



Planning & Transportation Commission Action Agenda: January 31, 2018

Council Chambers
250 Hamilton Avenue
6:00 PM

Call to Order / Roll Call

6:01pm

Chair Lauing: I'd like to call to order the Planning and Transportation a regular commission meeting for January 31, 2018. Will you call the order please?

Yolanda Cervantes, Administrative Assistant: Commissioner Alcheck, Commissioner Gardias, Chair Lauing, Vice-Chair Monk, Commissioner Riggs, Commissioner Suma, Commissioner Waldfoegel. Five present, two absent.

Chair Lauing: We understand Commissioner Riggs is in transit.

Commissioners Alcheck and Riggs arrived at 6:06pm

Oral Communications

The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

Chair Lauing: Ok, are there any agenda changes, additions or deletions from published? Either from the group here, no? Ok, we do Oral Communications on anything that's not on the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 agenda. I think we have one card and that's from... where is it? Nope, that's not it. Here it is.
2 David Carnahan.

3

4 David Carnahan, City Clerk's Office: Thank you, good evening Chair Lauing and Commissioners,
5 David Carnahan in the City Clerk's Office. I'm here to speak with you about board and
6 commission recruitment. Your homework is to reach out to at least two community members
7 to see if you can get them interested, someone that you think would be good for the boards
8 and commissions I'm going to discuss. And we also like to come and talk about board and
9 commission recruitment when members of the public that are most engaged residents are here
10 or watching from home.

11

12 The City is currently looking to fill one term on the Historic Resources Board (HRB), three on the
13 Human Relations Commission (HRC), three on the Public Art Commission (PAC), and two on the
14 Utilities Advisory Commission (UAC). As you know these are great ways to give back to your
15 community and help continue making Palo Alto the great place that it is to live and work.
16 Applications are available on the City Clerk's website, Cityofpaloalto.org/clerk and they're due
17 March 20th at 4:30 pm. So again we're looking for engaged community members to serve on
18 the HRB, the HRC, the PAC, and the UAC. We'll give each of you a flyer and leave some of at
19 back of the room and again I hope if you can think of a community member to that you think
20 would be a good fit to reach out to them and encourage them to apply. Thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

Chair Lauing: Thanks, David. You're tireless at doing this recruiting and the City thanks you.

Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions
The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

City Official Reports

1. Assistant Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

Chair Lauing: Ok, the Assistant Director's report.

Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director: Thank you, Chair. Just a few items to report. I wanted to let you know that the City Council will be hosting its annual retreat at the Mitchell Park at Mitchell Park and that's going to be this Saturday at 9:00 am. On Monday the City Council will have two items that this Commission may be interested in and one is reviewing the department's housing work program. This is in response to the City Council colleagues memo on housing. Also that evening the City Council is going to consider a resolution extending the Evergreen Park/Mayfield RPP program. The Finance Committee on the fifth is going to consider the Downtown Parking Management Study Phasing Plan and the Transportation Impact Fee Nexus and fee adoption recommendations. And then on February 12th we're going to present to the City Council an update on the North Ventura Coordinated Area Plan and that's going to include some information about goals and boundaries, schedule, funding, etcetera. We'll get the

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commission a copy of that report as well and we'll follow up and have a bring the Commission
2 up to speed after we have that discussion with the City Council on February 12th. And that
3 concludes the report.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok, thank you.

6

7 **Study Session**

8 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

9 **Action Items**

10 Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal.
11 All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

12 2. PUBLIC HEARING / QUASI-JUDICIAL. 2755 El Camino Real [16PLN-00464]:
13 Recommendation for Adoption of an Ordinance Amending Palo Alto Municipal Code
14 (PAMC) Title 18 (Zoning), Chapter 18.30 (Combining Districts) to Add a New
15 Combining District to Allow for High Density Multi-family Housing that Includes a
16 Workforce Housing Component to be Located on Public Facilities Zoned Properties
17 Within 0.5 Miles of Fixed Rail Transit; Adoption of an Ordinance Amending the
18 Zoning Map to Apply the New Combining District to the Project Site; and Site and
19 Design Approval to Allow Construction of a 57 unit Multi-family Residence at the
20 Project Site. Environmental Assessment: An Initial Study/Mitigated Negative
21 Declaration (IS/MND) was published for public comment on January 19, 2018 for a
22 circulation period ending on February 20, 2018. Zoning District: Public Facilities (PF).
23 For More Information Contact the Project Planner Claire Hodgkins at
24 Claire.Hodgkins@cityofpaloalto.org.

25

26 Chair Lauing: So we have a very full agenda again tonight and we'll try to work through it
27 efficiently. Per our review and agreement at the retreats Commissioners will be recognized by
28 the Chair and then speak. We'll try not to repeat what our colleagues have said so we can be

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.

2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.

3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 efficient and polite to the public. The game plan here is to move to Item Number 2 which is
2 public hearing. There are actually three parts to that and we're going to do all of the public
3 comment on all parts of that now, up front, including any discussion by the applicant. And then
4 for discussion and potential voting purposes we're going to divide that into two sections, one
5 being the consideration of the proposed ordinance and then secondly being the consideration
6 of the proposed project. So that's what the situation is there. Just a second. And we'll have a
7 staff report on that after before, sorry, before we get the public comment I'm thinking we
8 should have the staff report to inform where we are on this. And then on the second part of
9 that Commissioner Summa will recuse on the second part of this agenda item. Would you like
10 to address that Commissioner Summa? Go ahead.

11

12 Vice-Chair Monk: Chair, before you speak we have, can we ask for roll call because I noticed
13 that we're now a full Commission.

14

15 Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director: Yeah, so we've noted the other two Commissioners'
16 attendance.

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Thank you, Chair. So the City Attorney's Office has advised me to recuse
19 myself on the second two portions of Item 2 tonight and to provide a super abundance of
20 caution and a comfortable situation for everybody I'm going to do that. I wouldn't want anyone

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to be feel awkward by my presence here. The recusal is based on a letter that was sent by a
2 community group from a zoning committee on that community group about I think a year and a
3 half or about two years ago and so I will not be participating on the second and third portion of
4 Item 2 tonight. Thank you.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Ok, I'd like to introduce (interrupted)

7

8 Mr. Lait: Chair, if you don't mind I think before we launch into the staff presentation if we can
9 just go around the horn and get any disclosures with regard to this quasi-judicial item.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Ok, fine. Fine, I'm sorry, alright.

12

13 Mr. Lait: Thank you.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Gardias did you?

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, yes so I had a conference call with Todd a couple of days ago
18 where we discussed the project. Thank you.

19

20 Commissioner Waldfoegel: I also had a meeting with Todd to discuss the project.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Albert Yang, Senior Deputy City Attorney: And sorry, if Commissioners if you could just let us know if you learned any information that is not reflected in the record.

Vice-Chair Monk: I met with Todd of Windy Hill as well as his partner and we discussed a few items that mostly were in the packet. There was a question about the queuing and the parking situation and we were informed that City Lift would be the installer. I don't know if they're specifically mentioned in the packet that was new information to me. I asked about the corner usage and retail and why that couldn't be something that we could weave in. I was informed that it would trigger additional parking requirements. I also asked about why only six units are at the two respective deed restricted rates and I was informed that it couldn't be offered at any lower than what they were because of financing reasons. I did not receive any written materials and nothing was discussed other than that and that's not part of the record and I've not been biased in any way. Thank you.

Chair Lauing: I attended the same meeting with Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair] Monk and she's recapped that fully.

Commissioner Riggs: Hi, I met with Todd from Windy Hill just to understand the site plan. I didn't get any information that wasn't in the packet.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Summa: I'm good.

Commissioner Alcheck: I have no disclosures.

Chair Lauing: Ok. So the staff report.

Claire Hodgkins, Project Planner: Good evening, Commissioners; Claire Hodgkins, Project Planner. The proposed project before you today includes three key components. The first component is a zoning code amendment. The second component is a zoning map amendment to apply that code to the project site or apply that combining district to the project site. And the third is a site and design application for a multi-family residential project at 2755 El Camino Real.

So before I go into more detail about these three components I wanted to provide some brief background about the process that's proposed. So in September 2016 Council conducted a prescreening and discussed the proposed development and options to process the application. And at that prescreening Council Members expressed some concern about the broad application of this code amendment and an interest for a more narrow application to test some of these ideas out that are intended to make housing more available and more affordable. So

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 by focusing the potential application of this combining district to the PF zone properties as well
2 as areas within a half mile of major fixed rail transit the number of sites to which it could be
3 applied is very limited. By also building in a legislative action of a zoning map for each and
4 every site or sorry, a zoning map amendment for each site, it gives broad discretion to the
5 Commission and to the Council for application of this combining district to any future sites.

6
7 As the Commission is aware and as noted in the staff report this application is being processed
8 in the backdrop of the City Council colleague's memo regarding how seeing as well as the
9 upcoming February discussion on Planning Department's Housing Work Plan. Advancing this
10 ordinance and the project are included in that work plan. The Planning Commission and City
11 Council had a variety of comments that has shaped the project and the ordinance as noted in
12 the staff report.

13
14 So here is a quick overview of some of the key components proposed in the workforce housing
15 combining district ordinance. So I'll get go into a little bit more detail about each of these. So
16 the ordinance requires a includes a requirement for 20 percent of the units to be deed
17 restricted to between 120 and 150 percent of Area Median Income (AMI) and this requirement
18 which would be in addition to any Below Market Rate (BMR) in lieu fees that are already
19 required per our code encourages mixed income development and encourages pricing of
20 housing to support the missing middle. This percentage was determined based on what staff

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 believes will provide a meaningful contribution to making housing more affordable for residents
2 while also considering what may be economically feasible for developers and still encouraging
3 housing projects. The purpose of adding a local preference is principally geared towards project
4 related reductions in Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT).

5
6 So the ordinance does not restrict unit density, but it limits the maximum floor area to 2.0.
7 Housing Units are also limited to a maximum of 750 square feet (sf). The purpose of this
8 approach is to encourage more smaller units consistent with goals identified in the City's
9 Comprehensive Plan. The limit on Floor Area Ratio (FAR) and height as well as parking
10 requirements still limit the overall potential density as well as massing of the proposed
11 developments, but it also is recognized that these developments allow for greater development
12 in comparison to other zoned properties that allow for residential housing. So based on the
13 parking studies that were conducted by Hexagon for similar developments this parking ratio
14 accommodates project needs. The proposed Transportation Demand Management (TDM) plan
15 would include monitoring of parking to determine the effectiveness of this ratio.

16
17 Just a quick overview on process; the Commission's recommendation this evening on the
18 ordinances will be forwarded to City Council in early spring. If there is Commission support for
19 the site and design application this aspect of the project would be sent to the Architectural
20 Review Board (ARB) and that is tentatively scheduled for March. The ARB will consider more

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 specific details related to aesthetics and the siding of building features and other details. The
2 Commission's review of the site and design application is based on findings that are included in
3 the staff report starting on Page 36 of the packet. Typically site and design applications are
4 presented to the Commission in a preliminary or conceptual stage. So the plans in your packet
5 are more detailed and this is provided principally to assist the ARB in its review in March.

6

7 So some of the key items for the Planning and Transportation Commission's (PTC) consideration
8 tonight include obviously components of the ordinance and some of those key components
9 include the deed restriction percentage, the FAR, and the parking ratio also size restrictions,
10 consistency with previous Council and Commission comments, TDM for this proposed
11 development and overall enforcement. So staff recommends that PTC consider the draft and
12 then D. together with the MMRP and recommend that Council adopt the proposed ordinance
13 to create a new workforce housing combining district, adopt the proposed ordinance to
14 approve a zoning map amendment applying the new combining district to 2755 El Camino, and
15 approve the site and design application based on the findings and subject to conditions of
16 approval in the record of land use action. And that's all for me, thank you.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Anything to add before we go to public comment?

19

20 Mr. Lait: Good time for public comment.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Ok, we have 10 speakers on this issue.

Mr. Lait: Yeah and just as a reminder to the Chair so the applicant usually has the courtesy of speaking first for 15 minutes and then the rest of the speakers have 5 minutes to speak with a 3 minute rebuttal for the applicant at the end.

Chair Lauing: So if the applicant would like to speak now that would be great.

Todd Speiker, Windy Hill Property Ventures: My name is Todd Speiker with Windy Hill Property Ventures. Thank you, Claire and staff for all the work you have put into getting this project where we are today. And thank you, Commissioners for giving our project thoughtful consideration feedback. Windy Hill is a small Palo Alto based development company. We primarily work in San Mateo and Santa Clara counties with a strong focus on amenity rich sites close to transit.

This slide illustrates the time we've spent working with staff and the community to come before you with this project today. This was the former Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) site purchased by Pollock Financial in 2014 and at the time they proposed a primarily office project. As part of the feedback during their September 2015 prescreening the majority

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 of Council Members mentioned the need for more housing or this site being an appropriate
2 location for more housing in Palo Alto. So based on the feedback from Council Windy Hill and
3 Pollock Financial formed a partnership in 2016 when Windy Hill would propose to entitle this
4 studio and one bedroom housing project and we submitted our application for a City Council
5 prescreening in the summer of 2016. In September of 2016 we had a prescreening with City
6 Council where the majority of Council Members gave positive feedback for a housing project on
7 this site.

8
9 In December of 2016 we submitted a formal application with the City and we were asked to go
10 to PTC and ARB for further study sessions. During this time we did extensive community
11 outreach meeting with neighbors, respected community members, elected officials and
12 appointed officials. And based on the study sessions and community meetings over the past
13 almost two years we have made the following modifications to our original proposal and we
14 know that there will be differing opinions on our proposal, but we hope that it shows we have
15 given thoughtful consideration to the concerns and made changes and compromised where we
16 could.

17
18 We originally proposed a 60 unit project and a 2.25 FAR and the concern we heard was it was
19 too big and too dense. So we decreased the number of units to 57 and reduced the FAR to 2.0.
20 We were originally split equally with 31 bedrooms and 30 studios and now we are 40 studios

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 and 17 one bedrooms. If this were not the intersection of Page Mill and El Camino we would
2 have a more balanced unit mix, meaning more two and three bedroom units to go with the
3 studios and one bedrooms, but this location at this busy intersection across the street from the
4 Stanford Research Park (SRP) in our opinion is perfect for working professionals looking for a
5 place close to where they work.

6
7 And parking and originally we proposed 45 stalls and we heard the concerns of not enough
8 parking, no guest parking, where are Uber and Lyft going to pick up and drop off? Where is
9 Door Dash and Amazon going to park while dropping off their food and packages? Parking is
10 going to overflow into the neighborhoods. So to address these concerns we added 23 parking
11 stalls, we moved the [drive by outs] to the back of the parcel where we were able to add four
12 guest spots and space for Uber and Lyft and space for deliveries. At the time of application we
13 offered to be removed from the Evergreen/Mayfield Residential Preferential Parking (RPP) and
14 now that the Evergreen/Mayfield RPP is in place our parcel is excluded from applying for
15 permits.

16
17 We heard the concern about lack of affordable units and we determined after meeting with
18 Palo Alto Housing Corp (PAHC) that they could do more with the in lieu fee then we could and
19 we decided to address the missing middle by deed restricting twelve units or 21 percent of the
20 project at levels of 140 and 150 percent of the Santa Clara County area median income. We

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 heard the concern about traffic and how we could prove that people currently working in Palo
2 Alto will end up living here. We have committed that people working or currently living in Palo
3 Alto will get first choice to move into any available unit. Bike parking, so we heard the concern
4 about bike parking in the garage and how if we are pushing for a car-lite project, but making
5 our bike storage difficult to access. So now we have all of our long term bike storage easily
6 accessible on the main level.

7

8 Our TDM, this site receives a walk score of 83. A walk score is calculated by measuring the
9 proximity to amenities such as grocery stores, restaurant and other retail as well as measuring
10 the proximity to transportation options. For a point of reference the newly constructed
11 apartments called Carmel the Village located at El Camino and San Antonio in Mountain View
12 has a walk score of 79 and the eight-story project on Everett and Cowper here in Downtown
13 Palo Alto North has a walk score of 87. So a few of the highlights of our TDM plan, we have
14 Caltrain Go Passes and VTA Eco Passes for all residents. We are unbundling the parking
15 meaning we are pricing separately for all parking, makes the ramp more affordable to those
16 who do not want to own a car while placing a premium on those who want guaranteed parking
17 in a transit oriented environment.

18

19 We have bike parking and we have a bike kitchen. We have information kiosks, an information
20 board showing VTA, Sam trans, Marguerite Shuttle and Caltrain schedules. We have an onsite

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 transportation coordinator. With the implementation of these measures outlined in the TDM
2 plan it is anticipated that this project would result in a 35 percent reduction in trips. If this
3 project moves forward it will be the first project in Palo Alto to be GreenTRIP certified by
4 TransForm, a local nonprofit aimed at reducing traffic congestion here in the Bay Area. So
5 another important part of this project is the right hand turn lane. As part of our proposal we
6 will be deeding a portion of our property along Page Mill for a future right hand turn lane the
7 City has said they need to help traffic flow at this busy intersection.

8

9 So why? Why do we want to build this project? It's simple. There are more people working in
10 Palo Alto than living in Palo Alto. We have all heard it a thousand times, the jobs/housing
11 imbalance. And that voice is getting louder. Per the City's most recent data there are 3.05 jobs
12 in the City Palo Alto per one employed resident. That means on any given day we have over
13 two people coming from outside Palo Alto into Palo Alto causing traffic and parking congestion.
14 In 2016 the City of Palo Alto conducted a poll of residents regarding a variety of issues and one
15 of the questions was regarding housing. 76 percent of those polled said housing was a problem
16 here in Palo Alto. Obviously this project will not fix the problem, but it can help bring 57 plus
17 people working in Palo Alto looking for a place to live close to where they work. There are
18 more than 23,000 jobs across the street in the SRP and another 1,000 jobs in the neighboring
19 California Avenue District. All we are looking for is 57 of them.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 In closing we feel we are implementing what Palo Alto leadership has asked for and what the
2 Comp Plan calls for especially by adding to the diversity of units in Palo Alto and providing units
3 that can serve the missing middle. The Comp Plan has identified sites within the amenity rich
4 transit proximate areas as the locations where it makes the most sense to build the needed
5 housing. Our projects site is one of these and helps to fulfill this vision. There may be debate
6 about how much housing Palo Alto should be responsible for building, but there is consensus
7 that some level of housing is needed so why not here?

8
9 So along with me and my partner we have our architects, Jon Ennis and Ian Murphy from BDE
10 Architecture. We have our mechanical lift expert David LoCoco from Watry Design, and our
11 TDM consultant David Fields from Nelson\Nygaard. Thank you.

12
13 Chair Lauing: Ok, thank you. So we'll start the speakers. Go from the top here? Ok, just make
14 sure I get them. First speaker is Rob Wilkins and the next one will be Nielsen Buchanan. Hit the
15 lights.

16
17 Vice-Chair Monk: Three minutes each?

18
19 Rob Wilkins: You ready?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yeah.

2

3 Rob Wilkins: Good evening, my name is Rob Wilkins. I'm the director of real estate
4 development for Palo Alto Housing. I'm here tonight to speak in favor of this proposed project.

5 The workforce housing overlay district contemplated tonight for this project is an innovative

6 and unique way for the City to show its commitment to provide more affordable housing. In

7 addition this pilot project can serve as a guideline for debate and passage of the Affordable

8 Housing Overlay District Ordinance that the City is currently drafting in relation to our site

9 located at El Camino Real and Wilton Court. According to the latest housing draft work housing

10 work plan draft final consideration, final Council consideration for the affordable housing

11 overlay district is slated for later this year. We commend the City's willingness to accept a

12 reduced parking ratio for this project based on data from comparable projects and a robust

13 TDM plan. We also applaud the requirement for the developer to pay an affordable housing

14 impact fee of over \$600,000 as these fees allow for housing developers like us to leverage those

15 dollars into constructing more homes for individuals and families at the lower income levels.

16 More housing for Palo Alto is needed for all affordability levels and the workforce housing

17 overlay would be one more tool that can be used to address this need. Thank you.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Ok, thank you. Nielsen Buchanan and then...

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Nielsen Buchanan: Nielsen Buchanan at [unintelligible] straight down the 155. I'd like to make
2 comments in two areas. One, I'd like to support the project with one big but and I also would
3 like to talk about the ordinances that are being proposed with it. The ordinances first, my
4 concern is that the ordinances although the staff reports could only apply to a handful of
5 projects is that that may not be a good fit for Palo Alto. I think this particular project is an
6 excellent fit, but where the others might go, under what conditions and impact on the
7 surrounding neighborhood is a big if. So let me go to some of the underlying assumptions that
8 we're moving on. One is that we're making an assumption that the legislation that was passed
9 this last year by the state legislature is going to survive. I've submitted to you a letter from the
10 League of Cities which shows that there's some effort to do a lot of cleanup on the legislation
11 that's passed. It may be more than cleanup, there may be some political cleanup and back off
12 as cities across the city, across the state realize what has been passed. Opposition to some new
13 legislation is forming so I think Palo Alto ought to be very careful about going forward with the
14 assumptions that current legislation is going to survive. That makes you on a real guessing
15 game and I apologize for that.

16
17 I'd also like to point out to you the Grand Boulevard which is one of the traffic enforcement
18 reforms collapsed this last week. I'd like to point out to you that VTA bus schedule seems to go
19 on more backwards than forwards. I'd like to point out to you that nobody could answer during
20 the Stanford General Use Permit (GUP) challenges how much capacity will Caltrain actually have

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 when the electric trains are running lickety split? I can find no one on the entire peninsula that
2 can answer the question if you add up all the transit oriented density that's being piled into
3 every city up and down the rail corridor commercial projects and housing projects will
4 everybody get to board where they want to go? My guess and it's purely a guess because I
5 can't find anybody in the position who should know is if the capacity being built exceeds
6 [unintelligible].

7

8 So let me finish with really quickly about supporting the project, but I want to point out what
9 one of the Council Members said this last week when our project was being permit parking
10 program was being challenged for Southgate Dennis was saying we need more parking in
11 Southgate. They said ok, you got to park in [there]. One of the Council Members said well, be
12 glad we're not putting housing there. The dentists would sell their offices and would put in
13 housing. Then we'd put a lot more housing into Southgate. That's precisely the problem that I
14 see here. Summarized while I do support this project I've met twice with the developer I think
15 everything is really good except one thing, the restrictions on not moving into neighborhoods
16 not tight enough. You need an ironclad deed restricted whatever covenant to say that you can
17 never qualify to park in the neighborhoods. Zone C which is next to the project is completely
18 saturated with cars. It has no capacity to take extra residents even so I'd like you to close that
19 loophole, to contain this particular project. Thank you.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Thanks very much. Nina Rizzo.

2

3 Nina Rizzo, TransForm: I would first like to distribute a letter to the Commissioners and staff.

4 Good evening Commissioners, my name is Nina Rizzo and I manage a GreenTRIP certifications

5 at TransForm. We are a nonprofit committed to transportation and land use solutions in the

6 service of climate change mitigation. GreenTRIP certification as the Windy Hill spokesman said

7 this is our first certification in Palo Alto and the certification recognizes multi-family

8 developments that reduce traffic, parking and greenhouse gas emissions. One of our program's

9 goals is to see more housing for people rather than for cars.

10

11 Our evaluation demonstrates that the proposed project not only meets GreenTRIP standards,

12 but exceeds GreenTRIP standards with the following: there is a parking ratio of less than 1.5

13 spaces per unit, there is at least one traffic reduction strategy, and in this case the primary one

14 is unbundled parking which means tenants will pay for parking separate than rent. There is at

15 least one secure long term bicycle parking space per unit as well as short term bicycle parking

16 for at least 20 percent of units. And the daily household driving projected is almost 50 percent

17 less than the regional average. The transit service around this project site means that future

18 residents won't necessarily need a personal vehicle to get around especially with the VTA Eco

19 Pass and Caltrain Go Passes provided by Windy Hill. Throughout the day almost 500 buses on

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.

2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.

3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 nine routes and 100 shuttles on two routes are within a convenient five minute walk. Almost
2 60 Caltrains are available within a 10 minute walk.

3
4 Ulta Locale is a welcome addition to the GreenTRIP family of projects supporting more homes
5 in a vibrant location especially since only one other new apartment development has been
6 approved in Palo Alto this past year, the Sobrato project on 3011, this would be a significant
7 addition of much needed low traffic housing. I respectfully recommend the Planning
8 Commission support this project. Thank you and I can answer any questions you may have.

9
10 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Marilyn Mayo is next followed by Jeff Levinsky.

11
12 Marilyn Mayo: Good evening, I'm Marilyn Mayo. I'm a resident of California Avenue area and I
13 feel like a party crasher. Everybody's so in favor and I just want to bring out some concerns
14 that I have. I've lived 40 years in the area and my first reaction was you've got to be kidding
15 with the density, the parking, the whole shebang. Basically I'm delighted with the change that's
16 happening in the neighborhood. I support housing so that's what I support. I question this site
17 and the zoning change. I am concerned and I think from a practical viewpoint the location has a
18 double gamble for an experiment. One is on the micro units which is a fabulous idea and the
19 second is the jigsaw parking structure, if I understand that. I looked on the web to see how it's

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 working out and reviews of that and I'm finding lots of simulations, but I'm not seeing a lot of
2 people using it and reviewing it so I have concerns about that at that location.

