like to
3 have been here and I'm sure he would have appreciated the conversation too. And thank you
4 for sharing with us (interrupted)

5

6 Mr. Goldin: For sure.

7

8 Vice-Chair Alcheck: A little glimpse into something that you're doing to solve parking. And I
9 want to encourage any of you to have a contact or an idea for a study session to reach out to
10 Billy... to Commissioner Riggs, excuse me, to Chair Riggs and let him know because I think he's
11 interested in having one of these every couple... every month or every couple of months. Ok, I'll
12 get you. (interrupted)

13

14 Mr. Goldin: Great, thank you, Commissioners.

15

16 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Good luck your [unintelligible -crosstalk].

17

18 Mr. Goldin: I appreciate the opportunity.

19

20 Commissioner Roohparvar: Thank you for coming out.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Thanks again for coming.

Commission Action: No formal action was taken by the Commission.

Action Items

Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

- 3. Review and Recommendation to Finance Committee and the City Council on Proposed 2020-2024 Capital Improvement Plan and Comprehensive Plan Compliance

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Let’s move swiftly onto our action item which is to review and potentially make a recommendation to the Finance Committee and to the City Council on this immense budget. For those who haven’t participated in this process before, one of the things our Staff does is they sort of outline the items that are different from last year under the assumption that we wouldn’t necessarily spend as much time on items from last year. But really any item in this budget is... if you have questions about it or comments please feel free to raise them and does... Staff has a report so we’ll let them start. Ms. Moitra would you kick us off?

Mr. Jonathan Lait, Director of Planning: Yeah so Chitra is our planner with our department and she’ll give the presentation and I’ll just caution the Commission before you get excited that there’s a lot of members of the public in the audience. There are public folks out there but they are also City employees.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Actually, do we have any speaker cards?

Mr. Lait: I don't think we do except for Mary. Mary do you want to speak on the issue?

Ms. Mary [note- no last name]: [unintelligible – spoke from the audience]

Mr. Lait: You sure?

Ms. Mary [note – no last name]: (speaking from the audience) Yeah, thank you.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright. So, they're here for questions?

Mr. Lait: You can reserve the right.

Ms. Mary [note – no last name]: (speaking from the audience) Ok.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Director Lait, just to be clear, they're here to answer questions on
(interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Yes, that's right.

2

3 Vice-Chair Alcheck: And are they specific to the 13 new items?

4

5 Mr. Lait: I think it's... any question that you could possibly ask [unintelligible](interrupted)

6

7 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Got it, alright well there you go.

8

9 Mr. Lait: Probably answered this evening.

10

11 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Take us away, please.

12

13 Ms. Chitra Moitra: Good evening Commissioners. I'm Chitra Moitra, planner, long-range
14 planning section. Tonight, Staff requests the Planning and Transportation Commission to review
15 the 13 new Capital Improvement Projects for consistence with the Comprehensive Plan and
16 forward the findings to the Finance Committee and the City Council.

17

18 So, every year the City departments identifies new CIPs based on the City's infrastructure needs
19 and City Council's priorities. This year we have 13 such new CIPs which are included in the
20 Capital Budget Book. These new ones are reviewed by the Commission every year and Section

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 19.04.040 of the Palo Alto Municipal Code describes PTC's roll in reviewing this new CIPs. First
2 PTC should review these CIPs for Comprehensive Plan consistency. They can comment on
3 individual projects, they can suggest improvements, increase efficiency in the process, and
4 thirdly they can also identify new projects which seem to be missing from this year's list to be
5 included in the following year.

6
7 So, this year we have followed the same pattern of analysis which we do for previous years
8 come CIPs. We link each new CIP with the Comprehensive Plan Element, the goal, a policy, and
9 if a program is applicable. We also add to the new CIPs both Commission reviews which are
10 required and if any environmental reviews is required.

11
12 So, this year we have 210 Capital Improvement Projects in the CIP book of which I already 13 is
13 new. So, like previous years we will be focusing our analysis only on the new CIPs and the rest
14 197 remained CIPs have already been reviewed by the PTC years before.

15
16 The next slide shows that the major... the most important commonly [unintelligible] element
17 which is the Safety Element. Six of the CIPs are aligned with that and followed by the Natural
18 Environment Element and the Land Use Element. The next slide shows... well for the slide
19 before the... in the Safety Element Goal S2 which is on natural hazards and fire mitigations.
20 That's the most commonly quoted goal.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

For the next slide, this one, the... we have summarized the CIP budget and how much of the budget is invested by element. So, as we can see more than half, 52 percent of the 2020 Capital Budget, is invested in projects which align with the Natural Environment Element.

