



Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: November 14, 2018

Council Chambers
250 Hamilton Avenue
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

6:06 pm

Commissioner Alcheck arrived at 6:10 pm

Chair Lauing: Ok we're going to bring out the lights. I'd like to call to order the Planning and Transportation Commission regular meeting for November 14 of 2018. And Yolanda just disappeared, we need to have her call the roll. Oh, there she is. Thank you very much.

Oral Communications

The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

Chair Lauing: The first item on our agenda is oral communications and we have one card for that, Mr. Aaron [note- Andrew] Boone.

Mr. Andrew Boone: Good evening Commissioners, my name is Andrew Boone, I have lived on Woodland Avenue in East Palo Alto for the past 8-years and would like to share my thoughts on the City's plans for taking action on climate change. I think the City's programs and plans are insufficient now, in 2018, given things that have happened recently. The election of Donald Trump as president has taken a major step backward towards taking action on climate change;

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 withdraw from the Paris Climate Agreement and many other bad policies; trying to cancel
2 California's stricter vehicle emission standards so all of those things we need to do more. If the
3 federal government is going to do less and in fact be hostile to protecting the environment the
4 City of Palo Alto has to do that much more. Now, of course, the City is not a large City so the
5 reductions that we make in our own emissions are a small part of the total of course for the
6 county, the world, but the point is to be a leader. Is to demonstrate what can be done so what
7 can be done in a City that is well poised to do it? A City that already residents and workers use
8 alternative modes of transportation at high levels, where the residents are well aware of the
9 environment and climate change as an issue. So, I would recommend that this Commission or
10 whichever appropriate body of the City its for look into updating the Climate Action Plan. To be
11 something that is the actions we really need to take to avert catastrophic climate change.
12 Thank you.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Thank you.

15 **Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions**

16 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Are there any agenda changes, additions, or deletions? Ok, seeing none we'll stay
19 with the agenda as is.

20 **City Official Reports**

21 1. Assistant Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 2. Draft 2019 Meeting Schedule and Assignments

2 Chair Lauing: So, we have the City Official Report... Assistant Director's Report?

3

4 Mr. Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director of Planning: Thank you Chair and good evening
5 Commissioners. Just a couple of items to report, some projects or reports going to Council that
6 you may be interested in tracking. One is on November 19th the City Council will take up the
7 housed roof deck request and the broader policy for downtown roof decks on non-complying
8 facilities and that happens on the 19th.

9

10 On November 26th the City Council will have a public hearing on the Housing Work Plan for
11 2018 that the Commission has discussed and forwarded recommendations onto the City
12 Council.

13

14 And then on December 3rd, there's a couple of items going forward. One is when the City
15 Council reviewed the ADU and JADU revisions to the City's Ordinance they had directed Staff to
16 return with an amendment – Resolution to not charge the development impact fees for garage
17 conversions – a garage conversion to an ADU and so that's going to go to the Council on the 3rd.

18

19 And we have a – this isn't something that we're getting into right now but at some point, we're
20 going to be working on the Housing Element update for the next regional housing needs cycle.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 In anticipation of that, the City Council's already signaled its interest to engage with the county
2 and other interested Cities in the county to form a subregion. This would allow Palo Alto to
3 work with its neighbors to identify the best opportunities for providing and addressing the
4 regional housing needs for the county, instead of it being established by ABAG.

5 And then another item going on the 3rd is the Downtown Cap. The Planning Commission I think
6 had a discussion on this in January. This is the repeal of the 350,000-square foot limit for non-
7 residential development downtown. That's going to go to the Council on the 3rd as well and that
8 concludes the report.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Ok one of the items in the Official Reports is there's a draft 19 [note – 2019]
11 meeting schedule and assignments.

12

13 Mr. Lait: Yes.

14

15 Chair Lauing: That's obviously kind of loose right now because there will be additional
16 Commissioners joining the Commission. I just want to point out that being ever optimistic I
17 think we should look forward to booking our second annual retreat as the year gets underway
18 in 19 [note -2019]. So, we'll look to do that as probably a special meeting and at the next actual
19 meeting, which is December, maybe we can get into the specifics of a date for that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Lait: Sure.

Commissioner Riggs: We can't schedule that now?

Chair Lauing: We could try, sure.

Commissioner Riggs: My schedule (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: I like your optimism.

Commissioner Riggs: [unintelligible – off mic]. We can schedule something now.

Mr. Lait: We would have to check for room availability but if we get a sense for... are we talking evenings, weekends, mornings? Whatever the... I mean if we can narrow that piece down it would help us.

Chair Lauing: Ideas on that go-ahead Commissioner Riggs.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: Well I mean if we could do mornings during the week that would be – I
2 would love that.

3

4 Chair Lauing: That's what we did last year as I recall. Is that alright?

5

6 Mr. Lait: Is there a day that's better than others? We're thinking in January, right?

7

8 Commissioner Alcheck: I'll throw (interrupted)

9

10 Chair Lauing: It's January.

11

12 Commissioner Alcheck: If our first meeting is January is on the 30th, is that what you just said? Is
13 that right?

14

15 Mr. Lait: Yeah, that's right, [unintelligible] be February.

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: So, I would suggest that we host the retreat after the first meeting
18 because I assume at our first meeting, we'll be nominating new leadership to our Commission.
19 So, it seems like a prudent... to first select our leadership and then do a retreat.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: [unintelligible – off mic]

2

3 Chair Lauing: Right so you're saying push it to February?

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm saying do it after the first meeting.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Right, eventually that does put it in February.

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: So, we're one meeting in November, one meeting December, one
10 meeting in January?

11

12 Mr. Lait: I'm sorry?

13

14 Commissioner Alcheck: The idea is one meeting in November, one meeting in December, one
15 meeting in January?

16

17 Mr. Lait: For the new calendar?

18

19 Commissioner Alcheck: For just...

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yeah, the new calendar doesn't show any meeting in January until the 30th.

2

3 Mr. Lait: I wouldn't say it's a standard but just the way the holidays fell.

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: Got it.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Yeah Commissioner Monk [note-Vice Chair Monk].

8

9 Vice-Chair Monk: When does Council set its priorities?

10

11 Mr. Lait: It's typically the last weekend or near the last weekend in January I believe that they...

12

13 Vice-Chair Monk: We'd probably want to wait till after they set priorities for the week and align

14 with their priorities or is that not necessarily the case? Chair I was just recommending that you

15 might want to consider waiting till the Council sets its new priorities so you get a more

16 productive conversation that would have alignment with Council priorities for the coming year.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Yeah that's always a far debate. Last year we did not do that but we felt like it was

19 80 percent in place so I don't think we were far off on that.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: We had Council priorities when we had our retreat last time.

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: I would like to potentially get something on the calendar if that's ok. I
4 don't care when it would just be great to have something to shoot for so I can block it out.

5

6 Mr. Lait: Ok so we'll try to find a date in February, probably mid-February, somewhere around
7 there and send an email to get your feedback.

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm not opposed to... sorry. I'm not opposed to making time for a mid-
10 day – I – since – I don't think that's what we did last year. I think last year we were evening
11 again but I'm open to that. So, in case – if it does work out, I'm always willing to make those
12 sorts of...

13

14 Chair Lauing: Ok I can work the details with you. Ok, thanks.

15

16 Vice-Chair Monk: I had a question on Item 2 if that's what you're going onto. Do we have
17 annual – a requirement for an annual read of the Comp Plan and is that suppose to be on our
18 agenda for December?

19

20 Mr. Lait: As a matter of fact, you do have that requirement and we're working on it actually.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Monk: So, it might show up...

3

4 Mr. Lait: It's not going to show up this year...

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok.

7

8 Mr. Lait: ...but we are working on it.

9

10 Vice-Chair Monk: So, are we compliant with the annual requirement if it shows up next year?

11

12 Mr. Lait: Yes.

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok thank you.

15

16 Mr. Lait: There's two... and just to add a little bit, we have a local requirement and there's a

17 state requirement. And so, what we're looking at now is how do we report this in a way that

18 we're not doing duplicate of work and we're trying to make the report even more meaningful

19 than it's been in the past. So, it's going to take us...we have a new Comprehensive Plan, we've

20 got a lot of implementation policies that we need to address, and so we're taking a little bit of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 extra time to get a nice format for the Commission and for the community to see what we're
2 doing and we hope to roll that out in the first part of next year.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Ok so the next Item if Item Number Three, a study session...

5

6 Commissioner Alcheck: (off mic) Oh, before we jump...

7

8 Chair Lauing: Go ahead, yeah.

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: I may have missed this. I'm – I feel like there's a lot of information out
11 there, I don't always look to just rely on single sources we have. So, do you – is there anything
12 you can share with us about the President's Hotel situation? I read a couple – it's not even
13 worth quoting actually. I don't know what I read but I'm curious to know if there are any
14 developments that you can share with us?

15

16 Mr. Lait: I can tell you that there's no application that's been filed and I've read what you've
17 probably read in the paper as well but I don't have anything new to report on the issue.

18

19 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

20

21 **Study Session**

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

2 3. Provide Feedback on Conceptual Design Options to Improve Multimodal Connectivity
3 and Safety along El Camino Real Between Stanford Avenue and Lambert Avenue.
4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok so Item Three is a study session on the conceptual design options to improve
6 connectivity on El Camino. I'm going to start with the Staff report and then do public comment.

7

8 Mr. Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director of Planning: Thank you Chair. I'm going to just introduce
9 Sylvia Star-Lack to my right and Jarrett Mullen to her right. Jarrett is going to give you a brief
10 introduction and then introduce our consultants.

11

12 Mr. Jarrett Mullen: Good evening Commissioners, my name is Jarrett Mullen, I'm with the
13 Office of Transportation, and tonight we're bringing before you the conceptual ideas for El
14 Camino Real between Stanford Avenue and Lambert Avenue. This focuses on responding
15 documented incidences – collision incidents with bicyclist and pedestrians. So, I'd like to
16 introduce to my right Kendra Rowley from Fehr & Peers. She's a Senior Engineer with that firm
17 and she's been the project manager for the past year or so as we've been going through the
18 process with this planning study. And she can explain the background and some of our findings.

19

20 Ms. Kendra Rowley: Thanks, Jarrett. Good evening, so I just want to give you a little preview
21 about what we're going to talk about tonight. I will go over why we are doing the study and a
22 little bit of context about the project and what we've heard from outreach efforts so far before

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we dive into the draft design concepts. And then we'll follow up with some discussion and
2 feedback from you guys.

3

4 So, this project falls under the umbrella of the Grand Boulevard initiative which is a partnership
5 of agencies along El Camino Real from Daily City to San Jose that was formed to create a vision
6 for the corridor but the primary focus for this study in Palo Alto is safety. So, from 2006 to 2015
7 there were 51 people walking or biking that were involved in a collision with a vehicle. And the
8 City was awarded Caltrans grant funding on the basis of these collisions and because of the
9 opportunity to improve safety within the corridor and within the City with the additional goal of
10 developing guidance for the rest of the El Camino Real corridor.

11

12 A collision data is summarized into eight trends or collision profiles that get at the heart of the
13 safety issues for those traveling along and across El Camino by bike and on foot. Several of
14 these trends indicate the need for better bicycle crossings and connections between
15 destinations. So notable trends are high speed and shared traveling which accounts for a third
16 of the bicycle collisions. These are mid-block sideswipes, rear end, and lane changes, so this
17 indicated that people are biking along El Camino Real. Another third of the bike collisions was
18 wrong way bicycle along El Camino Real so this may be people that are biking for a short
19 distance, for example, to get to a destination. Trends for pedestrians indicate the need for
20 better visibility and also newly enhanced crossings. Over a third of the pedestrian collisions

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 involved seniors, 65 or older, and more than a third occurred at a side street with a stop sign.
2 Also notable are the red-light violations that are common among both the pedestrian and
3 bicycle collisions.

4
5 Another issue on El Camino Real is connectivity and access. So, collision trends indicate a
6 demand to bike along El Camino Real and we also know that there are many destinations on
7 the corridor that are difficult to access directly without traveling along El Camino Real, even just
8 for short distance. So, this includes bus stops at the Cal Ave Business District, office buildings
9 and community facilities in addition to several bicycle routes that cross El Camino Real that are
10 shown on the slide here. And we also heard that point reinforced during outreach and in some
11 cases, El Camino Real is the most direct path to get to these destinations by bike.

12
13 And the street is not just a bearer for bikes but also for pedestrians so currently the existing
14 controlled crosswalks are spaced 1,000 to 1,200-feet apart where the maximum distance that a
15 pedestrian is willing to walk to get to a crosswalk is 300 to 400-feet.

16
17 So, I want to add a little bit of additional context and go over what we've heard so far during
18 outreach before we share the draft concepts. First is vehicle access, just to round out the
19 discussion on access El Camino Real is classified as an arterial which is meant to focus on
20 mobility and moving vehicles along the roadway. Then there are no plans to modify that as we

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 are not proposing to remove a travel lane in either alternative. So, one thing the El Camino Real
2 does have is on-street parking which conflicts a little bit with the arterial classification and lends
3 itself more to a local street. In public opinions verged during outreach we've heard pretty
4 strongly for maintaining the on-street parking, especially from the Cal Mocha Business
5 Association [note – unknown group] but also, we've heard from the public that they are in favor
6 of removing it. So, given that one of the alternatives being studied requires removal of all of the
7 on-street parking along the corridor we did collect parking occupancy data which is shown here
8 on the screen. We collected data for three different periods, weekday lunch period, the
9 weekday dinner period, as well as the weekend lunch period. The dark red color shows the high
10 level of parking when parking becomes difficult to find. So, you can see that's most common on
11 the -- towards the north end of the segment during the weekday lunch period.

12
13 Since the project began, we've done three rounds of outreach in various formats. The dates and
14 formats are listed here on the screen. For Stage One was – the purpose of Stage One was
15 envisioning the corridor so this was – we presented our collision analysis results and asked for
16 issues and opportunities and also what goals were the most important to people. Stage Two we
17 displayed our initial improvement ideas which were linked with specific needs on the corridor,
18 as well as trade, offs for Design Alternatives One and Two which I'll go into more detail shortly.
19 State Three presented draft concepts for Option One and Option Two so these long examples
20 that are here on the wall today. And Stage Three is currently underway so we have an online

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 survey that closes at the end of the month. For Stages One and Two, the previous rounds of
2 outreach, we received over 1,600 comments overall and we estimate that we reached over 700
3 people. And then the current stage of outreach, again is ongoing and so far, we've heard from
4 over 100 people and the survey closes at the end of the month.

5
6 Some of the common themes that we've heard – comments that we've heard are to improve
7 bicycle and pedestrian crossings, that roadway maintenance is needed, many people that are in
8 favor of the bike lanes prefer the direct route that El Camino provides, destination by bike, they
9 think the bike lanes improve safety and it may also encourage alternate modes other than
10 driving. And then many people say that they want to preserve the vehicle access at
11 intersections, specifically the ability to make a right turn on red. A couple additional comments
12 were related to congestion on the corridor and wanting to see some sort of signal coordination.
13 And then also we've heard both that people are in favor of bike lanes and also that they
14 prefer... from a separate group of people, they prefer to focus improvements on parallel routes
15 for bikers.