3

4 With the units they're quite dense and not sufficient parking and that's assuming that people
5 won't use cars. I also share the concern of the parking flooding over to the next neighborhood
6 and the enforcement. We have an area that well, Palo Alto doesn't enforce a lot of the laws
7 that they put in place. So the back side troubles me. Who's to say who's really going to live
8 there? it's a great idea they're going to be people who work in Palo Alto wonder if they're laid
9 off, what happens? How do you control that unit? Who comes in next? How do you get them
10 out? It's a perfect place for students at Stanford to have someone live there go to Stanford.
11 Maybe they'll bike, maybe they'll have a couple of cars. So that's another concern; how do you
12 really control who lives there on the back end? It's like the Vi was supposed to be for
13 professors, but in the end they had to open it up because they couldn't fill that up and they
14 have other people living there. And I know it's another situation, but it happens.

15

16 With the parking again we're just experimenting with our RPPs in the whole area and we're in a
17 transitional zone and more pressure on it may cause more problems on that till we settle that
18 down. Plus we're getting a police security station and another parking structure so that's just a
19 big concern. The other concern I have is just distrust in this area. We were promised the
20 market. We got first republic banner flag on El Camino with the big monolith monster building.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The market closed, it wasn't viable and we're left standing. And I would just hate to have this
2 another situation where the traffic increases, the people who are supposed to live there don't,
3 and the parking problem becomes more of a problem. And I just want to leave you with a
4 thought, so I know at Druggers in Menlo Park they have a escalator that doesn't work. It's
5 mechanical, there's law suits, they can't get someone to service it, it's been two years. So who
6 holds the bag? Well anyway, thank you. Maybe the Fry's site might be a better choice. Thank
7 you.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Thanks very much. Jeff Levinsky.

10

11 Jeff Levinsky: Good evening, Commission members and staff. Thank you for taking input on this
12 item. Alas I suspect very few people have actually looked at the staff report. Buried deep in it
13 are numbers showing this project is not going to provide affordable housing in Palo Alto at all
14 rather it's going to provide luxury priced tiny units that will make everything else in Palo Alto
15 look like a bargain. So rather than lowering the average price of housing in our town this
16 project will make prices go up. Admittedly you have to dig to find this. Within Attachment H
17 there is Table 2B that shows the likely rents. Let's take the six units with the deepest discount,
18 namely those for people earning 140 percent of AMI. For them a studio in this proposed
19 building will rent for \$2,936 a month in today's dollars or a bit over \$35,000 a year. That's the
20 lowest priced unit in this building. For the six units targeted at people earning 150 percent of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 AMI that studio will rent for \$3,135 a month which is approximately \$38,000 a year. And the
2 majority of the studios in the building will rent for \$3,250 a month which is \$39,000 a year. The
3 rents are of course higher for a one bedroom apartment, but the one bedroom apartments
4 aren't going to be that much larger than the studios.

5
6 People supporting this proposal and statements by staff say it will lower the price of housing in
7 Palo Alto, but the staff report shows it won't. When the cheapest tiny studio apartment will
8 rent for over \$35,000 a year that's not affordable housing, it's not market rate housing, it's sky
9 is the limit housing prices. The staff report even makes that very point because every other
10 apartment building in town that it compares to in Table 2A rents studios for less per square
11 foot. Plus those other buildings have far better amenities and likely better parking.

12
13 It's easy to be fooled by this proposal. Everyone assumes that if you grant a developer tons of
14 benefits you should get less expensive housing and these developers are getting many, many
15 benefits beyond what other buildings in town get and yet it feels like this proposal doesn't
16 belong in Palo Alto, but rather in Russia where public property gets turned into the private
17 riches of Kremlin favorites. Please, please, please vote this project down. It's not at all what
18 Palo Altans are asking for and once they discover how bad it is they're going to be furious.
19 Instead draw proposals that will truly lower housing costs. Talk to local nonprofits that build
20 100 percent affordable housing. They say the biggest obstacles the price of land. Well the City

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 or some other local agency could buy the VTA parcel especially if you don't up zone it and lease
2 it for very little to such a nonprofit. Please turn it down and put your energy into solutions that
3 actually create affordable housing. Thank you.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok, thank you. The next speaker is Stephen Levy followed by Becky Sanders.

6

7 Stephen Levy: Thought I had it all figured out until Jeff talked so I'll turn it upside down. I think
8 you heard Todd and the representative from Palo Alto Housing say that Jeff was wrong, the low
9 income housing Palo Alto Housing supports this project. And I've attended all of [unintelligible]
10 the committee to house the Bay Area meetings. I've worked with Silicon Valley at Home on a
11 number of projects. And this is virtually the first time that we can be proud that the low
12 income housing group in town supports and acknowledges the innovative part of this project
13 which like Supervisor Simitian's project to develop teacher housing on the vacant County land
14 near the court building. We're addressing a group that is too affluent to qualify for subsidized
15 housing, not affluent enough to pay market rate rents. And if 150 percent of the AMI is close to
16 \$130,000 or \$140,000 and you're saving on transportation if you pay \$35,000 in rent your rant
17 in transportation is pretty close to the average under United States Department of Housing and
18 Urban Development (HUD), 30 or 35 percent. That's not outrageous. We're talking about
19 people who have enough income to afford that, but not \$5,000.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 The zoning ordinances as I said I'm in the middle of several regional housing discussions is a first
2 that Palo Alto can be proud of. Addressing the need in I guess the staff called it a combining
3 district to carve out a reason for people to want to provide housing that is affordable to middle
4 income people to the full 20 percent it can be a model for across the region, but it can also be a
5 model for the Fry's site. People are going to have lots of questions. That's your job to do
6 questions and comments, but please move this forward so those innovative aspects low income
7 and affordable housing together and projects in a zone that looks to the missing middle go to
8 the Council and community. Thanks.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Becky Sanders.

11

12 Becky Sanders: Good evening, Commissioners and staff. My name is Becky Sanders and I am
13 the moderator of the Ventura Neighborhood Association as well as on the Zoning Committee
14 for the Palo Alto Neighborhoods Association. You have a hefty letter on Page 101 from **PAN**
15 **[Note-Palo Alto Networks or Palo Alto Neighborhoods?]** that was sent a couple of years ago
16 actually and I believe most of that still stands. So I'd just like to draw your attention to that.
17 What if the property had not been sold to a private investor? Or what if it had been upzoned
18 prior to its sale? Then the public would reap the benefits. What if the Palo Alto Housing
19 Corporation were able to obtain that property? Thank you, Jeff, and build 100 percent BMR
20 housing on that property? That I think would be a fulfillment of the public trust.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 So what's flipping me out a little bit about this PF zone upzone/spot zone opportunity is that in
3 Ventura AT&T has indicated that they are willing to subdivide their property. They would like
4 to divide away the building and there's a green space and they would like to divest itself of that.
5 Our parks, we have a Parks Committee that has asked the City Council to look into that. It's PF
6 zoned. Now you know what I'm talking about, we're talking open season on PF zoned property
7 in the City of Palo Alto if this goes, gets spot zoned. With all due respect to the applicant, they
8 seem like fabulous people, they have a good reputation, but this sets a terrible precedent
9 because they are reaping the benefits of a public trust. And so I and Ventura and PAN don't
10 support it. I think for that's a really good reason not to support it. The rezoning forever loses
11 the opportunity for public facilities at that site.

12

13 As I said the free upzoning is a horrible precedent. It rewards the applicant for gambling,
14 buying it and then on spec and believing that it will be upzoned and then wrapped in persuasive
15 phrases like workforce housing, lessening the jobs/housing imbalance, and GreenTRIPing. I
16 think the applicant is obfuscating the truth. It feels like double speak to me and it's very
17 troubling. This is not BMR housing. PAN wants housing. Venturans want housing, but we want
18 housing for people that can least afford it and are the most vulnerable. So for us and this whole
19 almost was like a gerrymandering of the zoning code to get to shoehorn Drusilla's foot into
20 Cinderella's slipper. I don't know if you ever know that metaphor, but it's just this doesn't fit

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 with I believe our current values and what we're trying to accomplish here in Palo Alto. Thank
2 you for your time and thank you for letting me exercise my First Amendment rights.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Terry Holzmer followed by Jennifer Hetterly.

5

6 Terry Holzmer: Thank you, Commissioners for the opportunity to come and speak to you
7 tonight. I'm here tonight to support housing in Palo Alto, but this is the wrong kind of housing.
8 We need housing for low income hard working people who work in our service industries. We
9 don't have enough of that housing. We've got plenty of housing for high tech rich employed
10 employees, but we don't have enough housing for those people who truly need it, the people
11 that service are our restaurants, the people that service all of the things that we depend on
12 every single day including our City for that matter.

13

14 There are certain elements in this that are appealing and I understand that and they are
15 experimental, for example having less parking than normal than the site would normally
16 require; however, it's important to know that this is an experimental and pilot project and it
17 should be treated in that way. With that in mind it is premature for the PTC or the Council for
18 that matter to change the zoning that would add an overlay and create pressure to change or
19 make public facility areas more available for housing. I think that is a decision that the people
20 along with the Council need to make. It's not a decision at this level.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 As we build more housing and this is important and increase population the need for public
3 facilities and especially this land would have it, to serve these people also grow. We need to
4 keep these public facilities free or this space open to serve our community and this space
5 should be left open. I do not support the overlay. In addition I find it is premature to make this
6 overlay even before the Council has held its first meeting on the new proposed housing plans.
7 The PTC should wait for the Council's input on what it wants to do about housing before
8 proceeding with any zoning changes.

9

10 Because this is the type of project that a number of people believe is good for the City I'm also
11 concerned about the under parking of the facility. I live in this neighborhood. I'm there every
12 day. I see the parking. I live there. I'm only three blocks away. I know this area well. I'm very
13 concerned about its impacts and what happens there and if they're allowed for example to add
14 into the RPP that already exists what the impacts of that will be? I think not enough is known
15 about how these units will be used and who will use them and who will be there. I think we
16 need to take a greater look at this project. Thank you.

17

18 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Jennifer Hetterly and next up is Hamilton Hitchings.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Jennifer Hetterly: Good evening. The VTA lot is a sorely underutilized site and there is certainly
2 enthusiasm in the community to test the efficacy of high density small unit car-lite housing
3 project. Nonetheless, I urge you to consider to ensure that the zoning strategy fits the purpose,
4 does not preempt other City priorities or deliberation, and moves forward in a manner that
5 engenders public trust. This is your first and our first look at this proposed citywide combining
6 district ordinance and Council has yet to hold its first meeting on the draft housing work plan
7 that the ordinance seeks to implement. I hope that you will resist premature PTC
8 recommendations and focus your votes tonight on teeing up key considerations for refinement
9 of the draft ordinance and the project plan to insure its future success.

10

11 I submitted more detailed written comments, but since I have the mike I want to emphasize in
12 particular that public facilities zoning serves a critical public purpose fundamental to the long
13 term wellbeing of the community. The combining district before you tonight creates a strong
14 incentive to convert public facilities parcels to permanent housing use. As our population
15 grows so does will the need for public facilities for schools, parks, municipal operations,
16 etcetera. If we convert PF public facilities parcels to housing without setting aside other
17 locations for needed facilities we'll be in a big bind down the road.

18

19 And this is of particular concern regarding schools where Palo Alto Unified School District
20 (PAUSD) will have to serve up to 2,760 new students in the coming years. That's the total

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 operational capacity of all our middle schools combined. Accommodating them will require
2 creative solutions and use of suboptimal sites. In addition proposed combining district puts the
3 Stanford Mayfield playing fields and the AT&T property that was mentioned earlier and is
4 currently under negotiation for purchase at risk. PAUSD would face greater cost and shrinking
5 options to locate facilities near population growth under the proposed complaining district.
6 Stanford would have a strong disincentive to renew the City's lease on the well-used soccer
7 fields and purchase of the AT&T site for park use would be dead in the water. Please tread
8 carefully on public facilities zoned parcels, a valuable community asset. Thank you.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Hamilton Hitchings, next up would be Hope Smith.

11

12 Hamilton Hitchings: Hi, my name's Hamilton Hitchings and like Jennifer I served on the Citizen
13 Advisory Committee (CAC) for the Comp Plan and I was on the land use subcommittee. And I
14 share a lot of Jennifer's concerns. Public facilities zoned properties enable broad based
15 community services such as animal shelters, medical facilities, parks, etcetera. Rezoning a
16 public facility property for housing benefits a select few and thus if it is done it should be for
17 moderately income folks providing critical public services to the community such as teachers,
18 nurses, EMTs, young police officers, public safety officers as well community service and health
19 workers.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 In addition the developer paid for restricted, sorry, the owner paid for restricted public facility
2 and this up zoning results a significant financial windfall for the owner. This [unintelligible]
3 developer. This windfall from the up zoning belongs to the City of Palo Alto and its residents.
4 Thus while the developer deserves to make a reasonable profit for their investment and risk the
5 majority of value for this up zone should be used to subsidize housing. Unfortunately, the
6 current proposal does not deed restrict 40 of the 57 units. Keep in mind that San Antonio
7 Shopping Center Apartments that were 535 to 638 sf were running for \$3,000 to \$5,500. So
8 when the applicant says that because these units are smaller apartments they will be cheaper
9 please keep in mind that cheaper does not mean particularly affordable. No In lieu of fees
10 should be approved and instead a BMR should be provided for these units.

11

12 I also oppose ground floor retail as the need for more housing is far greater than the need for
13 more retail. Up zoning should not exceed the height limit for the area which I believe is 35 feet
14 and should not be 50 feet. Sufficient parking should be provided. The City has consistently
15 underestimated and inadequately zoned the amount of parking needed which is why we are
16 one of the few cities in the Bay Area that allows employees to park in residential
17 neighborhoods. In particular comparing this project to 801 Alma which is 100 percent very low
18 income and low income is not comparable with the current proposed [Renner Profile] which
19 likely will have a higher percentage of car ownership.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And lastly in terms of roof garden please be careful it doesn't allow people to look into the
2 neighbor's windows from above or cause excessive light. If this project does go forward please
3 incorporate the key improvements I suggested. Thank you.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Thanks very much. Hope Smith the next up is Leora Tanjuatco.

6

7 Hope Smith: Good evening, my name is Hope Smith. My son, my 10 year old son and I have
8 been residents for Palo Alto for about five years now. I heard about the project and I am in full
9 agreeance with it. I think that this program would be the whole housing project would suit
10 someone like myself, a single family that could somewhat afford to live in Palo Alto as well as
11 work in Palo Alto at the same time cutting down commuting time and spending more time with
12 the family. So I highly support this project and I hope that when we see, we hear more of it.
13 Thank you.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Leora and next is Paul Martin.

16

17 Leora Tanjuatco: Hi Commissioners, my name is Leora Tanjuatco. I live at 215 Alvarado Avenue.
18 I'm here to support the project as well. I heard a lot of discussion about cars and TDM and I
19 don't have a car. I actually got to get rid of it when I moved to Palo Alto because my home is a
20 block away from the Caltrain line and about a mile from the Caltrain station. I also wanted to

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 add that my fiancé's grandmother lives in Sunrise right next to the proposal and she is also in
2 full support. She's 92 so she can't be here tonight, but she takes her daily walk around the
3 corner and she wants to see more folks out. She wants to have more people in her
4 neighborhood and I even though I'm sort of two generations away want the same thing for Palo
5 Alto. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Paul Martin and then Arthur Keller.

8

9 Paul Martin: Hello, good evening. I'm a resident of Palo Alto and I wanted to comment on the
10 project in two aspects. The first one was mentioned several times, but rezoning of public
11 facilities properties is a one way street. It happens once and then it's gone. And we need to
12 think not just about the immediate needs, but about the future of Palo Alto. These one way
13 streets mean that we can't revisit this type of an environment in the future and it's critically
14 important that we find ways of improving the moderate and low income housing, but it's also
15 critically important that we don't rezone properties that were properly purchased with an
16 existing zoning. Rezoning is a giveaway to the developers and it shouldn't be that Palo Alto's
17 future is sacrificed at the at the altar of the developers.

18

19 Furthermore the parking is a vision that when I close my eyes I see. I see a vision where in the
20 future people don't have to have cars, but that vision is not today. And I see the impact of that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 vision not being today around Palo Alto all the time. People are parking along the streets,
2 people are parking in ways that means that young people on bicycles are at risk. It's difficult
3 crossing streets, etcetera. We should not also sacrifice for the developer the parking
4 requirements. Having 50 what is it now? 68 stalls is less than 1 stall for a studio and 2 stalls for
5 each one of the bedrooms which would come out to 74 or something like that, but that would
6 include no parking for any visitors and no expectation that there might be even some studios
7 with more than one person in them. So the idea that in the future we don't need a lot of cars is
8 fantastic. I have two daughters, neither one of them has a driver's license, but they also don't
9 live in a small city like Palo Alto. So I'd like to voice my opposition to this particular project and
10 ask that you not sacrifice the public facilities space for developers benefit.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Arthur Keller followed by Colin Roche.

13

14 Arthur Keller: Thank you, Commissioners. So the first thing is my understanding is when the
15 VTA decided this lot was excess property it should have offered it to sale to the City of Palo
16 Alto. And I've never heard of the opportunity for the City of Palo Alto to the purchase this land
17 way back when, when it could have been purchased by the City of Palo Alto and then leased or
18 sold to a low income housing developer like Palo Alto Housing or other or Eden Housing or the
19 like. So I would actually like to understand why that did not take place because then we would

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 be discussing what really makes more sense here which is a 100 percent affordable low income
2 BMR housing project.

3

4 There's a couple other concerns that I have. One is you have better make sure that you have an
5 ironclad agreement that the up that this property can never be part of the RPP and never be
6 eligible for RPP permits because we know how basically our expectations may change with
7 respect to Edgewood and how lawsuits may cause this to be included in the RPP and then the
8 car-lite is a joke. The next thing is that I heard the applicant say about a right turn lane. I don't
9 see a right turn lane on the screen over there that the City has provided. If there's a right turn
10 lane I'd like to see it and I know that this when this project was before the Planning Commission
11 when I was on it we talked about a right turn line in terms of Planned Community (PC) zone.

12

13 I think this project should be tabled until we do a general discussion of the Palmer fix in terms
14 of inclusionary zoning for rental housing this project should not proceed that process, it should
15 be table until it happens. Next thing is that the Electric Vehicle (EV) chargers, are they talked
16 about? I don't know how EV chargers work with these puzzle lift systems because I don't know
17 how somebody's going to be able to charge their car in it in this environment. So that's an
18 interesting thing for me. I don't I'm not sure that they're compatible. I think that that needs to
19 be understood. And also the issue is that if you have a car-lite development and puzzle lifts
20 people don't like parking in those kind of structures and therefore you should have one or the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 other. You either have fully parked with these puzzle lifts or you have a car-lite development
2 that has ordinary parking, people can leave their car and don't have to deal with some
3 mechanical thing that won't work if the power goes out.

4
5 Finally in order to be able to think about other developments that are privately held that are PF
6 there should definitely be a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) in any kind of structure like this so
7 that for example, the AT&T site they can't go and propose something like this if it's not desired,
8 but that it is something that at that there's this maintained the City maintains discretion in that
9 so that it's not automatic. So I think in summary I think that this project should be tabled until
10 you understand the more general comments about the Palmer fix. Thank you.

11
12 Chair Lauing: Thank you. Collin Roche which I believe is the last speaker on this agenda item.

13
14 Collin Roche: Hello, thank you. Glad to be here. I want to explain my full support for this
15 project as a Palo Alto native, Palo Alto graduate, parents that still live in the local area this plan
16 here seems to be the kind of project that you guys could lay claim to being one of the more
17 innovative ones as we've always said Palo A is. It's a center of innovation. It has TDM in it, it's
18 got bike share, access to transit, it's accessible, they're opening it up to Palo Alto residents.
19 These are all things that I think not only here, but across the Bay Area are things that most
20 developers should incorporate if we want to really kind of alleviate traffic, but also provide

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 somewhat affordable housing. I play soccer across the street over at Mayfield Park and I think I
2 speak for many of the younger guys out there that live in that work in Palo Alto Research, sorry,
3 SRP that always talk about how great it would be to be able to buy a unit, buy somewhere close
4 in the local area and possibly bike to work or walk Downtown or walk down to the California
5 Avenue. So I think this is a perfect template for you guys to work with and possibly get going
6 and use this again as a means for other developers to look for look to use as a kind of a guiding
7 principle. Thank you very much.

8
9 Chair Lauing: Thank you. We'd like to give the developer a chance to comment on these things
10 and then after that if there's anything that Claire you'd like to clarify, any comments from the
11 audience would be OK to clarify. Developer, three minutes if you want to make any comments
12 at this point. Ok, Claire did you want to make any comments on?

13
14 Ms. Hodgkins: No, I'll just let you guys ask any questions that have come up from...

15
16 Chair Lauing: Ok.

17
18 Mr. Lait: Just as a reminder at least at the beginning we're going to limit the Planning
19 Commission's discussion in this first round to just the zoning ordinance, the overlay ordinance
20 that's Attachment B in your staff report and so if you can reserve any comments or questions

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 about the project itself or the overlay of the ordinance applying the overlay to the project that
2 is a discussion that will take place after the Commission makes a Motion on the ordinance. So...

3

4 Chair Lauing: Great.

5

6 Mr. Lait: Thank you.

7

8 Chair Lauing: And we're going to try to target (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: Chair? May I just, may I make a point of order real quick?

11

12 Chair Lauing: Sure.

13

14 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, I just want to express that I find that distinction to be very
15 difficult. I believe these two issues are incredibly intertwined. In fact and I want to make this
16 point before we begin, the staff report clearly indicates that the likelihood of this zoning in the
17 77 other parcels in the City resulting in housing development is extremely low. So I think and I
18 think there was another point in the staff report that suggested that even if we did rezone
19 other sites if we did that if we did approve this change those other sites would still have to go
20 through a process of Planning Commission and City Council review and approval. So this seems

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 to be as much a one off as a bigger picture and I think it's a mistake to separate these two
2 issues out. And I'm going to reserve my comments for the second half of the discussion
3 because I can't separate the two.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok. The comments I just wanted to make just before we got started is that this is
6 being created for the possibility of the developer, the 2755, but because it's a broader
7 ordinance it could be applied to other projects. So that's why staff has commented on asked us
8 to comment on broader policy viewpoint as well as the applicability to the subject project.
9 Particularly they wanted comments on the 20 percent and the preferences to Palo Alto and
10 how that's managed. So on the 20 percent I wanted to just make sure we understood more in
11 dollars than in percentages what that meant. We only have this one project to reference right
12 now, every other project can be different, be based on size, location, etcetera. So I just wanted
13 to frame that before we get into the discussion about the 20 percent.

14

15 So there are 12 workforce units available with some rent breaks as was discussed, six to those
16 at 140 percent of AMI and six at 150 percent of AMI. Using a standard for what that is right
17 now those are generally salaries of about \$117,000 to \$143,000. So that's the kind of salary
18 that's being addressed and there are discounts as were discussed. The rental prices one of the
19 speakers pointed out in 2B in points out that the projected market rates are \$3,410 for studios
20 and \$3,690 for one bedrooms depending on the discount, depending on how the 18 numbers

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 come out it's between \$3,100 and \$3,500. So as we discussed this just wanted to have the
2 numbers in mind not just the percentages, but I think one of the things we want to get to is a
3 policy question is the 20 percent enough benefit for the this income segment of the workforce
4 for these more dense car-lite projects.

5
6 So I would suggest that we open the conversation. Did you have a comment? Ok, sorry. So I
7 would suggest that we open conversation with comments and questions at once and obviously
8 we want to move along as promptly as we can. So I would suggest we do that and then after
9 that decide if we want to go forward in a further conversation which we will probably will. I
10 apologize for my ongoing cough here. So I would suggest that we start from the right and have
11 Mr. Gardias start off.

12
13 Commissioner Gardias: Very good, thank you very much.

14
15 Chair Lauing: For this first round we're just going to go right to left because I know that
16 everybody has something to say. And not only that, but I didn't get my cheat sheet as to what's
17 going on, so you're lighting up as Mr. Wolbach.

18
19 Commissioner Gardias: So can we start?

20

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Go ahead.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: Very good, thank you again. Thank you very much to the Wind Hill for
4 the presentation and thank you very much for all of you for coming to us and advising us on this
5 review. We appreciate your time and all your comments.

6

7 Before we get to the more interesting items I would like to just go back in the history and I
8 would like to also understand this what Arthur Keller was referring to because this question was
9 nurturing me over the weekend and I just was thinking how to put it in the proper perspective.
10 And I will maybe speak to it in a moment, but I would like to understand and ask staff what was,
11 was there any Palo Alto involvement at the time when VTA put this property on the market?
12 Did we have any information? Did we have a right to buy?

13

14 Ms. Hodgkins: My understanding is that it was provided to public agencies including the City of
15 Palo Alto. I don't know if they applicant might have some more background on the history of
16 the sale of that site? They're certainly welcome if you do. Yeah.

17

18 Mr. Speiker: So anytime a public agency sells a piece of property they have to issue an Request
19 for Proposal (RFP) to other public agencies and that that did happen during the 2016 City
20 Council prescreening in September. And now Mayor Liz Kniss said at the time that she was

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 working with VTA and mentioned the process and how it did go before the City of Palo Alto. Is
2 that ok?

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: Yeah, thank you very much for the update. So I'm asking this and I will
5 tell you in a moment where I'm going to and I believe that we have some other PF zones within
6 Palo Alto that are either under ownership of Palo Alto or some other agencies. Do we? We do.