So here are some pictures of some of the important CIPs out this year. As you can see that all the CIPs have... are in compliance with the Comprehensive Plan 2030 and Staff requests that the Commission finds this and approves the findings for the Finance Committee and the City Council. So, this concludes my Staff presentation and I think we have Staff here from every department ready to answer your questions.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Ms. Moitra and thank you all for coming. We'll try to have one question for every single... no. Ok, let's use the lights, everyone. I have Commissioner Lauing, you want to kick us off?

Commissioner Lauing: Is this strictly for questions or can we (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Alcheck: This... you can make a comment or question (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: I was going to suggest (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Hold on, hold on, I will just say real quickly for clarification. At one point if we wish to make a recommendation, we'll need a motion.

MOTION

Commissioner Lauing: I was going to suggest that we start with a motion just so that's what we're discussing. So, I would move to recommend to Finance Committee and City Council that the proposed 20 to 24 Capital Improvement Projects are consistent with the Comprehensive Plan 2030.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Do I have a second?

SECOND

Commissioner Waldfogel: I'll second.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Waldfogel seconds? Commissioner on the floor would you like to speak now?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, just speak. We have seen a lot of these in prior years. Thanks again
2 to Staff and City Managers out there to kind of go through it for us in advance. Glad that the
3 emphasis is on taking care of our citizens and excuse me, fire and health and police and all that.
4 That's a very solid priority. There's also, excuse me, reasonable pushing out as priorities change
5 and that's kind of sad but it's also just good management. Priorities change, things have to be
6 coordinated to be cheaper. Two years from now, because something else is changing that
7 makes sense, so again a salute to all the managers that make those accommodations. When I
8 was Parks [note – Parks and Recreation Commission] I did... I was on a subcommittee for CIPs
9 for many years and it's very hard to come up with a document like this even on the new ones.
10 It's just great work. I went through all of the ones from Parks [note – Parks and Recreation
11 Commission], Daren's here tonight. Also, thank you... made some adjustments, pushed some
12 things out that we pushed out 5-years and we're still pushing out but again that's what has to
13 be done to make this thing all work. So, I congratulate him on that.

14

15 I just had one detailed question and that's when you phase in... I presume you phase in the
16 vehicle and equipment replacement over 5-years? Whoever's in charge of that one. Do you
17 have a budget by year and it phases in?

18

19 Mr. Lait: Vehicle replacement? Whose got vehicle replacement?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Lauing: Do you do like 20 percent one year and 20 percent the next year which
2 is what I've presumed?

3

4 Mr. Paul Harper: Is this one on? No.

5

6 [note – unknown female:] Yep.

7

8 Mr. Harper: Paul Harper with the Office of Management and Budget. So, the vehicle
9 replacement program essentially there is a replacement schedule for all of the vehicles. So,
10 when they come up in terms of their end of life-based on usually mileage, they are
11 programmed in for that year to be replaced. So, there's basically a cohort of vehicles every year
12 that gets added in and then once we get to that year, usually the year prior to the replacement,
13 is really kind of drilled into to make sure that those vehicles are still the ones that need to be
14 replaced. And they adjust it based on maybe this one doesn't need to be replaced because it
15 has some life left and they'll move stuff up and move stuff out.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: Good. More good judgment, like it, thank you.

18

19 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Actually, I have a quick question. Are those vehicles sold or what do you do
20 with our... like actually that would apply to the defibrillator and the cardiac monitors and the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 thermal imagining and the jaws of life. Do you guys... if they are at the end of their useful life do
2 they go to communities that maybe can't afford those things? What do you guys do with all the
3 old equipment?

4
5 Mr. Harper: I'll let the Fire Chief speak to the fire equipment. The vehicles themselves, I believe
6 if they have some useful life left, we try to sell them. Particularly fire vehicles, we've sold them
7 to WOHACA [note – sounds like] and I think it's done through a donation. The police vehicles
8 I'm not sure if we sell them or they get salvaged. I think we get some salvaged price back on
9 them and so that's used to offset some of the costs of replacing the new vehicles.

10
11 Vice-Chair Alcheck: From the [unintelligible]. Ok, thank you

12
13 Mr. Harper: Do you want the Fire Chief to speak about the...?

14
15 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Not necessarily, I can ask him offline. Ok, are there any other comments of
16 Commissioners? I'd like to mention something before we take a vote on this.

17
18 Commissioner Summa: (off mic) Does Asher [note – Commissioner Waldfoegel] want to speak on
19 [unintelligible]?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Asher [note – Commissioner Waldfogel] do you want to speak to your
2 second before we vote?

3

4 Commissioner Waldfogel: I just want to thank Staff for a very thorough analysis. I actually have
5 one question for you. This pie chart, is this percentage relative all CIPs or to new this year?