16
17 So, I'm going to share just briefly the two alternatives that we're presenting today and that
18 we've... that we were presenting during this current round of outreach. So just as an overview,
19 Option One includes protected bike lanes and this does require the removal of all of the on-
20 street parking. Option Two does not have a bicycle facility on El Camino Real and the focus

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 again would be on potential enhancements to parallel bike lanes. Some on-street parking would
2 be removed for safety benefits, just at intersections to improve visibility there. The trade-offs
3 between the two, Option One would result in safer bicycle access to destinations and along El
4 Camino Real and respond to known bicycle collision patterns. But it would require additional
5 parking management analysis so that the impacts of removing the parking were minimized.
6 Option Two does not provide an equivalent degree of bicyclist connectivity or safety and both
7 of these alternatives are consistent with goals and policies and programs in the current
8 Comprehensive Plan. So, both options also include pedestrian enhancements at intersections to
9 shorten crossings, to improve visibility, and to slow down vehicles. There's also streetscape and
10 placemaking opportunities to beautify the corridor with landscaping, street trees, and ped scale
11 lighting – pedestrian scale lighting. For both alternatives' buses would stop in the land with
12 passenger amenities at bus stops like transit shelters and pedestrian scale lighting. And Option
13 One would focus a little bit more on addressing safety at intersections for bicycles because you
14 do have the bike facility on the corridor. So, that's what you're seeing here, on the left side, is a
15 potentially protected intersection at Cal Ave so this is to address conflicts with right turning
16 vehicles.

17
18 Some additional highlights of the design concepts here, improvements at Stanford focused on
19 connecting bikes to the existing Stanford trail, as well as improvements to the bus stop there.
20 There are some signal timing changes that we're recommending at Stanford to address bicycle

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 conflicts at intersections. For example, adding a separate bicycle signal phase so that the heavy
2 southbound right turn goes separately from bikes. There's also bike boxes there to
3 accommodate transitions and turns which would require prohibiting right turn on red to
4 protect the bikes that are waiting there. At Cal Ave, again bus stop improvements and then in
5 Option One as I mentioned earlier a potentially – a protected intersection to address right turn
6 conflicts with bikes. And then at Hansen Portage intersection and offset intersection, there are
7 short sections of protected bike lanes to connect those off-set side streets through the
8 intersection. So, to make that transition for bikes easier and safer and the designs for One and
9 Two at that intersection are similar. So, there would be a short section of protected bike lanes
10 in either option.

11

12 So finally, I wanted to share some initial studies that we've been doing for Page Mill Road
13 where we've looked at the potential for bus queue jump lanes. Just as some background to the
14 idea, the transit priority treatment or transit priority treatments, in general, are identified as a
15 mitigation measure in the Comprehensive Plan EIR and were conceptually developed with
16 feedback from VTA. So, we tested multiple alternatives and this is the one that came out as the
17 preferred. Which is adding a dedicated right turn lane in both the north and south directions for
18 vehicles which would then be shared by buses as a through lane as a way to skip the queue of
19 vehicles that are going straight. This would require about 11 to 20-feet of widening of the
20 intersection and property acquisition in order to accommodate this extra right turn pocket or

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 queue jump lane. And the widening would be on the west side of the road only along the
2 frontage of the Palo Alto Square and Mayfield Soccer Complex and in both cases impacting the
3 landscaping bordering the parking lots. At a high level, the results show a substantial reduction
4 in delay for transit at the intersection and also a moderate reduction in delay for vehicles.

5
6 So that is actually all I have today. This last slide just shows some of the topics that we want to
7 focus on in terms of feedback from you all and for discussion today. So, we want to know what
8 you think about the on-street parking removal, also if there are any additional studies or
9 research that you would like to see related potentially to the parking occupancy, just where
10 should we focus any additional studies, and then finally the queue jump lanes that I showed on
11 that last slide if you guys had any thoughts on the tradeoffs there. In particulate related to the
12 right of way acquisition and the removal of landscaping.

13
14 Chair Lauing: Ok thanks. Any other additions from Staff? If not, we'll go to public comment, we
15 have three cards. The first one is Andrew Boone.

16
17 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic]

18
19 Chair Lauing: Larger version he is asking for.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: (off mic) On this...

2

3 Ms. Rowley: That's actually a snapshot of what's up on the wall.

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic]

6

7 Ms. Rowley: It may not have been. Oh no, it was right because it's part of the improvement or
8 the concept.

9

10 Mr. Mullen: Commissioners, it was in the Packet and it will be in a substantially reduced format.
11 This is probably something that you'll need a magnifying glass to look at and I do apologize for
12 that. It was... I should have done a compressed version but we do have the full-size roll out.
13 That's actually what they were reduced from over there.

14

15 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic]

16

17 Mr. Mullen: Ok.

18

19 Commissioner Riggs: (off mic) If you have your computer it's pretty resolute... it's pretty
20 resolute in the PDF.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah.

Chair Lauing: Mr. Boone, you're up.

Mr. Andrew Boone: Yes, good evening Commissioners, my name is Andrew Boone and I live on Woodland Avenue in East Palo Alto. I bike and walk often in this area and including on El Camino crossing, El Camino Ave for many years. There isn't really a practical way to avoid the street when you want to go shopping on... somewhere on El Camino and then you want to go somewhere else that's also on El Camino. So, this option to – of not doing anything to improve conditions for biking on the street doesn't make any sense to me. This is exactly what Palo Alto should be doing. El Camino Real, there's no reason why it should be excluded from our set of complete streets. No reason why we cannot make it a complete street. Right now, bicycle on the street and walking across the street they're hazardous. People get hit by cars, get injured and the effect is suppression of walking and bicycling as modes of transportation. People don't choose to walk and bike even if it's a short trip sometimes because of the condition of El Camino. So, this project isn't just for improving safety for these modes of transportation but the benefits go far beyond in protecting the natural environment and improving public health. So, I would urge you to recommend this Option One, the one that is... includes separated bike lanes to the City Council. I know that the City Council, some members are going to have some

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 skepticism about this concept and the ideas even controversial unfortunately among the public.
2 The right thing to do is think about it carefully and look at examples in other Cities what has
3 been done. These kind of bike lanes are very common in many parts of the world and have
4 been successful in getting lots more people to ride bikes and to be able to do it safely, even on
5 busy roads like El Camino Real. I think my main concern about the design is how wide are those
6 separated bike lanes. If they are only 8-feet wide, that doesn't give you an opportunity to pass
7 someone else who's bicycling in the lane and so you have traffic congestion. It would be nice to
8 avoid that unfortunate reality. What you want is something very comfortable, very covenant,
9 wide and especially here at – where El Camino crosses Page Mill Road. The priority in this
10 design is being given to car traffic. There's a total of 10 lanes on El Camino Real up from the
11 existing 8 lanes for car traffic. And so, the resulting bike lanes are narrow and get the left-over
12 space. That is not how it should be, people walking and bicycling should be put at the front in –
13 when we are redesigning streets and intersections. Thank you.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Thanks very much. Next speaker is Wayne [Note – Wynne] Furth. Wynne, I'm
16 sorry.

17

18 Ms. Wynne Furth: Good evening. My name is Wynne Furth, I'm the Chairmen of the
19 Architectural Review Board of the City of Palo Alto and I'm glad to know that – we are glad to
20 know that you all are working on this project. We have reviewed a very large number of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 projects along this stretch of El Camino Real and also north and south in the past – in the recent
2 past. Most of them are still being built and more of them are coming to us. Some of them are
3 hotels, some of them are all residential, some of them are all commercial, some of them are
4 mixed-use. They all intensify the use on their sites which are sometimes a bit small. They are
5 often adjacent to these rather narrow side streets with rolled curbs which have their own
6 transportation, pedestrian, bicycle problems because that leads to parking half on the sidewalk,
7 half on the street. And as we've looked at them our charge is to make sure that they work well
8 for pedestrian and bicycle traffic on and off the site, there's adequate loading, that they
9 basically function and one of the – we do pretty well I think in dealing from the curb to the
10 building. I mean there's... we have the south El Camino and the El Camino Design Guidelines
11 that's all for these wider sidewalks, we have street furniture, we have trees but the thing that
12 keeps coming up which is really more in your jurisdiction is what I understand is called curb
13 management. And that is what happens between the curb, what happens beyond the curb and
14 most of these projects assume that they will have less use of cars by the people coming to the
15 project or in the projects. That they'll use ride-sharing service, that they use bikes, that they will
16 walk but they don't necessarily come to us to designed that way so we do what we can about
17 their design. We try to make sure that the driveways are designed in a way so that people
18 walking or even bicycling along the sidewalks won't have lethal conflicts with the cars coming in
19 and out. But we make assumptions and Staff tells us that space will be available for example on
20 the curb for commercial loading and for laundry services and for deliveries. And we make

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 assumptions that when we can, which is usually the case in a hotel, we make sure that they are
2 designed so that anybody waiting for a ride service has a place to meet that ride, not on El
3 Camino but we can't do that for some of these projects. They're simply... if you look at that one,
4 if you look at the top left-hand corner I think where it says bus stop, that's the new small unit
5 housing project which is designed on the premise that people will use alternative forms of
6 transportation. It's a snug site, those people want to be able to get around to the Cal Ave
7 District, they want to get... I always think of it as North... towards San Francisco on El Camino
8 and then hang a right and then they are fine once they cross the way but it's hard for that. So,
9 as you do this we would very much appreciate if in thinking about this you think about how
10 those on street support functions of these new and old developments interact with what you're
11 thinking. Thank you for your work on this.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Great, thank you. Ken... is it Joye?

14

15 Mr. Ken Joye: Ken Joy, I'm a resident of the Ventura neighborhood and I want to thank Staff for
16 the work preparing this and you all for considering it. I have to say I went to one of the data
17 collection meetings that the consultant mentioned at the farmer's market and I probably
18 marked something on the form there that I've since then changed my mind about. At one point
19 I want to affirm is in the belief that bicycles were better served by going parallel paths but my
20 mind has changed. And I think the key thing was something that was referred to as the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Peninsula Bike Way or the Manager's Mobility Consortium where people are trying to look at
2 how you get from Redwood City to Mountain View on a bicycle. And it seems to me that the
3 best place is probably El Camino Real and the plan that's put forward here is Option Number
4 One would really serve that so I encourage you to consider that as a strong option. I do have
5 one question, I know that this has been addressed but I'm not sure where northbound cyclists
6 would be coming from as they move from Lambert forward to Portage? How does this plan tie
7 into the existing connection between the ballpark path along Margarita to Park Boulevard? One
8 other thing I'd love to see if 24 by 7 automated data collection of all bicycle movements on El
9 Camino Real in this project so if you could toss that in there that would be super. Thank you for
10 your time.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Thanks. David Coale.

13

14 Mr. David Coale: Yes, my name is David Coale and I'm a Barron Park resident. I also went to a
15 meeting just earlier this week about this project and as a cyclist and cycling advocate I actually
16 support Option Two. I think that parallel routes get you away from the most congested, highest
17 possible accident place to put a bike path. Even if you had a protected bike lane, you do not get
18 rid the right hooks and the two lower sections of accident reports that were on the Staff report.
19 Those don't go away and protected bike lane on El Camino will never be an 8 to 80 bike path, it
20 just would never feel safe.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 As far as having a connected route from Redwood City to Palo Alto, that's a tough one. I think in
3 our area between Lambert and Stanford Avenue we do have very good parallel routes. I would
4 rather see money put into Park Boulevard and to unfreeze those funds. And finish that project
5 and those projects, the bike boulevards, to make that the safest alternatives so the people
6 would be gravitated to that area.

7

8 On the bulb-outs, learn from Arastradero. They redesigned all the bulbs out because they were
9 too sharp so they paid twice for that. So, start with the Arastradero radius and reconsider that.
10 Also, reconsider and have modeled the amount of rear-end collisions that happen when
11 somebody slams on the break to make these 90 degrees turn when you have bulb-outs and
12 how sharp that should or shouldn't be. I know you want to reduce that crossing lane for
13 pedestrians but consider the back up of traffic.

14

15 On the jump queue lane, if you're heading northbound in the morning on El Camino toward
16 Page Mill Road, it backs up all the way to Matadero. So that this little jump in and out of lanes
17 that they show along El Camino is totally not feasible. So, the jump lane should be redesigned
18 or considered because it's just not possible with the flow of traffic. In the morning at 8:30 I
19 couldn't – you know it was jammed up to Matadero, all lanes, so I think that needs a little more
20 thought. Thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Thank you. Cedric de la Beaujardiere.

Mr. Cedric de la Beaujardiere: Hi, I'm Cedric de la Beaujardiere, I live in Barron Park, I am what you classify as a – what is it, a strong and fearless rider. And I do ride down El Camino quite often on my bike when I am going to businesses on California Avenue for instances is the most frequent thing. If I'm not going on Cal Ave I go to Park and Park is a much more friendly bicycle route but I do often go on El Camino and even as a fearless rider it is absolutely terrifying. So, I strongly support Option Two, I think it would be a great improvement to bicycle safety. As we saw there were 31 accidents... 31 collisions between bikes and vehicles in that area so that's significant. So yeah, it would increase safety and I think as others have mentioned it would also potentially increase the mode share, including all those developments that are depending upon increased mode share of bicycling and walking.

If you do, do Option Two instead, I noted that there is some places where there's the... where there's kind of a wide bus stop connected to the sidewalk. And the idea is that the bus stops basically in the traffic lane and the idea is that a bicyclist should stop and wait for the bus to go and then go forward. As a cyclist who rides on pretty burly streets like El Camino, I can tell you that a cyclist like me is not going to wait behind the bus. It's going to go around the bus and then there's the risk of getting hit by a car behind them. So, given the... that Option Two has

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 some slight improvements for bicycling but not very much and doesn't really address the bulk
2 of those collisions there; the behind swipe collisions. I think that that aspect of it really needs to
3 be considered and take that... allow the buses to pull out of the way of traffic and let the bikes
4 go past. Thank you very much and please support Option Two.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Thank you, helpful. Kelsey Banes.