7 Ok, so now just having this clarified let me make this statement. So when I was thinking about
8 this lot it is very specific lot. I think this is the flagship lot in Palo Alto. I don't believe there is
9 any other more attractive lot than this one and there is a specific reason for the value of this lot
10 because from the commercial perspective it is in the place that is passed by most traffic a day.
11 And then naturally in absence of PTC or City Council if this was just a market purchased
12 property I believe that this lot would be well suited for the office building and probably it would
13 be the most expensive property because giving it the some advertisement opportunity,
14 presence that company that would be located in this building would have the value that would
15 be that this lot would be sold for would be probably higher than any other property. And I'm
16 saying this, but we know where we are. We want to have housing so it is already done deal.

17

18 I'm saying this because there is some benefit, public benefit. Have this been approached
19 differently a maybe there is a lesson learned and then if we have some other properties of this
20 similar zoning that we could come across in the future we should have some sort of lesson

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 learned from this lot and understand for the future benefit of either low income housing that
2 we want to promote or some other subsidized housing we could have extracted much more
3 benefit from this lot with the objectives to subsidize housing that could have been in some
4 other area. But it's history now, but I still want to just put this in into perspective.

5
6 So now allow me just go to some other item that I would like to clarify and if possible Chair I
7 would like to ask that speaker just to come to us and just tell us, clarify to us (interrupted)

8
9 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm sorry, point of order. Are we discussing the general zoning
10 ordinance or the site specifics or the project? Because I understand we're doing (interrupted)

11
12 Chair Lauing: We're discussing the zoning ordinance.

13
14 Commissioner Alcheck: Right. So it seems highly inappropriate if we're doing this for the
15 purposes of creating some wall for recusal then let's create it, please.

16
17 Chair Lauing: It's not, this is not the time to address the specific project. This is the time to
18 address the ordinance.

19
20 Commissioner Alcheck: Or if possible wait till the second half because I'm...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Gardias: Well let me say the same as you, I think that all this items are intertwined.

Chair Lauing: Ok, if you'd like to hold (interrupted)

Commissioner Gardias: And this is the reason I want to start with this because I thought that this was important because if we don't say this aloud, if we don't put this into record then there is going to be another lot that would be pretty much sold or treated in the same way and then as opposed to just having the right benefit that half of this audience was referring to this benefit would be lost.

Chair Lauing: Ok, so if you'd like to hold your comments as well that's fine. We can just move on.

Commissioner Alcheck: May I propose an alternative?

Chair Lauing: No.

Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Commissioner Gardias: So can I finish?

3

4 Chair Lauing: Yes, if but we can't talk about the project right now. That's what we're saying.

5

6 Commissioner Gardias: Ok, so...

7

8 Chair Lauing: So those are the two options. You can either stay on the agenda item right now

9 (interrupted)

10

11 Commissioner Gardias: Ok, so I will reserve the question. We're going to come back to this
12 later then. So let me then just talk about the ordinance because we're going to talk about
13 number one, right?

14

15 Chair Lauing: Correct.

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: Ok, good. So let me just talk about so I when I was thinking about this
18 in terms of the ordinance and rezoning I the regret of us not having a PC zone came again and
19 as you may know we work on the modification of the PC zoning a couple of years ago and it
20 hasn't passed so we don't have this tool at our disposal. But had we had it when I was looking

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 at into this property it would be like any other PC zone and a couple of buildings like that are
2 adjacent to this property, Sunrise property and the two buildings behind along Page Mill they
3 are also PC zoned. So naturally this building had we had all other tools should be another PC
4 zone. So I just and then also I don't believe that we should have a specific ordinance to create
5 work house, workforce housing combining district because it would suggest that we create a
6 specific zone and then any other building would be could be consider under the zone. I also
7 believe as Michael already injected at the beginning that this is one off and then it should be
8 considered as such. And then there should be no specific zone dedicated for this property that
9 would allow some future unnecessary consideration of having another property under this
10 zone. So my recommendation would be to either rename it or if anybody wants to keep the
11 name just call it work house housing and then for 2755 El Camino Real. Thank you.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Waldfogel do you have comments?

14

15 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yes, thank you. Just before I comment on it just as a point of
16 clarification can we repeat what the 120 and 150 percent household income... 120/150 percent
17 of AMI household incomes are. Just like to know what those numbers are.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Did you ask for 120 and 150?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well that's what the ordinance refers to is 120 and 150. Just clarify.

2

3 Ms. Hodgkins: So you're looking for 100...

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well the ordinance on Packet Page 29 [1830J090A] refers to 120
6 percent of AMI and 150 percent of AMI. So I'd just like to know what those numbers are
7 relative to this because I just want to put this in perspective.

8

9 Ms. Hodgkins: Let me see if I can find them [unintelligible].

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, while you're searching for those let me just make some other
12 comments about the ordinance. I mean as a point of let's call it code architecture I don't really
13 like this approach of building an overlay category and then figuring out where to apply it. I
14 think that train may have left the metaphorical station so I won't really dwell on that point
15 tonight, but what I would say is if we're going to do this and especially if we're going to do this
16 in a PF zone I think the main public benefit that we can as a... that we can get as a community
17 from this overlay is data collection. That the public benefit we can get is this is a pilot as it's
18 identified on Page 9 of the packet. We want to explore whether these approaches will work
19 elsewhere, but we won't know the answers to those unless we're aggressive about collecting a
20 lot of data about how the units are occupied. I can go down a list here if you like of the types of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 data that we should collect, but we should be at the end of the day this is a pilot or we should
2 learn if this car-lite concept is real or not because honestly we don't know. We also don't know
3 we heard from Hope Smith and the public that she'd like to live there with her, I think it was her
4 son. How many school children will we get in small units? I don't have any issue with that, but
5 I'd just like to know will we produce school kids in these units or not? I suspect that the
6 number is not 0 and the numbers is not 57, but I think that we should be tracking and
7 monitoring these things so we know going forward. I mean with the car lifts we've heard from
8 a couple people issues about the car lifts. We should just have a program to monitor average
9 and peak wait times for people getting their cars in and out of the lift. So we should just know
10 these things and I think if we can learn these things these are public benefits that we can
11 acquire from this sort of project.

12

13 I have some comments about the parking situation, but I'll probably reserve those for the
14 project. But did you have the AMI numbers now?

15

16 Ms. Hodgkins: I do. So based on the median income of a \$113,300 it would be \$135,950 for 120
17 percent AMI and \$169,950 for 150 percent of AMI.

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: So I'm sorry, so relative to the ordinance the 120 threshold is how is
20 what income?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Ms. Hodgkins: \$135,950.

Mr. Lait: Clarify that's for a family of four and so (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: But is that what actually applies in because this ordinance remember restricts units to 750 sf so is that the right number for this ordinance?

Mr. Lait: No. We can rerun those numbers.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, could you? I mean get back to me when you get the numbers (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: Want a household of one?

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, well (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: Is that a [unintelligible]?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well it's household of one, household of two or whatever actually
2 applies in these units.

3

4 Mr. Lait: [Unintelligible] let me just give you the number right now. I've got it right here. So it's
5 for moderate so for a household of one the 120 rate would be \$95,150 and for 150 \$118,950.
6 Oh and let me just make sure I got the right data set here. I think so, yeah. Yeah I believe that's
7 right. So give or take a little bit, but that's I believe what the numbers are.

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok. Ok...

10

11 Mr. Lait: For like again and for a number of persons household one.

12

13 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, ok well just so I have here the PAUSD teacher's salary schedule
14 and just as a point of comparison to get to the \$95,150 income level that would be a teacher
15 with oh, 13 years of experience and thirty credits toward a master's degree. To get to the
16 \$118... what is it 950 level that would be a teacher with 20 somewhere between 26 and 30
17 years of experience and nearly a Ph.D. So I mean when as we're thinking about workforce
18 housing I just want to be clear that we're not talking about teachers here most likely. I just
19 want to introduce that into the record that we're probably not talking about teachers at the
20 120/150 AMI level because a studio apartment will be just affordable to a what did I say? A 15

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 year experienced teacher. So let's just get that on the record. Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair]
2 Monk.

3

4 Vice-Chair Monk: First I'd like to acknowledge the overwhelming support from our community
5 tonight in regards to this new ordinance supporting it and hearing your concerns against it as
6 well; just having your involvement and being here today and all the letters that you sent in are
7 greatly appreciated. We all know that traffic and housing are top concerns. It's what we talk
8 about every day in Palo Alto. It affects us every day in Palo Alto. Our Council Members know it.
9 In fact they ran for their seats on these two big issues. They've mandated that we look into
10 creating more pathways to housing and our community, everyone here tonight has expressed
11 their concern and interest in creating more avenues to housing. We also know that Palo Alto
12 has not kept up with its regional obligation to add housing.

13

14 There are many people that spoke tonight that said they support housing, but not this housing.
15 Not this ordinance. If not this ordinance what ordinance? It might not be perfect, but it is a
16 start. So in my viewpoint you either support housing or you don't. We may not have a perfect
17 solution, but we need to get moving on it in some capacity and I think this is a good start. We
18 have the opportunity with this ordinance to concurrently address these two competing
19 concerns regarding housing and transportation and we are the PTC so this ordinance is squarely
20 fitting within what we are obligated to do in creating a pathway to address both of these issues.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 So I'm pleased that this ordinance has come before us and all the work that staff put into it.
2 You also provided very key data points in your staff report that I appreciate and have helped
3 guide my viewpoints on this.

4
5 The reason why this ordinance will address both of these areas is because it adds housing. Plain
6 and simple it creates more housing. It also takes cars off the road. It gives preferential
7 treatment to workers that live within a half mile, three miles of the housing project site. That's
8 critical. It's car-lite housing. There's a reason for that. It's within walking distance to Caltrain.
9 We heard everyone speak about that so I don't need to go into detail. It will take cars off the
10 road because of the nature of the project itself and it will add housing.

11
12 There's been some concern tonight about whether or not this will increase future
13 developments of this nature. We heard from staff that every new project will undergo scrutiny
14 by Council and by the Commissions and so I feel that that directly answers any concerns that we
15 might have that have to do with upzoning or spot zoning. I don't believe that's an issue
16 because of the other parameters that we have in place to check those balances. We've been
17 tasked by the prior Council and this Council to help increase our housing supply. It's been over
18 two years in the making and I think that we need to do what we can as a commission to just
19 advance us to the next step. We're not making a final determination here tonight. All we're
20 doing is saying this looks good enough to move on to ARB and to get before Council because

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 regardless of what we say here tonight Council is going to modify it however they see fit. So I
2 appreciate all of the comments that were brought up tonight and all of those can and should
3 get elevated to Council for their consideration. And I don't think that we should be a barrier to
4 this ordinance moving forward to Council.

5

6 I just have a little bit more here to go on. The ordinance itself succinctly points out that housing
7 in California is becoming increasingly unaffordable and I'm referring to packet... starting at
8 Packet Page 26. We also have to look at the 15 new state laws that were enacted to address
9 the housing crisis in California and the increased displacement of middle income wage earners.

10 Let's be clear on what that means, we heard some figures just now of what that means and
11 based on figures that were presented reducing it down to a one head of household I believe an
12 AMI of 100 percent is \$83,000. So we're looking at people that are in that \$100,000 range if
13 we're going to 150 percent of AMI. We don't have the exact figures and that's ok, but this is a

14 class of citizens that has been overlooked by the BMR and the high housing prices. And in our
15 Comprehensive Plan and in our Housing Element we're very concerned about this missing
16 middle and this is a great opportunity to address our concerns. We have been directed not just
17 by Council, but also by this own Commission in adopting these provisions within our Housing

18 Element and our Comp Plan and they are also referenced in the staff report so I won't read
19 them to you directly right now.

20

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 I do have a question for staff and it has to do with incidental retail. Can you please explain
2 what that is? What that means? It's on Page 27.

3
4 Mr. Lait: Right, so in coming up with a way to define workforce housing as a permitted land use
5 in this district we didn't want to preclude the possibility of as it was discussed by the Council
6 earlier in 2016 I believe about this community has a strong interest in retail and retail like uses
7 and if you adopted those ordinances and so we didn't want to create a situation where if
8 somebody was proposing a workforce house project as defined in this code that they wouldn't
9 be precluded from providing an incidental amount of retail. It's deliberately not specific in
10 terms of square footage, but this project at one point in the previous iteration had considered a
11 retail bike kitchen or something like that to the tune of maybe 450 or 500 sf. I forget the
12 details, but that's kind of what we had in mind is a small amount of... a small retail area would
13 be permissible along with the residential component.

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: And would that impact parking requirements in some capacity?

16

17 Mr. Lait: It would be subject to the retail parking requirements of the code which I believe is
18 like 1:250 or something like that.

19

20 MOTION

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Vice-Chair Monk: At this juncture I understand that we have other Commissioners that want to speak to this Motion or ultimately yes it will be a Motion. And in fact I would like to advance a Motion if I could get a second. And the Motion that I would make would be to support the ordinance that creates a new workforce housing combining district. I do have three exceptions or caveats that I would want to include in that Motion and they have to do with the vehicle parking, bicycle parking, the TDM, and the incidental retail that we just discussed. So at this juncture I don't know if there's anyone that's inclined to hear me out on those I guess four items (interrupted)

SECOND

Commissioner Riggs: I'll second it for discussion. Well, I have some questions so maybe...

Vice-Chair Monk: I'll go over my three exceptions (interrupted)

Commissioner Riggs: Maybe you could go over those and I'd like some clarification on some stuff.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: Great. Ok, so the caveats or exceptions that I would have include vehicle
2 parking. In our report we were given data points about occupancy rates with parking in regards
3 to 801 Alma and also I thought there was another, there are two studies in there that showed
4 that it's on Page 19 of the packet. And perhaps Claire you want to clarify what's going on here,
5 but at the top of that page 15 percent of spaces are unused in a comparable property and in
6 this case we're parking at 1.2 spaces per unit. Based on the studies that you presented in the
7 staff report we should be at 0.8 or 0.9 percent given that this is a traffic reducing, car
8 dependency reducing project I don't understand why we are putting 1.0 in the ordinance and I
9 would advocate for 0.8 to be the standard for vehicle parking for this type of project.

10

11 In regards to the bicycle parking I don't know why that is required to be at grade. I don't know
12 where that came from. If you'd like to comment on it feel free otherwise I would make the
13 recommendation to remove the last sentence on Packet Page 28 on vehicle parking. That all
14 bicycle parking must be provided at grade.

15

16 In regards to the TDM to me it seems excessive. The project itself is a TDM. It's an experiment.

17 We're going to see who... we're unbundling, it's already been discussed.

18

19 Chair Lauing: This is not just the project remember, this is the ordinance.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: I have the mike still, right? Or the floor rather. So (interrupted)

2

3 Chair Lauing: I'm just pointing out the rules of order. We're talking only about the ordinance.

4

5 Vice-Chair Monk: The ordinance has a TDM plan that's required and I'm speaking to the
6 ordinance. So this ordinance is designed to encourage workforce housing that gives priority to
7 workers that live nearby and also within close proximity to public transit and it also has an
8 extensive bicycle parking requirement. Therefore I don't see the need to support this TDM
9 that's in the ordinance and I would like to see some... we can take that off the table if it's not
10 (interrupted)

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, I will not support... I mean I will not second that Motion.

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, so then I will withdraw the TDM piece of it. And then in regards to
15 incidental retail I would like to see some form of retail on this. I guess it my comments really
16 have to do with this particular project because of the location so I can't speak to that at this
17 point. So I'll have to reserve and speak to that later on, but I would like to see the ordinance to
18 be cleaned up if possible in regards to incidental retail because it's not clear and/or if there is
19 something small like a coffee shop or a bike rental, things like that that would be supportive of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 community building and the new projects that would work in a general sense within this
2 ordinance maybe bake that into the ordinance.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Ok, Commissioner Riggs you were the one that seconded it. You were the one
5 who was next up (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, well I mean it's... yeah it's [unintelligible] so yeah. I don't, well I
8 don't need to discuss something that I clearly support the ordinance generally. I have a
9 question about the rationale for the one mile and three mile buffer. It seems like housing
10 policy as to alright, seems like an employment policy as to housing policy. So is that arbitrary or
11 what is the rationale for those buffers? I can see that becoming an impediment in deployed
12 certain parts in certain parts of the town or City, sorry excuse me.

13

14 Mr. Lait: Yeah and so we chose these numbers, but it's certainly open for the Commission to
15 weigh in as to whether those are the right numbers. That's one of the things that we would like
16 your guidance on. We chose the numbers that we did for the following reasons: one, we
17 thought that so this is in the context of the preferential leasing of the rental units and that we
18 thought if workers were within one mile of the project site or whatever the whatever the
19 project site is that would apply to this ordinance that you're that supports the interest of a car-
20 lite type of development and you might encourage more people to bike or walk within that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 distance. So that would be the preference. And so we went up to another level of three miles
2 because we still felt it was within that area and supporting a distance, maybe that not walking
3 at that point, maybe they're biking or taking a bus or something like that. And so we were just
4 trying to create these little bands to encourage that. And then the last one of course is
5 encouraging people to take rail because they would be within a half mile of fixed rail.

6
7 Commissioner Riggs: But, yeah obviously the logic is [and sounds] [unintelligible] really arbitrary
8 to me. Clearly a bike shed many times is when we consider it five miles. Rail is far beyond that
9 so if you were if you wanted to live in Palo Alto and worked in San Mateo or you work if your
10 project site was outside of that three mile buffer I mean you wouldn't get the preferred policy
11 by it based on my understanding. You would be third, am I correct in understanding that right?

12
13 Mr. Lait: Yeah so that the idea is that if when filling the tenant the rental units the preference
14 would be given to people who are closest to who worked closest to the project site. And then
15 once you exhaust that list of the one mile, the three mile, and the half mile radius from Caltrain
16 or a stop then it would then it opens up to others.

17
18 **FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1**

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, I just see some flaws in the three, in a three mile preferential buffer.
2 I think it leaves out too many jobs and I think that what I would suggest and I'm happy to...
3 actually I don't understand the procedural way to do so because I'm not sure whether it's an
4 Amendment or a Substitute Motion, but it would basically I will amend I would propose an
5 amendment that... well, I would actually just suggest that Council consider this when they
6 approve it and when they discuss the approving the ordinance. And so maybe that would be
7 the amendment that would be the Council will consider the proximity and whether or not it's
8 the appropriate commute shed particularly with regard to transit.

9

10 Chair Lauing: That's acceptable to the maker?

11

12 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 ACCEPTED

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: I do accept that and thank you for pointing that out. That was one of my
15 items that I wanted to discuss because I think it does merit a further discussion and ease of use.
16 I don't think the way it's written is... it's just a little bit cumbersome the way it's drafted. I also
17 did not mention that I do take a little bit of issue with the titling of this ordinance workforce
18 housing and I think Commissioner Gardias mentioned that as well. When I when I Googled
19 workforce housing migrant worker, temporary worker, construction worker type things came
20 up and frankly I don't think as a City we're in the business of building housing for workers. I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 think we're trying to address the missing middle. So if there's a different type of naming
2 convention we can utilize I would support that. Just as an aside. Are we (interrupted)

3

4 Chair Lauing: Ok.

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: Ready to does anyone else have any other problems with the Motion?

7

8 Chair Lauing: I'll figure this out. Did Commissioners do you have any other comments?

9

10 Commissioner Riggs: No, I'm good.

11

12 Chair Lauing: On the Motion? So I think there's a Motion on the table. It's moved and
13 seconded. We're continuing the discussion and the next one up is Commissioner Summa.

14

15 Commissioner Summa: Ok, thank you staff and thank you everyone who came out tonight and
16 sent letters. We got a lot of them. I am sorry that you made that Commissioner **[Note-Vice-**
17 **Chair]** Monk made a Motion so quickly because one of the flaws in the process for me with this
18 ordinance is that it has come a little bit out of nowhere in terms of the public process as this is
19 the first time it's been discussed publicly and I think that there's a disadvantage to that.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 And some of the speakers mentioned this one of the disadvantages that I think is we haven't
2 taken advantage of SB 1505 or the Palmer fix as it's known which allows us now to require
3 inclusionary zoning in rental units. And I would have preferred a slower process for the
4 citywide ordinance that allowed us really to consider that advantage for future and present
5 residents and also a process that took more time in identifying really appropriate sites for
6 housing. I think it's kind of a funny situation with this ordinance that staff and Commissioner
7 Alcheck mentions is the staff report seems to say well here's a bunch of potential housing sites
8 and it's looking like it's a housing ordinance, but in fact because they don't expect them to be
9 developed because there's PF zones. There's just a handful I think that would be good for
10 housing sites because we so many of the PF zones provide important amenities or necessities
11 and we're looking at Ronald McDonald House, Palo Alto Medical Foundation, the Caltrain
12 stations themselves as being potentially privately purchased and developed this way, parks
13 which we already have a shortage of... And the VTA site since it has already been purchased is
14 kind of a unique site I think and stands out in the list of 77 parcels. I couldn't quite so I have a
15 few questions too, but I just think we're putting the cart before the horse a little bit here and I
16 think we're going to pass what either will end up being a ordinance that doesn't provide any
17 housing or an ordinance that sometime in the near future could provide a slippery slope to
18 losing very important PF zoned parcel.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 So I did have a couple questions that I wanted clarified from staff. When you the in the list
2 there's an AT&T site listed. My assumption is that that is the AT&T site at 345 Hamilton
3 Downtown?

4

5 Ms. Hodgkins: Yes, it is.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: So at this time we're not really considering the AT&T site near the park
8 in Ventura?

9

10 Ms. Hodgkins: Correct and I actually have a brief map that shows that... oh sorry, unfortunately
11 this is a little bit hard to see, but there is a yellow outline right here showing the five mile radius
12 and the project site is located or sorry, not the project site, the site that was referenced in a
13 number of comment letters is located outside of that half mile radius.

14

15 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, that's why I asked. I wanted to clarify that. And then I also am
16 confused about another aspect of the ordinance. Oh, sorry.

17

18 Mr. Lait: Yeah, so thanks to the members of the public who had provided all those comments
19 too and I think this is something that we've had a conversation about as well. And it depends
20 on where you're measuring the radius from and what part of the station are we talking about?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Are we talking about the platform, the parking lot, the building that's there and so I think that
2 we've heard some concerns from some members of the public and I don't know where the
3 Commission is relative to the breadth of the applicability of the PF zone to include that parcel
4 or not. If you're if the majority of the Commission is would like to consider a different radius for
5 the boundary adjusting it from the half mile radius to some other radius or some other metric
6 then we can have a conversation about that.

7

8 Commissioner Summa: So that brings up another question. Was it where was the epicenter for
9 the measuring? I assumed it was sort of in the geographical center of the [unintelligible] and
10 the radius was produced as the crow flies.

11

12 Mr. Lait: Yeah, it is a crow's fly type of radius, but again the Caltrain station itself is depending
13 on where you measure it from from one end of the platform to the other to the parking lot it
14 could be where you consider the train station is significant in determining whether it's within
15 that half mile or not to a property.

16

17 Ms. Hodgkins: As far as the maps that were provided to you in the attachments I think yes, I
18 think our Geographic Information System (GIS) generally picked a central location on at the
19 Caltrain.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: Ok. And then I have a question so we have another PF zone change on
2 our agenda tonight which is the PF zone change that would be required not to change the PF
3 zone use, but the PF zone the development standards to produce the two projects on Sherman,
4 the safety building and the garage and then the garage Downtown and that generated a full
5 California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review.

6
7 Mr. Lait: Yeah, I can speak to that. So that specifically didn't generate the CEQA review. That
8 environmental document that we provided copies to the Commission related to the Public
9 Safety Building (PSB) construction and the public parking garage as well. That's what generated
10 the need for the Environmental Impact Report (EIR). The ordinance piece is would not have
11 generated a need for an EIR.

12
13 Commissioner Summa: Ok, thank you for clarifying that. Let's see, so I could of other
14 comments. For me I also had a problem with the term workforce housing in subsidized housing
15 preferential housing is usually for certain categories of people based on perhaps their abilities
16 or their jobs. So I think the more and staff identified this in the staff report that was based on
17 state law that identifies middle income housing and I think that would be more accurate and I
18 think that workforce housing also makes it oddly sound like it would exclude retired people or
19 people that didn't have jobs, but still wanted to live there. So I don't I would recommend a
20 change of name if and when it gets approved.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

I would be prepared I think this deserves a lot more discussion and since we are separating it from the second and third portion of the discussion this evening I would be prepared to make a Substitute Motion to sort of get this back on a citywide track. I'm really afraid that this ordinance as proposed has not done, has not really provided much in the way of anticipating any significant housing and that in the future it could be sort of a slippery slope to lose our PF zones which we really need to provide all these services and amenities to residents.

And one last question, I believe from my calculation there is only one undedicated piece of parkland identified in the 77 parcels. Is that accurate?

Ms. Hodgkins: Honestly I don't know off the top of my head. I'd have to research that a little bit more.

Mr. Lait: We can look into that. I don't know that [unintelligible].

Commissioner Summa: I think it's the only one I the one I'm concerned about is one on Alma. I think it's 201 Alma, the water tower, which also might be a historic, have a historic status. So I just wanted to bring that to your attention. So I am not in favor of supporting this as is today, but I really appreciate staff is taking this first steps to look at opening up as the Comp Plan has

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 provided for for more housing of more affordable types in Palo Alto and I really look forward to
2 having a broader community discussion about the topic. Thank you.

3

4 Chair Lauing: So procedurally you're not making a Substitute Motion now? You're just speaking
5 against approving of the current Motion, correct?