6

7 Ms. Moitra: (off mic) All CIPs.

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok so that's interesting that 52 percent of all CIPs are in the Natural
10 Environment category? That surprises me a little bit. That's good news.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok a comment from Commissioner Summa.

13

14 Commissioner Summa: Thank you. I just wanted to thank Staff. This is like a weighty tomb
15 [note -sounds like] and I just think it represents so much work across so many departments.

16 And just for our huge TV viewing audience, this is the Capital Improvement Budget and I did
17 look at it pretty... I've looked at the whole thing and I just... it's just an impressive piece of work.

18

19 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok I don't see any more lights so before we take a vote, let me just double
20 check. Anybody else want to make any comments?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Roohparvar: I had a question.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok.

Commissioner Roohparvar: It's not (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Roohparvar.

Commissioner Roohparvar: Yeah, it's just a process question for you. Thank you for the presentation. Since I'm new this year I kind of want to understand how it works from a process perspective so 197 that were outstanding from the prior years. Do we not get to them or why... do they roll over? How does that work?

Ms. Moitra: So, these are continuing CIPs meaning these CIPs have been either introduced either 3 or 4-years before. So, every year the new CIPs are reviewed by the PTC so these have already been reviewed before so these are continuing CIPs.

Commissioner Roohparvar: Ok but they're going to get down the old ones this year?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Moitra: Yes, yes.

2

3 Commissioner Roohparvar: Oh ok.

4

5 Commissioner Lauing: [unintelligible – off mic]

6

7 Ms. Moitra: Not necessarily this year.

8

9 Commissioner Roohparvar: In 5-years?

10

11 Ms. Moitra: So, this (interrupted)

12

13 Commissioner Roohparvar: Oh, they have 5-years to get done.

14

15 Ms. Moitra: So, they have 5-years to get done.

16

17 Commissioner Roohparvar: Ok I just want to make sure I know for my own understanding how
18 these works. Thank you.

19

20 VOTE

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok all those in favor of supporting the motion on the floor please raise your hand. Ok, that’s unanimous support for the motion on the floor with one absent and that concludes our discussion on this item. Thank you all for attending. If any of you need a copy of the CIP, we have six up here probably.

MOTION PASSED 6(Lauing, Rookparvar, Alcheck, Templeton, Summa, Waldfogel)-0 -1(Riggs absent)

[note- many people started talking at once off mic]

Vice-Chair Alcheck: We will leave the copies with our... any unused copies you don’t want to take you can leave with Director Lait. He will make sure to recycle them.

[note – many people started talking at once off mic]

[The Commission moved to Commissioner Questions, Comments, or Announcements]

Commission Action: Motion to approve staff’s recommendation made by Commissioner Lauing, Seconded by Commissioner Waldfogel. Motion Passed 6-0 (Riggs absent)

Approval of Minutes

Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 4. March 27, 2019 Draft PTC Meeting Minutes

2 5. April 10, 2019 Draft PTC Meeting Minutes

3

4 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Unless someone has something in particular about one of the two meetings,

5 I would accept a motion for approval of the minutes for both meetings.

6

7 MOTION

8

9 Commissioner Summa: I'll make that motion.

10

11 SECOND

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Second.

14

15 VOTE

16

17 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok so I have a motion from Commissioner Summa and a second from

18 Commissioner Lauing to approve the meeting minutes from our March 27th and our April 10th

19 meetings from this year. All those in favor please raise your hand? That's a unanimous vote for

20 that approval with one absent and moving on.

21

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 MOTION PASSED 6(Lauing, Roohparvar, Alcheck, Templeton, Summa, Waldfogel) -0 -1(Riggs
2 absent)

3

4 **Commission Action:** Motion to approve meeting minutes made by Commissioner Summa,
5 seconded by Commissioner Lauing. Motion passed 6-0 (Riggs absent).

6

7 **Committee Items**

8 Vice-Chair Alcheck: We don't have any Committee items.

9

10 [The Commission moved to Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements]

11 **Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements**

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: So, what... yeah so before we go to the minutes let me just ask. I actually
14 haven't had a chance to read this but Commissioner Templeton just asked me an interesting
15 question which is if we want to have a discussion about... you sort of suggested that we may
16 want to review this and have a discussion on our purview or involvement or (interrupted)

17

18 Mr. Jonathan Lait, Director of Planning: So, I (interrupted)

19

20 Vice-Chair Alcheck: When would you discuss (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: Maybe it's short of a discussion but maybe some comments at the end of the agenda under Commissioner questions, comments, announcements, [unintelligible].

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Would you suggest that we do that at the next meeting or do you want to do that now?

Mr. Lait: Today, just a couple... just a few words we'll spend on it. You'll see (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Do you have some comment? Ok great, alright.