7

8 Ms. Kelsey Banes: Good evening Commissioners, my name is Kelsey Banes, I'm a resident of
9 University South and I just want to start by saying I support these efforts to generally make El
10 Camino safer for pedestrians and bicyclist regardless of which redesign you go with. However, I
11 would favor the redesign that creates protected bike lanes over retaining on-street parking. My
12 reasons for this are about traffic, so traffic is one of the main concerns in Palo Alto. And if we
13 want to really make an effort in reducing traffic, I think we should make it feel much safer and
14 make it more pleasant for a bicyclist to run errands and go out to eat and things like that. So,
15 basically making the experience of biking a more pleasant one. And I think that even if it's just a
16 small barrier I hope you would explore ways to make it even safer because of the comment that
17 it's not going to be 8 to 80. And I think that's important but even if it's a minor improvement I
18 think that could change behavior.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The other thing that wasn't really mentioned that I would be curious about is if removing on-
2 street parking, just given that cars take time to pull in and out of spots and wait for spots to
3 open up, if not having the on-street parking could actually reduce traffic. And I just had some
4 more questions about bus priority and how that will work because ideally it will be set up so
5 that buses can have priority over cars. But I thought the gentlemen who spoke before me who
6 talked about the danger of blocking bikes made a really good point. So, just looking for ways to
7 make bus travel more quick and favorite over cars but not get in the way of a bicyclist. Thank
8 you.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Ok thank you. That completes the speaker (interrupted)

11

12 Mr. Beaujardiere: I'm sorry I miss spoke, I meant Option One, support Option One. I was told... I
13 said the wrong thing. Option One, thank you.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Alright it comes back to the Commission for comments and I think we'll just look
16 for lights. Mr. Riggs.

17

18 Commissioner Riggs: I have... so I don't... I'm just going to structure my comments on this
19 because they're comments and questions and I need to kind of unpack them so maybe we
20 could stop and... if you want to dive deep. I... so I guess my first comment is I feel like there may

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be some embedded bias in the locations that you've gathered some of the feedback. They all
2 seem very concentrated around Cal Ave so they seem to be targeting a certain type of user and
3 that user may be already bias towards... maybe already have other cognitive or availability bias
4 that is already slanted towards biking or walking. Particularly if you're doing it around the
5 farmers market so I would just caution you to maybe expand the type of event that you're
6 doing. Maybe put somebody out there at Mayfield during the day to talk to the people... you
7 know all the people that are there waiting to get their kids after soccer practice or something
8 like that. That may be a good idea and maybe you go further up or down Cal Avenue but I just
9 think expanding that audience might be a good strategy.

10

11 I guess my second big question and/or comment is I think its really clearly... I mean the physical
12 design options here I would suggest similar interventions but I feel like you're giving us to ends
13 of the spectrum with nothing in the middle from a physical intervention standpoint. One is
14 basically a... almost a status quo alternative with certain minor augmentations and one is
15 exactly another extremely -- a super enhanced completed street. And there could be many
16 different permutations in the middle of that, let alone many different options at any of these
17 intersections. I mean you mentioned a Phase for the bike... for the cars and I immediately
18 thought well why not do a full bike phase at Cal Ave which I didn't... maybe I'm
19 misunderstanding your statement. But it sounded like there was... there would be a right-hand
20 turn phase as opposed to a full stop phase which I know Caltrans will allow. Caltrans will allow

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 for a full bike crossing phase where the intersection becomes an effective scrambler. So, I don't
2 see... I think we just want to make sure that we looked at the full... I would want to make sure,
3 let me not speak for the rest of the Commission, you've looked at the full range of options. And
4 I've not been presented those options and I don't know that they've been dialogue, I see two
5 ends of the spectrum. So maybe... I don't know that we need to dive into that but I just see a
6 limitation. I think the... I would say personally I favor the kind of the more aggressive... just
7 based on my personal bias the more aggressive complete street. I think that the curbside
8 management piece is better facilitated by removing the parking particularly for all the housing
9 that we're... and other active serving uses that we're putting along El Camino.

10

11 But I would say that I have one concern and this is, I'm chewing down to the meat of my
12 comment, is that I'm really concerned about embedded bias in the original... the first slide... you
13 know 51 collisions. You haven't told me anything about traffic volume, you haven't told me
14 anything about bicycle volume, you haven't told me anything about pedestrian volume, you
15 haven't told me anything about parking occupancy, and I want to believe that these
16 interventions are appropriate. I don't know what the travel... what the current patterns are if
17 this type of investment per volume is wanted. What we know is that this... these 51 collisions
18 wouldn't stand up in a traditional [unintelligible] statistical model. We know that this is not a
19 significant sample and that this is mainly... this is most likely randomized... this is random. And
20 so, unless I can get the volume data, I don't actually know that I'm making... that we would be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 making a good use of prioritizing limited transportation funding along this corridor. And I think
2 we heard that from... in my opinion, we heard that from a couple in the audience who felt like
3 prioritizing off El Camino was the better option for their own commute. But I haven't seen the
4 cyclist data on each of these corridors to know whether or not we would induce... we would... I
5 don't believe that we're going to induce.... I think we have to be cautious in saying that we're
6 going to induce mode shift by physical intervention because there's very little [unintelligible]
7 that shows that but we're going to choose people traveling differently. And I just think that
8 we... I haven't seen convincing data from what you've presented that this is actually... these are
9 justified. And that... I just... I think its maybe time to step back and maybe take a data-driven
10 approach to what I want which is this awesome cycle track you're pitching but I haven't seen
11 the data-driven argument here. And I... maybe I'll just let it be at that, I have some other
12 detailed design options if that Option One, that sexy El Camino awesomeness is going to
13 happen but I think it's not worth maybe diving into that until we know that that's the right
14 policy chose. And that would be the only... that's the real concern that I have starting off with
15 here.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Ok you don't (interrupted)

18

19 Commissioner Riggs: If I said anything to fast, I'm happy to go back.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: You don't need to respond but you can respond just so you know the ground
2 rules. So, if you wanted to give him any feedback on that or we can continue until you have
3 more...

4

5 Commissioner Riggs: You don't have to respond.

6

7 Chair Lauing: I mean I'm talking about clarification. Ok, let's go on to the next one then.

8

9 Mr. Lait: Oh, I'm sorry Chair, so we may have some information to inform the conversation. It
10 may not... I don't think we got to the level that you have but if we have some traffic... we may
11 have some traffic volume data that we can share with you at least.

12

13 Commissioner Riggs: I think that would help, for me, to justify whether or not we can... I mean
14 because if we have a high-volume intersection, both high volume for multiple modes, then that
15 actually... and that is consistent with the collisions than we maybe have a logical argument. But
16 I still think there either could be a degree of randomness in these collisions and so we
17 necessarily aren't making collision-based decisions, we're making a volume-based decision. So, I
18 think it's... collisions drive emotion but they can happen anywhere.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Sure. We'll have to do... get some more data but for information that we have
2 available now, we're happy to share that.

3
4 Commissioner Riggs: And let me say, for you Staff, I have an Eco counter, it just happens to be
5 one of the... if my lab will allow the City to use it, we can install it somewhere out there if you
6 want to use it. I'm happy to do that for a little while. You may have one in place but we can
7 figure that out and dialog it later. It's... mines at Hoover Elementary School right now counting
8 little people so we can figure out if that's a resource that I can provide to you.

9
10 Mr. Mullen: So as far as... I can speak to the data question about traffic volume. The El Camino
11 is around 40,000 cars per day, it's given or take and it fluctuates but that's what we're looking
12 at. And then we also do have parking... the parking stall counts as well. It's a bit of an estimate
13 because the stalls aren't formally marked but throughout the corridor, it's 154 stalls and that's
14 the study [unintelligible](interrupted).

15
16 Commissioner Riggs: But I would just say that we have to take a... have you looked at a
17 probabilistic approach. That's a lot of volume for not... I mean so... there are far more vehicle
18 collisions for example at 19th Avenue and Highway 1 [note – maybe Highway 101] in the City.
19 So, I just... I would like to see a probabilistic approach to that. Not just... and you can't do that
20 without the pedestrian and cyclist data. You can tell me 40,00 trips but...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Lait: Sure, no I don't... and we're not questioning that. I think we just want to share what
3 data we had available now and understand that we may just need to do some more work.

4

5 Commissioner Riggs: So, one of the things that embedded in my suggestion is if there are not
6 great spot counts on bike/ped volume. That could be something that we asked Fehr and Peers
7 to do during peak hours to compliment and reinforce maybe some of the argument. And I don't
8 know if that's being done, maybe that's something that we can ask Stanford about. I don't
9 know if Stanford... if some of this seems... I'm done, sorry.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Ok, you're done as well? Ok. Commissioner Gardias.

12

13 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you very much for your report and thank you very much public
14 for just arming us with a different perspective. It's always usefully to hear what Palo Altans
15 think so thanks very much. So, a couple of comments and I think the discussion will continue, so
16 it probably would be useful to see what others are doing. We had this conversation with
17 Commissioner Summa and I'm sure that she's going to speak to it as well but the concept of
18 Grand Boulevard has been here since I was here. Since maybe not forever but at least 5-years
19 but so it would be interesting to see the... how the whole concept is implemented or is
20 discussed in other municipalities. And I understand that this is not... we're not talking about the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 whole boulevard, we're just talking about the streetscaping. The discussion about the
2 boulevard would be much greater than this but I'd like to understand what is the continuity of...
3 whether the decision in Mountain View and then further south, Sunnyvale, in regards to the
4 same throughput of the bikes and cars. Are they just leaning towards allowing the bikes running
5 along the El Camino or they are precluding this giving that there's a limitation? At least in
6 Mountain View and Palo Alto, there is a limit of the width. I think that further south El Camino
7 goes then it... the wider it gets so they have broader opportunities over there but at least
8 adjacent municipalities I would like to understand what is their thinking in trying to align the
9 bikes with the street or not so that's number one.

10

11 In terms of the... I'd like to also understand some other items that... because I get it, we just
12 focus on the small section of... that is prone to some accidents. So, I'd like to understand more
13 about... also about the bike traffic. I'd like to have... besides the cars, I'd like to know how many
14 bikers are there, how many potential bikers would it be if we opened this to others because it
15 would be much safer? So, I'd like to see the current count and I'd like to just see some estimate
16 based on some scientific data what would be increased traffic if we opened this to others. This
17 would also allow us just too... and the counts to judge from the perspective of the investment is
18 that the money well spent if it's going to be say small volume open maybe to some stronger
19 bikers. I don't remember what the gentlemen was calling himself but would it be open to
20 everyone or it would be open only to a few?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 And then I would also like to understand and maybe that's a different option, this current
3 design although segregates... and this is Option Number One. Although it segregates bike traffic
4 from the street it still... the bikes are still aligned with the street. That may be a nuance but it's
5 a very important one because in some other municipalities bike traffic is aligned with the
6 sidewalk. Pretty much those bike routes are parts of the sidewalk which is totally a different
7 thing. It's the same surface, pretty much there is a very small separation between the
8 pedestrians and the bikers. That extension may be used by the pedestrians due to some... I
9 don't know maybe due to some... during some other hours but then it's a different concept
10 than to separate a lane that is part of a street.

11

12 Also, I would like to see an option that would allow us maybe not use... my question would be
13 like this. Is there any other option the using of Park Boulevard as an alternate route? Perhaps
14 there is not because we are all going to look at Park Boulevard and say ok, there's already a
15 bike route there. Do we really... is there any other alternative to pretty much allow bikes just to
16 go in parallel along El Camino as opposed to in a distance which is Park Boulevard.

17

18 Also, I have a couple question so maybe you can just help me on this. What is the cost of the... if
19 those bus queue... jump queue lanes would be entertained what is the cost of the acquisition of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 those properties that are in... that would be subject of that acquisition? And you don't have to
2 provide that answer at this moment but probably somebody will ask this question.

3

4 There is... there was... we have the Chair of ARB and she brought the question that or the
5 comment about the properties that are along this stretch of El Camino Boulevard. And then I
6 think that it may impair those properties if you're going to take away the land as it is in Option
7 Number One. I don't think its part of Option Number Two as, well right? It's Option only One
8 when you acquire some land from those properties. Are you going to pretty much impure those
9 owners so their properties will just not have much of the value because it becomes so small, so
10 inaccessible, and if this is the case why do we even bother with this? Has this been thought
11 through or it was just drawn because it's pretty? So, I'm just throwing this, don't answer it right
12 now but you should have those answers in the [unintelligible] because somebody is going to ask
13 us this question.

14

15 And then also just a question that you may tell me... answer right now. In Option One when
16 bikes are run along the El Camino Boulevard, that stripe of route that is taken away from the
17 street it makes it narrower right? Is it... is that... that strip of land that's designated for a bike
18 lane, it's... how wide is this and is it taken away from the road or is it taken away from the
19 sidewalk?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Rowley: So, it actually converts the on-street parking lane to a bicycle lane. That's how the
2 parking would need to be removed in Option One. So effectively the width of the travel way is
3 the same although we may have recommended actually slight reductions in the lane widths but
4 we're not removing a travel lane to accommodate the bicycle lanes. It's just in place, kind of
5 right on top of where the parking is.

6

7 Mr. Mullen: I'd like to add to that too, we also looked at some earlier plans along El Camino
8 Real. Including El Camino Real Master Plan from 2007 which was never adopted but it
9 progressed to a pretty mature draft that had some conceptual design ideas in it. One of which
10 was to narrow the traffic lanes from 12-feet to 11-feet... 1-foot sorry to accommodate a slightly
11 wider median. Specifically, in the area between... sorry, I have to look at these S streets,
12 Sheridan and Stanford Avenue which currently has no planting in most of it and the idea was to
13 try to facilitate more landscaping in the median. So, we are trying to pick off of or use that as a
14 starting point along with some of the other feedback we received. So, the lanes are narrower
15 going from 12 to 11-feet and then the parking would be removed in Option One as Kendra
16 noted.

17

18 Commissioner Gardias: And probably there is no option just to accommodate the bike lane and
19 then still allow for the car parking along El Camino? Just removing the or narrowing or totally

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 removing the median. I believe in... around Charleston that median disappears... in some areas,
2 it disappears completely right? It's just a concrete curb.

3
4 Mr. Mullen: So that is one thing that the El Camino Real Master Plan draft actually looked at
5 was looking at striping on-street bike lanes next to parallel parking. And you could smooch
6 everything in there actually but with the current guidance, we wouldn't recommend that
7 because you would just have a standard 5-foot bike lane between on-street parking next to
8 very high speed, high volume automobile traffic. So, we wouldn't recommend that with our
9 current design guidelines.

10
11 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. Thank you, I'm glad that you had the answer from the top
12 of your head. So, my preference would be, just so you know, to allow the bike lanes with... to
13 have bike lanes being a part of the sidewalk. Not being a part of the street as it's currently
14 proposed if this Option Number One is going to be preferred by others. Thank you for now.

15
16 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Monk [**note – Vice Chair Monk**].

17
18 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you and thank you to all the speakers that came out tonight. I think the
19 comments were really useful and I'm particularly grateful for our Director or Chair of the ARB
20 who came out. That was very nice to hear from you. Just as a preliminary question, can you

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 kind of explain to us this grand boulevard concept versus the safety issues presented because
2 it's a little convoluted as to what we're supposed to be... what lens we're supposed to be
3 viewing this as.