6

7 Commissioner Summa: I really wanted to hear my colleagues all speak before we took any
8 Motion. So I will make Substitute Motion...

9

10 Chair Lauing: But now there is one, there is a Motion so the other colleagues to speak I think
11 are only myself because two colleagues said that they wanted to speak on the...

12

13 Commissioner Summa: I'd be happy to make the Substitute Motion now if you think that's a
14 better process.

15

16 Chair Lauing: It's up to you. I mean I think there's benefit in hearing everybody's comments as
17 well. So.

18

19 Commissioner Summa: I'd rather hear my colleague's comments and then make the
20 Substitution Motion before the vote. Is that proper?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Alright. I will allow that.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Alcheck your light is on now.

Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, I wasn't going to speak, but I didn't think you were going to speak so I'm going to speak now. I think this ordinance was crafted for the specific purpose of making the single site at 2755 El Camino more amenable to multi-family housing development. I think the staff report makes very clear that while the zoning change would affect 77 sites few of them are "developable." The majority of which are owned by the City which satisfy a number of possibilities and the rest are almost all owned by Caltrain. I think again to suggest that this issue can be separated from for the purposes of your recusal doesn't pass the smell test and the fact that you're making a Substitute Motion now strikes me as inappropriate to participate in this discussion because this whole ordinance in my opinion and in the subtle context of this packet seems to basically empower this specific site to be developed for this specific purpose. So I am really uncomfortable with the approach that we've taken tonight and I'm repeating that discomfort for the purposes of City Council at this point because it doesn't seem to be a persuasive here.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 I am going to add one more thing, a couple one more comment here which is that I love the
3 idea of workforce housing. I want to highlight that the City has actually defined workforce
4 housing in the ordinance. So we are defining the term and that is an innovation. By creating
5 this definition we are innovating and we're not the first, in fact Assistant Director Lait and I
6 participated in a conference call a year ago with Elizabeth Brady of [OMB Modular] who was
7 building workforce housing in Oakland. We had an hour long conversation about that
8 innovative approach. So we're not the first, but I think who wants to be the last, right?

9

10 So I would support any version of a Motion that supported the passage of this ordinance. I'm
11 concerned that the one individual who is recused from having a discussion about this project
12 could tank the entire conversation tonight with a Motion to not pass this ordinance which
13 would effectively do what to the remainder of our conversation if we even have it. And I think
14 that that should be unacceptable so.

15

16 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2

17

18 Chair Lauing: Ok, the only other person that hasn't spoken for the first time is myself. I think
19 part of the confusion here from some members of the public and maybe even some of us is
20 that the housing as we just said here with rents get \$3,000 to \$3,500 is not what we generally

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 think of as being affordable. It may or may not be to those people in the income ranges of
2 \$117,000 up, but it may be more likely when this thing is leased up that it's tech workers that
3 are \$175,000 to \$200,000. That's part of the reason for doing the test. The whole idea here is
4 to do a model to get some data which Commissioner Waldfoegel commented on.

5

6 I think there's a broader context within the City of if this works this is great because it can be
7 rolled out and it addresses the broader housing issue, but there's a difference here between
8 market rate housing which we need and affordable housing which we need even more. So
9 that's some of the comments I think we also heard from the public is that this is not really
10 addressing the ordinance may not be addressing with 20 percent which is what staff wanted to
11 get some comment on, 20 percent at this range. So specifically addressing that just to have a
12 conversation on that I don't think it should be restricted to 20 percent. I mean I would suggest
13 that it would be more advisable to say 30 percent I'm talking about the general ordinance now,
14 not the specific project which we repeat will be 30 percent and maybe we would put
15 developers in the head of the queue if they did 50 percent. These are all very hard numbers to
16 hit, know that. But I'm just saying that I think that when we do 20 percent we're not really
17 getting there in terms of what is a bigger problem in the City. So we need to understand that
18 this is really more about market rate housing which is totally fine, but it's not really a lot about
19 affordable housing. Which is again, that's just the name of this project.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Therefore when we get to the language speaking again of the draft, the draft the agenda, I'm
2 just really concerned about the words that are used here because to me if I'm reading this, if
3 the public's reading this it's going to seem like wow we're really addressing affordable housing
4 and with 20 percent as exemplified in the next item that we're going to talk about we're talking
5 about twelve people. Obviously if it's a bigger thing then we're talking about more people, but
6 we're not really addressing affordable housing in a big way and I'm concerned that the
7 language here suggests that. So in terms of the wording I don't actually think we need A, B, or
8 C at all because I wouldn't state that people over paid for their housing. They're making
9 decisions based on their income. I don't think we have to talk about housing in California being
10 becoming increasingly unaffordable. This is about Palo Alto affordability. We know about the
11 lack of housing at affordable levels. I'm ok with D and E, but even in F the resident workforce is
12 leaving the City, new employees are deterred, maybe. But I'm just concerned that this is
13 starting to send the wrong public message in terms of what this is going to do at 20 percent and
14 particularly get over to 183010 on Packet Page 26 we are incentivizing development of new
15 housing that is affordable to the local workforce. I don't know. It' just if you're making
16 \$150,000 I don't know that that's affordable. So I'm just concerned about the language on A, B,
17 C so I would like this I would like to suggest that we just delete A, B, and C from the finding
18 section so it doesn't look too overblown in terms of the accomplishments of having this
19 ordinance on the books which would be an amendment.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: Is that a Motion?

2

3 Chair Lauing: It's an Amendment to the Motion that's on the table. We don't need it. It's just...

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: Quick point of order. Are we treating amendments as Unfriendly

6 Amendments like we discussed in our last meeting so we would vote on them one by one as

7 opposed to in conjunction?

8

9 Chair Lauing: Well, yeah, but we first have to see if the Maker is going to accept it. That's what I

10 was waiting for.

11

12 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: So referring to Package Page 29 A, B, and C. you wanted to take out the

15 affordability requirement BMR and continued affordability?

16

17 Chair Lauing: Page 25, Section 1 A, B, and C.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: The ordinance doesn't start or does it? Hold on. So those are findings. I
2 don't know what that does for us to be honest with you. Those are just findings so it's not the
3 actual law so.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Yeah, but the but this is setting up why we're doing this and how we're going to
6 solve affordable housing programs. And all I'm saying is I think we're overstating that in here
7 and I just think we should just clean it up. That's all.

8

9 Commissioner Riggs: May I suggest that we get some clarification on your suggestion from
10 Council because this seems like I'm just reading this and I don't know that the ordinance would
11 make sense if you didn't include the municipal code section that it was referencing. So that's
12 Section A and...

13

14 Ms. Hodgkins: I think we're on different sections. On Page 25 of the packet?

15

16 Chair Lauing: Correct.

17

18 Ms. Hodgkins: Is that what you're looking at?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: So this Section 1 is just a series of sort of recitals or information that goes to support
2 the reasoning behind the ordinance. It's been used in other ordinances that we've had and that
3 the Council has approved. I think that if the Commission wanted to and some of the data in
4 here is referenced by with and supported by other materials, but if the Commission felt like
5 some of this information is not relevant to the ordinance that could certainly be a part of the
6 recommendation. But yeah, I don't think the ordinance fails if you eliminate a couple of those...

7

8 Chair Lauing: Correct

9

10 Mr. Lait: Sections.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Correct.

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, so on Item B you are using 2010 data. I don't know why, this is 2018 so I
15 think you can find newer data.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Wait, we need to know if we're going to have a second on 25 A, B, and C.

18

19 Vice-Chair Monk: I'm looking at Page 25 B right here.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok.

2

3 Vice-Chair Monk: So I'm addressing your amendment.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Good.

6

7 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2 ACCEPTED IN PART

8

9 Vice-Chair Monk: So I'd like to treat these as unfriendly amendments with that exception that
10 I'd like to see clean up on B and I'd like to move this to a vote. Would you be willing to do that?

11

12 Chair Lauing: Please restate.

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: I'm treating your proposal to remove A, B, and C as Unfriendly with the
15 exception of B in that I would like to see well, I guess you want to take it out completely. So I'm
16 treating it as Unfriendly and would like to move it to (interrupted)

17

18 UNFRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1

19

20 Chair Lauing: My suggested amendment is to just delete A, B, and C.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: Right. And so what I'm hearing (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: That's all I'm saying.

Mr. Lait: Right, so just so for clarification so we don't get bogged down in process too much. The your request Chair is to strike A, B, C, and D and what I'm hearing from the maker of the Motion is that she's willing to remove Section B. That's acceptable, but if you want to continue you would need to make a Motion to an Amendment to the Motion to strike A, C, and D. And that would need a second and then you can vote on that and then that would be acted upon.

Commissioner Riggs: I'll second the A, B... A, B, and D.

Mr. Lait: A, C, D.

SECOND

Commissioner Riggs: A, C, and D. So second recommending that A, B... A, C, and D be stripped from the Motion or from the ordinance.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Yes. Ok.

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: As recommended by staff I guess.

4

5 Mr. Lait: Ok.

6

7 Chair Lauing: It's very simple stuff, but is there anybody else that would like to comment on
8 that?

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: I'm sorry is B retained or was B struck? Is B struck?

11

12 Chair Lauing: B was accepted by the maker and (interrupted)

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: The removal of B. So we're removing A through D?

15

16 Chair Lauing: Yeah.

17

18 Commissioner Waldfogel: Is the proposal? Ok, thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: These lights are not aligned because I don't have my grid here so you're going to
2 have to use a hand at this point. So who was next? Sorry. Ok, yeah. Commissioner Riggs.

3

4 Commissioner Riggs: Where I was going to call for of a vote if you were done. That was...

5

6 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I just wanted to see if there was any comment on the amendments, but if
7 you want to call the question that's a different point.

8

9 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION

10

11 Commissioner Riggs: I'd like to call the question. I believe procedurally we need to vote to
12 accept your amendments.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Right, but generally we can do that with debate or without.

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: That's correct.

17

18 Chair Lauing: So.

19

20 SECOND

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Alcheck: I'll second the call the question Motion.

Chair Lauing: Ok, so everybody who wants to call a question please raise their hand. One, two, three, four. Ok, that's fine. So let's vote on this amendment which is to further delete A, C, and D. I'm sorry? Yes, A, C, and D.

Commissioner Alcheck: I'm sorry, point of order. Don't we have to first vote on the Motion and then the Substitute Amendment?

Chair Lauing: It's not a Substitute Amendment. No it's an amendment to the Motion.

Commissioner Alcheck: But we haven't voted on the Motion.

Mr. Lait: It's not important right now. What you're... you're making an amendment to the Motion.

Chair Lauing: Correct.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: So you're not voting on the Motion right now and so this is an amendment to the
2 Motion and that's what you're going to vote on right now. This is just to be clear you're not
3 making a vote on the Motion that's on the table you're making a vote to amend the Motion to
4 require A, C, and D to be removed from the Section 1 of the ordinance on your Packet Page 25.
5 We will continue to discuss the ordinance after this vote.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Correct. Unless there any other changes?

8

9 Mr. Lait: Well there may be other changes, but right now you have a Motion to do this very
10 specific purpose.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Yep, ok. So all in favor of the vote at this point?

13

14 Mr. Lait: To and just to be clear to what you're voting you're voting to remove A, C, and D from
15 Section 1 to require that as part of the Motion that you'll be voting on later.

16

17 VOTE

18

19 Chair Lauing: Right. So all in favor of that as stated please vote. Any opposed? Opposed, one.
20 But I think... you were aye? Opposed. That's what I thought.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

UNFRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 PASSED (6-1, Commissioner Alcheck opposed)

Mr. Lait: So six, we've recorded it as a 6-1 in favor to add that amendment to the Motion.

Chair Lauing: Right. So relative to other comments that staff requested I think that the preferences as are stated are fine. So I would support that (interrupted)

Commissioner Alcheck: I'm sorry, quick point of order; Jonathan do we speak to our dissent in an amendment?

Mr. Lait: You know if you if the I suppose it's up to the Chair to recognize that.

Chair Lauing: If you'd like to speak to that, sure.

Commissioner Alcheck: I think that the notion that somehow the statements made in A through D are somehow misleading to the public or will somehow anger the public because they potentially confound the idea of workforce and affordable is a mistake. And I think that there is a significant proportion of Bay Area residents who would argue that the numbers that we're talking about are unaffordable are what they would describe as affordable as compared to the

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 market. So I that's the reason I did not support the removal of these items from the
2 ordinance's language.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Ok. I just wanted to continue with my first round comments. The only other thing
5 I want to say as I started to was that I think that the preferences are fine. I'd prefer to see a
6 higher percent at least 30. I'm not sure there's any interest in that. And I think that's all I have
7 for my first round. So we've completed the first round. Commissioner Gardias you were going
8 to (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Riggs: I'm sorry. I believe I called the question. I mean I called the question
11 about the Motion that Ms. Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair] Monk made.

12

13 Mr. Lait: So I'm sorry that I don't think was what we called the question to was to the
14 amendment, but if you want to make (interrupted)

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: That was not my intent. My intent was to call the question on the primary
17 amendment so we could actually have a vote on that. I mean the process is really obtuse and I
18 see I mean candidly it's so that we had to vote on an amendment. I want to vote on what
19 Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair] Monk (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: You can [unintelligible] you can now do that if you'd like to call the question.

2

3 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION

4

5 Commissioner Riggs: I would like to call the question.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Right, so you can do that. You have a second?

8

9 SECOND

10

11 Commissioner Alcheck: Second.

12

13 VOTE

14

15 Chair Lauing: Right and ok, two-thirds vote. All in favor of calling the question at this point?

16 Two and you're voting for it? Three. Ok, it fails for lack of a two-thirds vote. So that means

17 there's other comments that need to come on this. I want to keep this brief so if there's other

18 comments it doesn't have to be everyone and we'd like to keep it to a few minutes so we can

19 get cranking here. We want to be done with this [along ago] so.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: So I accepted those amendments based on my understanding that it also
2 related to calling the question. So you know...

3

4 Mr. Lait: Well so I don't want to get bogged down on process, seriously. We've got a Motion
5 and it sounds like there's still some discussion on that Motion.

6

7 Vice-Chair Monk: Right and I (interrupted)

8

9 Mr. Lait: [Unintelligible] a request to call the vote has failed so there is discussion now.

10

11 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, it my impression was the same as Commissioner Riggs that it was moving
12 forward to a vote and so in trying to facilitate that I was make being agreeable in accepting the
13 these amendments in order to move it forward.

14

15 Mr. Lait: I understand that's your perspective. I understand Commissioner Riggs had a similar
16 perspective. Unfortunately that's not what was on the table.

17

18 Vice-Chair Monk: Alright then I would just like to make a record to Council that I would
19 maintain the four provisions that were initially inserted into the ordinance. Thank you.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok, so for any further discussion I really would like this to be brief and to the
2 point. So please in the absence of these lights working properly raise hands. I think
3 Commissioner Gardias on the same issue of the ordinance.

4
5 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, thank you and thank you, Commissioner Summa. I appreciate I was
6 trying to raise my hand long time ago. So I'd like to propose something like this, I just I don't
7 believe that this ordinance is appropriate. I believe that we should reschedule the discussion
8 and only discuss it within the perspective of this one single project. If there is a need for an
9 ordinance then we would after incorporating our comments about this specific project staff
10 may write an ordinance if it's appropriate, If it's proper, If it's needed. If it's not needed let's
11 just take it out of the table, let's just focus on the project. Thank you.

12
13 Vice-Chair Monk: So if that's a Substitute Motion?

14
15 Chair Lauing: There's no Substitute Motion? No. So yes, Commissioner Summa.

16
17 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1

18
19 Commissioner Summa: So a couple of things. I'd like to make it clear with regards to
20 Commissioner Alcheck's comments earlier that no one Commissioner can tank this project and

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 this Commissioner had no intention of tanking anything. I did not feel that this ordinance the
2 citywide one was ready to go forward. I did not think it provided enough benefit. I think the
3 fact and I was hesitating to make a Substitute Motion because I really thought we needed to
4 have a lot of discussion. We haven't even touched on many aspects of this ordinance including
5 the development standards which I have a lot of problems with, but I feel forced to make a
6 Substitute Motion now because of the what I see as a somewhat aggressive nature of pursuing
7 this. And just to be clear I cannot express my feelings about the specific project, but I in no way
8 is my intention to tank anybody's genuine proposal to do anything this evening.

9

10 So I am ready to make a Substitute Motion that I think will really serve us better and I wish the
11 applicant and the Commission when I recuse myself the very best results in my absence. So I
12 will go ahead and make a Substitute Motion and that is that I would like to make a Motion that
13 we do not recommend the draft ordinance for approval this evening rather we recommend that
14 staff prepare a combining district that would incent more actual construction of middle income
15 and subsidized housing after amending the BMR ordinance to require an appropriate
16 percentage of inclusionary zoning in rental units as allowed by AB 1505 and a more opportunity
17 for the public to comment on the overriding ordinance.

18

19 SECOND

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok. Do we have a second for that? I'd like to second it to hear your conversation
2 about what that is (interrupted)

3
4 Commissioner Alcheck: A point of order. I have a point of order question here. So the nature
5 of the Chair's decision to not allow a call a question on the Motion itself has now allowed a
6 Substitute Motion to replace the Motion based on your second.

7
8 Chair Lauing: No, that's not correct.

9
10 Commissioner Alcheck: But you've just allowed a Substitute Motion to replace the Motion that
11 Motion (interrupted)

12
13 Chair Lauing: The Motion to the call to order, sorry, the call of the question was defeated. It
14 was allowed and it was defeated by a vote of the Commissioners. It was defeated 4-3.

15
16 Commissioner Alcheck: The makers of that Motion don't necessarily agree with that position.

17
18 Chair Lauing: That was explained to you by staff. Just (interrupted)

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: Staff's interpretation and the makers of that Motion's interpretation of
2 their Motion are not in line. And now we have a Substitute Motion which has replaced the
3 Motion. This whole thing seems very confusing to me. And I may (interrupted)

4
5 Chair Lauing: The amendments were processed according to how they're always processed so.
6 I'd like to hear the comments on what's being proposed here because I don't obviously
7 understand it. We only got one version of a proposal from staff and if there's another idea why
8 not just listen to it? So...

9
10 Commissioner Alcheck: Because we have limited time and there seems to be a majority here
11 who may favor the Motion on the floor. So that's why (interrupted)

12
13 Chair Lauing: Thank you. So I've seconded the Motion and now we open it up for discussion
14 and the Maker will be the first discussion.

15
16 Commissioner Summa: Well I think I've spoken to this and my feeling is that this ordinance for
17 the citywide ordinance is not ready to go forward, that there hasn't been enough public
18 comment, that it won't... it even staff and my colleague Commissioner Alcheck seem to think
19 it's a just a spot zoning then it shouldn't include all those other properties and we should find a
20 really good process and legal way to advance a project if my colleagues after I leave are in favor

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 of doing so. I don't think we've had enough discussion to recommend this. We haven't even
2 touched on the development standards and just to be clear I made my position clear that I
3 would be ready to make a Substitute Motion and I also said I would wait because I wanted to
4 give people a chance to talk about it. So my intention is to not recommend this only because I
5 would like to see something better, a better ordinance to provide more housing middle income
6 and subsidize. Thank you.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Is there any staff comment on this the structure of what she's proposed to help us
9 understand it?

10

11 Mr. Lait: Well, I mean I'd rather answer your question this way; if there is an interest in not
12 supporting the ordinance at this time I would suggest that you make a recommendation to the
13 City Council for denial based on a series of reasons so that the conversation can be held at the
14 City Council and they can make an informed decision as to whether or not based on what they
15 hear at the Council, at the Commission level that yeah, you're right. Maybe this does need a
16 little bit more time and let's remand it back to the PTC for discussion or alternatively the
17 Council would have the opportunity to say we're prepared to move forward. Maybe there's
18 some changes, but the Motion that the Substitute Motion that's on the table I'm concerned
19 that it takes it out of the Council's ability to move forward. And this is this item this ordinance
20 is something that is in our housing program, work program. So I would only suggest that if

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 there is majority support for this that it not be referred for staff to come up with a whole list of
2 new criteria, but rather that recommendation go to the Council and say hey, we're not ready to
3 support this yet, these are the things that we think you need to address. And then the Council
4 would have the opportunity to decide how to proceed.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Is an, excuse me Jonathan; is an alternative this I heard was not supposed to go
7 until Spring to the Council?

8

9 Mr. Lait: Well so we're... yeah. We're I mean we're working on getting it scheduled for the
10 Council. If the Commission moves the project forward it goes to the ARB for review. If the
11 Commission is not supportive of the ordinance presumably it would not be supportive of the
12 site design also and that would go to the City Council sooner.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Right, but I'm just asking what I was going to ask was as an alternative given that
15 there's another proposal and some questions on this one what about just continuing the whole
16 thing for two weeks and in the interim have somebody here iterate with you on what does that
17 mean, what are the legalities of it, and just bring it back in two weeks.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: We're not going to be able to address what I understood the various items in two
2 weeks. It's just it's not, there was there was a lot there. There was a lot packed into that
3 Motion.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok, Commissioner Gardias.

6

7 Commissioner Gardias: I will just allow Commissioner Riggs to speak first because I have to
8 gather my thoughts before I speak. So please, go ahead.

9

10 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: I was going to call the question on the Motion on the floor I think just to
13 move it forward. So I will (interrupted)

14

15 Mr. Lait: So just to be clear. I'm sorry to interrupt, but just we have some confusion on the last
16 one so if you're calling the order now you're calling it on the Substitute Motion. I just want to
17 be clear about that.

18

19 Commissioner Riggs: I understand that the prior Motion was dead.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: It's not dead. It's just...

2

3 SECOND

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: I will second the Motion in an effort to revive the discussion on the first
6 Motion.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Ok, so the question has been called on the Substitute Motion which would require
9 four which would terminate any further discussion and require a vote on the Substitute Motion.
10 So those in favor of calling the question please raise your hand. And opposed? Ok, that did not
11 pass so we still have conversation the Substitute Motion. Commissioner Gardias you still want
12 the floor?

13

14 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION FAILED (Commissioners **[not named]**)

15

16 Commissioner Gardias: Sure so I will speak now. I'm just I was trying just to figure out how to
17 structure it, but I will just tell you what my interest is. My interest is to move with the
18 discussion and hopefully move ahead with the project tonight; however, I totally understand
19 and share concerns that Commissioner Summa had so I'm trying just to make those two things
20 happen because I am clearly against any ordinance for workforce combined for the workforce

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 district because I think this is too early. However, I would like to see us moving ahead on the
2 discussion on this on the specific projects. So for this reason I would like to either propose that
3 you're going to accept my Friendly Amendment that there will be a special district created for
4 2755 El Camino Real as it is proposed here and then during the discussion we will modify some
5 numbers that are within this the sheets. But my interest is clearly to either have it as a
6 Substitute to your Motion or if you're going to reject it then I would be pretty much proposing a
7 Substitute Motion just to create separate district for this one project. Thank you.

8

9 Chair Lauing: So can staff speak to that structurally please and legally?

10

11 Mr. Lait: Well so what I'm hearing is that Commissioner Gardias is asking the maker of the
12 Substitute Motion and the seconder if they would consider alternative language that would
13 move forward an ordinance for the property at 2755 El Camino Real.

14

15 Chair Lauing: In parallel with revising the actual ordinance? Is that the concept?

16

17 Mr. Lait: I'm unclear as to what the amendment would seek to do.

18

19 Commissioner Summa: I have a suggestion.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: I think is that what you're saying is that you'd like to make sure we can proceed,
2 but still take more time to consider other ways to do the ordinance?

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: Correct.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Ok. Commissioner Summa.

7

8 Commissioner Summa: I have a question for staff. Could I add to my Motion that or could I
9 suggest that his that his Motion, Commissioner Gardias' Motion sorry, be worded slightly
10 differently to say that I that the maker of the Motion would be comfortable because she would
11 not be participating in the rest of the conversation with any decision regarding a
12 recommendation for the specific project going forward. See I'm kind of in a bind because I
13 don't mind if that happens in my absence with my colleagues, but I can't speak to it. So is there
14 any way you can craft something that would be legal?

15

16 Chair Lauing: I don't know why that isn't legal because he made the amendment.

17

18 Commissioner Gardias: So you know what? So let me just make it simple, sorry for this. So let's
19 I'm going to withdraw my Motion, my Amendment. So.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Ok.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Ok, Commissioner Waldfogel.

6

7 Commissioner Waldfogel: Thank you. I don't support the Substitute Motion. The reason I don't
8 support the Substitute Motion is that I think that Commissioner Summa raises some very
9 important points about affordable housing. I think they need to be taken up at some time in
10 the future. I don't think what we're doing tonight precludes that. I mean we're taking up
11 something which is not affordable housing, it's a different category. I'm perfectly willing to
12 deliberate on the topic that's at hand tonight. I don't like the structure of what's in front of us,
13 but I feel that that train has left the station. If I were starting fresh I would certainly take a
14 more targeted approach. I will have a few amendments I'd like to propose to the original
15 Motion if the Substitute Motion fails.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Ok, other comments? Commissioner Alcheck.

18

19 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah look, I 100 percent agree with what Commissioner Waldfogel just
20 said and I just I can't miss the opportunity here to suggest that we didn't have to second this

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Substitute Motion for those comments to be articulated. And you can suggest that you like the
2 idea of exploring alternatives and different approaches without this I would say sabotaging the
3 process here. So I would very much like if we could just move forward with a vote because I
4 feel this Motion will fail and we can get back to the business of tonight.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Ok, so if there's no other comments then it is time to vote on the Substitute
7 Motion after the well thought out commentary by a number of my colleagues. So those who
8 favor the Substitute Motion? Hands in favor of the Substitute Motion.