Mr. Lait: It will be clearer when we get there.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Then we will do that right after we review the minutes. Thank you for clarifying.

[The Commission moved back up to Approval of the Meeting Minutes]

Vice-Chair Alcheck: But we're going to use this minute for the Commissioner questions and comments to talk about the Transportation and Traffic RPP Program Evaluation Report that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 was given to us. So, I have a light from Commissioner Summa, anybody else who would like
2 to talk about it just lights me up, please. Thank you. Commissioner Summa.

3

4 Commissioner Summa: So, I also wanted to mention first that I know not everyone can come to
5 the May Fete Parade but I did participate on our behalf and waved at the children and whatnot
6 and missed you all but I know it's not a time everyone can attend.

7

8 Commissioner Waldfogel: Thank you.

9

10 Commissioner Summa: You're welcome. It's really super fun to do. If you can do it next year, I
11 would encourage you. It's really just heartwarming and fun.

12

13 And then I don't know if you all want to take a look at this. I read it a little bit but I knew this
14 was kind of coming and it's coming next Monday to Council. So... but if you look at Page 4, I
15 guess I must have watched a meeting so I knew this was coming up at a Council meeting. So

16 (interrupted)

17

18 Vice-Chair Alcheck: (off mic) Which page? Of... you mean the beginning of 4? Ok.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: Yeah. The Staff and consultant recommended participation in the third...
2 fourth paragraph this participation from either the Planning and Transportation Commission or
3 an independent group. And I think it's logical that it would be the Planning and Transportation
4 Commission that would participate this way. So, I don't know if you guys want to take a second
5 to read it but I'm not making a motion because we don't do that this point but just
6 (interrupted)

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: I would support that. I'd like to know what we can do by Monday?

9

10 Commissioner Summa: Yeah.

11

12 Mr. Lait: Well so I think that if I may Chair? This is... I don't expect anybody to have digested
13 this. It was just placed on your Packet and the purpose of this just to bring awareness to the
14 Commission. I know that the... from our past conversations that the... this Commission has
15 longed for more involvement in the transportation and parking discussions. That last year I
16 think there was one maybe two items that were presented to the Commission and we had
17 talked when other folks previously. Rob de Geus came and made a presentation and talked
18 about how we're reorganizing our programs, we're creating the Office of Transportation and
19 we're commissioning this consultant's report to help us to understand what's... what our
20 priorities are going to be. And so, we're marching down this path and we have this consultant's

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 report now with some 30 some odd recommendations on how to address the Residential
2 Parking Program. And one of the comments that Commissioner Summa was just referencing is
3 there's going to be this interest in wanting to get some input from the community about how
4 to... on some of these recommendations. And I would suspect that the City Council would give
5 some clear guidance and direction on how to implement some of these recommendations. And
6 then the question is, what's the forum for which the community can have that dialog and so
7 what's presented on Page 4 of the Staff report is from the MRG Report is that it be either the
8 Planning and Transportation Commission or some other Committee or forum. So that's an area
9 where I think Commissioner Summa is referring to is perhaps this is a Commission that would
10 be engaged in that discussion. And if so, it would be worthwhile for you to communicate that
11 interest to the City Council may be by way of a letter before the Council meeting.

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: On Monday?

14

15 Mr. Lait: Between now and Monday to just (interrupted)

16

17 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, I... all shoot an email to Commissioner Riggs [note – Chair Riggs] and
18 sort of pass on that message. I think it would be... it wouldn't be a bad idea if you did the same.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 If you guys go to Page 26 though of the Packet I just want to sort of highlight something which I
2 think this is sort of where we want to be and I think to some extent not just encouraging them
3 to direct us to be more involved but just to encourage them to think through all of these ideas.
4 The idea of improving the Parking Management System and conducting a Parking Study
5 downtown and beginning the process for changing our current RPP. And then you can see
6 Number Four, adding a Parking Manager to the Office of Transportation. I mean I think these
7 are things that we've, as a Commission, have realized are good ideas and if you keep going to
8 the list, I think this is a long list that Staff has put together. I guess in consultation with your
9 consultant but you're endorsing these? Oh, ok well then in that case.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: (off mic) Yeah, this is a consultant's work.

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think it might be interesting if we... if... I guess what I'm trying to say is if
14 you have an opportunity to review these items and you feel strongly about them. Don't feel
15 that we have to speak as a Commission in unison between now and Monday. I think personal
16 emails to the Council Members that you have relationships with expressing to them which one
17 of these items is in your mind a priority based on your experience on the Commission is
18 extremely valuable. And so, I... in the absence of us having really time to review this as a whole,
19 I almost think that's maybe even a better idea than having just Commissioner Riggs [note –
20 Chair Riggs] or somebody sort of speak on behalf of the Commission.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lauing: Can I ask just procedurally what the action is or the study session item at Council?