4

5 Mr. Mullen: Sure, so the grand boulevard is basically a... it's not an agency, it's not a regulatory
6 government agency. It's really more of a coordinating group of agencies along the corridor... the
7 El Camino Real corridor from Santa Clara County all the way up to San Francisco. And the idea is
8 to use it as kind of a brainstorming session to come up with ideas for really approach El Camino
9 Real which has a very strong presence in all of these communities. And there's a lot of shared
10 issues but really to develop approaches that Cities can pick and choose from that fit their
11 individual unique needs. So, the grand boulevard is not a prescriptive agency that... top-down
12 agency. It's a brainstorming idea bank basically. So, this project is done in partnership with the
13 grand boulevard. It's a bit of a complicated funding structure (interrupted)

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: Jarrett, I'll spare you for all the details. I really wanted to know if other Cities
16 are viewing the grand boulevard implementation or concept in terms of addressing safety or is
17 there some other aesthetic that we should be considering? Because what I'm looking at that
18 we've just been presenting this... it's been presented to me mostly as a safety concern. That's
19 how I'm viewing our report today. I don't know if others are sharing that sentiment but that
20 was something that I took away from the report so I'm a little confused by that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Mullen: So, safety is usually the highest priority in all of our roadway designing efforts but the grand boulevard does touch on placemaking and aesthetics as well.

Vice-Chair Monk: And then we're designating, just to confirm so that folks are aware, we're talking about .8 of a mile here. So less... you know close to ¾ of a mile so I wouldn't really view this as an extensive amount of travel that someone will be doing if they want to travel from Palo Alto to Redwood City or to Mountain View. You're not going to be utilizing this ¾ of a mile stretch together because it's many more miles beyond that. So just to clarify that we're talking about a pretty small stretch.

In regards to the connectivity that Kendra brought up, you mentioned the arterial designation which I was surprised to hear because to me El Camino Real is quite a major thoroughfare. Did I hear you correctly and can you elaborate on that a little bit more? And the reason I'm asking is if we've got bike boulevards and other streets that we're trying to divert bicycle traffic onto, how does that intersect with that current designation?

Mr. Mullen: So, I'm sorry you mentioned the (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: I just want to confirm, you said it was an arterial designation. That sounds like
2 any other [unintelligible](interrupted)

3

4 Mr. Mullen: Yes, in our Comprehensive Plan it's designated as an arterial.

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: Versus a major thoroughfare?

7

8 Mr. Mullen: You could see them interchangeably.

9

10 Vice-Chair Monk: That is interchangeable.

11

12 Mr. Mullen: Those are kind of interchangeable terms but it's... I referred to the Comprehensive
13 Plan designation of arterial.

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok. I have a few more questions and I'll try to go as quickly as I can. This is
16 my... I do want you to consider and look into for additional study when I... you know I'm an... I
17 consider myself very much a novice local cyclist. And when I tried to go from here to Redwood
18 City or other communities [note-using] Google maps using the bike app it puts me on El Camino
19 but I know I do not want to be on my bicycle on El Camino Real at any point in time. And in the
20 brief conversations I've had with Google I understand their maps team is located in Switzerland.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And the bicycle people... I don't even know but we have contacts... I know that the Planning
2 Department has some contacts there but I think it's a big issue that they are diverting traffic.
3 And I do believe I have some... it may not be reliable but some good insight information that
4 Google is intentionally diverting cycling traffic to paid advertising businesses and to me that is a
5 very competitive safety issue. If they are actually intentionally putting cyclists on busy roadways
6 because that's their -- they are getting sponsorships for their Google map applications and
7 things like that. So, I would like additional study and investigation because you're using Google
8 maps and you're relying on that icon for cycling and it's not even showing a bicycle boulevard
9 that's right here that's only two blocks away. It's adjacent, it's much longer, it's much safer, it's
10 a parallel street, there's something wrong that we're not getting that map so I really do want
11 additional study on that. I think it's really critical and also with Park actually because if the
12 segment is south of where Bryant stops, it would be... I guess the [unintelligible] boulevard.

13
14 In regards to the number of crashes, you said that there were 50 crashes over the last 10-years.
15 I think it would be interesting to know the number of pedestrian incidents versus cycling
16 incidents. I don't think it was detailed in here and when you were... I mean do you know the
17 answer to that now or did you have that data point?

18
19 Mr. Mullen: Yes, I believe it was... yes, it's on the Packet Page 13, there are two tables that
20 break out the total collision by mode.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Monk: So, can you just... how many pedestrians and how many were cycling?

3

4 Mr. Mullen: Twenty pedestrian collisions, 31 bicycles.

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: So slightly more bicycle versus pedestrian? Ok well, that's helpful because to

7 me when you look at the two options. One of them really looks more bicycle oriented, slightly

8 pedestrian, and then the other one looks like status quo as Commissioner Riggs was eluding

9 too. They look kind of extreme so just quantifying it in terms of where the data is at is helpful.

10 So, when you look at the proposals that were given to us, the two options, and that one of the...

11 you said one of the issues was high speed. That was... those... you gave us a third, a third, and a

12 third. I think those were for cycling accidents, is that right? The high speed, going the wrong

13 way and seniors?

14

15 Ms. Rowley: (off mic) Seniors where pedestrian.

16

17 Vice-Chair Monk: That was the pedestrian, ok? So that was the total number? So in regards to

18 high speed... so I'm just wondering... what I want to know is how are these proposals solving for

19 those issues? What are... where are you doing... what's being done to address high speed and

20 this is just for you to consider? Are you putting any signage up? Are you putting any markers to

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 indicate how fast people are traveling? Share the road? I know we have rules about too much
2 signage in Palo Alto. We don't want to... I know we have other rules that we need to comply
3 with but is that happening because I would prefer to see that the solutions being presented
4 actually solve the very specific problems that are identified. That they are being caused by
5 people speeding so is this slowing people down, yes or no? People going the wrong way, is this
6 addressing that particular issue? Seniors, I don't know what to say about that if that's... because
7 it's more likely that seniors walk versus young people and that's just how the demographics
8 turn out or are seniors doing things that are problematic? I don't know. So, I think it was
9 Commissioner... both Commissioners that spoke before were wanting a little bit more
10 information on that and I think it would be useful.

11

12 I'm trying to read my own handwriting which is terrible. I've got a... I can't even write right now
13 so I apologize. I'll just try to read it and see if it makes sense when it comes out. If the concern is
14 over the bicycle and pedestrian accidents then why does it seem that the options are kind of
15 extreme that I had just mentioned? I mean are there other scenarios that were considered for
16 the issues presented that were not presented tonight? That might be a question more for
17 Kendra, I don't know but it just looked like we just got two extremes (interrupted)

18

19 Mr. Mullen: I can speak to that.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: Options and nothing like midway.

2

3 Mr. Mullen: The options are... they're really making use of the [unintelligible] right of way all
4 priorities considered. I'd actually... if we were looking at more extreme options that would
5 probably involve repurposing motor vehicle travel lanes and we are not considering that in
6 these options.

7

8 Vice-Chair Monk: Yeah, I'm not saying that we need to consider more extreme options but what
9 I'm saying is that I think Commissioner Riggs eluded to it. So, I'm just concurring with his
10 position that one of them looks like its more or less maintaining status quo and one of them is
11 pretty aggressive with bicycles was kind of what I took away Commissioner Riggs if I'm correct?

12

13 Commissioner Riggs: [unintelligible – off mic]

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: That's sort of my take away just on the two here. It doesn't seem like there
16 are other options presented.

17

18 Commissioner Riggs: I think that I'll just weigh in. It's basically either Class One or Class
19 (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: Kind of all or nothing.

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: I called it Class Four but it seems like there are variances like you could do
4 a Class Two protected bikeway. I don't think there'd be anything inconsistent and I would
5 [unintelligible] on that. And I just feel like we're only seeing... what I was saying is we're only
6 seeing one variance of aggressive bike options when there may be... we haven't seen pure Class
7 Four (interrupted)

8

9 Vice-Chair Monk: Yes, I'm just (interrupted)

10

11 Commissioner Riggs: Bi-directional bikeway here and that... you could do that.

12

13 Vice-Chair Monk: Yeah, I'm concurring with that, for example, I'm seeing that you're taking
14 parking on both sides of El Camino when maybe you should just have bicycle lanes right next to
15 each other going either direction. Put them in the middle of El Camino or put them on one side
16 so that you're not taking away parking on both sides of El Camino. I just would like to see
17 additional creativity and study on that. Particularly given the comments that were made from
18 the Chair of the ARB that we're looking at a lot of driveways and the curb to building issues. I
19 really think that... I don't know how deeply explored that was and I definitely encourage a
20 further analysis of that. It seems to me on the... I'm calling on the west side of the street I guess

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there's less... it seems like less driveways. And maybe that would be the area to focus on a bike
2 lane rather than the east side where you're seeing a lot more driveways and buildings and cars
3 that might be going in and out.

4
5 So on to cars and traffic and parking do we know how many spaces are going to be removed
6 under either option? It might be in here but I don't recall exactly where it's located because I
7 know that spaces are going to be removed in either option.

8
9 Mr. Mullen: That's correct, as far as the total number of existing parking stalls that figure was
10 not in your Packet so you weren't imagining that one. But the total number of parking stalls
11 along the corridor... along the studied corridor is 154 and that's between Stanford and Lambert.
12 Some of that is an estimate because many block faces do not have formally striped parking
13 stalls but when we did estimate we estimated on the more conservative side.

14
15 Vice-Chair Monk: I think it would be useful as you go forward to know how... what percentage
16 that 154 is on the east side versus the west side of the avenue and the proximity to businesses
17 and the frequency of drivers accessing those businesses? Are they sitting there all day? Are they
18 coming in and out? Those are things that you really need to be conscientious of, especially if
19 we're trying to accommodate for cyclists. Because you can put in these beautiful bike lanes, but
20 if you're having cars come in and out every half hour at this one particular block or cars sitting

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there all day and dealing with doors opening and closing, things like that, it's going to be a
2 factor. So, just... so I am concerned about Option One, I prefer Option One over nothing but it
3 doesn't seem like the right solution at the time. And I don't think it necessarily worth taking
4 away necessary and desperately needed parking for roughly ¾ of a mile. So, I just don't have
5 enough data to fully get behind that idea. I know Ed is giving me the eye here and wants me to
6 hurry up, I think. So yeah, I would recommend if we had to vote on something today, I would
7 say more on doing Option One. But maybe on Cal Avenue specifically, my concern is that you
8 have bike lanes that direct people to that intersection on either side but then there's no way to
9 really cross over El Camino. You have to go in the crosswalk as a cyclist or you have to be
10 concerned about a car making a left turn and crashing into you and likewise the competing
11 interest with the pedestrians as well. I do have more things, I'm taking a bit more time than...
12 I've got more issues. I think I brought them up at the pre-meeting Chair so if you want to relay
13 that to the consultant you may.

14

15 I was curious why we didn't hear from any cycling groups; SV... what are they called? Which
16 one?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: [unintelligible – off mic]

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: No, the SV... the one that puts on the bike Palo Alto and S... did you consult
2 with any of the local cycling group to get their opinions and I just didn't see... I don't know if
3 that was part of your outreach or not. I think it would be relevant to find out who the
4 stakeholders are in the community and get their input. I didn't see any letters come in either, I
5 was kind of surprised by that.

6
7 Mr. Mullen: So, we didn't ask for letters at this time. This is structured a little bit differently in
8 that this PTC meeting is more of a piece of the outreach, the final kind of stage of outreach. And
9 that's partially because of the way the grant was structured but not to go into too much detail
10 there. I did speak with a representative from SVBC at the College Terrace open house and was
11 reminded of the coordination with neighborhood Cities which I can speak to later if that's
12 requested. And we did bring this... the same information you're getting tonight before the
13 Pedestrian Bicycle Advisory Committee earlier in the month.

14
15 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you.

16
17 Chair Lauing: Yeah ok thanks. I'd just like to get everybody else in for... everybody's light is on.
18 This is a topic that we're interested in so I just want to make sure that everybody gets in kind of
19 a first chance before we go around and second, so next up is Commissioner Waldfogel.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Thank you. I'll try to be brief at least on this pass. I think this is the
2 first transportation agenda item we've seen this year (interrupted)

3

4 Chair Lauing: That's right.

5

6 Commissioner Waldfogel: And I would really like to see an El Camino Master Plan come back to
7 us for a discussion. If there some policy around that I'd like to know what it is. I don't know that
8 I have that and (interrupted)

9

10 [note-male speaker spoke off mic]: [unintelligible]

11

12 Commissioner Waldfogel: Around El Camino Master Plan and I'd also like to get a presentation
13 on the grand boulevard. I mean in 3-years we have not had a presentation on the grand
14 boulevard and what the status is. I mean I'm not up to speed. Is **BRT** still under discussion for
15 the grand boulevard?

16

17 [note – male speaker]: No.

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: Has that ever been told to us officially?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: So, I don't believe its still on the table. I think the... if... backed off of that for the lack of
2 response from different Cities.

3

4 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok well I mean that's just not something that we (interrupted)

5

6 Mr. Lait: Yeah, we have a broader conversation that we need to have about how Staff and... is
7 engaging the Planning Commission on transportation-related issues. This has been a
8 conversation point that we're having now (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: Right right.

11

12 Mr. Lait: As we talk about the Office of Transportation and how we support those interests.

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: No, I'm just sort of pointing out that it's hard to jump into this
15 because we don't have a lot of contexts that would be quite helpful. The other thing that I think
16 we really need to hear about is how committed VTA is to transit in north county? You know the
17 522 bus or some extension of the 520 bus. You know there's been a lot of debates about
18 frequency on those buses and so it's hard for me to know how much investment to make in bus
19 lanes when I don't know if the operating agency is really committed to using them. So, do you
20 have any comment on that, on their long-term commitments?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Mullen: The latest point of reference we have where the service plan assumptions from the VTA Next Network which was basically, for those who aren't familiar, was a complete top to bottom network redesign proposed by VTA. And that hasn't been implemented yet due to delays with the rollout of the incoordination with the [unintelligible] Bart extension. However, the bottom line is the service on El Camino increased from what there was today. So, El Camino Real -- in all of VTA's long-range planning documents, El Camino Real is their core highest ridership transit corridor and that's really because of the land use around it. So well into the future, it's probably pretty fair to say that service will stay frequent along the corridor.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok it would be helpful if we got a report on that again because it's just hard to know what kind of investments to make if we don't know what the operating agencies commitments are.

One other just area of background, you mentioned at the front of this report that El Camino is an arterial and could you just list out what are the north/south arterials? What's the list of them?

Mr. Mullen: I'm going to be working from memory here so (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Memory is a pretty good start.

2

3 Mr. Mullen: We... it's principally El Camino Real and Alma Street. Other streets such as
4 Middlefield Road are actually kind of a subclassification called a residential arterial which is still
5 intended to move traffic but through... it acknowledges the residential contexts. So, it
6 emphasizes a little slower vehicle speeds and more landscaping and aspects like that. I cannot
7 recall if West and East Bay Shore are classified as arterial roads. Those are the Highway 101
8 frontage roads so you'll have to forgive me for that.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: That's fine so from a classification standpoint you're saying that El
11 Camino and Alma are the same category?