9

10 Commissioner Riggs: Aye. Oh, sorry.

11

12 Mr. Lait: I believe you're voting no.

13

14 Chair Lauing: I helped you there.

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: Sorry.

17

18 VOTE

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Alright, in favor of the Substitute Motion? And opposing the Substitute Motion?

2 Ok, so that fails. We're now back to the original Motion. The floor, I'm sorry the Motion has
3 been amended a couple of times. The floor is still open so the first hand I see is Commissioner
4 Gardias.

5

6 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 FAILED ([count not given])

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. I'd like to propose Substitute Motion to (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Riggs: There's no Motion on the floor.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Yeah there is. The original Motion (interrupted)

13

14 Commissioner Gardias: There is original Motion on the floor.

15

16 Chair Lauing: As amended.

17

18 Vice-Chair Monk: The one you seconded.

19

20 Chair Lauing: As amended. It's still there. Go ahead.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: I would like to propose the change; I'd like to propose a Substitute
2 Motion to rename this ordinance for 2755 El Camino Real.

3

4 Commissioner Alcheck: We can't do that with Commissioner Summa on the dais. We cannot
5 mix these two things.

6

7 Chair Lauing: This is just the general ordinance; it's not relative to (interrupted)

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: Can staff step in here please?

10

11 Mr. Lait: I'm not hearing a second.

12

13 Commissioner Alcheck: This is our evening that we're wasting here.

14

15 Mr. Lait: So I'm not hearing a second.

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: It doesn't matter (interrupted)

18

19 Mr. Lait: Michael. I'm not hearing a second so I think you need to move on with the
20 deliberation on the Motion.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

Chair Lauing: Yeah, Commissioner Waldfogel.

Commissioner Waldfogel: I'm sorry; I have a couple of amendments that I would like to propose to the original Motion. And just as a point of clarification did the original Motion on packet Page 28 did it include the in the vehicle parking section did it include the any incidental retail section or not? Can we just get a point of clarification on that?

Ms. Hodgkins: I believe that the parking section of the ordinance did include a note that parking...

Mr. Lait: Yes, it includes the Motion does include the incidental parking being subject (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Monk: My Motion was to strike that language.

Mr. Lait: So you just kept the 0.8. You just change everything to 0.8.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well in this section vehicle parking it sounds like I just want again a
2 point of clarification. Is this sentence that starts any incidental retail in the Motion or out of the
3 Motion? I just want to understand.

4

5 Vice-Chair Monk: I was suggesting to remove that last sentence of the ordinance.

6

7 Commissioner Waldfogel: Was that the Motion that was, is that the Motion that's on the floor?

8

9 Chair Lauing: I don't think that's in there, in the Motion.

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: I just want that as a point of clarification. So if you want that you
12 may need to just bring that in as an amendment, but let's just get this clear. So there are two
13 things in particular that I'd like to do in this that I'd like to amend. The first one is in the TDM
14 plan section. I'd like to change the last sentence so after Section 1852.05(d) I'd like to say
15 "comma associated administrative guidelines comma and subject to decision making body" so
16 the decision making body can set up TDM standards that are pilot-y because this is all based on
17 a pilot promise. So that's my first (interrupted)

18

19 Chair Lauing: What's the packet page?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 UNFRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2

2

3 Commissioner Waldfogel: That's Packet Page 28, the TDM plan, table... I don't know if the table
4 has a... it's Table 1, Development Standards so I'm moving an amendment to change the last
5 part of that sentence to add the ability for to make this subject to a decision making body as
6 well as these other criteria.

7

8 Vice-Chair Monk: Can you clarify who the decision making body is and also what is set forth in
9 Section 1852.05(d)?

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: Well so decision making body is referenced in other parts of the
12 Development Standards Table so I assume it's the same decision making body that that's
13 referenced. I don't know I assume that that's Council, but it just gives Council discretion to set
14 up TDM plan that are appropriate for projects like this.

15

16 Chair Lauing: Ok.

17

18 Vice-Chair Monk: And is staff going to speak to what's listed in Section 1852?

19

20 Commissioner Waldfogel: We need a second.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Lait: Yeah, that is dealing with adjustments that the Director can make for various reasons; adjustments by the Director.

Commissioner Waldfogel: And if we get a second I'll tell you specifically why I want to make this...

SECOND

Commissioner Riggs: I'll second that discussion.

Chair Lauing: Go ahead.

Commissioner Waldfogel: So the specific reason is that there's a list of things that we need to learn as we proceed with this kind of project. I mean we have this promise of [Karl White], but we need the discretion to be able to measure impacts, we need to we need TDM plan that are collecting data not only about trips, but about vehicle ownership, about where cars are parked, etcetera, etcetera. So I just want the discretion in the ordinance to be able to set up TDM plans that can count the things that need to be counted. And when we get to the project I will have

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 some specific proposals relative to the TDM plan that's in the in whatever we are looking at, the
2 Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND).

3

4 VOTE

5

6 Chair Lauing: Any further comments on that proposed amendment? [Unintelligible] there are
7 none we'll put to vote. All in favor of that amendment, aye. Any opposed? One opposed.

8 Sorry, two opposed. Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair] Monk?

9

10 UNFRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2 PASSED (5-2, Commissioners [Monk and ? opposed])

11

12 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, can I make a second amendment?

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: The amendment passed.

15

16 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #3

17

18 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yes, but now I have a second one that I'd like to propose which is in
19 the findings section if I don't get support [unintelligible]. Oh, I'm sorry am I on now? I don't
20 think Finding F makes a whole lot of sense, but I think it's really important that the findings for

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 this zoning district establish that data collection that measurement is an important aspect of
2 creating this district. We're setting up a pilot. If we don't collect data, if we don't make it
3 public then we won't accomplish the goals of this district. So I want a finding I can propose
4 language such as data collection on measures that succeed in car-lite occupancy is a valuable
5 public benefit that needs to be collected and published from this project or from projects in
6 these zones. I mean I'm sorry that's not good that's not great language per se, but...

7

8 Chair Lauing: I'll second that.

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: Just data collection.

11

12 Chair Lauing: I just want to comment that that's the core stated reason why we're looking at
13 this and it will apply to the next item we talk about and could apply to others, but we want to
14 continue to collect data so that we can make some decisions here going forward. It's a big
15 strategic thing so I would support that.

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: Point of order, can we just find out if the maker will treat that as a
18 Friendly Amendment so that we can just continue?

19

20 Chair Lauing: Sure, but I was speaking to my second first

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Alcheck: I know, but has to not accept it before you can second it.

Vice-Chair Monk: Staff I have a question. What's the effect of If I treat this as Unfriendly versus Friendly?

Mr. Lait: They just vote.

Vice-Chair Monk: Does it make a difference how I'm treating this amendment?

Commissioner Alcheck: We don't vote on it.

Mr. Lait: If you are accepting it and the seconder of the original Motion accepts it, it gets embedded into the Motion. If you don't accept it or if Commissioner Riggs does not accept it then you have the first and the second and you vote on it.

Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, so the this amendment proposal is not clear to me and because of that reason I can't accept it.

Mr. Lait: So perhaps asking for clarification?

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Vice-Chair Monk: If you want to further clarify and are you asking to remove the current language and replace it with something else?

Commissioner Waldfogel: I'm proposing adding a new finding. I don't know what letter it will be based on I don't really care what letter it is and a finding that data collection on parking, traffic, and how do I say this? Occupancy profiles? Sort of who's getting these? I don't know how to say that. I need some help with that.

Commissioner Riggs: Demographics.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Demographics. Thank you, that's a good word. It's getting too late for me to think of big words like that, but thank you. But data collection on traffic, parking, tenant demographics is a key goal of this zoning district.

Vice-Chair Monk: I accept the aspect of the amendment that goes to parking occupancy as far as occupancy demographics I believe that there is a constitutionally protected class that we might be dealing with here and I don't want to go down that road. I think it's dangerous. As much as I'd like to know what's going on I don't know that that's something that we could do. If our esteemed Assistant City Attorney would like to weigh in, please do so.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Yang: I think we understand the Motion and if there are legal constraints on the type of data that we can collect that's something we'll analyze.

Commissioner Riggs: Treat the ethos of the Motion as being...

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #3 ACCEPTED

Vice-Chair Monk: Then I would accept this Motion.

Commissioner Riggs: And I will accept it as well.

Chair Lauing: Great, Commissioner did you have any other ones?

Commissioner Waldfogel: No, I'm done.

Chair Lauing: Ok, any other comments? Well we don't have to because she accepted it.

Commissioner Alcheck: I have a quick question about the amendment.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yeah, Commissioner Alcheck.

2

3 Commissioner Alcheck: So I just had one quick question. I my current understanding of multi-
4 family property management suggests that you really can't essentially conduct some sort of
5 demographic analysis of your residency. And so I I'm only I think this concept of the ethos is
6 great. I'll support any version of this Motion that can move us to the second half of the fight
7 here, but I do want to just make the point real quick that I think there is some real legal issues
8 here that we're probably not equipped to deal with tonight. And it's worth mentioning, but...

9

10 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Riggs had his comment on that.

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: Well, I actually think it's a really good idea Michael and I understand the
13 legal concerns, but having like having a little more aggressive analytics program that validates
14 your TDM measures is not a... is

15

16 Chair Lauing: Good thing.

17

18 Commissioner Riggs: Is a great thing that we should aspire to. So... ok, yeah. I mean
19 (Interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm saying for the drafter.

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: Ok, totally understand your concern, but I think it's a nice addition.

4

5 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Summa.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: I'd like to propose some amendments. One of ok so there's the first

8 one has to do with the Development Standards Table. There are two places in the front yard

9 and the (interrupted)

10

11 Chair Lauing: Packet page, please?

12

13 Commissioner Summa: Packet Page 27 and 28.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Ok.

16

17 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #4

18

19 Commissioner Summa: So there's the front yard and the street side yard have no standard

20 setback. I think there should be a standard setback which can always be adjusted through a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Design Enhancement Exception (DEE) these days, but I think there should be a standards that is
2 required. The height restriction within residential district other than RM-40 or PC zone
3 currently is within 150 feet. It has to maintain the height of the residential zone which is 35.
4 That's been reduced in the distance to 50 feet and expanded in the height to 50 and I don't...
5 no? Packet Page 28. It's the under the standard height has been identified at 50 and within the
6 next row within 50 feet of a residential district other than RM-40 or PC it can be 50. Currently
7 there is 150 foot buffer when abutting commercial zones, abut residential zones that requires a
8 35 foot high. I think that would be more appropriate.

9
10 Ms. Hodgkins: So this was actually revised for clarity. It actually technically says the same thing
11 as what is in other sections of the code. Basically it said something along the lines of... well, let
12 me pull it up really quickly.

13
14 Commissioner Summa: I can make it simpler if you'd like and I could simplify it to say that the
15 Development Standards Table should be adjusted where necessary to represent the to reduce
16 to represent the current standards of reducing negative impacts on a budding zones. If that
17 makes it simpler rather than detail? And while you're looking that up I'll speak to my second
18 amendment and that would be that I don't think there's anywhere tonight that we have
19 identified in this ordinance under this proposed ordinance I don't think we've identified any
20 standard under which the zone change would could be denied. I think that staff should add

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 some standards before it goes to Council to identify reasons that the change could be denied.

2 It's just not in here at all.

3

4 Vice-Chair Monk: And where are you referring to specifically? Or is that something that you
5 would need to see added?

6

7 Commissioner Summa: I think it would need to be added, a set of standards under which the
8 zone change could be denied under the ordinance.

9

10 Vice-Chair Monk: Could I ask for a brief recess because the seconder of the Motion is not here
11 to hear what the proposed amendment is so if there's any other administrative discussion to
12 have on timing or whatever (interrupted)

13

14 Chair Lauing: There isn't.

15

16 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, alright so well then in regards to the first aspect of your amendment that
17 the front yard and side street side yard should have a standard I agree that would allow for
18 uniform applicability of this ordinance. I don't know what that standard would be. I don't know
19 where we would get guidance or guidelines on that if staff can speak to that further?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Hodgkins: Yeah, sure. So we left this open, but I think there is also the possibility what we
2 do for the RM-40 district for example it leaves some flexibility. So it says 0 to 25 five feet and
3 then leaves it open to subject to decision making body. I think in the RM-40 it references the
4 ARB. So we could provide a range or the reason we ended up keeping it open in this case was
5 because it is really dependent on where the site is located. In some cases such as the
6 Downtown a 25 foot setback would not be appropriate. Somewhere along for El Camino Real
7 there were specific exclusively residential guidelines that we were following and in other areas
8 a typical 10 to 20 foot setback might be more appropriate. So I think we could always add a
9 range of something potentially.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: So that's thank you for that answer. That helps and I think then maybe
12 the right kind of language there would be not to leave it wide open, but to say consistent with
13 the adjacent properties. Just so there was guidance for decision makers.

14

15 Mr. Lait: I think is this is on the setback issue? Yeah, I mean so we wrote it this way to maximize
16 flexibility for the decision makers to accommodate a project like this in the future. So we our
17 recommendation is that it not be specified. If you want us to come up with a number we'd be a
18 little hard pressed to come up with it tonight, but that could be the direction that you give us
19 and we can figure out what would be appropriate.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: The intention of my amendment was for staff to take that back and
2 decide what was best.

3

4 Mr. Lait: Sure, ok.

5

6 Commissioner Summa: To and change that for Council.

7

8 Mr. Lait: Ok. It was just that added part that gave me a little pause about looking at the
9 adjacent parcels because I'd like it to be a little broader than that.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: Whatever staff thinks is appropriate. I just think it's better when there's
12 a standard that you work from.

13

14 Mr. Lait: Ok.

15

16 Chair Lauing: So do you accept that?

17

18 Vice-Chair Monk: I think Gardias has a comment.

19

20 Chair Lauing: But you need to decide if you going to accept that amendment.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #4 REJECTED

Vice-Chair Monk: This amendment is one that I would like to support because I agree that we should have standards; however, the fact that it wasn't included intentionally and it's staff recommendation to leave it a little more flexible to allow for the decision making body to weigh in I think that's enough oversight and governance that they will look to other similar setbacks moving forward on these decisions. So I would not accept it, but I would strongly encourage staff to please inform Council of the contents of this amendment and give them the opportunity to deliberate it and add it in it when it comes to Council.

Chair Lauing: And that works for Commissioner Summa? But I mean you can force it by putting it to a vote, but I'm just saying if that's ok then we can move on so? Ok, great. Alright, so.

Commissioner Summa: But then perhaps staff could weigh in? It was my understanding then when a residential zone other than RM-40 or a PC zone abuts a commercial zone the commercial standard is within 150 feet that it be held to 35 feet.

Ms. Hodgkins: So it was a little bit unclear. So basically what's stated in other areas of our code is within 150 feet of a residential district other than RM-40 or PC zone abutting or located

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 within 50 fifty feet of the site. So we just wanted to kind of... it's really 50 feet, but we just
2 wanted to no sorry, not in terms of height, but 50 feet in terms of distance. But we were trying
3 to just take an awkward sentence that's included in another section of our code and make it a
4 little bit more clear by just stating 50 feet. Like I said it says abutting or located within 50 feet
5 so it's kind of...

6

7 Commissioner Summa: And you, but that does not include a 35 foot height within?

8

9 Ms. Hodgkins: Within 50 feet of a site includes the 35 foot height.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: Ok, so I see 50 here so maybe I'm reading it wrong, but I see that it's 50.

12

13 Ms. Hodgkins: Yeah, exactly. We, sorry, we use that from other section of the code that
14 references anything generally within 150 feet of the site, but then clarifies that it's only if it's
15 abutting within 50 feet of the site. So we were just trying to make our code this code section
16 more clear by just stating 50 feet, within 50 feet of the site. Does that make sense?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Not really, but I think that it won't be accepted by the maker so I will let
19 it go. But it was not my understanding of the of that law.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. Hodgkins: Ok.

2

3 Chair Lauing: Did you have any other amendments? That's it?

4

5 Commissioner Summa: Well I think it would be useful for the Council when they're considering

6 it to understand on what to have some guidelines on denying the ordinance change. So and I

7 don't think those are included here really. So I was wondering if the staff, if the maker of the

8 Motion would like to (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm sorry, what does that mean? Standards on denying the ordinance

11 change? Wouldn't they just not change the ordinance?

12

13 Commissioner Summa: No I think there should be standards on which you would deny the PF

14 zone change as proposed (interrupted)

15

16 Chair Lauing: Are you proposing this as an amendment?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Yes that (interrupted)

19

20 Commissioner Alcheck: But the standard is they don't approve it.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: Ok, Commissioner Summa has the floor.

Commissioner Summa: I think it would be helpful for clarity in the ordinance which I don't find very clear for there to be some sort of standards or findings that have to be made to deny or approve the zone change rather just to give the discussion some when it goes to.

Mr. Lait: We have those standards. They're in another section of the code, Section 1880.080.

Commissioner Summa: Ok, great.

Mr. Lait: So we're good.

Commissioner Summa: Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Ok, great, any other... sorry, the maker.

Vice-Chair Monk: Commissioner Summa you alluded to the fact that this might not accommodate workers necessarily that it might address the need for folks that are not

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 employed, underemployed or elderly, retired, whatnot. Did you want to propose any sort of
2 amended language to that effect?

3

4 Commissioner Summa: I think Commissioner Gardias already proposed that and it didn't fly.

5 And that is I agree also that it should be called middle income housing not workforce housing.

6 And if you would accept that as an amendment I'd be fine with it.

7

8 Vice-Chair Monk: I wouldn't accept it as middle income housing because that's only addressing

9 20 percent of it. So I think we made it clear to Council that we're not pleased with this choice of

10 language and that they'll look at it, but as far as crafting it tonight I don't know that that's

11 something we can come up with. But I guess on that note I would encourage staff and/or

12 Council to just look again at Page 5 under C where we're using workforce housing maybe refer

13 to it as deed restricted units or something like that. So are we ready to move forward?

14

15 Chair Lauing: Ok, we had one more light. Commissioner Gardias.

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Then I think we're done.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: So question to the staff. It is about the vehicle parking. There is a
2 reference to section which I don't have in front of me, 1852. I'd would like to understand if that
3 section excludes this zone from the residential parking programs?

4
5 Ms. Hodgkins: Section 1852 of our code would not provide any restrictions on the RPP program,
6 but the ordinances that develop each of those programs, each individual RPP has its own
7 ordinance, the ordinance has been developed and approved for the Evergreen Park/Mayfield
8 RPP does not include this site in its boundaries and therefore nobody, no tenants from the site
9 would be eligible to participate in that program.

10
11 Mr. Lait: Good and so I don't want to get into details of the specific project, but so I think we
12 this ordinance does not need to address that RPP issue.

13
14 Commissioner Gardias: So by this you're saying that other sites within the zone, within the
15 zones excludes our RPP, excludes these zones?

16
17 Mr. Lait: Yes. They could.

18
19 Commissioner Gardias: They could or they do?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Well there's (interrupted) [unintelligible]

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: What my intention is to pretty much exclude them because of the
4 specifics of the zone. I believe that pretty much all this zone, all middle income housing should
5 be included, excluded from RPP. Shall I repeat this?

6

7 Mr. Lait: No. It's just up to the Commission if that's how you if you want to amend the
8 ordinance to (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Yeah, so I'd like to understand, right? Before I just propose it to the
11 Commission I'd like to understand because this project (interrupted)

12

13 Mr. Lait: We can't talk about (interrupted)

14

15 Commissioner Gardias: Is excluded (interrupted)

16

17 Mr. Lait: No, I'm not going to talk about the specific project.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: I understand.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: I could talk to you about the ordinance, but not the specifics of the project.

2

3 Chair Lauing: So is your intent what was your intent on the ordinance?

4

5 Commissioner Gardias: My intention is to use to exclude this zone from participation in
6 residential parking programs.

7

8 Chair Lauing: I see.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: But now the question is technical because if that regulation should be in
11 RPP or this should be in this zone specifically. Either way?

12

13 Mr. Lait: Either way.

14

15 Commissioner Gardias: Either way. So if it's either way I'd like to propose to a as a Friendly
16 Amendment to exclude this zone however it's called from residential parking programs.

17

18 Chair Lauing: The people who were living in these zones cannot participate in any residential
19 parking?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: Can I (interrupted)

2

3 Vice-Chair Monk: As the maker of the Motion (interrupted)

4

5 Commissioner Riggs: Can I interrupt?

6

7 Chair Lauing: I'm just trying to clear (interrupted)

8

9 Commissioner Riggs: Can I just interrupt?

10

11 Mr. Lait: So can we just take that under advisement and as we go on to Council if that's where
12 this goes next that we explore that we report back to Council on that issue? There's enough
13 uncertainty here with the folks at the table to know if this is something that is permissible. So
14 we hear your comment and we'll explore that and we'll tee that up for the Council and its
15 deliberations when this gets (interrupted)

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: Of course. This addresses my question. Thank you.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Ok, great. It worked. Go ahead. Yes.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: I just want to call the question. I think we've had a lot of debate.

4

5 SECOND, VOTE

6

7 Chair Lauing: Ok, great. Second on that? Great. All in favor of calling the question? And
8 opposed? One. Ok, so the question is now on the table with the amendments.

9

10 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION PASSED (6-1, Commissioner [REDACTED] opposed)

11

12 Mr. Lait: Oh yeah and I want to be clear what these amendments are.

13

14 Chair Lauing: That's right. That's what I was going to ask for, thank you.

15

16 Mr. Lait: Ok, so the Motion on the table is to move forward the ordinance in Attachment B, the
17 what we now call the Workforce Housing Ordinance Over a Combining District with the
18 following changes: that the parking requirement in the development table be changed from
19 one car per unit or bedroom to 0.8 eight cars per unit or bedroom; it retains at present the
20 retail provision; there was a the Motion also includes some cleaning up of the incidental retail

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 provision; that Council consider local workforce preferential proximity this is the commute shed
2 with regard to the 1 mile the 3 mile the 0.5 from transit, Caltrain, fixed rail to with regard to
3 transit; the removal of Items A through D in Section 1; an amendment to Table 1 and Section
4 1830J070 the TDM plan; adding a comma after the referenced code section and the words and
5 decision making body at the end of that TDM plan section; amend Section 1 to include a new
6 finding that data collection on parking, traffic, and tenant demographics is a key goal of this
7 zoning district.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Plus the deletions.

10

11 Mr. Lait: The deletion of the bike parking at grade. And that's all I have so if I (interrupted)

12

13 Chair Lauing: Did you cover the deletions of the (interrupted)

14

15 Mr. Lait: Yes.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Up front findings?

18

19 Mr. Lait: Yes. Yeah, that was removed Sections A through D in Section 1.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Alright so from the maker first is there anything that's not correct there?

2

3 Vice-Chair Monk: I believe my initial Motion was to exclude the last sentence on the vehicle
4 parking on incidental retail and you're saying to keep it in?

5

6 Mr. Lait: No, I'm just saying what I have listed. If that was your understanding and the maker's
7 under, the seconder's understanding then fine.

8

9 Vice-Chair Monk: Alright so this section has to do with vehicle parking. I don't... my
10 recommendation on Page 28 as per my Motion was to remove that last sentence and then as
11 part of that to clean that up separately which you had already mentioned.

12

13 Mr. Lait: Commissioner Riggs is that your understanding as well? Was to strike the parking
14 requirement for incidental retail or and just have it be 0.8 per unit?

15

16 Commissioner Riggs: Sure.

17

18 Mr. Lait: Ok, so (interrupted)

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: I'm looking at digital documents so like you guys... I really have no clue
2 where you are in the document.

3

4 Chair Lauing: You can look at this document, but if it's not (interrupted)

5

6 Commissioner Riggs: [unintelligible] the same way.

7

8 Chair Lauing: If it's not correct then we want to make sure that you've got what you seconded.

9

10 Commissioner Riggs: It's fine [unintelligible]

11

12 Vice-Chair Monk: When I made the Motion I recommended [unintelligible]

13

14 Chair Lauing: And then other Commissioners that don't think that that's what was in there or
15 whatever? Commissioner Waldfogel.

16

17 Mr. Lait: Yeah so that is, yeah that is the Motion.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Right.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Right.

2

3 Chair Lauing: Right, we're just trying to make sure that everybody agrees that that's what's in
4 the Motion.

5

6 Mr. Lait: [Unintelligible] want to remind you that the question has been called to vote on the
7 Motion. We've just clarified what the Motion is so I don't think there's any room for debate
8 before the vote.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Ok, I wasn't even trying to get debate I just was making sure that everybody
11 agreed it was accurate. You're saying that we don't need that?

12

13 Mr. Lait: The maker and the seconder have agreed that the Motion as I've restated it is
14 accurate.

15

16 Chair Lauing: Ok.

17

18 Commissioner Waldfogel: Based on this final reading I'm going to vote against this because
19 there's something in there that was not what I understood the Motion to be when we took that
20 vote.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: Do with the incidental retail component.

Commissioner Waldfogel: [Unintelligible] has to do with the 0.8 versus 1.0 parking requirement.

Mr. Lait: Right, the right. Oh, ok.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah and so I will vote against this if that's part of the Motion. That was not my understanding of the original Motion.

Commissioner Riggs: And I didn't understand that from the original Motion either if I can just clarify. I that would have felt arbitrary and so I would need to understand that proposal again, but...

Chair Lauing: Well should we go back to 1.0 so we can get on with it here?