Mr. Lait: [unintelligible – off mic]

Commissioner Lauing: No, no at Council. How is it agendize at Council?

Mr. Lait: Oh, it's an action item at Council.

Commissioner Lauing: Action item to approve the RPP recommendations?

Mr. Lait: Well so the recommendation is on the first page.

Commissioner Lauing: Ok, sorry.

Mr. Lait: Yep.

Commissioner Lauing: These At Place things don't work that well.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: One of them is to approve the RPP Program (interrupted)

2

3 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, ok, got it.

4

5 Vice-Chair Alcheck: And then the others are to maybe pursue other options.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: So, Vice Chair?

8

9 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah?

10

11 Commissioner Summa: I think... I mean I didn't get along time to read this but I think what the...

12 what I was referring to was a process that will move forward engaging the community that

13 suggested maybe the Planning and Transportation would have a... Commission would have a

14 roll in that. So, I would not... I'm not recommending a letter certainly between now and

15 Monday (interrupted)

16

17 Vice-Chair Alcheck: (off mic) No, no, [unintelligible]

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: Opining on the merit of the report. Just that we think that we would...
2 are the appropriate body to be engaged and that we would like too. And ideally, that would
3 come from the Chair or you if the Chair's out of town.

4

5 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll pass that on. Yeah, no, well I will (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Summa: Is everybody in agreement with that general...?

8

9 Commissioner Lauing: Well yeah and so as a priority that seems to make more sense than all of
10 us flooding Council Members with opinions on each of the merits of these things. I think what
11 we're just trying to set up is we'd like to be involved as this thing plays out.

12

13 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah and I'll... and correct me if I'm wrong but I don't imagine like let's just
14 take Number Two, for example, The Parking Operational Study. If the Council determines that
15 they'd like to do an operational study of our downtown parking I would assume that at some
16 point, once that study is complex, it would probably make its way through our Commission. I
17 don't know that I would assume that somehow there... I will pass the message on but I do think
18 that we should communicate that we are excited and interested in being involved in a capacity
19 that is meaningful. But I just want... I'm not suggesting that we all go out and lobby them but
20 there may be things here that in our past meetings you have been like god, we really need

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 more Staff on parking for example in my opinion. We definitely need a parking zar and if there's
2 anything in here and you absolutely don't have to.

3

4 Commissioner Summa: But I think all those items that the MRG report is asking for
5 recommendations on will this be done through a community process and a Council process.
6 And they're asking... I think I'm right; you can correct me if I'm wrong. So, they want to know
7 how do you want to do this? Do you want... we think maybe you should invite... involve the
8 Planning and Transportation Commission. So, I don't... the Council (interrupted)

9

10 Vice-Chair Alcheck: You mean reviewing all the recommendations from the consultant?

11

12 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, a community process.

13

14 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Got it.

15

16 Commissioner Summa: They're not going to... I don't believe they're going to consider all those
17 many recommendations. I think they're going to make a consider a process to do it and then
18 they're going to look at our recommendations specifically about Green Acres and that sort of
19 stuff. Am I interpreting that correctly, Director Lait?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Yeah so, I'm not sure what the exact number is but I think that it's clear that the
2 objective of this I think is simple to... what I'm hearing from the Commissioner... from
3 Commission Summa and gauging by the nods on the Commission. That there seems to be an
4 interest that the Planning and Transportation Commission have a role in reviewing any
5 direction that the Council provides with respect to receiving community input on any number
6 of the priorities that they choose to advance from the report. We don't know what numbers or
7 which ones will get traction but I think the question is... a question that I think is being
8 presented I guess in this report is, is that an independent body or is it the Planning and
9 Transportation Commission? I think it's to that specific point that this conversation is taking
10 place.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok let me actually do something slightly different, why don't we do this.

13

14 Mr. Lait: And we're not agendize for a discussion on this. I don't want to continue a dialog on it.

15

16 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Lets see how you feel about this suggestion. Our representatives are Ed and
17 back up or excuse me, Commissioner Lauing and back up in Commissioner Roohparvar for May.
18 I'm comfortable if you're comfortable and if Director Lait is comfortable in either encouraging
19 Commissioner Lait [note -Director Lait] when he presents on Monday night to pass the message
20 that we would love to be involved and there's interest.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: So, I think what I'm hearing and I can speak to Commissioner Riggs... Chair Riggs.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Or maybe he can (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: I think we're spending more time on this than we actually need too. I think the message is in (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Alcheck: I'm trying to deformatize it.

Mr. Lait: Then let's end it.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright.