12

13 Mr. Mullen: Yes, that's correct. The... El Camino is a little more unique because of its land use
14 context. There're commercial services on El Camino and also the changing land use on El
15 Camino is unique as well and Alma does not really possess that characteristic. Additionally, El
16 Camino Real is a designated state highway, it's under the jurisdiction of Caltrans. But they are a
17 project partner with this grant so they have been collaborating with us on these designs and
18 participating in review all along the way.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, does the arterial classification then put any responsibility for
2 throughput analysis or are we forecasting how much north/south traffic that we'll need to carry
3 through Palo Alto over the next two or three decades as we look at this project? Also looking at
4 things like Alma might get shut down for some period of time due to Caltrain construction. Are
5 we just sort of looking at all these things in the broader context of movement?

6
7 Mr. Mullen: Yes, absolutely. As far as these plans go, they really actually add motor vehicle
8 capacity with the Page Mill/El Camino intersection. The remainder of the corridor is really... not
9 really a change on motor vehicle capacity and operations overall.

10
11 Commissioner Waldfogel: That word overall has me worried. Ok, it doesn't really... I don't think
12 the report really gets to that or whether it's... I mean do we expect that the demand will stay
13 the same, will grow, will shrink, over the next two decades, three decades?

14
15 Mr. Mullen: The general assumption is traffic volumes. This is simplifying it but you generally
16 see an interest of increase of 1 percent per year. That's generally what models boil down too.

17
18 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok no that's helpful so have we built in 30 percent capacity growth
19 over the next three decades in this plan?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Mullen: That would involve changes to roadways capacity and widening or other
2 treatments that actually increase motor vehicle capacity. And that... we haven't looked at that
3 principally because the policies in the Comprehensive Plan do not... generally, do not speak to
4 expanding roadway capacity.

5

6 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, I guess what we can expect is that delays will just increase. I mean
7 it's not linear but whenever we hit the inflection points with that 1 percent a year growth, we'll
8 see delays going up exponentially. Is that a reasonable expectation?

9

10 Mr. Mullen: In the Comprehensive Plan Environmental Impact Report a full comprehensive
11 traffic impact analysis was performed generally using those growth rates. I'm simplifying it but
12 it generally used those growth rates to try to estimate or project future automobile demand at
13 the peak hour. And it did project significant delays at intersections... major intersections in the
14 City. Not all of them but some of them so there's... it basically poses a challenge to try to plan
15 for that and make policy decisions to address that.

16

17 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah so what could we do to anticipate or to mitigate those? I mean
18 are there things that we could do in this... within this scope to mitigate those impacts?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: So, I'm just going to insert myself here, I think that there's a... you're talking about a
2 broader conversation. I think this ¾ mile segment isn't going to answer the question that you're
3 posing.

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well but El Camino and Page Mill/Oregon is pretty impacted today.

6

7 Commissioner Riggs: Well let me just... I mean I (interrupted)

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Please.

10

11 Commissioner Riggs: Think that you're... we... you can't talk about a 1 percent increase in
12 isolation of efficiency gains and we see massive efficiency gains just in the technology we're
13 seeing in current vehicles. So, the idea of the linear relationship with traffic growth, even if
14 that's what they're plugging into the model is not rational. We're not going to see a linear
15 increase and that's... I know that he just... I know that was just said. No offense but that is
16 actually... that is overestimating volume increase so dramatically that's it's not worth... I know
17 you pitched back 30 percent increase over the next 30-years but that's like so far away out
18 there that I do think it's going to distract us from our purpose tonight. And it doesn't consider
19 the amount of innovation we have in this sector right now so I apologize Mr. Chair for

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 interjecting myself but I just think that is a huge zinger that we probably shouldn't go there.

2 And we can... I'm happy to talk offline because that's... it's not a rational argument.

3

4 Commissioner Waldfogel: Right but with all due respect then we do need to look at those
5 models so that we understand impacts because we're talking about something that will take a
6 couple years to implement. It will certainly have a 20 or 30-year lifespan so 30-years is actually
7 a reasonable interval to be thinking about what it does to north/south circulation.

8

9 Commissioner Riggs: If I can just throw out a statistic from... we... from my discipline in
10 engineering. We are anticipating at least 90 percent capacity green due to technological
11 innovation in the automotive sector over the next 30-years.

12

13 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, I'd like to see those studies because I've been working the
14 automotive sector and I'd be shocked if the technologies are doing what you think they are
15 doing. So anyway, there's a (interrupted)

16

17 Chair Lauing: Ok so that's a point for us to take a look at in the future.

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: I think that's for another day.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yeah, that's for another day. Did you have other comments Commissioner
2 Waldfogel?

3

4 Commissioner Waldfogel: I think I'll leave it at that, thank you.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Ok Commissioner Summa.

7

8 Commissioner Summa: Thank you and thank you for your presentation and also to everybody
9 who came tonight. At a very high level, I agree with a lot of comments that my colleagues have
10 made and I just... yeah, it would be perfect to have a fully multi-modal road with very wide, safe
11 bicycle and pedestrian. How to shoehorn all that in with what we have without losing vehicular
12 capacity or taking some in the transit queue jump or taking some land? How to fit it all into the
13 time when we're going to have increased... we're going to increase the needs for El Camino.
14 Especially when we think about all the construction along El Camino and a taking of a lane for
15 construction which is typically what happens with these projects because they cannot contain
16 their construction vehicles and needs on site. And we have concentrated a lot of the growth in
17 this same area interestingly enough and I think someone else mentioned it but we may have
18 Alma closed for a couple years at least which means all the construction traffic through the City
19 will come on El Camino. So, I see a lot of constraints and I'm not sure how to get what we want
20 out of this street without a lot of tradeoffs. I... and I am concerned that this piecemeal approach

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 on this one little not quite mile corridor with all this new stuff on it I don't see how it's really
2 addressing the problem throughout the City, much less the region, and I don't see really what
3 we're getting from it. I really... I'm terrified for bicyclists, I'm glad that we have some fierce
4 enough to ride on El Camino but I have always thought the approach of parallel bike routes on
5 safer streets was a better one.

6
7 I'm wondering... I think a red light... I live really close to El Camino so I... and I walk a lot. I don't
8 bike a lot but the speed at which people are driving and the red-light violations have become
9 alarming to me in the last year. I see someone run a red light at either California or Cambridge
10 every single day whether I'm walking or I'm in my car waiting to turn left. And its... I've seen
11 giant double haulers do it, I've seen articulated buses do it, I've seen regular cars do it, I've seen
12 motorcycles do it, I have not seen bikes do it, and I worry that some of these... some of those
13 problems. So, safety would be best addressed through police enforcement and I think that's a
14 real immediate need for that stretch of El Camino as I know it.

15
16 And I'm worried that... I don't know if you've taken into consideration that on the north half of
17 this project on both sides of the street there are neighborhoods that have RPP restrictions. So,
18 there's already a huge need for all that parking along El Camino. I don't experience it as being...
19 as empty as some of your studies show so I'm not sure how often you got to go out and do
20 those stall counts. And I don't know if all of the merchants along El Camino would be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 represented in the... I don't know how many of them you talked to outside of the Cal Ave
2 merchant group. And I think that you'd find that a lot of them really depend on that... on those
3 parking stalls.

4
5 I also note that we have a lot of tour buses parking on El Camino taking up those spots so
6 there's a lot of moving parts on El Camino. I'm not sure at a high level how to shoehorn it in. I
7 worry about some of the data that we don't seem to have. I worry about spending a lot of time
8 and money on a little short segment that isn't going to make the kind of improvements that
9 bicyclist really need so those are some of my high-level fears.

10
11 Your transit queue jumps at Page Mill Road, I think you should look at on the northbound side
12 just north of Page Mill. You have... you indicate taking a part of a lane there and actually that
13 bus stop... there's a project that's been approved there. And for that project to happen the bus
14 stop has to move up to the next block so I'm not sure that would even work there.

15
16 And I wonder if you have done any sort of interface with emergency... with the police and
17 emergency vehicle coordination because I have seen more than once the lanes being so full and
18 all the parking full-on El Camino that an emergency vehicle has to go down the wrong side. If
19 they are heading south and they go down the northbound lanes because they are emptier. And
20 that's pretty scary so I wonder if we've really coordinated with the emergency people.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

And I do worry also that we have had a trend lately of moving loading zones off of sites off onto streets which is also taking up parking. So those are just some of my fears and I wonder if it's... if we have really looked at all these things and if we have all the data that Commissioner Riggs was talking about to make the best decisions about this going forward. So, I will leave it at that for now, thank you.

Chair Lauing: Thanks. Commissioner Alcheck.

Commissioner Alcheck: Good evening, thank you for the presentation. Well, first I just want to recognize just how exceptional it is to have a member of our Commission with such in-depth knowledge on transportation. I think every Commissioner brings a unique perspective right and your expertise here is profound, your comments are invaluable and enlighten to me personally. So, not that there was ever a doubt of your value but I just want to reiterate it, I mean what an asset.

Ok, I think it's worth pointing out that the grand boulevard initiative was first presented to this Commission on April 30, 2014. I want to share a thought I had at that meeting since I was the only person in the room that was at that meeting. And I think it helps... I was, I was the only person. You were not yet on the Commission in April 30th of 2014, it was Carl King who was a

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 member. Anyways I think this sort of sets a little bit of the context here that I think we're
2 missing which is that the vision of the grand boulevard was not that residents from all over the
3 corners of Palo Alto would get in their cars and drive to El Camino, parking, and walk up and
4 down the sidewalks of the boulevard all day. And nor was the idea that we would provide
5 bikers from one side of the City a safer path to the other side of the City. The idea is... actually,
6 I'm quoting... I'm using the notes from that meeting, I keep all my notes. The idea... I should say
7 what the idea was to create a more inviting framework for mixed-use residential, intense
8 development all along El Camino. So that future residents of the boulevard could enjoy a vast...
9 the future residents of the boulevard could enjoy a vastly more walkable and retail and
10 restaurant friendly streetscape. The soul of the grand boulevard was essentially about
11 increasing residential density on the boulevard. So look, in my notes it's a guy named Garvey,
12 the consultant at the time, who had been involved since 2006 I guess had suggested that in the
13 8-years since the initiative began it wasn't surprising that the regional idea was struggling
14 because the local municipalities didn't love the idea of not having full autonomy over what
15 happened in their community and they wanted to be able to control the changes that were
16 made. I think as a result there are some communities in... on the peninsula that are like
17 crushing their "grand boulevard" process which San Mateo is one of them and I think Redwood
18 City is making a lot of progress. We aren't and one of the things that we talked a lot about that
19 day was gap tooth development. So, when you look at Page Mill and El Camino for example
20 there's that theater office structure that is set really far back from Page Mill and how allowing a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 development like that in interferes with creating a walkable streetscape because some of the
2 buildings are so far away and some of the buildings are right on the street. And it doesn't create
3 continuity for pedestrians and I think we've addressed some of that. I think we've encouraged
4 housing development on the boulevard. I'll refer to it as the boulevard but I don't think Palo
5 Alto is served by having a sutto-freeway [note -unknown phrase] cutting it in half. I don't think El
6 Camino really serves the residents of Palo Alto in its current form. I think that it allows a lot of
7 people from outside of Palo Alto to get in and through Palo Alto and it's kind of a mess.

8
9 And I still very much prescribe to the view that El Camino and the grand boulevard has a
10 tremendous amount for high-density residential housing. I think it's exactly where we should be
11 focusing our intense support of residential housing development. I think that if you... I mean
12 this picture is so pretty compared to what it looks like today. The notion that you could have
13 let's say a 5-story condominium complex right here overlooking what's there today is an
14 unappealing residential space. The idea that we would... look, what are the consequences of
15 this option or these options, yeah, it's going to reduce throughput. It's going to make it more
16 difficult for people to park on the street. I think one of the things that we didn't really touch
17 upon or we didn't... I don't think we... it's in... on the radar today is some of the changed
18 circumstances. So, Palo Alto's El Camino Real, our boulevard, has actually experienced an
19 increase in residential density in the form of mobile RVs. I don't think we really talked about
20 that. What does eliminate parking on our stretch of El Camino do for those residents if they can

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be called residents? That's got to be a component of it. But I think... I don't... don't get me
2 wrong, I am a big fan of the experts and the data but I don't need any transportation data to
3 inform the notion that if we slow down this street, we will make it more appealing for
4 residential density and for walkability, for restaurants and retail. And I think that has to be our
5 goal. I do not think we should consider El Camino our contribution to making the path from a
6 resident's home in Belmont to his office on... at the Stanford Research Park or something on
7 that vain. I think we need to think about how Palo Alto can serve our goals for housing more of
8 our **ABAG** allotment and I think when we think about how to create housing, I think we have to
9 think about how to create the feeling that we want.

10

11 So, it's very hard for me to sit and look at Option One and Two and suggest that I prefer... that
12 the... I think the rubric I would use is does this play into the larger grand boulevard initiative
13 framework? So, does... it seems to me like the gap that we were... that you were... that is
14 illustrated here between the street and the bike lane, the larger that gap or the more often that
15 division... I don't know, what are we calling that? What's the term of art? The planting area or
16 the hardscape feature that separates the street from the bike lane. I think that the significance
17 of that feature to anyone walking on the sidewalk is dramatic. I imagine the sidewalks suddenly
18 becomes a lot more pleasant when there's maybe 12-feet between the sidewalk and the cars.
19 And so, look, I don't want to belittle the consequences of slowing down traffic on El Camino. I
20 suspect that if El Camino got tremendously slower that would be a problem for a lot of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 individuals on the peninsula who are trying to get through Palo Alto. Maybe if we do this... I
2 mean this is going to sound a little ridiculous and naive but maybe if we incorporate a design
3 scheme like the grand boulevard initiative in these major thoroughfares, we would encourage
4 the housing development that so many of us talk about. And then some of those people who
5 are finding it really hard to get through Palo Alto on their way home to other Cities on the
6 peninsula or across the bay will move into some of those residential units that we have made
7 more appealing to developers.

8

9 I mean it's a chicken and an egg problem but I look at this... there are two major questions for
10 me or two major ideas here. The first is any effort... any funds invested by the City to enhance
11 the boulevard in a pedestrian and bike friendly way I think are an incredibly positive tool to
12 increase residential development along the boulevard. And number two, I think in this
13 particular time, something that we didn't have to deal with in 2014, is addressing what it means
14 to remove some of the parking that may currently be used by mobile home... I should say
15 mobile home, by RV users. And I think we need to be particularly sensitive to that situation
16 because it has become a very significant tool for individuals who are finding it difficult to find
17 housing.

18

19 So, I can't say which particular option I support except to say that I support the option that
20 most significantly advances pedestrian and bike-friendly space. And I would encourage even

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 greater beautification or curb appeal... curb enhancements to continue to further the notion
2 that maybe one day someone would like to have dinner on the curb of El Camino Real. That
3 should be our... that is the vision of the boulevard and I support that vision.