Commissioner Alcheck: Point of order. What happens when a maker and a seconder are not understanding the Motion together? Guys, can you tell us please?

Chair Lauing: We can't discuss it now, but before the vote they can do whatever they want.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Mr. Lait: So here's what we'd recommend is that you make you've called the question on a
3 Motion there's some ambiguity as to whether it included this change to the parking
4 requirements in the table. We'd recommend that you remove that from this Motion and then
5 which would be a vote on the ordinance as I've described less not including this point 0.8
6 language. After an action has been made, a vote has been taken let's come back and revisit this
7 0.8 issue and see if that gets added into the Motion as the second tier discussion. Ok?

8

9 Chair Lauing: Ok, excellent. Everybody understand that? Alright then we're ready to vote on
10 the Motion as amended with that item being 1.0. Alright? Then all in favor of the Motion
11 (interrupted)

12

13 Vice-Chair Monk: I just wanted to clarify the reason why I made that statement is because
14 (interrupted)

15

16 Chair Lauing: You can't do that now. You can't do that.

17

18 Mr. Lait: [Unintelligible] that after the vote.

19

20 Chair Lauing: The Motion's been called so.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Alcheck: Doesn't she have to accept this?

Chair Lauing: No, not after I call the question.

Vice-Chair Monk: My Motion has been modified.

Commissioner Alcheck: No, no her Motion has stated how can you just change it?

Vice-Chair Monk: If there's only (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: I'm sorry, I'm sorry. You're saying your Motion.

Vice-Chair Monk: My original Motion did contain a 0.8 and the retail parking permit change. So

Commissioner Alcheck: She has a extra flexibility (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: Thank you, thank you.

Commissioner Alcheck: She's entitled to a vote.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: She's speaking.

Mr. Lait: So it sounds like your seconder was unclear about that and may withdraw his second if (interrupted)

Commissioner Riggs: I'm fine taking a vote on this. It's fine.

Chair Lauing: At 0.8?

Commissioner Riggs: I... honestly I just want to vote on it. If she wants to vote on it I'll vote on this. I think we can make a... if it doesn't carry we can make another Motion, it can include all those components, and we can dialogue the thing if that's what Commissioner **Note-Vice-Chair** Monk wants to do (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: The alternative is we can go ahead with this and then we can do the reverse process of what was just recommended by staff and we can then vote on a 1.0 instead of the 0.8 which was in the original Motion.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Riggs: I think Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Monk really would wanted to vote
2 on the item [unintelligible].

3

4 Chair Lauing: I know. That's what I'm saying. So we can do that and then see if somebody
5 wants to vote on the 1.0.

6

7 Mr. Lait: So yes, so we're voting... apologize for this. So we're going to go back to the Motion
8 that's been agreed upon by the Motion maker and the seconder that this is going to have a 0.8
9 cars per unit per bed or bedroom, whichever is greater period as the parking requirement for a
10 project under this proposed zoning. All the other matters are included in the Motion. The vote
11 is the Motion the call for a vote has been made so we need a vote on that Motion.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Correct.

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: As the maker of the Motion I would prefer to move this forward and go back
16 to (interrupted)

17

18 Commissioner Riggs: We're doing that.

19

20 Chair Lauing: That's what we're doing.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. Lait: That’s what we're doing. We just your vote we're voting on your Motion with the 0.8.

Vice-Chair Monk: There were the members of the Commission that did not acknowledge or recognize and there was some (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: Your seconder did.

Vice-Chair Monk: Ok then I would I will withdraw that aspect of my initial Motion and revert back to the original language in that paragraph in order to move this to a vote.

Mr. Lait: Ok, we were just about to vote on it, but that's if that's if that's agreeable to the seconder.

Commissioner Riggs: That's agreeable to me and let's move it forward.

VOTE

Chair Lauing: Ok. All in favor... we’re at 1.0. So all in favor of the Motion and it's now 1.0 please vote. And opposed? One. Ok, that passes. Now we're well past our 8:30 and we're halfway

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 through Agenda Item Number 2. There are a couple of things procedurally that we want to
2 look at (interrupted)

3

4 MOTION PASSED (6-1, Commissioner Summa opposed)

5

6 Mr. Lait: Yeah and I think the first is to give the dissenter an opportunity to speak because that's
7 typically what we do when we have a dissenting vote.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Yeah, ok. Thank you.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: Thank you very much. In the interest of time I don't think I need to. I
12 think everybody knows what my concerns were about the ordinance. Thank you.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Ok, so is this on a new point? Ok, go ahead.

15

16 Commissioner Gardias: I know that I'm not entitled to because I voted for because I voted to
17 specifically support this project, but I believe that there is much more within this ordinance that
18 we overlooked and the discussion should have been much deeper. Because we only looked at
19 this from a perspective of one project truly we didn't consider so I'd like (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: I'm just saying this because it should be because it should be carried to
4 the Council with the approval vote. Thank you.

5

6 Chair Lauing: So procedurally you want to look at two things right now, one is a short break just
7 to give us a break and then secondly what is staff think about other agenda items and making
8 an adjustment on those now?

9

10 Mr. Lait: Right, so we would like to conclude Item 2 and proceed with Item 3 and push Item 4 to
11 your February or your February 14 meeting. So we would like to have a Motion to continue
12 Item 4 to February 14th.

13

14 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm sorry.

15

16 Chair Lauing: So the next meeting?

17

18 Commissioner Alcheck: Excuse me, I heard you say that you want to conclude Item 2. So are
19 you suggesting that (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Conclude as in continue, continue the discussion after the break on Item 2, have the
2 discussion on Item 3, push Item 4.

3

4 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, sorry. I misunderstood you. I thought you meant continue it to
5 another meeting.

6

7 Chair Lauing: No the idea is to move out the last item to the next meeting.

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: I suggest that if we (interrupted)

10

11 MOTION [Note-not on tape?] AND SECOND

12

13 Chair Lauing: And second? Everybody in favor of that? Ok, passes. Thank you. What? Ok, I'll
14 do the second then.

15

16 MOTION PASSED (7-0)

17

18 Commissioner Alcheck: Alright, who voted for that?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Everybody did. Yeah. Passes. Ok, so I'd like to do a just a 10 minute break just to
2 get a glass of water and recycle here and then we'll come back on the second aspect. And this
3 is the point at which Commissioner Summa will recuse. So stand by, we'll be back in 10.

4

5 **Note – The Commission took a break.**

6

7 Chair Lauing: We didn't get a nap, but we got our rest so that's good. We're still on Item 2 the
8 second section of that which is the site specific project. Did you want to have any other
9 comments to lead this off?

10

11 Mr. Lait: No.

12

13 Ms. Hodgkins: No.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Alright. Otherwise anyone who wants to jump in I now have my little grid up here
16 which might help a little bit more on the lights. So Commissioner Alcheck.

17

18 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, I actually this is not a comment. I'm wondering if we can do a
19 quick round of questions for the applicant. They haven't spoken their second time and they've

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 brought an entire team here so maybe if we consolidated only questions about the project and
2 went one by one and had the applicant sort of respond that could be really beneficial.

3

4 Chair Lauing: [I think it works] great. Everybody ok with that? Ok, [rock] do you want to start?

5

6 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, I would love to sort of better understand the parking tool. I'm
7 going to use that word. If that's possible if we get sort of an overview there was a few people
8 here who suggested that the parking is chaotic. That's not was not my read and so if you guys
9 could sort of clarify that and if anybody else has piggyback questions feel free to jump in.

10

11 Mr. Speiker: Yeah we'll have a... David LoCoco from Watry Design.

12

13 David LoCoco, Watry Design: Thank you. I'm Dave LoCoco with Watry Design. I'm one of the
14 principals. I've been there for 35 years, been in the parking industry. We've seen a major trend
15 in mechanical parking these type of puzzle lifts in residential projects in the Bay Area. They
16 started probably 15 years back so they've come quite a long ways in acceptance and sort of
17 integration, in the issues of technology and sort of the problems that were first plagued with
18 them. Those don't exist today the integration of software and keypads and type situations the
19 interface that the human has with the machine is much more robust today. And all of the
20 projects that we go and survey and discuss and ask how people are using the system they're

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 enjoying the benefits that they get from their car being secured and safely tucked away rather
2 than dinged and dented and scratched. So we're not hearing or seeing any of those issues that
3 we heard from people that aren't familiar with them.

4
5 Again there's lots of vendors in this area. We've probably got five or six very strong vendors in
6 the area that have installations. In fact I think your Council may be trying to get some tours set
7 up to go see these so that they can understand how they work. There was an ordinance
8 recently accepted on some of the criteria and adjustments and again I believe the design that
9 we've got meets all those criteria points.

10
11 Commissioner Alcheck: I just have a quick question. In the last let's choose a small number, five
12 years, how many jurisdictions in the Bay Area do you have were you involved in a project that
13 included some version of what you're doing today?

14
15 Mr. LoCoco: Almost every one.

16
17 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

18
19 Mr. LoCoco: I mean Walnut Creek has been more difficult in how they review their zoning
20 planning. Sunnyvale adopted mechanical into it. San Francisco's adopted mechanical parking

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 into their code. You guys in Palo Alto have now. So we're seeing this 80-90 percent of my
2 projects that I do parking planning under a residential use have mechanical parking as part of
3 the program.

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: One more follow up question. So I notice that there is sort of there's
6 essentially three systems or three at a time can essentially operate?

7

8 Mr. LoCoco: Yes.

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: They're just for the purposes of me understanding it better.

11

12 Mr. LoCoco: Sure.

13

14 Commissioner Alcheck: Is there an attendant? Is it self?

15

16 Mr. LoCoco: It will be trained for the person who rents a space in the project they'll have
17 somebody on staff that would teach them the operational whether it's a key fob like you use
18 your car and open a door you'll come up if that's the type of system they add the amenity to. It
19 could be a key code that they punch in it a little keypad outside the system.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, so it doesn't require like a physical like attendant?

2

3 Mr. LoCoco: No.

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

6

7 Mr. LoCoco: No, again not in a residential environment. If it was a public retail mixed-use
8 center you might look at having an attendant there because you have a different person coming
9 every day to the facility to try to figure out what is this thing, right?

10

11 Commissioner Alcheck: That makes sense.

12

13 Mr. LoCoco: And so until they become so routine to our process we're seeing that residential
14 it's integrated the market very rapidly in the last five years. Again I'm seeing commercial
15 projects look at it in smaller numbers with a valet attendant during certain hours. So it will
16 come. Those days will come. Fully automated is starting to come to California and the U.S. in
17 bigger numbers so we're seeing 15-20 of those projects right now.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, so last question. Do you would you characterize the growth in
2 adoption if you will as an indication that the parking requirements that cities impose are to
3 some extent very financially costly that are now just, it's now justifying this technology?

4
5 Mr. LoCoco: It's a piece of it. So there's multiple reasons why you'd look at a mechanical
6 solution like this. It puts more parking in the volume and again it allows independent access.
7 So instead of building more flat parking that everybody parks in this allows the user to come up
8 and independently access their spot. And so it makes it more efficient and effective in some
9 situations. Again, your site geometry it has to fit and fall into place.

10
11 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, I'll pass it on if anybody else has questions about parking.

12
13 Chair Lauing: I thought Waldfogel had his light on I think. Go ahead.

14
15 Commissioner Gardias: Yeah, so it's still about parking. So I remember just a quick comment,
16 right? We talk about this when I remember Susan Monk joined our Commission, we talked this
17 technology has been in existence for 70 years so I trust that this works. And question that
18 Arthur Keller asked was valid. I never thought about this. Does it work, does this technology
19 work also with electric cars?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: Yes. Yeah, again if you ask me that three to five years ago I would have said
2 they've been very hesitant to adopt and integrate. Today every vendor is adopting and
3 integrating solutions to fit within their mechanical system. So they've fixed all the issues, the
4 problems that were there. They are now all on board. They recognize that California Green
5 Building Standards Code (CALGreen) it requires in California EV parking and if they're going to
6 sell their systems here they need to have a solution. So yeah, very (interrupted)

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: So could you tell me please how this works for the car that's at the top
9 of the stock?

10

11 Mr. LoCoco: Sure. When the person pulls into the pallet the pallet will be at the ground level.
12 So the pallet that's above will lower and the gate will open where they can pull in. When they
13 pull in there will be a charging plug system that has a flexible cord that can pull and plug into
14 the vehicle and that then when the car gets raised goes right up with it. And so whether the car
15 on the ground level slides horizontally that cable has enough room to stretch with the car or go
16 vertically and/or to the pit again depending upon which need to be EV capable.

17

18 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you.

19

20 Mr. LoCoco: Yeah.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Waldfogel.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Well ok, so just a couple questions about this. One very practical, will you fit small Sport Utility Vehicles (SUV) on these lifts?

Mr. LoCoco: Yeah, they fit again your code says sport utility (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah.

Mr. LoCoco: And so yes. Again a city parking code has standard and compact which some cars, trucks are longer than a stall stripe so it sticks into a drive aisle. So these systems fit the midsize sedan, SUV.

Commissioner Waldfogel: Right, well that's I think the most popular vehicle format now.

Mr. LoCoco: Yeah, correct. And these will handle that.

Commissioner Waldfogel: So it's important to fit that. I mean we could get into a lot of a lot more questions about EV charging, but rather not do that right now. I mean I can see you

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 upsizing your electrical service, but anyway that's kind of off topic. Is anyone from Hexagon
2 here because on this quest, on this topic I have some questions about the some of the
3 assumptions in the traffic report. Is that is it relevant to ask that now?

4

5 Chair Lauing: Yeah, I mean it's about parking, but are there any other specific parking
6 questions?

7

8 Mr. LoCoco: Yeah I mean I, I depending upon what it is I might be able to tell you again I know a
9 lot about the local projects. I've been in the Bay Area here and with Watry for 36 years so...

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: What's that? Yeah. Ok. Yeah I mean this is really about their
12 queuing model so I don't know whether this is more of a (interrupted)

13

14 Mr. LoCoco: Yeah they'd probably have to speak to it and again (interrupted)

15

16 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok.

17

18 Mr. LoCoco: The system itself within a minute and a half can lower and open the gate.

19

20 Commissioner Waldfogel: Oh, it's a minute because here it says 33 seconds.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Mr. LoCoco: Well it's 33 seconds to drop and then there's time to open and they put a human interaction time in a queuing model. So (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, so but what's actually the so what is the dwell time? So if you push the button what's the dwell time for your car to get to a?

Mr. LoCoco: Depends on which spot you're in, right?

Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok.

Mr. LoCoco: Effectively (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok what's the best and worst case dwell times?

Mr. LoCoco: I think it's right around that 30 seconds or so, yeah.

Commissioner Waldfogel: That's worst case? So if your car's at the top of the rack it's 33 seconds for it to get down to?

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: That's traditionally what most systems get set to is a 30 second drop.

2

3 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok. Because you said a minute and a half a minute ago so I'm
4 confused.

5

6 Mr. LoCoco: Well, it's the gate opening that's another part of the function, right? So the
7 security gate's closed (interrupted)

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, so I let me be clear. A human arrives, puts his key fob there to
10 summon his car, right? So what is the interval between when he presents his key fob or she
11 presents her key fob and when she is able to climb in the car and drive out?

12

13 Mr. LoCoco: Well if her car is let's say at the ground (interrupted)

14

15 Commissioner Waldfogel: Best case/worst case.

16

17 Mr. LoCoco: Best case/worst case. It, no. It the fastest case (interrupted)

18

19 Commissioner Waldfogel: I'm asking about the system.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: Is that the gate opens within 15 to 20 seconds.

2

3 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok.

4

5 Mr. LoCoco: And that's the fastest then the person walks into their vehicle. So they touch the
6 fob or put their code and the gate, security gate has to open. If their car is at that ground level
7 it's accessible just like you'd walk to it. If a car has to slide horizontally out of the way that's
8 about a 30 second shift and about a 30 second drop so it's about 1:15 for again that security
9 gate kind of process. So I'd say it's about a minute and fifteen for that worst case.

10

11 Commissioner Waldfogel: And then when you drive your car in when are you done? So you
12 drive your car in are you done at that point? You walk away?

13

14 Mr. LoCoco: You can take your keys whatever else you need to do with the car. So again on an
15 average a queue model would put in a different time or a different average.

16

17 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok and the next user, it's ready for the next user immediately? So
18 you walk out of your car you push the button and the next user can drive in then in zero
19 seconds or in some number of seconds?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: Again depending upon where their car is in the process of that system. If it's a
2 ground floor one it'll be 20 seconds, 15 seconds later and if it's an upper one and it has to shift
3 another car it'll be again that minute and 15.

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, yeah none of that's in the report.

6

7 Mr. LoCoco: It's about a minute and a half usually to two minutes to cycle through.

8

9 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok.

10

11 Mr. LoCoco: And again with residents they get used to the process and so you adjust your
12 behaviors and your habits.

13

14 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok. Well I still have a queuing question, but I'll defer to
15 Commissioner **[Note-Vice-Chair]** Monk on the parking question.

16

17 Vice-Chair Monk: Is the time the same for the 23 stalls and the 14 stalls or is it a shorter waiting
18 maximum waiting period?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: It's not. It's the same to slide the car. So it shifts all cars over to get yours down if
2 it's moving multiple cars in the system. So again within the system it's that sort of again we
3 usually speak to a minute and a half to two minute range.

4

5 Vice-Chair Monk: Thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Ok, I had a just a couple of quick parking questions as well. So in terms of the user
8 interface it's just a fob, no problem there. What about actually driving in? Anybody just sort of
9 hesitant the first two times and needs a training course or?

10

11 Mr. LoCoco: Sure, again that's part of that experience of driving into a pallet or pulling into a
12 narrow single car garage. When I first bought my house in San Mateo it felt uncomfortably
13 tight (interrupted)

14

15 Chair Lauing: Right.

16

17 Mr. LoCoco: In a two car garage you have plenty of room. A compact stall when you pull in
18 feels a little tight in some places. This has that feeling at first. Once people get acclimated
19 they're very comfortable with it.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok and then roughly peak times when you're picking it up in the morning and
2 dropping it at night does that go up to three minutes or?

3

4 Mr. LoCoco: Again operationally the management of the building can try to help facilitate
5 improvement if anybody has like multiple issues within one system. If they're all showing up at
6 the exact same moment and they need to get car after car after car I would look at if that's
7 going to happen on a regular basis and we've talked to Todd and his team you move some of
8 the tenants to the other system to balance if they have the exact kind of demand need to leave
9 at 8:00 or 7:50 every day. So usually it spreads out and again when I query projects that have
10 these from I'll say 20 of these to 150 of these the folks that are using them are not saying these
11 are problems.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Ok.

14

15 Mr. LoCoco: So again the user interface after it's in and running, very happy people.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Do you want to go on with your queueing question then, Commissioner
18 Waldfogel?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Sure. This may be more in Hexagon’s realm, but on Page 4 of their
2 report they make an assumption about [plus on] arrival for incoming vehicles; however, those
3 vehicles will have been waiting at traffic lights and synchronized at traffic lights so it's likely that
4 you'll have [plus on] distributed queue lengths, but not [plus on] intervals. So how does that
5 affect the busy hour retrieval time or parking time?

6

7 Mr. LoCoco: Yeah, I mean tradition... I’d have to leave that to Gary to specifically speak to his
8 report, but (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Waldfogel: Is he here?

11

12 Ms. Hodgkins: I think it would be best if we had Hexagon answer that.

13

14 Ricky Williams, Hexagon Transportation: Ricky Williams for Hexagon Transportation. Based on
15 your question on the queueing your I guess the assumption behind yours is that three would be
16 queued up at an intersection and going in the same direction. So that already assumes that
17 they’re all going to be coming from the same direction which we could account for, but the
18 [plus on] distribution the way we used it is the industry standard and we applied it in that
19 (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, I'm just questioning that the [plus on] distribution for inner car
2 arrival times doesn't work if they're getting synchronized at traffic lights. I mean I've done
3 queueing theory for many years and I would really question this as a valid model. So I'd
4 challenge you to actually run that queueing assumption through a synchronization model.

5
6 Mr. Williams: Ok.

7
8 Ms. Hodgkins: I think we can look into that, but I think that that again still assumes that I think
9 what Ricky is mentioning is that that assumes that everybody is coming from the exact same
10 direction if they're being stopped at a light which the model does not assume per industry
11 standard that every single car (interrupted)

12
13 Commissioner Waldfogel: That's actually [plus on] distributed. And that's the point. The point
14 is that there will be busy minutes when they do come from the same direction. I mean that's
15 just part of a [plus on] model. I mean it's like basic queueing theory. I mean I think the key thing
16 is we actually have to measure this. So I mean I'll be talking about this when we talk about
17 TDM. I think we just have to measure this, measure performance on this system, come up with
18 performance criteria, and then we'll be in a good place. If it works, great. If it doesn't we need
19 to know.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Williams: And just from a, sorry, just from a general kind of like back of the hand calculation
2 if you're having three vehicles arrive at the exact same time on the site even if they're all going
3 to the exact same lift based on the data that we've kind of learned about there would be
4 enough time for them to get in their spots while there's that space between another group of
5 cars from the same direction to get there without having any queuing on site. There's plenty of
6 driveway space for queuing to stay within the site and not actually affect anything.

7

8 Commissioner Waldfogel: Right, but what I really care about is somebody you get a bunch of
9 people coming home from work at whatever, 7:00 p.m. and then if it takes them consistently
10 15 minutes to get parked then they will get disappointed in these systems. We just have to
11 measure this stuff.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Ok, yeah Commissioner Riggs.

14

15 Commissioner Riggs: Are we just, yeah I was going to add...

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: Quick follow up question. Is there [unintelligible] is there like a
18 [unintelligible] that talks about... I just want to understand are you accounting for people using
19 the their cars to go to work or are they using public transportation? How does that factor in?
20 Like is that a part of it? If we assume they're all coming home at 7:00 then doesn't that defeat

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the idea that this is within transit? Doesn't that have to be a part of the calc? Does anybody
2 know?

3

4 **[Unidentified Man]**: Who are you asking?

5

6 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm asking anybody.

7

8 **[Unidentified Man]**: I believe ask Hexagon (interrupted)

9

10 Mr. Williams: Yeah our trip generation **[unintelligible]** assumptions for that.

11

12 Commissioner Alcheck: Well I mean I guess my question is: is there, is it possible, is it
13 reasonable to assume that the occupants of the building are going to utilize all their cars and
14 return at 7:00 or does the model suggest that the vast majority them will likely use alternative
15 transportation?

16

17 Mr. Williams: It wouldn't suggest that a majority of them or a huge majority like you're
18 suggesting would use this alternative transportation, but it definitely wouldn't suggest that they
19 would all arrive within the exact same moment even if they were queued up. It doesn't suggest
20 that statistically they would arrive all of the same time.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Riggs: And I would just [unintelligible] we could go down this rabbit hole, but I
I'm going to refuse not, I'm going to refuse to go down this rabbit hole because there's a lot
broken with transportation models in general. But I think the questioning [plus on] distribution
is I mean I think it's an appropriate tool to use, but I think your Commissioner Waldfogel was
right that gathering data is an important step as we embark on these type of endeavors. But I
would suggest too that it's we can't look at intersections in isolation and I think that's I'm
inferring and I'm going to ask you a question. I mean theoretically you're going to be, you
would be looking at the distribution not only of this intersection, but if you look to
[unintelligible] approach you'd actually be looking at a number of different intersections which
would again make the queueing more diffuse.

Mr. Williams: Correct.

Commissioner Riggs: Ok. Just making sure I understood.

Chair Lauing: Any other comments about parking or access to parking at this point? Because
then I'd like to ask a question about guest parking. Because at this point or the last time I heard
there were four spots.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Williams: Yes there are four spots.

2

3 Chair Lauing: So obviously that's an issue because people are going to come, they're going to
4 stay overnight. Is there any way that you can look at this to squeeze in more guest parking?

5

6 Mr. Speiker: I mean originally when we proposed the project there was no guest parking and
7 we had the access to the garage was directly off of El Camino and went directly into the garage.
8 But we have removed that gate and put it at the back of the parcel where we have added the
9 four guest parking. If we were to add more guest parking it would be removing units or it
10 would be removing on long term bike storage which has a domino effect on a lot of other things
11 with the project.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Right, there's also the possibility if you can figure out the security issue of maybe
14 having guest parking downstairs, but is that under consideration?

15

16 Mr. Speiker: If staff is ok with us putting guest parking in the garage or some amount of guest
17 parking in the garage in in the parking lifts then we are open to that, but I understand there's a
18 security issue that residential parking needs to secure.

19

20 Chair Lauing: Claire, did you want to comment?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Ms. Hodgkins: Sorry, I will say that we actually are recommending that some of the lift systems
3 in excess of the number of units, but at least two be included as guest parking and this was
4 outlined in based on recommendations in the traffic impact analysis or traffic assessment. I will
5 note that that's something that we are kind of working through to make sure that it is going to
6 work if we're opening these lift systems. So right now it is included as a condition of approval
7 of the project that two of the lifts be guest parking.

8

9 Mr. Lait: So we're ok with guest parking in the structure, the lift structure.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Ok, great. That answers my question. It's in process not finalized, but...

12

13 Mr. Speiker: And how many spots are you requiring?

14

15 Ms. Hodgkins: Two.

16

17 Mr. Speiker: So two more? So if that we can make, we are ok putting two more guest spots in
18 the parking lifts.

19

20 Chair Lauing: Ok.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

Mr. Speiker: Are you guys interested in hearing how that works or?