Commissioner Lauing: I mean the merit of that is just simply that we don't have to write letters and figure that out and Commissioner Riggs [Note- Chair Riggs] has to do it from Germany and all that. I could just be there as a resource because I'm the liaison anyways so.

Mr. Lait: [unintelligible – off mic]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, I think you could communicate that to them for us.

2

3 Mr. Lait: [unintelligible – off mic]

4

5 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Good, ok, alright (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: Because that way... since I am going to be there Monday night I still
8 want to know if there's a letter or not.

9

10 Vice-Chair Alcheck: The reason why I'm uncomfortable with the letter idea, the reason why I'm
11 sort of pushing back is because I imagine that there would want to be a group review of it. And I
12 don't know what it would say yet because I haven't even really read that report and I don't
13 want to speak on behalf of Chair Riggs if he something. So, my preference really is I think the
14 sentiment here is that we want to be involved, I think that will be communicated, and I just
15 don't think we have time for a letter. I'd rather not encourage anybody to write a letter if that's
16 ok? Ok.

17

18 I have interest from Commissioner Templeton and maybe others to talk about our future
19 agenda at all. Do you want to... is there a specific question or you just want a little bit more
20 heads up?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Templeton: I just wondered if we're going to have agenda items or if that meeting will be canceled?

Vice-Chair Alcheck: This is the May 29th in particular or yeah, ok.

Mr. Lait: So yeah, our agendas continue to be a little bit light. There's been a question that I'm still trying to answer about the summer and our schedule for the summer and whether or not there might be some dates that we can cancel to accommodate vacations or schedules that people may have. In the past, I think this Commission has taken July off from time to time. I think we did it last year but it has happened a few times. Not that it needs to be that way but let me look for May. Yeah, we... so these things and I appreciate that it's a little bit frustrating. We have... we plan for items and we work toward that and then things shift either because other things come up or an applicant needs to revise some plans or something like that. So, at the moment we do not have anything scheduled for May 29th so that is an open day where we can consider canceling that. We are tentatively scheduling a public meeting on the Castilleja EIR, this will be just the EIR, not the project, that's tentatively schedules for June 12. And that's contingent on us getting the draft Environmental Impact Report out on May 17th where we would give the Commission a copy of that and about three plus weeks to review that document. One thing that I was considering also was... and could help... Yolanda could help me

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 sort of pole the Commission offline to see if there's interest in moving the last meeting that you
2 have a schedule for the Planning Commission in June up one week. And the idea there would
3 just be to mostly for us to accommodate some scheduling considerations that we have. I know
4 its kind of late and we've had previous conversations about not wanting to move meetings
5 around. So, I'm sensitive to that but if it also works for the Commission in terms of your own
6 schedules and what you have planned for the summer. Maybe that's a place where we can
7 have a conversation about that. We don't have to talk about it tonight but I can send a follow-
8 up email.

9

10 Commissioner Lauing: I have a question.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, Commissioner Lauing.

13

14 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I'm going to bring up again with complete respect with your
15 Staffing needs or your Staffing vacancies but are we making some progress on the Housing
16 Workplan? You know the second part of that was Council mandated for this year and we're
17 down to about 6-months left in the year. I know you said happily at the end of last year
18 something around the Palmer Fix was underway. Could we please get the Palmer Fix and the
19 BMR stuff this year?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: That's our intent. We're under contract now with a consultant who's helping us with
2 that. We had to... we actually started working on it last year but with the changes to the
3 Housing Ordinance that just became effective here on May 2nd we've had to rerun our numbers
4 on our prototypes to find out the percentages. We're looking to... we're evaluating what's the
5 appropriate inclusionary requirement because right now it's 15 percent. Does it go up to 20
6 percent? Is there some other metric that or standard that we want to use? So, we're still
7 looking at that and it's our goal to have it done this year to the Planning Commission and
8 hopefully to City Council. So that's one that we're working on. We do have these other resource
9 constraints. I'm not sure that we're going to be able to get through all of the things that have
10 been listed.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Understandable. It's just that the housing crisis is a crisis and BMR
13 housing crisis is a crisis within a crisis.

14

15 Mr. Lait: Yeah, we're working on that one because obviously it's got some significant movement
16 in that piece too.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: Ok thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Alright thank you and I'll just add; I mean look I am present for the dates in
2 July; the standard Commissioner dates. But just sort of as we demonstrated tonight that we can
3 be... we can create an opportunity to learn with each other and maybe with the community and
4 Staff. So again, if any of you have an interest in having a discussion about a specific topic, we
5 can use our dates to do that and they can be shorter meetings but they can still be meaningful.
6 Then last question, is anybody going to the event on Friday? The Housing the Bay event?

7

8 Commissioner Templeton: I think so.

9

10 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok. Alright, I will be there.