4
5 Chair Lauing: Thanks. That would look a lot like Nice I think in France and it worked for them so.

6 I just want to make a few comments just on my own and then we'll go back to some second
7 rounds for folks who have their lights on. This .8-mile has gotten a lot of focus obviously and I
8 guess the question is, is this the worst .8-mile in the City? Is that why there's so much focus on
9 it? We don't have any comparison here to any other collisions from any other areas so it's kind
10 of... there... it's just out of context for us to take a look at.

11
12 Ms. Rowley: So, we did take a look at the collisions on similar lengths of road for some of the
13 neighboring jurisdictions along El Camino Real. So, for the same time period, same 10-year span
14 in Mountain View for a 1-mile section they had 22 collisions. Sunnyvale had 27, Atherton had
15 16 so around half of the amount that we're looking at on this section in Palo Alto.

16
17 Chair Lauing: And within Palo Alto are you saying that this is the worst?

18
19 Ms. Rowley: That was just in comparison to other sections (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Right but within Palo Alto which is obviously our purview.

2

3 Ms. Rowley: That is something that we can look into. I'm not... I don't know the answer off the
4 top of my head.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Yeah not at all discounting that this is a problem, I'm just trying to see where it
7 ranks in the (interrupted)

8

9 Ms. Rowley: Sure.

10

11 Chair Lauing: In terms of this intense focus on this. Just going back to one of the basics it
12 seemed to me as I was reading this report a couple times that your comments and graph on
13 Page 16 suggested that there really wasn't at this point a parking problem. Although some of
14 the merchants might of disagreed but other than that one point that was read on Page 15. So, it
15 seemed to me like you were saying we don't need to worry about taking out these parking
16 spots so I'll give you the chance to speak to that.

17

18 Ms. Rowley: I'm not necessarily saying that just presenting the data for the three time periods
19 we looked at which are the time periods that we understood to be the busiest on El Camino
20 Real in terms of demand for parking. So, if there are other periods that you guys want to see

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 studied that would be helpful to hear but the periods that we looked at were the weekend or
2 the weekday lunch period so from 12-2, the weekday dinner period from 6-8 pm, and then the
3 weekend lunch period from 12-2. And so that's the data that we're showing there that we
4 collected... which we collected this year and the dark red zones show up predominantly in the
5 weekday lunch.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Yeah, let me rephrase that. You're not showing that there's zero demand for
8 parking (interrupted)

9

10 Ms. Rowley: No.

11

12 Chair Lauing: But you're showing that its relatively low compared to the old 80-85 percent
13 when it's (interrupted)

14

15 Ms. Rowley: That's correct.

16

17 Chair Lauing: So, it seemed to me to indicate that wouldn't be a crisis if that came out so that's
18 just what I was trying to – excuse me – to confirm with you.

19

20 Ms. Rowley: Sure.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: The... it's been very helpful [unintelligible], the public is very informed as usual and as are my colleagues. The idea that you point out in here is that land use probably drives those bikes going down El Camino and if you make that shift to parallel are we convinced that behavioral that's going to go away? And what do we have to do there if not? Is it just... I mean you've got...the bikers got to come up a learning curve. So, I guess it's just to get all the people that are biking aware of it but where I'm going with this is I don't think we can make the assumption that it's going to go down to zero. So, whatever we do to bikers we also have to address the pedestrians and the trucks and the buses that are driving through red lights. And as Commissioner Summa added which I've witnessed many times on El Camino, the emergency vehicles were having to drive up on sidewalks sometimes to let the emergency vehicles through. So repeating point which I'm trying not to do but I thought those were valuable points. The land acquisition process, is that just a matter of emanate domain or is it negotiations? Just a process question.

Mr. Mullen: That would require further study. Usually its... Albert can probably correct me but I don't want to go to into this because we're really not at that stage but generally you look to make a deal or try to acquire (interrupted)

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Right which again the point that I want to make there's... if that's the case which I
2 expected then we're talking about years out. Many years out before this thing could get
3 resolved and we've got a problem now and we've had a problem for the last 10-years. So even
4 though I asked the question before about this is only .8 of a mile, we need to do something
5 here. So, I think you might want to come in with some interim solution in the meantime to help
6 our residents who are there as this bigger picture gets solved.

7

8 One other just process point that I want to make is it seemed like you've had about 10 meetings
9 with the public and I wasn't aware of any of them. I don't think any of our Commission was so
10 we'd like to have... be able to help you sooner than when it comes to us as a body. Listening
11 directly to some of the on the street interviews would be quite helpful.

12

13 I won't repeat my questions, there's just been a lot of very excellent comments from the
14 Commission. So, I'd like to go to second rounds and the first on up was Mr. Gardias and I just
15 wanted to ask you, your lights still on, right? I wanted to ask you if your last comment there was
16 on Option Three essentially when you talked about having bikes up near the sidewalk. So, like
17 others here, are you proposing that there are more than just these two options and this would
18 be an example?

19

20 Commissioner Gardias: So (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Lait: I'm sorry, just... I'm sorry, just before we... I'm also just noting the time and
3 understanding where we are in the stage of this process. I think we have received a lot of
4 feedback from the Commission so to the extent that we're doing another round maybe it can
5 be focused on a couple of key outstanding issues.

6

7 Chair Lauing: I don't expect 7 speakers but there were a couple of lights on that I wanted to
8 cover.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you so what I was speaking to was that pretty much from the
11 perspective of separation is the same [unintelligible] plan but in terms of the... of where does
12 the bike lane belong to, is it part of the street as it's currently... as this currently shows or is it
13 part of the sidewalk? Pretty much it's elevated and then there's a different level of landscaping
14 or hardscaping that pretty much separates the combination of the sidewalk plus bike lane from
15 the street as opposed to pretty much separating the sidewalk only from the bike lane and then
16 separating the bike lane from the street which those are totally two different concepts. I'm sure
17 that you guys can look at European and see how it has been resolved. It's been resolved in
18 1,000 of cases so take a look but it looked and feels completely different. There is also an
19 important thing that of course, you may have brave bike riders that will be using both options
20 but in terms of luring more bicyclist, you have a much larger population including children,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 maybe more women participation riding on those bike lanes which are part of the sidewalk as
2 opposed to those that are part of the street itself.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Did you have other comments?

5

6 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, I have some other.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Ok go ahead.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you so just very brief right because I know time is high. I think
11 that... I... it may be small and cosmetic but I think you have to change the project name because
12 listening to my colleagues they have very right comments. Colleague Alcheck, Waldfogel, pretty
13 much they long for some session about the grand boulevard concept which is totally different
14 from what you're proposing today. So... and I can... and then you have some other
15 Commissioner that was confused with this is what you proposed? Change the title, it's a small
16 effort, and pretty much we don't want to have any misnomers, here right? You're not just
17 proposing any grand boulevard. For me grand boulevard it's a space, for maybe for some others
18 it may be a street, for me it's a space between the facades of the buildings on the opposite
19 sides. That's how I felt about the streets for the last 45-years so there's a significant difference
20 and you will not be confusing people this.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 There is also from the perspective of the project, others spoke about this but I want to
3 emphasize this. I'm not really sure if that this... I know the basis for this project but I'm not
4 really sure if this in terms of just this... of what comes to the Commission if this is the right
5 approach. There should be some other approach in terms of the... of really first thinking about
6 El Camino as the hall and then we would just... this should be one of the offshoots of the larger
7 thinking. Otherwise pretty much you're just coming to us with a piecemeal and then pretty
8 much people don't know where to put it in the hall. And that's so... so I would just... I know that
9 we were granted... that we were ensured about some grant but this should not be a trigger of a
10 project. It should be pretty much in tandem with some larger strategy about the space.

11

12 And then the last time is pretty much I thought that you came to us with the most important
13 question which I thought by looking at these plans was shall we have the bike lane along El
14 Camino or maybe we should not have it. That's how I read it. Maybe you had some other
15 question but when I'm looking at those two options, I think this is the key and then I cannot
16 give you the answer. If you're going to return to us with some other research, I would just like
17 to simply have pretty much pros and cons. You heard comments from my colleagues and based
18 on those comments you may just define a table that will list the pros and cons and then pretty
19 much we'll make the decision. Me, as well as the others, we cannot give you a straight answer
20 because I'm indifferent. You can convince me very easily if there should be a bike lane or there

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 should be a parking lane along El Camino. I think I see benefits for both, I don't think that one is
2 superior over the other, but I would like to... I see that there is a number of issues with each
3 concept because there is an impact on a variety of items. So, if you construct the table it's going
4 to be clear for us, we can just compare the number or the weight of each one of those and then
5 we can make the decision. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Commissioner Riggs.

8

9 Commissioner Riggs: Well first off, I wanted to make sure that... to Commissioner Waldfogel to
10 make sure that I have full respect for your ideas and your questions are really important. I want
11 to make sure that you're not offended by me getting brash and I'm not questioning your
12 intellect. I want to make sure (interrupted)

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic] all of your questions.

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, I know, I appreciate that, and I'm going to say I'll send you some
17 papers. I definitely will do that because this is something that's really close to me right now so I
18 just want to make sure I offer that sign of respect to you as a peer and as a professional.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Just I have some really detailed, quick comments. First off, I know that... I really... thank you for
2 the edification (interrupted)

3

4 Vice-Chair Monk: [unintelligible – off mic]

5

6 Commissioner Riggs: Well I was trying to figure out outgoing Vice Chairmen how to put it and I
7 think thanks for that edification. I think my detailed comments were actually more about
8 experimenting with the intersection design. I think there's... the exploration on different
9 options particularly might... intersection design really has a lot of options as well which is why I
10 mentioned the different phasing options as well as a scramble option and things like that. So, I
11 don't know how many permutations are viable based on a limited real estate available with the
12 Class One versus Class Two bikeway and I threw out Class four. That wasn't intended to be a
13 zinger but I probably think you've probably have thought through some of that. I was thinking
14 more by intersection design because I saw basically more or less two scenarios presented there
15 but I do think that I don't want to disagree with that. It may be that there are other variances
16 and particularly as we think about this is a mesh network. Usually when you look at the
17 problems that happen at the scene so Commissioner Summa's point about how this fit into the
18 broader plan and Commissioner Waldfogel's point about how this fit into the broader El Camino
19 plans. We'd want to think about the scenes a lot and the transition from the cyclist
20 experiment... experience.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 So that said I wanted to... I like the idea that Commissioner Gardias was bringing up. I would
3 just suggest that you... before you spend a bunch of time on that I'm not sure that its consistent
4 with the highway capacity [unintelligible]. So, because of its adjacency to the pedestrian
5 thoroughfare, I'm pretty sure that a Class One bikeway is limited when it's adjacent so that
6 could not be a multi-use path because of the adjacency issue. But I have a very literal read on
7 that so it's Section 1,000 I think in the Highway Capacity Design Manual so you might just want
8 to check that before you spend time thinking about whether or not that's viable.

9

10 And then I think the... I would... I appreciate the dialog and asking the VTA questions and I think
11 Commissioner Waldfogel is totally appropriate to ask that question but I would step back and
12 challenge our Commission. We are totally appropriate to anticipate... it's appropriate to us to
13 anticipate changes, not only in service but in platform. And I think the VTA will be reticent to
14 keep up with changing platforms and changing styles as we see more mobility of a service
15 platform become prevalent. And so, I think we want to anticipate changing service styles along
16 that, even if VTA is not planning for that right now. I mean I don't think they're ready to come
17 out and say that they are going to be using autonomous micro transit in 10-years but we very
18 well might be looking at privatized autonomous micro-shuttles in 10-years. So, I think that we
19 would be astute as a Commission to start thinking like that because that's the only way we're
20 going to evolve policy faster and fast enough to really respond to new mobility. And we heard a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 little bit of that earlier so I would just maybe... I think that's appropriate to ask that question
2 but I also... I think that's kind of our job to think beyond what we're getting from VTA so those
3 are my points.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok thanks. Did you have one? No. Commissioner Waldfogel.

6

7 Commissioner Waldfogel: Whoops, first of all, I want to thank Commissioner Alcheck for his
8 notes on the grand boulevard, that was very helpful. I just... one final question for Staff given
9 that this is a state highway, how much discretion do we have to say... I mean let's say that we
10 want to really slow down traffic on El Camino through Palo Alto. Do we have the discretion to
11 do that?

12

13 Mr. Mullen: Any changes to El Camino Real do require approval from Caltrans.

14

15 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, if we envisioned it... I mean supposable we went full on and
16 envisioned the grand boulevard as a residential mixed-use that had organically slower traffic
17 movement. Is that something that we could persuade VTA was a good idea?

18

19 Mr. Lait: (off mic) Sorry, could you repeat the question?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, suppose that we embrace the vision, the grand boulevard vision
2 of El Camino as a mixed-used residential boulevard and that as part of that we envision is as
3 having much slower traffic movement. That we just wanted to slow down traffic, we wanted to
4 make it a genuinely pleasant place to say sit on the sidewalk, would we have the discretion to
5 do that? To turn it into that kind of a residential boulevard?

6

7 Mr. Lait: Well it's... so we don't have control over the traffic volumes on El Camino Real. It's still
8 an arterial street, it is not in our jurisdiction.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well but what does that mean? I mean what I'm trying to get to is if I
11 wanted to embrace Commissioner Alcheck's memory of the grand boulevard vision, I wanted to
12 fully embrace that. That this would become some kind of beautiful residential mixed-use street
13 with, I don't know, Kurfurstendamm in Berlin or something like that. I just want to know how
14 much discretion we have because if we wanted to go in that direction then I would say that I
15 don't like Options One and Two. I would say let's widen the sidewalks and let's take some other
16 approaches to turn this into a much more inviting residential setting. Let's slow down traffic
17 organically and I just want to know how far we can go in this grand boulevard visions because
18 we haven't been briefed on it.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Right and we're not going to be able to brief you on that tonight but I will say that I
2 think your vision of... your interpretation of Commissioner Alcheck's vision is not probably
3 aligned with his vision of the boulevard that you described. There is degrees of tolerance for
4 vehicles and how you create a pedestrian environment that serves folks while still also
5 providing sufficient multi-modal transportation. I do think that this meeting highlights again the
6 ongoing challenges that the Commission has had relative to transportation planning in the City
7 of Palo Alto; which is why there was recently the transportation community forum that took
8 place a month ago... within the last month and why the City is currently looking at how we
9 reorganize our transportation operations, how we engage the community, and Commissions
10 and the Council in implementing our various plans and advancing these programs. So, I
11 appreciate your question, I'm not going to be able to answer it to the level that you would like
12 it to be answered. And it ties into a lot of land use policy conversations that we've been having
13 relative to growth and parking and so it's... there's a whole mess of stuff there that we still need
14 to unpack.

15

16 Commissioner Waldfogel: I appreciate that there's a whole mess of stuff. I think my take away
17 is I mean I think we need to fix some intersections I think Commissioner Riggs mentioned. The
18 bike circulation issues, I'm struggling over that one because I've ridden my bike on El Camino. It
19 scares the crap out of me and it's not something that I would recommend that anybody do and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 I think that absent this bigger policy discussion, it's really hard for me to come down squarely
2 onto of either of these recommendations, One or Two so that's where [unintelligible].