11

12 Commissioner Summa: Which event?

13

14 Vice-Chair Alcheck: It's called Housing the Bay. It's an event put on I think by the Urban Land
15 Institute and there's a number of great speakers. Ok, I just wanted to see who was coming.
16 Alright, does anybody else have any other comments?

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: Is the May 29th meeting on or off or pending?

19

20 Vice-Chair Alcheck: It's currently TDB until we here more.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: [unintelligible – off mic]

Vice-Chair Alcheck: But we're not canceling it or are we canceling it?

Mr. Lait: No, I'll... let me check in with Chair Riggs and just go over that but it's unlikely.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: But we would know by when I think that's what the question is maybe?

Mr. Lait: Soon.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok, soon. Commissioner Waldfogel.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Thanks. You've already answered a whole bunch of my questions so this is fantastic. The Castilleja EIR that is an action item for the (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: Not... so it's (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: What is that?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Right so we... there's an application on file, we are preparing an Environmental Impact
2 Report, and... well, not required under state law. We typically have a practice of presenting the
3 draft EIR at the Planning Commission or we could do it in other meetings but we've been using
4 the Planning Commission as an opportunity for that. To one, hear the Commission's comments
5 on the draft EIR but also just create a forum where the public can come speak and articulate
6 those comments. And we'll have our consultants here and... to listen and the idea is that we
7 would respond in the final Environmental Impact Report to any of the comments that have
8 been raised regarding the document.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: Great. So, a suggestion for the assuming that the EIR drops on the
11 17th we could potentially use May 29th... if there's some format where we could have let an
12 informal discussion among ourselves, I mean just as a way to educate ourselves. I'm just
13 wondering if there's some way we could do that; that's not really a public comment session but
14 is more of a guide us through it, figure it out. So that we're really prepped for the deeper
15 conversation. I mean I'm assuming this is not a 3-page document when it drops.

16

17 Mr. Lait: Yeah maybe 4 but you know I think that would be difficult to have that conversation.
18 There's a lot of interest in this project in the community and I think just having a forum where
19 we can have that exchange and not involve... engage the community on that would be difficult.
20 However, I'm happy to make myself available and our consultants available to answer any

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 questions that individuals Commissioners may have and we can have that offline in advance of
2 the meeting. If that would be helpful to sort of walk you through the document on a one on
3 one kind of basis.

4
5 Commissioner Waldfogel: Thank you, all 4-pages. Let's see a couple of other items. We talked
6 about the RPP in relationship with Council. Council is also stood up a new Grade Separating
7 Committee that I believe does not liais [note- liaison] with PTC. I mean I'm assuming at some
8 point this will probably touch PTC if Churchill is closed or something like that. I think that that's
9 a mandatory touch point but do we, as a Commission, do we have any feeling we want to be
10 involved with that? Do we want to stay away from it?

11
12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Are you talking about grade separation?

13
14 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yes, because there's a new Committee that's being... there's a new
15 Committee that's looking at this again, I think that has finance involved in it as well. So, I just
16 want to tee that up. It's not agendize so we can't have a deep discussion about it.

17
18 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, it's an interesting question. I think everything got tabled when
19 Governor Newsom sort of had his State of the State and made a lot of changes and so it
20 became unclear what was what.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Waldfogel: And there's a lot of history here because there's also still the what is the Rail Corridor Task Force Report which was, I believe adopted a City Policy 10-years ago and so there's a lot of moving parts here.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Is the question do we want to communicate as a group to City Council to empower us to be part of that process?

Commissioner Waldfogel: I think that's the discussion we might want to have; whether we feel we can contribute to that process or whether we would like to propose that in some fashion. We're not... I don't think we can have a deep discussion about it, I just wanted to raise it.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think we continue to have questions about how we would have a discussion about having a discussion. So obviously right now wouldn't be an appropriate time for us to move something like that but how would we (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: So, let me... so I am not as connected to that process and so I'm not going to be as helpful to you in terms of answering your question. But what I can do is connect with the City Manager and the folks that are involved in this and see one, see if we can answer that question. Where does the Planning and Transportation Commission plug into this? Two is there an

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 opportunity to at least give the Commission an update as to what's going on so that you can at
2 least be informed as to where we are and where you plug in. And that would just be a Staff
3 person probably coming and giving that update.

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: And actually, if we could get... I think Caltrain came in. Did they brief
6 the Council on their Business Plan?

7

8 Mr. Lait: I think they did like a couple of weeks ago.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: I mean if we could get a copy of that or (interrupted)

11

12 Mr. Lait: Oh sure.

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: If we could even get a briefing on that. I mean it's a bit of a mystery
15 to a lot of us. The other thing is I just wanted to reflect for a second on our study session, on
16 our parking study session. I think overall it's a step forward, it's a step in a good direction. I
17 think to perfect it; it would be helpful to get some part of the presentation in advance. At least
18 get a little more scope in advance. I made a lucky guess on what the scope would be so I was
19 somewhat prepared but I think that just knowing a little bit more than any of the speakers
20 would be helpful and empowering for us.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Alcheck: I just... we can connect on this, I completely agree. I think in the absence of your comment as well there's already been some discussion about how we can improve this process. So that maybe even community members can have even a better heads up because they may not be as familiar with the topics as even, we are.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah and I don't want to criticize. I think it's great that we did this.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: No, we're learning.

Commissioner Waldfogel: It's a great first experiment. So, my two takeaways are if we can get a little bit more presentation in advance or just a little more agenda in advance number one. And number two, as a reformed entrepreneur I know the... there's always temptation to be selling but we should ask... when people do this, I think we that we should just be very conscientious about not selling.

Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, no I... that message was passed on and I was going to make a comment that the... this isn't Shark Tank and we may see holes. But we necessarily... the idea wasn't necessarily to have a broad discussion about this individual or company's specific technology but just how that technology might impact planning. I think one of the things that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we've talked a little bit about at some point we may want to invite some developers to come in
2 and talk about their models. I think your feedback is very helpful and ideally, the next time we
3 do this we'll be able to frame the topic more articulately in a Staff report so that people know
4 what they're coming too.

5

6 Commissioner Waldfogel: No, it's great and I have some topics that (interrupted)

7

8 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Please share them with me.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: That I will feed in so it's a good precedent and let's make it better.

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I'm really more than happy to sort of help facilitate any of these so let us
13 know.

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: I just wanted to add on to that.

16

17 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Yeah, go ahead.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: I think last meeting Commissioner Summa was instrumental in saying
20 besides just sending stuff in, could we... these weren't her words... but preprocess it. So, if there

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 are three ideas or one that the Chair thinks is great. It seems to me like the meeting before we
2 should say this is the plan, does that work? Is that of interest to everybody? Here's the other
3 two that we could go to and then maybe even discuss format. We might even say yeah that's
4 would be sort of good get a for and an against. So, if we just had time to chat about it as
5 opposed to arriving to kind of preprocess, I think that might be helpful. Maybe... I'm kind to
6 stealing your thunder Commissioner Summa so you might want to add to that.

7

8 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think this is good.

9

10 Commissioner Summa: [unintelligible – off mic]

11

12 Vice-Chair Alcheck: I think this is good feedback. I can't say that I initiate this topic from the
13 topic standpoint but I was involved in the coordination and I will tell you it's complicated. The
14 scheduling of individuals who are just not involved in our... sort of as Staff members of our City
15 don't really have as flexible schedule. And I think my sense is that there's some discretion here
16 being exercised by the Chair and sort of decided and inviting the speakers. I think... but I can let
17 him speak to that more but I'll pass the message on. I would consider... based on how difficult it
18 was to coordinate I would consider ourselves lucky if we had at least... if we had one or two
19 more of these. It is that difficult to get somebody in the room who's willing to have a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 conversation. I think certain topics may be easier than others but we shall see. Anyways, yeah,
2 Commissioner Summa.

3
4 Commissioner Summa: So, I don't need to beat a dead horse. I was hoping for a more
5 collaborative approach and I even think if the specific topic had been agendize I probably would
6 have called the other company that I know about that's located in Palo Alto that as an app for
7 doing this. I don't know how successful they have been and talk to them about it; Piped Parker I
8 think it is. I think they are still in operation so let's try to do a more collaborative thing on that.

9
10 And then I wanted to ask the Director, did you say we're going to get the draft EIR on May 17th?

11
12 Mr. Lait: That's our objective.

13
14 Commissioner Summa: Ok and then you wanted to know... around May 17th. You want to
15 know... I think you asked if we wanted to move the June 12th Castilleja draft meeting up? Did
16 you say that?

17
18 Mr. Lait: No, no our plan is to... so if we're able to meet our mark and get the draft
19 environmental out on May 17th then we would have that public hearing for the Planning
20 Commission on June 12th.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Summa: Ok, thanks.

3

4 Vice-Chair Alcheck: Ok seeing no more lights and no more comments this meeting on May 8th is

5 adjourned at 7 [video cut off].

6

7 **Adjournment**

8 7:33 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas and Reports are available online: <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

Vice Chair Michael Alcheck
Commissioner Ed Lauing
Chair William Riggs
Commissioner Giselle Roohparvar
Commissioner Doria Summa
Commissioner Carolyn Templeton
Commissioner Asher Waldfogel

Get Informed and Be Engaged!

View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto> or on Channel 26.

Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs, or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.