3

4 Mr. Lait: Yeah, I think we're hearing that not just from you but from other Commissioners as
5 well and I (interrupted)

6

7 Chair Lauing: I think that's the conclusion is that we can't put this even to a straw vote because
8 of the everything else in between.

9

10 Mr. Lait: And that's fine, I don't... you know we're having a public meeting, we want to get
11 feedback, this is part of the public feedback process, and it sort of touches that nerve of the
12 broader conversation that we need to have and resolve relative to City governance and
13 transportation planning in Palo Alto.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Ok, very sensitive to the time but I've got a bunch of lights lighting up.
16 Commissioner Riggs had one more thing that he forgot.

17

18 Commissioner Riggs: I have... they... Item Number Four right here.

19

20 Commissioner Waldfogel: [unintelligible – off mic]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2 Commissioner Riggs: No, you did not and this actually... it's a nice segue, you provided me a
3 nice... not referencing a transportation vote. Sorry. You know I just feel like I don't share the
4 same concern about... I don't think we have big problems... structural problems with regard to
5 our capacity to handle transportation. The funny part is that this is the real first meaty item that
6 I've been able to weigh in on transportation on this Commission so it's actually awesome, I love
7 it but I actually see this as an opportunity. I'd recommend that maybe Staff go back and dialog
8 this with both the City Manager's Office and with Council Members. I feel like this is a great
9 opportunity for tackling urbanism... for tactical urbanism. There's no reason why we couldn't do
10 a full-fledged experiment of this scenario for a month, for a couple months. You know we have
11 a really nice natural experiment right now where they are putting up the barriers on Charleston
12 for example where at least for the time being there is in effect what is a protected bikeway.
13 And so why wouldn't we try to do some similar experimentation with something like this and I
14 know Fehr & Peers... Fehr & Peers has a lot of experience doing this, particularly in East Bay.
15 Let's run an urban experiment and let's see if it works? I mean I feel like we're operating in a
16 data vacuum on some of this but these are great ideas. This is a potentially transformative
17 opportunity but there's nothing that says we have to install a permanent structure. So, I would
18 just challenge us to maybe make an incremental decision that maybe we want to do something
19 with straw bales or plastic bollards or things like that, rather than actually operating in a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 vacuum. So that would be my final suggestion and it feels like a great tactical urbanism
2 opportunity.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Ok Commissioner Summa you passed?

5

6 Commissioner Summa: (off mic) No, I'm fine. Commissioner Alcheck.

7

8 Commissioner Alcheck: So, are you both consultants? Sorry, I may have missed it, you're both
9 new faces to me.

10

11 Mr. Mullen: I'm with the Office of transportation, I'm City Staff and Kendra is with Fehr & Peers.

12

13 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, alright, so this comment is sort of directed to you. I subscribe to the
14 comments that Commissioner Riggs just mentioned, I like his suggestion a lot. And I would also
15 suggest that I think we could all really benefit from a broader understanding of what San Mateo
16 and Redwood City have done in the vain of the grand boulevard since I know those two Cities
17 have had a lot more progress than we have. And so, what do I mean by that? What... it might be
18 as simple as a telephone call to Redwood City for example because a lot of our... actually the...
19 Steven Turner and Aaron Actin [note -spelling] who were both at the April 14th... April 30th, 2014
20 meeting are now in Redwood City. So, they... I just suspect that they would be happy to sort of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 share knowledge with their old colleagues in Palo Alto and I just mention that because I think
2 it's hard sometimes for us to operate in a vacuum of examples. And so, to the extent that they...
3 they may have... they may not have the exact same arterial map as we do but they have more
4 than likely addressed curb and bike traffic, pedestrian traffic on the boulevard. And I just think
5 maybe they have some slides they could send down here and say here's what worked because
6 they've certainly have had a lot of success in enhancing the residential ... I'm not saying what
7 worked. Here are examples of the envelope changing and the landscape changing and I think
8 that helps the community and the Commission understand better what it really looks like to
9 affect that landscaping.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Alright, is yours on now? Uh-oh.

12

13 Vice-Chair Monk: [unintelligible – off mic]

14

15 Chair Lauing: One more comment from Vice Chair Monk.

16

17 Vice-Chair Monk: Again, I agreed and we talked about it at the pre-meeting about Redwood City
18 has done in the past. Regards to what Commissioner Gardias has said earlier asking about more
19 bike data, I don't know necessarily that we need more bike data but I really want to see data in
20 this section compared to other sections if we're doing this for safety reasons. If we're doing it

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 for bike grand boulevard reasons and these other reasons, I just want to distinguish between
2 that. And then also why are we choosing this area only and this length... this segment versus
3 going a little further south? We're updating the North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan and
4 Commissioner Alcheck and Commissioner Waldfoegel kind of eluded to that as well so I think
5 that's something to consider. Thank you. Oh, and lastly to also prioritize the other streets as
6 alternates for that north/south bicycle transport. Thanks.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Ok thanks to the presenters and thanks especially to the public for sharing your
9 views on which alternative where pluses or minuses, thanks. Let's take about a 6-minute break
10 while the other... the next agenda comes up. Five sounded to traditional.

11

12 [The Commission took a short break]

13

14 **Commission Action:** No Commission action was taken.

15

16 **Action Items**

17 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
18 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.1,3

19

20 4. PUBLIC HEARING. Recommendation to the City Council an Ordinance Amending Palo
21 Alto Municipal Code (PAMC) Title 18 (Zoning), Chapter 18.31 (CEQA Review) to Add
22 Environmental Review and Compliance Regulations for Development Projects in
23 Furtherance of and to Implement the Comprehensive Plan Environmental Impact
24 Report (EIR) Mitigation Measures, as Documented in the Mitigation Monitoring and
25 Reporting Plan Adopted by Council Resolution 9721 on November 13, 2017.
26 Environmental Assessment: Not a Project.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok let's call the hearing to order. The next Action Item is relative to CEQA, Item
2 Number Four. I don't have any cards on that from the public so you can launch.

3

4 Ms. Claire Hodgkins: Good evening Commissioner, Chair Lauing, I'm Claire Hodgkins and I'm the
5 planner for this ordinance. The project before you today is an ordinance to amend... oh, I'm
6 sorry. It's an ordinance to amend Chapter 18.31, a CEQA review of the Palo Alto Municipal Code
7 and there were six mitigation measures that were identified in the Comprehensive Plan
8 Environmental Impact Report that required the City to amend it's local CEQA guidelines to
9 include additional requirements for certain types of development projects. So, these measures
10 are required to reduce impacts City-wide on-air quality and aesthetics. The proposed language
11 in the ordinance mirrors the exact requirements outlined in the adopted mitigation measures
12 identified in the Comprehensive Plan EIR and the City is required by law to implement these
13 mitigation measures. The ordinance also includes three additional best management practices.
14 Staff proposed to codify these best management practices to ensure that they are implemented
15 as applicable on the ministerial projects or other development that may otherwise be
16 exempted from CEQA. And Staff recommends that the Planning and Transportation
17 Commission recommend approval of the proposed ordinance amending Palo Alto Municipal
18 Code Chapter 18.31 to the City Council, including approval of the relevant standards and the
19 List of Standard Requirements for development projects that are included in your Packet. And
20 I'll leave it at that and let you ask any questions.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Chair Lauing: Ok questions from Commissioners on any part, turn on your light? Commissioner

3 Monk [note -Vice Chair Monk].

4

5 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you for that brief report, Claire. Just a general question, how many

6 current projects are compliant with BAAQMD... whatever it's called and what effect would this

7 have on any new development?

8

9 Ms. Hodgkins: I don't know that I can speak to how many projects are currently compliant with

10 the BAAQMD requirements. I can say that the BAAQMD Guidelines are only recommendations

11 and unless we have a project that is subject to CEQA for which we prepare an environmental

12 analysis, we don't really have a way of incorporating or requiring the preparation of some of

13 these policies. We can include some of them as Conditions of Approval but most of these are

14 analysis in advance to analysis the project to determine for example if it's a... it impacts on air

15 emissions or whatever Citywide. Sorry, what was your second question again?

16

17 Vice-Chair Monk: What impact would it have, if any, on new development?

18

19 Ms. Hodgkins: So new development would be subject as applicable so it's kind of outlines in the

20 ordinance some of these are applicable to all new development. Some of them are applicable

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to only certain types of development, but it would be something that is as stated in the
2 ordinance applicable to all new development projects that meet those specific requirements.
3 Which is something that was again outlined in... as a requirement for implementation of our
4 Comprehensive Plan.

5
6 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok and then I also... thank you for clarifying. If you just want to look over on
7 Packet Page 30 under the MMAR [note – MM AIR] -3A, I was just curious if there were
8 examples you could give that have to... that could rise to this 100 or more diesel truck trips per
9 day.

10
11 Also, I wanted to point out that it appears that the second paragraph here, the HRA shall be
12 prepared in accordance... I don't know if that match with what's in the ordinance which is on
13 Packet Page 40. It just... the language looks a little different so just for consistency, I don't know
14 if it's anything that's [unintelligible] to what you're trying to implement but it just didn't look
15 like it was lined up. You can look at that offline. If you want me to... its basically if you look at
16 Packet Page 40 under C, kind of smack in the middle there it says the HRA shall be prepared in
17 accordance with the methodology described... That sentence is a little bit inconsistent with
18 what's listed on Packet Page 30. It might just be how you drafted it, it might not have an impact
19 so I'm just pointing it out.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Hodgkins: We just... what we did was the... we outline in the Standard Requirements for
2 development projects we listed out the methodology of where we can find or developer can
3 find the methodology but it still reflects back to... BAAQMD actually depends on it called
4 CAPCOA which is the... I'm trying to remember what that stands for.

5
6 Vice-Chair Monk: Is that different from the State Office of Environmental Health Hazard? Is it
7 related to that maybe and that's why you just (interrupted)

8
9 Ms. Hodgkins: It is related to that, yeah, so all of those... all of what's included in the Standard
10 Requirements for development projects reflect back to those same standards.

11
12 Vice-Chair Monk: Thanks.

13
14 Ms. Hodgkins: And you asked about what projects might reach these thresholds? I don't know,
15 we haven't had a project recently that has gone through that, but again all of these numbers
16 and information were all derived from what was identified in the Environmental Impact Report
17 for the Comprehensive Plan Update EIR. And it was identified that this is what was needed to
18 reduce air emissions throughout the City. This along with other mitigation measures from full
19 build-out of the Comp Plan.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: Thanks, and I know that also drafting this or codifying rather these... I don't
2 know what to call it... these regulations... yeah, I don't know what you're referring to it but
3 you're codifying it and a lot of that to also help with SB-35. So, I don't know if other
4 Commissioners are going to ask about that but if you wanted to explain that to the Commission,
5 they might want to hear how this addresses that potential impact.

6
7 Ms. Hodgkins: Sure. I mean just the additional three requirements we've added we just felt like
8 it was a good opportunity as we were updating this chapter to incorporate these three
9 additional measures because there's something that we require for a lot of different projects.
10 But as more projects move forward and with new SB-35 regulations there may be projects that
11 move forward that might not be subject to CEQA or may be ministerial in nature that we would
12 still want to capture and require these standard requirements for.

13
14 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you very much.

15
16 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Waldfogel.

17
18 Commissioner Waldfogel: Thanks. I also appreciate the brief presentation, just a couple quick
19 questions. Can you just clarify what projects this applies too? Does this apply to single-family
20 residential construction? I mean I'm trying to work that out from the table.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ms. Hodgkins: So, the tables just identifies the mitigation measures, the actual language in the
3 ordinance it depends on the measure. In some cases, it applies to all developments, for
4 example, the EIR mitigation measure for MM Air -2a was something that required all
5 development projects. So, it's basically just standard things to reduce dust emission such as
6 watering a site or sweeping at the end of the day and making sure dust is not in the street at
7 the end of the day. So that is something that would be required for all development projects
8 including single-family residences. However, there are... if you go into each section for example
9 as Commissioner Monk [note - Vice Chair Monk] pointed out MM Air -3 only is a requirement
10 for a very specific subset of projects that meet very specific requirements.

11

12 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, no, that's great, so just to fall into that so who's responsible for
13 enforcing? Since we just had a newspaper article, I guess we have a City Auditor's Report that
14 Code Enforcement is not always doing their job.

15

16 Mr. Lait: I think there's a lot of unpack in that audit and certainly there's more work that we
17 need to do. But I don't think it can be summarized in a brief sentence like that, but in any event,
18 when we're looking at these, we have... there are a couple things that we need to do. One is we
19 work without consultants to develop these standards and we are... it's through our inspection
20 process and also through the planning inspection that we implement and enforce these. I do

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 think that there are some additional enhancements that we can make that might come out as
2 apart of the audit to ensure ongoing monitoring.

3

4 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok but the point is there's an intent to enforce if we (interrupted)

5

6 Mr. Lait: Yes.

7

8 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok that's really what I wanted to understand. Two more question
9 then I'll be done. Do we need to consider the costs to implement? Is that something that needs
10 to be part of our scope

11

12 Ms. Hodgkins: No, I don't believe so.

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: No legal requirement for that?

15

16 Ms. Hodgkins: No.

17

18 Mr. Lait: No, not for this.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok great, if there's no requirement we won't go there. Final
2 question, would maybe a different ordinance to look at but Construction Noise Standards. Do
3 they potentially fit somehow into this umbrella because just as a, for instance, our Construction
4 Noise Ordinance allows 10-hours a day of emission of a noise level that OSHA only allows 15-
5 minutes a day of unprotected exposure too? So, there's kind of a gap between what we allow,
6 120 Db, that we allow at the lot line versus OSHA standards. So, would that be... I... it's probably
7 not tonight's scope but is that something that we can come to under this rubric?

8

9 Mr. Lait: So yeah not tonight and the City has a Noise Ordinance Chapter, I think it's Title 9 or
10 something. I forget what the title is so it would be an amendment of that section. It wouldn't
11 come under this section under the Zoning Code.

12

13 Commissioner Waldfogel: So, there are no CEQA standards on noise?

14

15 Mr. Lait: There are CEQA standards for evaluating noise and we would do that as part of our
16 review process but we would default on our City's Noise Ordinance. And if that's out of date
17 and things that we need to update then (interrupted)

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, we should look at that but not tonight.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Gardias.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: Along with my colleagues I want to thank you for the presentation. So, I
4 [unintelligible] with this question so the plumb area that is defined here and with the
5 composite insulation of membrane detectors and stuff like this. So why is it defined as between
6 Olive and California? It has a different shape or different area so why are we just picking up this
7 specific perimeter?

8

9 Ms. Hodgkins: So, we're not only limiting it, that's just the name of the plumb that Regional
10 Water Quality Control Board has for the plumb, California/Olive/Emerson Plumb but it's not
11 limited to that area. It is defined... you know we have maps that define it and it is outside just
12 that area.

13

14 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, thank you very much and so is this truly... the City code the true
15 place or proper place for this building related requirement? I guess... I'm just questioning from
16 the technical perspective shall we just have it in the... as part of the Municipal Code or maybe
17 there is another place under the Building Department documents?

18

19 Ms. Hodgkins: Do you mean for all of these or just specific ones?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: No, I'm talking about only the plumb area requirements.

2

3 Ms. Hodgkins: You know I'm sure it certainly could fit under other sections but we felt like this
4 was a good opportunity when talking about CEQA because these are things that we require a
5 lot of times in CEQA documents. As I mentioned a lot of projects may otherwise be exempted
6 from CEQA or be... when we have SB-35 projects coming in they might be ministerial in nature
7 and therefore they wouldn't be required to implement these measures which are for the
8 protection of the environment. So, we felt like this was a good place to kind of help add it in as
9 we're updating this Chapter.

10

11 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, I understand but I think that this is... it's not the right place. I just...
12 it doesn't matter... I mean I'm not hard on this but from the perspective of just a clean
13 documentation allocation. And then the last question is pretty much those are specific... and
14 then again about the plumb area. Those are specifically tough requirements; ventilation,
15 sensors, right? Where does this come from? The reason that I'm just asking about this is
16 because it's going to increase cost and this is a very attractive area. So pretty much it's going to
17 add substantially to the cost to the area that this... probably will be subject of the future... near
18 future development. So, we're pretty much just asking the developers to add additional costs
19 which will be passed onto the inhabitants. Why do we have these specific requirements which
20 are really tough the way that I see them?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Ms. Hodgkins: This came from language that we've been using on development projects that was prepared by some of our consultants that are experts in hazardous materials, but we can reassess that and just make sure that it actually is accurate. I tried to add some language in there that gave some flexibility. If they could show that they were below screening levels or if they can show that they have an alternate design that was appropriate that it would give some flexibility for alternative options for a developer.

Mr. Lait: Maybe just a question and then I'll... are there... is there a universe of projects that may not require if they're not excavating for instance? I mean could we consider a group of projects that wouldn't have to implement this?

Commissioner Gardias: Yes, or if I may add to this, sorry for interrupting, but you know for example if there was an underground... because we're talking if the containment is in the soil. So pretty much if there was an underground parking maybe parking or garage doesn't have to be, in my perception, subject of these rules. And then if there's an above ground apartment or residential part if they prove to you that pretty much, they don't... that there's no hazards post occupancy maybe they could be exempted from this requirement.

Ms. Hodgkins: Department of Toxic Substances Control.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: [unintelligible - off mic]

Ms. Hodgkins: We can look into this further. It's partially regulated by the Department of Toxic Substance Control but it really is a variety of projects. If you're doing basements and you absolutely need to ensure that the actual excavated garage is... if you're in that garage that it's properly ventilated, but it can also affect if a volatile organic compound rises up through the soil. So, if you have an enclosed space that's placed above it then that can also be impacted.

Mr. Lait: We can take a look at it.

Commissioner Gardias: Yes, thank you.

Mr. Lait: Yeah, we'll take a look at that on the way to Council to see if we can fine tune that a little bit.

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Summa.

Commissioner Summa: (off mic) Oh yes, thank you very much. I had a couple of questions (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: Mic.

Commissioner Summa: And I'm referring to... oh, thanks. A couple of questions and I'm referring to the actual draft ordinance so G, the Director shall be authorized to promulgate blah blah blah. Does that mean that there could be changes to this over time that wouldn't go through a public hearing?

Ms. Hodgkins: Yes, so that's what our... what we've said is it wouldn't require a public hearing. The goal of that is simply that sometimes the Bay Area Air Quality Management District or other agencies will update their guidelines. I think that the BAAQMD Guidelines were updated within the last 2-years so we just want to make sure that we are providing the most up to date guidance always and ensuring that developers are following the most recent recommendations. If they change their screening levels slightly, change their threshold slightly, we want to make sure they're complying with that most recent requirement. So that was the goal of including some of these details of how to implement the measure in this additional development standards. So that we can regularly update that without having to go through the process of Planning Commission and Council again.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: Ok so that would be more for regulatory updates but if there were big
2 substantive changes it would come to a public hearing is what I'm hearing. Ok and then in J,
3 during construction on any site in the City, if previous unknown archaeological, cultural, or
4 paleontological blah blah blah. So that also includes historic resources under cultural resources
5 that had not been identified yet and requires that say some sort of historic resources hadn't
6 been identified but through the application project... process for a project it was identified as
7 being historic. That would be taken into consideration?

8
9 Ms. Hodgkins: Yeah, I think the... yeah, this is really for you're doing a development project and
10 you've already gone through the entitlement building process. And they're digging and nothing
11 we found during the planning process identified anything, but you find something on the site.
12 You still have an obligation to ensure that you're properly treating that resource and protecting
13 it whether it removing it and properly treating it or avoiding it in place is dependent on the
14 resource. But that was the goal of this, it's more unearthed... resources that can't be known or
15 unknown during the planning process.

16
17 Commissioner Summa: Ok I guess I would have a preference when you use the word cultural
18 resource to me means historic also. So, I would have a preference of making that clear if that
19 was the intention or including that if it wasn't what you were intending.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: I think these are really related to archeological artifacts and a lot... I mean this is really
2 below grade stuff. Not buildings that we typically have conversations about with respect to
3 historic resources, but yeah, we can take a look at the language and see if there's some
4 refinement.

5
6 Commissioner Summa: Ok, I guess that was my reading of a cultural resources and I just
7 wanted to clarify that. I would be... of course if you... as a recommendation, I would be in favor
8 of broadening that to include cultural resource but... and thank you very much for adding these
9 last three because I think they're really good. Those are my comments.

10

11 Chair Lauing: I had one question on 18.31.10 and .30 about (interrupted)

12

13 Vice-Chair Monk: Packet.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Packet Page 39 so the Director... rather the decision maker has the authority to
16 make these decisions except if it's a statement of overriding conditions and then it goes to
17 Council? Ok, so I understand that we're making a distinction there. On 18.31.030 it says any
18 person can appeal to City Council. That means one person so is there any consideration given
19 to... I mean they're a lot of statistical corner cases in environmental stuff and it seems like it
20 could be capricious or arbitrary for just somebody to kind of hold up a project.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Albert Yang, Senior Deputy Attorney: So, I think what we're trying to do here is create an administrative process where a Staff person's CEQA determination can be reviewed but without having litigation be the first opportunity for that.

Chair Lauing: Sure.

Mr. Yang: And so, any person could bring a CEQA lawsuit saying the Director shouldn't have approved this negative declaration. We'd like to have our Council be able to consider that before it got to... instead of having it show up first in court.

Chair Lauing: Right but if one person objected then it'd have to go to Council automatically, is that what this says?

Mr. Yang: If they wanted to appeal the CEQA determination. I think in general for our discretionary decisions we also allow on a person to appeal the architectural review entitlement. That's usually what gets appealed rather than the CEQA review so I think this is largely to create an administrative process. I think it's rarely used, its more often that the substantive decision on the project gets appealed.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I mean generally I would... I'm generally in favor of more latitude to the
2 public so that they can get a review by more than one person, but I'm just aware that in these
3 circumstances they can be very esoteric which means it could slow down process. And I guess
4 what you're saying is it's better to go to Council than to defend a lawsuit but they could also do
5 a lawsuit after that, right?

6
7 Mr. Yang: Yes, but the fact that we have an administrator process also helps to constrain any
8 potential lawsuits. So, if you don't bring up an argument before our Council then you can't
9 bring it up in court.

10
11 Chair Lauing: Right, right. No, I get that it's just that we're trying to make it easier for
12 developers to get things done within the rules and this seems like it could arbitrarily delay
13 something. So, I just wanted to probe that a little bit.

14
15 Ms. Hodgkins: I just wanted to note also that under state law under the CEQA Guidelines if the
16 decision on the CEQA document is not made by an elected body, they... anybody is allowed to
17 appeal to an elected body already.

18
19 Chair Lauing: Ok, good, thanks for the clarification, that was my only question. Commissioner
20 Gardias.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Gardias: Well I mean I've... I'd like to just ask Commissioner Waldfogel if he has any comments because I was about to propose a motion. No?

Commissioner Waldfogel: Make your motion.

MOTION

Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. I'd like to propose that... I'd like to propose the approval of the CEQA and three best practices inclusion into the Palo Alto Municipal Code that's proposed by the Staff and also allow Staff at their discretion to make some modifications based on comments they heard from us and afterthoughts. Thank you.

SECOND

Vice-Chair Monk: I second.

VOTE

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok any further discussion or comments? Alright, all in favor please raise your hand
2 and that is 7-0.

3

4 MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY 7-0

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: Unanimous.

7

8 [many Commissioners started talking at once off mic]

9

10 Vice-Chair Monk: let's eat cake.

11

12 Chair Lauing: We'll just have Commissioner Gardias make all the motions if they are going to be
13 7-0. That's good. Ok thank concludes that item

14

15 **Commission Action:** Motion was made by Commissioner Gardias to accept Staff's
16 recommendation seconded by Vice Chair Monk. Motion Passed 7-0.

17

18 **Approval of Minutes**

19 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

20 5. September 26, 2918 Draft Planning & Transportation Commission Meeting Minutes.

21

22 MOTION

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 VOTE

2 Chair Lauing: And then we have two sets of minutes to approve. First of all, the September 26th
3 minutes and again if anyone was absent please abstain. So, all in favor of those minutes? So, it's
4 6-1 I think, right? Ok.

5

6 MOTION PASSED 6(Lauing, Monk, Alcheck, Summa, Gardias, Waldfogel)-0-1(Riggs abstain)

7

8 Mr. Lait: (off mic) Who was the one?

9

10 Chair Lauing: Riggs.

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: No sorry, yeah sorry, I lost focus.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I didn't cross reference but (interrupted)

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: [unintelligible – off mic]

17

18 Chair Lauing: We'll just cross reference it. October 10th Commissioner Riggs was not here so
19 that's an abstention.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

Mr. Lait: So, I mean it's fine. Whether a Commissioner is present or not you're just moving the minutes. It's not critical to abstain.

Commission Action: Motion to approve minutes made by Chair Lauing seconded by Vice Chair Monk. Motion Passed 7-0.

6. October 10, 2018 Draft Planning & Transportation Commission Meeting Minutes.

Chair Lauing: And then the 11/14 minutes. All in favor? November (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Monk: October 10th.

Mr. Lait: (off mic) 10/10/18.

Chair Lauing: I'm sorry, I was looking at the meeting date. It's 10/10.

Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, the first ones were the 26th and the second was the 10th.

Chair Lauing: Correct.

Commissioner Riggs: Fine I'll move... that was the day I wasn't [unintelligible].

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 MOTION

2 VOTE

3

4 Chair Lauing: Correct. Ok, unanimous? Ok, it's unanimous, alright.

5

6 MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUS 7-0

7

8 Commissioner Riggs: I was checking my (interrupted)

9 **Commission Action**: Motion to approve minutes made by Chair Lauing seconded by Vice Chair
10 Monk. Motion passed 7-0.

11 **Committee Items**

12 Chair Lauing: Ok so then I don't think there are any current Committees so we don't have any
13 Committee items.

14

15 **Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements**

16 Chair Lauing: Just general questions, comments, announcements and or discussion of future
17 agenda items? Did you want to address the last item first or just go with what's on here of
18 future agenda items?

19

20 Commissioner Summa: [unintelligible – off mic]

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: Ok Commissioner Summa.

Commissioner Summa: So, the North Ventura CAP Group is meeting for the second time tomorrow night actually. So, the first meeting was sort of meet and greet and get used to each other and that sort of thing so I'll keep you guys posted.

Chair Lauing: What's the total number of people in that?

Commissioner Summa: Fourteen I think, yeah fourteen and a lot of Staff and consultants also. And we had a good turn out from the public at the first meeting actually so I'll keep you guys... we didn't do much substantive and so I'll keep you informed going forward.

Chair Lauing: Ok, great, thank you. Any other comments, announcements?

Vice-Chair Monk: My lights on.

Chair Lauing: It is? Oh, Commissioner Monk [note -Vice Chair Monk].

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: I wanted to thank Staff for that incredible Commissioner recognition. I don't
2 know that they are here in this room tonight but maybe they will get wind of this transcript. It
3 was a really beautiful ceremony and the gifts were really lovely. I thought that was really nice.
4 For those who attended, I'm sure you share that sentiment. I was really blown away by it.

5

6 And I also just want to thank Staff for everything that they've done. As you know I've sent a
7 letter out today that this is my last meeting and I wanted to just tell each and every one of you
8 that you offer a very unique perspective and I truly learned something from every one of you.
9 And I feel very humbled and grateful for having served on this Commission with you and this is
10 an experience that I will keep close to my heart and I'm going to get emotional here. I really
11 love it here and I actually don't want to be moving. I'm really sad so I wish I could stay here. I'm
12 envious that you get to live in this spectacularly beautiful community. We have our issues but
13 this is a fantastic place to live and I would choose to stay here if I could. And I'm not going to a
14 bad place because I'm going to San Diego so that's a lot to put out there. So be grateful for
15 what you do have and enjoy your Thanksgiving Holiday and also, I believe we have a birthday
16 coming up for Commissioner Alcheck. Happy Birthday to you and thank you again, everyone. I
17 hope we all stay in touch.

18

19 Chair Lauing: I think you can count on us to keep the confidentially from the Chamber of
20 Commerce of San Diego for everything you just said. We will keep your secrets.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Monk: They don't want me, they are very Republican, and I've already reached out to them.

Chair Lauing: But I would like to thank you for your (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Monk: I mean before I moved here many years ago, I've been in touch, not this time around. Sorry, go ahead.

Chair Lauing: No, I was saying but I'd like to thank you for your 2-years of being a colleague and your preparation and your work. And maybe you can someday help them down there or maybe you'll come back but I'm very appreciative of your efforts and your results. So, I'd like to adjourn the meeting in honor of her but if anybody else wants to make a comment first. Commissioner Alcheck.

Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah you know I'll say this to you one on one too but it's worth acknowledging now. I can't imagine working on this Commission the last couple of years without. You've been a very strong ally on so many important issues and you're going to be really missed. And if you know you need any letters of recommendation for your application (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Monk: I will.

3

4 Commissioner Alcheck: To the Planning Commission in San Diego I'm sure they benefit from
5 your involvement down there, but really thank you.

6

7 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Ok in honor of Vice Chair Commissioner Monk we stand adjourned.

10 **Adjournment**

11 9:45 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas, and Reports are available online: <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

Chair Ed Lauing
Commissioner Michael Alcheck
Commissioner Asher Waldfogel
Commissioner Przemek Gardias
Vice Chair Susan Monk
Commissioner William Riggs
Commissioner Doria Summa

Get Informed and Be Engaged!

View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto> or on Channel 26.

Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs, or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.