Chair Lauing: That would be great, briefly.

Mr. LoCoco: Operationally again a lot of these things if it was 10-15 years ago folks were really uncomfortable, the technology wasn't there. But today with iPhones and technology and people's ability to use those tools we can have codes given out to tenants that can allow access. So they could give that tenant guest a special code that will be and they could tell them what stacker unit and what location it is so they know exactly where to drive and where to queue up, where to be. And so they type it in or that tenant would be told the first time your guest coming if they haven't parked in a mechanical parking system you should go down there and help them, guide him in, make it comfortable and then the next time they come they'll be very, very comfortable. But again, one or two times with these systems and it's just like driving in your garage.

Chair Lauing: Yeah, ok. Great.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Speiker: I mean I'd like to understand more about because with the unbundled parking I
2 want to make sure that we're it's going to work with having two guest spots in the parking lifts.

3 So...

4

5 Mr. LoCoco: [Unintelligible – off mike].

6

7 Mr. Speiker: I don't know, can we?

8

9 Chair Lauing: Ok, you guys work it out.

10

11 Mr. Speiker: Ok, if we can do it we'll do it.

12

13 Chair Lauing: Yeah. Staff's ok with it.

14

15 Mr. LoCoco: I don't think anybody wants the space built and unused.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Yeah.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. LoCoco: So that's the purpose and Todd's concerned that if you've got a tenant that wants
2 it we'd like to give it to them, but [unintelligible] held for a guest spot and never used then he's
3 losing that opportunity.

4
5 Chair Lauing: Right. Ok and I just wanted to raise one more access question which I think we all
6 understand, but what you've now done is you move the Ubers and the Lyfts around the corner
7 and move the bus stop closer to the, I'm sorry, around the corner yeah and move the bus stop
8 closer to the corner, right? So you have a place where people can go out on the curb in a
9 loading zone and pick up their Uber or (interrupted)

10
11 Mr. Speiker: Yeah so the kind of [unintelligible] that's called north of the drive aisle there will be
12 loading and unloading zone.

13
14 Chair Lauing: Right.

15
16 Mr. Speiker: And the new bus stop is now in between the drive aisle and Page Mill.

17
18 Chair Lauing: Right. And the bus stop is improved is what it says in the report?

19
20 Mr. Speiker: Yes. It will be a brand new state of the art bus stop.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Lauing: Yeah. It wouldn't be hard to improve what's there, right? Other questions that are related? Yeah, Commissioner All, I mean sorry, Gardias.

Commissioner Gardias: So I don't have a question, but I'd like to just share some thought with you. It cannot be implemented because this project has been on the board for two years and this will be probably taking you by surprise, but I'm going to say this only because we are start, we are starting we are coming across the problems that are related to more dense areas. And I think that your lot is truly unique and should have had a different approach and hopefully this Commission one day will just take up on a task to start addressing some true removal of the parking structures what we discussed here a couple of months ago from the apartments. So right behind the fence you have a Sunrise Property. Sunrise Property parking is just 5 meters away, 15 feet away from the fence. If you go down there and I've been there you can easily access your property. That is all just a drop off area in addition to the drop off area right above it. You could have resolved this lot much better and you could have had more units. At least 5 or maybe 10 units more if you had an agreement with Sunrise Properties to access your parking from the from that street that sunrise is facing. You would not have to have all this problems with a ramp going down. You could've free up the space for additional housing units. You could have also had some amenity which we talk about. I'm only making this just to a pretty

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 much open your minds because maybe thinking this way could resolve many problems in some
2 other zones that we're going to encounter in the future.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Maybe that's a future thing they can do. Any other questions or anything? I think
5 Commissioner Waldfogel I think you have some TDM questions? Oh, I'm sorry. Go ahead.

6

7 Vice-Chair Monk: So again we have 68 parking stalls for 57 units. Units whose occupants are
8 designed to accommodate nearby workers, folks that are transit dependent, there's specific
9 local preference for these units and that we discussed earlier tonight some of the incentives for
10 occupants that don't own cars. So if this pilot does what it's supposed to do and it results in
11 car-lite housing a measure of success would be by observing lower occupancy rates in the
12 parking garage. Is that something you agree to? And I'm asking that of my fellow
13 Commissioners and to the applicant.

14

15 Mr. Speiker: Well yeah if we have 57 people that don't own cars then there's going to be an
16 empty garage.

17

18 Commissioner Waldfogel: I think success is a little more subtle than that. I think that two things
19 need to be true. One is that the garage is not 100 percent utilized, but secondly we have to
20 verify that the tenants, their guests, etcetera are not resorting to street parking. So if we can

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 verify those two things then I think we can call this a success. I'd actually like there to be a way
2 for you to collect a windfall if you're successful that you can potentially rent those spaces to
3 other people subject to some conditions, but I'd like you to be able to collect a windfall if you
4 can show both of those conditions to be true.

5

6 Vice-Chair Monk: And I appreciate Commissioner Waldfoegel's comments that we might want to
7 explore a little bit further with staff. And before we do that I guess what I wanted to go to was
8 confirming that what I was stating was not 100 percent success, but a measure of success
9 would be that we would find decreased occupancy in the garage. And so my concern in asking
10 this question is how do we know that this unbundling in this program is actually going to
11 ultimately result in lower rental costs to the occupants? Because whether or not the garage is
12 full or not there would have to be an adjustment to level out your cost basis. And so I'm just
13 trying to really understand how the unbundling is (interrupted)

14

15 Mr. Speiker: We have two separate agreements. You get an agreement for the apartment and
16 you have an agreement for the parking space.

17

18 Vice-Chair Monk: Well if let's say it turns out hypothetically that you're not getting expected
19 revenue from the unbundling and what you're planning on charging for these parking spaces

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 how do we know as a Commission that the following year you're not going to start raising rents
2 or whatnot so that they are ending up paying for parking that they're not using.

3

4 Mr. Speiker: So 79 percent of the project is a market rate project. So we are going to be kind of
5 resetting rents to market which you guys have discussed based on the economic study. So
6 every year we're going to look at the rents and we're going to see who's below market, who can
7 be raised up, and who's still at market and, but the parking doesn't apply to that. The parking
8 will be kind of separate to that. If we are at full capacity we'll raise the rents on the parking. If
9 we're... and the same thing goes for the units. So I mean it's going to be market driven. Does
10 that answer the question?

11

12 Commissioner Riggs: Maybe I could interject? I feel like it's not our role to question the
13 developer on their read on the market. More is to kind of state what the what our expectation
14 is in terms of enforcing local policy. So I just I think this is where you're basically making a
15 market prediction and he's taking the market risk. It's a little bit of an awkward question to put
16 before him.

17

18 Mr. Speiker: I mean I want to answer your question.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: There's a conundrum inherent in the project in that it's designed to
2 accommodate or alleviate car dependency yet we're building parking and ignoring that aspect
3 of it. So it's just hard for me to get my mind around why we have so many parking stalls when
4 we're having a parking lite project. So I guess my real question is: is there any cost savings that
5 can be done by minimizing or limiting any aspect of the parking in order to pass that along to
6 the future tenants? And perhaps offer one additional deed restricted unit in the event we were
7 able to have some cost savings in regards to the number of parking spots.

8
9 Mr. Speiker: I appreciate your question. My only concern about going down that path is other
10 people may have differing opinions. So I just don't want to get in a situation where I'm agreeing
11 to something that somebody else is not going to agree to. This process has been going on for
12 almost two years now and when we originally kind of designed this project it was 45 parking
13 stalls and 60 units, half one bedrooms and half studios. And in going through three study
14 sessions with City Council, PTC, and ARB we are now in a position where we have 68 parking
15 stalls and 57 units. So I'd like to just have the project looked at with what's there now versus
16 try to like change an aspect of it that's a significant change that I'm just not sure will lead to a
17 success by vote. If that makes sense.

18
19 Mr. Lait: Chair, if I may?
20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Ok, alright yeah. Commissioner Riggs.

2

3 Commissioner Riggs: Well first off I would calm your fear I mean Commissioner Monk this is an
4 ambitious project for our market just for your information (FYI). I think that this is a risk
5 because we don't know the parking demand is going to be at low and car-lite is ambitious for
6 Palo Alto. But I second I would I think I will question the posit of using parking occupancy as an
7 indicator for the success of a car-lite development. I think what people will find that the
8 location efficiency will allow them to shed a vehicle post occupancy which or they will use their
9 vehicle less. And to be honest we care about reducing trips to a certain degree. We may not
10 want to concern ourselves as much with a project like this about trying to induce which we
11 don't we can't be trying to induce lack of ownership. So I just think that like at the end of the
12 day being ok with storing cars below grade may be an aspirational goal as long as the trips are
13 made via multi-modal means. And so in my mind those are the factors to get [unintelligible]
14 and those are actually built into the TDM plan in terms of a monitoring program. So I just...

15

16 Vice-Chair Monk: I'm satisfied with the applicant's response and also I appreciate your further
17 commentary on the fact that just because there's cars might be in there it might not be that
18 they're driving them per se. I feel that it smells like there's smoke in this room. Is anyone else
19 smelling anything odd? And does anyone want to look into that? Maybe check out the back
20 room?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

[Unintelligible. People talking off microphone. Someone mentioned barbecue]

Chair Lauing: I hope they have leftovers. Ok, there (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Monk: It's quite smoky in here.

Chair Lauing: Commissioner Alcheck.

Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, don't leave. I'm going to speak. You know what I'm going to just I think there's a framing issue here that I want to acknowledge. I was a bit surprised with just how meekly staff has suggested that the parking ratio proposed is sufficient. And what do I mean by that? It's I feel like I'm missing something here. The it's results like these that the staff report highlighted in our other multi-family housing that you looked into so last time we met we said what are they doing in other cities, how are we I think maybe Commissioner Waldfoegel wanted to know well how did the last project on Alma do. And the results of the analysis suggest that our requirements were high and that the lots are being underutilized. And the reason why I mention that is because there is a trend that is allowing cities like San Jose, San Francisco, and Oakland to reduce their parking requirements to zero. And I understand you're interested in two more guest parking spots, but the analysis is that the requirements that we

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 had on the other multi-family project that we have passed in the last decade was more than
2 sufficient and the study that somebody brought suggested that... Oh gosh, you got a study in
3 Appendix G which suggested that the 1:1 ratio that the applicant is suggesting even higher rate
4 than the 1:1 which seems to be like in many jurisdictions sufficient.

5

6 So I think this is a framing issue and I would encourage staff when they reread the second and
7 third paragraph on Packet Page 19 to reconsider articulating before Council more
8 enthusiastically how sufficient this parking requirement is. Don't be afraid to do that. We need
9 staff's leadership here to feel more comfortable with the trend. And without it we're having a
10 discussion about whether it's enough, but all of this again it's a little meek. All the wording in
11 those two paragraphs suggest like wait we should even be talking about parking, we're past it.
12 This is more than sufficient, move on, maybe even lower it which we almost voted to do in the
13 previous section of this discussion, but that didn't succeed, right?

14

15 So I want to touch on a couple other things. Tonight we heard from a number of individuals
16 who felt that the bargain, I'm putting that in quotation marks, was not satisfactory. You heard
17 some of the rhetoric that we hear when we talk about PC zoning that there needs to be more of
18 a public benefit in some of the e-mails we received. I want to respond to that. I believe that
19 this is a very flawed lens through which to view this project and projects like it. I think while
20 some believe that developers are lining up to overwhelm our City with housing developments

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 that view is dramatically at odds with the experience I have had on this Commission since 2012.
2 I think the perception that we must always play hardball with for profit developers of multi-
3 family housing is an imprudent approach.

4
5 I also believe that the argument that we heard tonight that had this project been 100 percent
6 affordable it would be acceptable is a red herring. A few individuals made that point and I'm
7 not persuaded. My skepticism is in large part based on the unhealthy track record of Palo Alto
8 in approving and realizing multi-family affordable housing developments. So had we had a lot
9 more I'd say ok, but the last 100 percent affordable complex was Maybell and that exploded in
10 an awful disaster. And so I don't feel comfortable with the argument and I don't think you guys
11 should either that somehow more affordability would be acceptable. I think that there's a
12 hurdle here.

13
14 If I could change one thing about this project I would double its size; twice as tall, twice as
15 dense. And needless to say that's not in the cards. I know you've got your 68 parking spots and
16 you've got a four-story building. I'm not really suggesting you go back to the drawing board,
17 but I mention that anyways because the notion that simply because this project approaches our
18 maximums should not suggest to anyone that it ought to be scalped in some form or another to
19 become more palatable. Our maximums are artificially low. They're so low in fact that they
20 resemble exclusionary housing policy and I suspect that in the near future one can hope we will

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 reflect on these Palo Alto limits as incredibly harmful to the overtly embraced but rarely
2 realized objectives of encouraging multi-family housing.

3

4 I just want to add one thing. And at my brief conversation during our break with Ms. Rizzo from
5 TransForm she suggested that in other jurisdictions they used the term affordable by design. A
6 few of us seem to have a real problem with the concept of workforce housing. Maybe that
7 seems I don't know, problematic. I don't know, I don't share the view, but I appreciate that
8 there is that view. Other jurisdictions have adopted the term affordable by design. We know
9 what affordable housing looks like, we talk about low income, we talk about moderate income
10 housing. When someone describes something as affordable by design what they're suggesting
11 is this idea that we are going to make flexible our restrictions in an effort to encourage
12 someone to build something more dense that will house, that will provide a housing option that
13 is unlike any other housing option in our City. So if you are the kind of person that thinks that
14 this is too small for you it is and 99 percent of the housing options in our City cater to you. This
15 is a whole new option.

16

17 And I my if there was one takeaway that I would give to Council it would be that this is an
18 awesome experiment to participate in. I think it's going to be a wild success. And I hope that
19 the City approaches this development which I could have, it could have been twice as big for my
20 from my perspective. I hope they approach it from that perspective that if we don't start trying

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 different things then we're not going to get different results. And so the more we cut down this
2 thing with all the things that we're a little uncomfortable with the less likely we're going to see
3 affordable housing. This isn't an office building. This is the tool that we keep saying we need.
4 So I am prepared and I'm not going to make a Motion, but I am prepared to support the Motion
5 that makes that acknowledges that the findings have been met to recommend that Council
6 approve this project tonight.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Other comments that go beyond the questions? Commissioner Riggs? I'm not
9 seeing if... I was looking that way listening so I don't know whose light was on first. Ok, so I
10 don't know who was first. I'm sorry. Go ahead Commissioner Waldfogel.

11

12 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, look I'll try to be brief here. Look, I'm prepared to support this
13 project subject to a couple of things. I mean I don't really want have a debate here about
14 whether it's too big, too small, too many parking spaces, too few parking spaces. You have
15 toiled so let's say that that's behind us. My ask on this is just that we measure the results. That
16 we do it, we measure the results. If the results are what we expect we celebrate, we go do
17 more of it. If the response or if the results are different from what we expect then we have the
18 City has the tools under the TDM to go in and ask you to do to make some adjustments. And if
19 we can do that and I have opinions about that that probably wouldn't be shared by all of my
20 colleagues, but if we can do that if we can measure what it's doing, communicate that to the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 public, and take action as appropriate then I'm comfortable. And that's why I made the
2 amendment to the zoning ordinance about the TDM because I want the TDM to reflect that
3 idea that we're going to measure stuff and if it's working we I actually want you guys have a
4 way to capture windfalls. If it's not working I want you guys to work with us to fix it. If you if
5 we can do that then I'm satisfied.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Commissioner Gardias.

8

9 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. Before I get to the question I'd like to just briefly thanks to
10 my colleague Commissioner Alcheck for being considerable and restraining himself from
11 proposing a Motion. It used to be a practice at this body that Motion was proposed after a
12 discussion was held and I found that for the number of years I was on this Commission as a
13 good practice.

14

15 And so with this I'd like to just go back to the subject and is there anybody from Sunrise
16 properties here? There is no one. I believe that you discussed this project wish Sunrise. We
17 talk about this over the phone. What were the comments? What were their comments
18 (interrupted)

19

20 Chair Lauing: What's the relevance to this project? I mean if it's legal and you know.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Gardias: There is a relevance because this is adjacent property and building this project is going to affect Sunrise.

Chair Lauing: I don't think it is. I mean I don't see how that impacts his ability to build (interrupted)

Commissioner Gardias: If you heard me you would maybe have an answer which you can disagree with (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: Give it another 30 seconds so we can understand it, but...

Vice-Chair Monk: I think staff should weigh in on whether or not this falls within our purview to ask about adjacent properties. Can you please advise on that?

Mr. Lait: Well so I mean I don't know where the questions are going, but (interrupted)

Commissioner Gardias: Yeah I just, I'm sorry I just (interrupted)

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: I will say this, the project laid out before you is before you is the one that's before you.
2 It doesn't involve any interaction with adjacent properties. If you're concerned about impacts
3 in terms of that will be perceived by occupants of that building after construction or
4 construction related impacts we've addressed that in environmental or the MND. If it's a
5 design consideration I don't that's not on the table. And I will note that Sunrise is a PC and
6 owners of that site would have to go through a PC ordinance amendment and probably
7 wouldn't be interested in entertaining something like that for an adjacent development. So if
8 it's if the end goal here is to have some kind of integration between Sunrise and this
9 development that's not what's before you. And I would say that's not pertinent to the
10 discussion.

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: Right, but with the whole respect to the three of you, you didn't allow
13 me just to say anything and then you came up with the comment so I find it inappropriate.
14 Allow me just to say what I want to say. So the reason that I'm just raising the relationship
15 between Sunrise because there is always an impact of your building onto this adjacent
16 property, so my question to you is like this: could you just tell us what were the comments from
17 **the** Sunrise and how you considered them in this project?

18

19 Mr. Speiker: So we've met with the ED of Sunrise for that specific project and we've spoken
20 with the property owner as well. Their comments were more about kind of logistically in the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 construction. We even talked about potentially giving the members of Sunrise a kind of a field
2 trip tour during the construction of the project. They kind of felt like it was a broken record
3 because this project there was two other proposals on this site prior so they were kind of like
4 well we've been waiting for people to come back to us. One concern or one thing they were
5 excited about is the safety right now of that parking lot. There's they comment that sometimes
6 there's some bad things that go on there. So they're excited to see that that's no longer going
7 to happen.

8

9 Commissioner Gardias: So allow me just to share the thoughts, right? And I'm just doing this for
10 this Commission because we just approved the ordinance in which there is there are some
11 planning decisions that will have impact on the adjacent property. There are site setbacks,
12 there is a daylight plane, and some other considerations that were subject of the discussion
13 that of the ordinance that we just approved. There was no discussion so I'm just raising them
14 right now. So a couple of items that I see here that number one is that when Sunrise was
15 designed as a PC that part of the building along El Camino is recessed and then your part of
16 your building enters that area creates that patio with its L shape where you have the driveway
17 to the underground garage. That part of the building that overlaps Sunrise property is going to
18 create a will create the view for their rooms that are where elderly people live. They will be
19 looking at the empty wall which is the side wall of your building. And I'm just raising this so it's
20 going to be on the record. I don't know if it has been discussed (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: I don't, I still don't see relevance here to the project.

Mr. Lait: Yeah, [unintelligible] the site and design application that you have I mean it's a conceptual kind of review. I mean these are questions that ARB is going to be talking about design and window placement and you know. I think you got two discreet actions here. Are you going to apply the ordinance that was recently recommended to Council due to the property and it can make the site and design findings? And that's really what's before us right now. There are some details that need to be worked out for sure and it's going to go to ARB and on to Council and there's a few things we still need to do before we get there.

Commissioner Gardias: Sure, yes. And for the record so thank you very much for your comments.

Mr. Lait: And Chair just, I'm sorry, just Chair so it's 10:15 and we still have another (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: Right, that's what I was just going to say.

Mr. Lait: Beefy item.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: That's exactly what I was just going to say.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: So let me finish, I'll be brief. So the second item is pretty much the
4 daylight plane because those buildings will be very close to each other. Then pretty much your
5 structure is going to take that daylight from the rooms that are at the bottom lower floors of
6 the other structure.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Ok, you're on the record with that.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Ok, thank you.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Any other items that? I'm sorry, I'm sorry. Go ahead. Yes, Commissioner
13 (interrupted)

14

15 Commissioner Riggs: It's ok, we're I'm flying too so. Two things and this is please Todd I don't
16 you can sit down if you if you want to. I don't need to ask you another question. So you've
17 been standing there for a while.

18

19 I'm definitely, I'm prepared to support this project, but one of the in terms of kind of the next
20 steps I did kind of feel like Commissioner Alcheck that this is a was is in an iconic intersection in

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 our City. I consider it a gateway site. And in that respect I feel like it could have handled more
2 density and I'll just put that out there. In that aspect I think that there is an opportunity for ARC
3 [Note-ARB?] I'll make this as a because some of the massing and we deal with mass and in bulk
4 some of the massing and giving the building more of a presence potentially can be dealt with in
5 design and I feel like particularly at the corner of El Camino and Page Mill there's an
6 opportunity to have a little more of a signature presence and a gateway to really it's a gateway
7 to California Avenue is the way I look at it from a from an architectural standpoint. And that's
8 where I would just actually provide that feedback and recommendation to ARB to say look at
9 this to think about gesturally within the mass that is allowable based on what we're dialoguing
10 and maybe that should be there should be more mass that we should be dialoguing, but that
11 train has left the building. But maybe there's some architectural gestures that they could put
12 forward that actually could create a little more presence on that corner.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Alright. Are we at the point of making a Motion? Commissioner Gardias did you
15 have a?

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, I can make a Motion, but before I do so I'd like to just add one
18 more point. I find and I'm supportive of this project and I can make a Motion unless somebody
19 will jump in to pretty much to advance this project to the City Council, but hoping for thorough
20 ARB review. I find the ground floor units substandard and (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: But that's ARB. That's ARB so we're really out of order here and it's 10:20. And I think you're on the record with that so we should really get cranking here.

Commissioner Gardias: But can I finish the sentence?

Chair Lauing: I don't know. Can you finish it quickly because you're off the record? I mean sorry, you're off the agenda.

Commissioner Gardias: So I find those units substandard. People will have blinds closed all day and we should not have units like this at the corner of a busy street like this.

Chair Lauing: Ok.

Commissioner Gardias: Thank you.

Chair Lauing: So is there would someone like to... Commissioner Waldfogel? Commissioner Waldfogel go ahead.

MOTION #2

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Gardias: Ok, so with this right as I said I'd like to propose a Motion. So the Motion would be to approve the site and design application based on the findings and subject to conditions of approval as presented by the staff.

SECOND

Commissioner Alcheck: I'll second that Motion.

Chair Lauing: And by definition that has to be contingent on zoning approval. It's a formality, but...

Mr. Lait: Yeah and when it's an action that you're taking so if I'm understanding the action your moving adoption of the ordinance that would apply the overlay zone to this property and you're moving the site design application.

Commissioner Gardias: Correct.

Mr. Lait: With the findings and conditions in the staff report.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: So pretty much I'm moving number two and number three.

2

3 Mr. Lait: Yes.

4

5 Commissioner Gardias: Ok. As proposed by the Staff.

6

7 Chair Lauing: And you second?

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: I seconded.

10

11 Chair Lauing: I'm sorry. [crosstalk-Multiple people talking about a speaker] Ok, sorry. Go
12 ahead, Commissioner.

13

14 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 TO MOTION #2

15

16 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, I have three amendments I'd like to propose to this Motion.

17 The first one I already alluded to which is I'd like the TDM to collect as much data as possible
18 about performance on the project. I mean we could spend a lot of time wordsmithing that, but
19 maybe you know directionally.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 TO MOTION #2 ACCEPTED

2

3 Commissioner Alcheck: I'm comfortable accepting the ethos of this idea.

4

5 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2 TO MOTION #2

6

7 Commissioner Waldfogel: Ok, so that one is easy. Then there's two others I'd like to propose
8 they may be a little tougher they're both on development standards during construction. The
9 first one is this is a tricky corner. I'd like to see the streets and sidewalks remain open during
10 construction to the extent that's practicable.

11

12 Commissioner Alcheck: I... I am willing to I look, I'll accept whatever to get this passed, but what
13 I would suggest is that we encourage the Council to encourage the Building Department to do
14 their best to enforce some sort of access route or something. I mean I just... They likely are
15 going to have to dig underground. I don't know and I just I'd hate to be too specific. That's all
16 I'm saying.

17

18 Commissioner Waldfogel: That's why my suggesting was as far as its practical.

19

20 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, I'm fine with...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Waldfogel: Because we just it's an important intersection, we want people to be able to be able to circulate. As things are now we have construction on three sides. The circulation along El Camino along Page Mill is really bad so let's do our best to keep it open. That's my ask.

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #2 TO MOTION #2 ACCEPTED

Commissioner Alcheck: I accept that.

Commissioner Gardias: So it's acceptable for me. I don't think that we need to have it in a Motion. Across Page Mill there is 451 if I remember number correctly under construction. There is no problem with the traffic. It flows (interrupted)

Commissioner Waldfogel: Well actually there is. I was there this morning and there is (interrupted)

Chair Lauing: We already (interrupted)

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #3 TO MOTION #2

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Waldfogel: I'm sorry and I have a third development standard condition I'd like to add which is the... oh, where is it in the packet where you, staff has done some analysis on noise standards during construction. I think it's in this book. It's getting late. I admire that we're finally taking some baby steps to improve our development noise standards. There's actually a really good standard that I'd like us to reference which is Occupational Safety and Health Administration's (OSHA) 1910.95(a) occupational exposure standard which sets limits for unprotected noise exposure. I'd like us to at least look at adopting the 1910.95(a) OSHA standard as the lot line standard for noise production from construction on the project.

FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #3 TO MOTION #2 REJECTED

Commissioner Gardias: So with the whole respect, but I'm not going to accept it just because of the I have no understanding about a specific OSHA. So had we had time I probably would be open.

Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah, it doesn't make a difference whether I accept it because he hasn't although this is another area where I feel like specifics probably I don't know. I don't have a choice here because he didn't accept it.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Waldfogel: Yeah, and what I can say to this is that our City noise ordinance
2 allows 10 hours a day of noise production at a level that OSHA only allows 10 minutes a day of
3 exposure to. So there's a little bit of a gap.

4

5 Commissioner Alcheck: Is that, hold on, just to be clear. Are you talking about unprotected
6 exposure?

7

8 Commissioner Waldfogel: Unprotected exposure.

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: So are you is your concern for the individuals working the job or for?

11

12 Commissioner Waldfogel: No, the individuals working the job will be subject to OSHA
13 regulations. The it's the individuals who live next door who are not subject to OSHA regulations
14 who are exposed to noise. So I want to protect them from noise in excessive of OSHA's
15 unprotected noise exposure standard.

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: Is would you be willing to make a Motion after this Motion to I mean
18 see if that carries? I guess my point is I don't feel in any way capable of articulating to the
19 Building Department whether their standards are sufficient enough. That just seems like
20 expertise I don't have.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Is there a way we can handle that on just a referral basis?

Mr. Lait: Yeah, we're happy to look into it further if you know between now and going to the Council. And we can adjustments.

Chair Lauing: Ok, thank you.

Commissioner Waldfogel: That's sufficient, but I just want you to look at the (interrupted)

Mr. Lait: Yeah.

Commissioner Waldfogel: I want you to look at that and put some teeth into your noise exposure standards. Thank you.

Chair Lauing: Ok if there's no more comments I just I want to make a couple comments. This is aptly it says 79 percent market rate housing. So again I'm concerned about just making sure the public understands that. And there is a component to get some more affordable housing, but this is going to be for generally higher price people. I think some of the comments tonight were very well from the public there are a lot of people which is great. And what you heard is

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 an urge that we all have. We found out during the Comprehensive Plan discussions and we
2 found out during Council discussions this community is committed to having diversity in in their
3 demographic groups and everything. And that's what isn't here that some of those public,
4 people speaking with the public said we need that which we do. And basically it's a higher
5 priority than just market rate housing. So we still have to get to that. That's not exactly what
6 this project is, but we still can evaluate this project on its own.

7

8 I agree with what Commissioner Waldfogel said earlier is that relative to the land use of this we
9 are testing what we just discussed, I won't go through it again and we really need real data to
10 infuse the current debate/speculation on car ownership and all these other factors. So this
11 provides us that opportunity and to that extent we are getting that benefit out of the property.
12 Stating the obvious this is a pilot that's going to put up a building for 50 years so it's not like a
13 software pilot where you don't like it you say I don't like the results we're going to unplug it and
14 go home no footprint. Again that's some of the concern of the public which I think we should
15 take very seriously.

16

17 This building isn't going to go away and this the fact that this is PF I honestly think we really this
18 should cause us some angst because we're giving up you know a PF zoning piece of property.
19 So thousands of new residents with thousands of new housing units they're going to need City
20 services built on public land and this is a piece that we're going to be parting with. So I think it's

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 we're sacrificing it for a different purpose. There's always tradeoffs, but that's real in the
2 community.

3
4 Just a quick comment on parking. Glad to see the guest lots situation is filled up. We have a
5 problem as a City because I think that given that the RPP next door is open from open for
6 business to park from 6:00 at night to 8:00 in the morning is a wide open loophole that we
7 might need to help this project be successful by looking at some adjustments in that because
8 it's an obvious place for guests or anybody else to come in and park for a good long time.

9
10 I think this is a actually a really good project for market rate housing. I think that the applicants
11 have listened very well to the complaints from all three of the boards that they were in front of.
12 I always like to ask you know what would make it better and not entirely humorously it be
13 better if it was built in a different place meaning that it would be nice if we didn't have to take
14 away that PF. The a bigger contribution to real affordable housing fees would be great. That's
15 clearly still our biggest objective in this City is providing diversity. And I think that we've talked
16 about this parenthetically, but there has to be some penalties if TDM goals are missed which no
17 one is expecting. So and all that said with the angst over the PF which is reluctant. I would
18 support this housing unit. I think it as I said I think it's a good project. I said that last time in
19 spite of the constraints and the combination of the zoning shifts and your as the applicants
20 adjustments I think it's a good project for the City. The map amendment is included in this?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

Commissioner Alcheck: Chair, do you mind if I speak to the Motion for a minute?

Chair Lauing: Sure. We were going to have a new speaker though first. Go ahead,
Commissioner **[Note-Vice-Chair]** Monk.

Vice-Chair Monk: This might be more of a question for staff rather than a potential amendment, but in regards to Attachment K which goes over the consistency with the El Camino, South El Camino Real Design Guidelines specifically on Packet Page 110. For example, looking at Section 3.3.3, Property Edges, staff is recommending increased greenery on multiple sides to further reduce massing has been baked into the new project? What has been done in regards to this attachment and the actual project that we're voting on today?

Ms. Hodgkins: Yeah so this is something that we're we wanted to make available to you guys, but we're kind of teeing up for the ARB discussion, but this does reflect the current proposal. Urban Forestry has mentioned that they'd like to try and corporate additional greenery specifically to reduce building massing as Mr. Gardias mentioned so that's (interrupted)

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: So the answer then is that the suggestions that staff put in response to the
2 design guidelines are going to be pushed forward to the ARB so it's not something that we need
3 to specifically address tonight.

4

5 Mr. Lait: Right.

6

7 Ms. Hodgkins: Correct.

8

9 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok and the reason why I was asking was also in regards to the fact that if the
10 very first one on Page 106 is talking about having street level facades that should have
11 numerous pedestrian amenities. Obviously we're having a departure from that guideline here
12 and again to iterate my interest in having some sort of minimal retail that is not subject to a
13 parking requirements such as a coffee kiosk or bike rental, something nominal that reflects the
14 community and could build greater pedestrian usage in that corner I think would be something
15 that we'd expect to see on El Camino and currently as drafted in this project plan that's absent.
16 So I don't know if I can make an amendment or not or just make that as part of the record to
17 advance to Council.

18

19 Mr. Lait: What are you looking to? Are you looking to require (interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: That we would encourage Council to explore some form of nominal non
2 traffic inducing type of retail on that corner. Pedestrian friendly retail I suppose.

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: If I can just (interrupted)

5

6 Chair Lauing: Let staff answer it.

7

8 Mr. Lait: I think that, I think you got an application that's before you. It's not proposing retail.

9 There was a whole conversation about that. I think some of the comments we hear I mean I
10 know there's mixed perspectives on it at Council and it may come up at Council, but again that's
11 not what they're proposing.

12

13 Chair Lauing: In other words the applicant is not requesting it.

14

15 Mr. Lait: They're not requesting it.

16

17 Chair Lauing: Right.

18

19 Mr. Lait: And you know.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Vice-Chair Monk: [They're] not requesting it because they were told that they I can't.

2

3 Mr. Lait: I think there's been... No, that's not true. They, that's not true.

4

5 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok.

6

7 Mr. Lait: In fact the way that the definition of that we wrote it is that it would be permissive of

8 incidental retail. So incidental retailer is allowed if they wanted to do something in here they

9 could.

10

11 Vice-Chair Monk: Could they still at this point when they go before Council?

12

13 Mr. Lait: Sure if they... yeah.

14

15 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok.

16

17 Mr. Lait: I mean I think that yeah, I mean we'd have to see how the parking plays out, but.

18

19 Chair Lauing: Ok, the next speaker was Commissioner Alcheck.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: Yeah I just want to speak to the Motion real quick. I'm really excited to
2 take this vote. I'm happy to see this conversation go in this direction and I'm encouraged by a
3 lot of the comments that my fellow Commissioners have made. I just make one quick point sort
4 of a counterpoint to what Chair Lauing said. When we talk about affordable by design which is
5 I'm going to use this term a lot now a 300 or 400 or 500 square foot unit is going to rent for less
6 than a 700, 800, and 900 square foot unit, 1,200 square foot unit, etcetera. And so although
7 this is market rate there is nothing like this in the City. And so by design it will be more
8 affordable and hopefully create a housing option for individuals who can afford the unit size
9 that's being offered, but can't afford to get into a single family home or some of the more
10 expensive rental units that one and two and three bedroom that are sort of more common in
11 the few multi-family complexes we have. So I'm very encouraged and I want to just sort of put
12 a little optimism and happiness into this process.

13

14 Chair Lauing: Ok. Ok are we ready for the question? So all the vote and do we want to repeat
15 that or do we know what we're voting on this approval with those I think it was just one
16 amendment [net net]?

17

18 Mr. Lait: Yeah, there's two amendments. So there's a so you're moving the staff report which
19 has application of the recommendation to the City Council to apply the overlay district to the
20 subject property and recommendation for approval of the site and design application based on

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 the findings and the conditions included the staff report along with two other changes. One,
2 that the TDM be modified to reflect the desire for a collection of as much data as possible as it
3 relates to the project and two, to the extent feasible that the street sidewalks be kept open
4 during construction.

5

6 Chair Lauing: Ok.

7

8 Mr. Lait: So that's what we have.

9

10 VOTE

11

12 Chair Lauing: All in favor of that Motion? Any opposition? No. Thank you. Item concluded.

13 Thanks for all your patience everybody that came and helped work on this in the last two years.

14

15 MOTION #2 PASSED (6-0-1, Commissioner Summa recused)

16

17 **Note-The Commission took a break**

18

19 **Commission Action**: Item 2 had two motions:

20

21 1. Recommend the City Council adopt an ordinance establishing a combining district as
22 presented in the staff report with the following changes

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

- 1 a. Incidental Retail Needs to be Cleaned Up
- 2 b. Council consider the local workforce preferential proximity to commute shed
- 3 w/regard to transit.
- 4 c. Remove item A - D in Section 1 of the Workforce Housing Ordinance
- 5 d. Amend Table 1 in Section 18.30(J).070, TDM Plan, "A transportation demand
- 6 management (TDM) plan shall be required and shall comply with the TDM pursuant
- 7 to Section 18.52.050(d), and associated administrative guidelines, and decision-
- 8 making body.
- 9 e. Amend Section 1 to include a new finding that data collection on parking, traffic, and
- 10 tenant demographics is a key goal of this zoning district
- 11 f. Deletion of at grade bike parking requirement

12 **Motion made by Commissioner Monk, seconded by Commissioner Riggs; motion PASSES**
13 **6-1 Commissioner Summa against.**

- 14
- 15 2. Moved the staff report applying the overlay zone to the property and recommending
- 16 approval of the site & design to the city council based on staff findings and conditions,
- 17 with the following additional requirements:
- 18 a. TDM to collect as much data as possible to the project
- 19 b. To the extent feasible the street sidewalks keep the street sidewalks open during
- 20 construction.

21 **Motion made by Commissioner Gardias, seconded by Commissioner Alcheck; motion**
22 **PASSES 6-0 (Commissioner Summa Recused From Discussion)**

- 23
- 24 3. PUBLIC HEARING: Recommendation to the City Council to Adopt an Ordinance
- 25 Amending Palo Alto Municipal Code (PAMC) Title 18 (Zoning), Chapter 18.28 (Special
- 26 Purpose, PF, OS and AC Districts), Sections 18.28.050 (Site Development Standards),
- 27 18.28.060 (Additional PF District Design Requirements), and 18.28.090 (Parking and
- 28 Loading) to Revise Development Standards for City Essential Services Buildings and
- 29 Appurtenant or Ancillary Structures Including Emergency Communication Towers,
- 30 and Public Parking Facilities within the Public Facilities (PF) Zone District within the
- 31 Downtown and California Avenue Districts, and to Make Other Clerical or Technical
- 32 Corrections. CEQA: The proposed Ordinance is evaluated in the Draft Environmental
- 33 Impact Report (EIR) for the Palo Alto Public Safety Building and Public Parking Garage
- 34 Project at 250 and 350 Sherman Avenue. The Draft EIR was published January 8,
- 35 2018 for a 45 day comment period ending February 22, 2018. For More Information,
- 36 Contact Amy French at Amy.french@cityofpaloalto.org.
- 37

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Yay, all the way to Section 3 of our agenda. So we have one speaker card.
2 Hamilton Hitchings is still here hanging in so thank you for your patience and your opinions.
3 We welcome that.

4
5 Hamilton Hitchings: Thanks. I practically passed out by now and I got to get up at 6:30 and
6 drive to the city, but the police station is near and dear to my heart. I was I worked with
7 Annette Glanckopf really closely on the Citizen Advisory Committee (CAC) to authors the Public
8 Safety Element along with staff and I'm a volunteer for Emergency Services Program and I
9 worked really closely with Ken Dutcher. And there was one thing that I am concerned about
10 with it and so I wanted to bring that out. And that's the seismic safety of the building. The
11 original justification for this project one was modernization and the other was to make it so
12 that it would be operational after a major earthquake, but as the process has gone on the
13 desire or the focus on making it withstand a major earthquake seems to have been slightly
14 deemphasized. So I just want to start with a few details.

15
16 The United States Geological Survey (USGS) has just updated their in the last couple years their
17 predictions for the Bay Area and they now estimate there's a 72 percent chance of a 6.7 or
18 greater earthquake in the Bay Area in the next 30 years. The Hayward Fault typically has about
19 a 6.8 every 150 to 160 years although that can be variable. It's been 150 years since the last
20 one. In addition, the San Andreas Fault is five miles away from the Public Safety Building (PSB)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 site and can experience up to a 7.9 earthquake and thus the new Stanford Hospital has been
2 built to withstand an 8.0. The San Francisco and Oakland City Halls and the Berkeley Police
3 Station have all been fitted with what's called base isolation which reduces the shaking during a
4 major earthquake which is not currently planned for the police station. In the DR it incorrectly
5 quotes Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) website as saying the Modified Mercalli
6 Intensity Scale (MMI) would be 7.0 whereas when I visited the ABAG website it had the San
7 Andreas Fault with a 7.8 selected and said it was an MMI 8.0. So there could potentially be an
8 underestimation there. Please ensure the PSB is designed to withstand an earthquake in the
9 high sevens and be operational thereafter.

10

11 And the other thing is as an emergency services volunteer communication is really important.
12 So I know we talk a lot about height limits, but in the case of the communication tower I
13 definitely support it even though it's going to be very tall because out of be critical in an
14 emergency. Thank you for listening to my comments.

15

16 Chair Lauing: Thank you again for your attention to our business and helping the City along. Ok,
17 want to do the staff report? Or we can just jump in (interrupted)

18

19 Amy French, Chief Planning Official: Sure. I'll be brief. Yeah, I was I wasn't sure if I was going to
20 give one today. Let's see. We've got an ordinance before you, text changes for the City parking

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 garages and essential service facilities in the Downtown and California Avenue business
2 districts. On the screen are two pending projects we have the one project Public Safety Project
3 site is two blocks, currently surface parking lots. This site here would be the PSB. This site here
4 would be a new parking garage providing 636 parking spaces. This is the Downtown garage on
5 Hamilton Avenue nearby which would also include some retail. These projects are a
6 architectural review application, but the hinge on having the Council to have the ability to
7 modify the Public Facilities (PF) zone own standards for parking garages and essential service
8 facilities.

9

10 So we're here before you today to allow for comment on the Draft Environmental Impact
11 Report (DEIR). This was released January 8th. The Architectural Review Board (ARB) had a
12 meeting last, sorry, on the 18th of January where there was public comment opportunity. The
13 focus for the Planning Commission is of course on the PF zone change as it relates to the DEIR.
14 The ordinance itself involves three sections as noted here regarding site development
15 standards, parking and living standards, and design requirements. It's just a little bit about the
16 DEIR. Again your role relates to the text amendment. And if you have additional comments
17 you can certainly send those in.

18

19 This has the purpose of the PF zone. We have Council direction on this to modify the PF so to
20 allow for these buildings that are so important to our infrastructure from last year in April and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 basically we're looking for the Planning and Transportation Commission (PTC) support so that
2 Council has latitude to apply these PF regulations to these specific types of buildings and the
3 specific areas of town. And this would not apply to private development and other projects in
4 the future would also have to go to Council with this type of arrangement. So this is where we
5 are and I wish for you to ask questions if you have any. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Lauing: You can just ask questions by lighting up. I think we're working now. Ok that is
8 Waldfogel I believe. Sorry, I didn't have it aligned. Commissioner Gardias.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: I mean thank you very much for sticking that late. So hopefully we'll
11 not get into a habit of this late meetings, but thank you very much for staying late. I'd like to
12 understand so when the reasons for those setbacks and I'm looking at page of the packet 275.
13 And I understand that the whole purpose of this ordinance change is to accommodate the
14 public building design and probably garage design as it's being developed currently. Is this
15 correct?

16

17 Ms. French: Yes, there's a need in order for Council to approve these projects eventually there's
18 a need to have flexibility in our PF zone standards and so that's what we're seeking.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: And where this because we are encroaching the setbacks mainly
2 underground if I got that correctly, right?

3

4 Ms. French: So specifically on the projects the parking garage on Sherman would encroach
5 above and below ground into those setbacks which for the public PF zone it's a 20 foot setback
6 on these on every street. So it's quite a big setback. So the entire building for the parking
7 garage encroaches. The PSB encroaches below grade. They're still doing some design revisions
8 so we want the flexibility for that.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: You're right. I'm looking at the parking garage and that proposed
11 setback would have as opposed to 20 feet would have 11 and in this example 11 and along
12 Birch would have 11 and 2 inches. So let me ask you a question because we don't have any
13 drawings and I understand that this measurements are coming from the physical design. What
14 impact specifically along Birch this setback would have in relationship to the buildings that are
15 farther down from Birch how does it differ from the setback that is farther down. What's the
16 setback?

17

18 Ms. French: So Birch leads to California Avenue of course and there are shorter buildings there
19 and it also leads to a taller building which is the County Courthouse building. And that has
20 differential setbacks chamfered to the corner. There's also residential in the area. I'm going to

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 go ahead and put on the screen and I have some pockets slides that show what's gone on here.
2 This is the setbacks exceptions for the PSB and the garage. So I can maybe provide it on one
3 slide. So I don't have data of tonight to present as far as what the dimensions of other buildings
4 set back from Birch. The PSB is well set back from Birch. The parking garage that's proposed
5 has a grand staircase that's proposed on Birch to encourage folks to walk instead of take the
6 elevator in a grand fashion and it's been a topic of architecture review attention for several
7 meetings now. It's intended to bring people from California to the parking garage site in a kind
8 of grand manner.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Yeah, I'm only concerned about this 11.2 setback on Birch. I just want
11 to make sure that this is not closer to the curb than the setback on the other buildings along
12 Birch. That's where my question was (interrupted)

13

14 Ms. French: Yeah, well I don't think we're going to have a problem with that. I mean the there
15 is a Antonio's Nut House I believe does there's a parking lot there so on the corner of California
16 and Birch that building is setback because there's kind of a parking lot in front. So it will be
17 closer than that building.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: That's right there is a parking lot, right?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. French: Yeah.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: Ok, so that, but what setback if there was no parking lot what is the
4 setback over there for what it's going to be redeveloped one day.

5

6 Ms. French: Well, PF zone is requires a 20 foot setback no matter what.

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: So that parking zone, the other parking zone is also PF?

9

10 Ms. French: Both of the blocks C6 and C7 are zoned PF.

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: No, no I'm not talking about this. I'm talking about the parking lot that's
13 adjacent to our parking garage on Birch. Do you have them up maybe?

14

15 Ms. French: I'm showing on the left here on the screen. So the bottom property is the
16 proposed parking garage and on and Birch. Well the Nut House or you're asking if the parking
17 lot at the Nut House the former that's a different zone. That's commercials zone.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: Right. I mean have I had that pointer I would show you, but pretty
20 much on the slides on the left side there is a... yes.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Ms. French: Here?

Commissioner Gardias: Where you have a cursor. Yes.

Ms. French: Yes.

Commissioner Gardias: There's a parking lot.

Ms. French: This is a little parking lot here.

Commissioner Gardias: There is a parking lot.

Ms. French: Yes, that's part of this property, private property.

Commissioner Gardias: So I'm asking what's the setback for this property once it's been going to be under for the future redevelopment and was the setback of the other property further down on the right side of the parking structure, of the Sherman parking?

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. French: Ok. So this is the whatever the CC setbacks are, probably zero. And then this is
2 RM-40 so RM-40 I can look that up and get back to you. At the CC setback as well I think it's
3 zero.

4
5 Commissioner Gardias: I just want to know if we're not encroaching farther into a space, a
6 public space then the adjacent building. That's the essence of my question.

7
8 Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director: So as Amy's looking that up I just want to remind the
9 Commission that we're not looking at the details of the project, any of the garages or the
10 essential PSB with this. We're looking at an ordinance that allows us to adjust the development
11 standards that would apply to these projects.

12
13 Commissioner Gardias: Right.

14
15 Mr. Lait: So this the particular... I understanding trying to get a concept of what it could look
16 like, but we're just looking at the ordinance here. We're not looking at anything to do with the
17 buildings.

18
19 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, understand, but the ordinance is driven with the specific project
20 as we talk, right?

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Mr. Lait: It is and it's driven based on the Council's direction to process these garages and PSBs. I mean they've approved these concepts so we're just giving the Council the latitude to do that in compliance with the code. They're not... Maybe we can, can we go to other questions while we're looking this one up or?

Commissioner Gardias: Sure. So thank you. So I will just briefly tell you that the intention behind this question is that we that because this is City owned property we don't grant ourselves more greater exception that we would have granted to the adjacent private property owners.

Mr. Lait: Well I so I have a different perspective on that and it may not be universally held in the City and I and I'll accept this as sort of my own perspective on this, but I think that the City should have actually the flexibility to have different development standards than would apply to private property owners. The City has a much greater responsibility in terms of the services that it provides for its community and we have to look at all the different aspects that a City is responsible for and these large infrastructure projects don't fit neatly into traditional zoning that is intended to address typical commercial buildings or things of that nature.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 We're trying to build a PSB here and it has certain operational needs that are constrained by
2 the location that the City has identified as the place to put it. We're trying to maximize parking
3 to satisfy the interests of business owners, residents, visitors and that doesn't necessarily fit
4 neatly into zoning. And so we are I do think that the City should have more flexibility in how it
5 applies these. Now it's not a blanket, a blank check. There's a process, there's a public hearing,
6 there's a review process and members of the community can have a chance to speak to design
7 factors and things like that, but I don't think that these structures necessarily should be bound
8 by the same development standards for the adjacent private property owner.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Sure, the comment was about the parking only. The garage, Sherman,
11 the garage only.

12

13 Ms. French: So I have regarding the commercial district we have zero setback for parking
14 garages from alleys. I found that nugget when you're in the CC district if that helps. So that's
15 the Jacaranda Alley. Then as far as minimum setbacks the way it's phrased is there's none
16 required in the CC. No setback. If you're going to... on the adjacent site there's no setback
17 required for commercial building.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you, Amy.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Ms. French: Yep.

2

3 Chair Lauing: Is that it? Ok. I think Commissioner ok.

4

5 Commissioner Waldfogel: I'll be brief it's getting late. Something that really stands out in the
6 zone change is the 130 foot monopole and I just wonder if you could speak to whether we've
7 fully explored alternatives to this or is this a necessary component? I think the community just
8 wants to know this before we say yes.

9

10 Ms. French: Thank you. We have Charlie Cullen here from the Police Department. He has
11 background on this. Thank you.

12

13 Charlie Cullen, Palo Alto Police Department: Hi, good evening. I'm Charlie Cullen. As Amy
14 mentioned I'm the Technical Services Director for the Police Department and thank you for
15 giving me the time to address this issue.

16

17 Actually Commissioner Waldfogel and I had a good conversation yesterday about the height of
18 this tower and the necessity for having the tower in this area. The communications tower is
19 critical wireless communications infrastructure for public safety. Not only will it enable
20 conventional radio transmissions, but we use it to provide line of sight microwave connectivity

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 with our neighbors in Los Altos and Mountain View. And why is that connectivity critical? We
2 share our 911 systems and our computer aided dispatch systems over that network. So we
3 share that those applications over a microwave network now between the three cities and
4 obviously 911 being a critical function for Palo Alto and Stanford University.

5

6 The question of whether it's possible to provide another location for a tower that can reduce or
7 eliminate the need for the onsite structure is a legitimate question certainly. As part of the
8 design process the architectural firm contracted by the City commissioned a technology
9 consultant to look at connectivity and other technical requirements. That consultant, [Wynn
10 Borne & Associates] looked at both the Montebello site and the Black Mountain site in the
11 foothills. Neither of those options were recommended because of the cost and line of sight
12 issues. There is a high likelihood that even if those locations were feasible a tower of some
13 magnitude would be required on the PSB. In addition connecting the PSB as a spur off of the
14 microwave ring creates a single point of failure. So a microwave ring the data flows in both
15 directions so if there is a cut on one part of the ring it can still flow the other way and you can
16 maintain connectivity.

17

18 The critical technology that supports public safety assumes heightened importance during a
19 catastrophic event such as an earthquake. On site communications capabilities enable
20 continuity of operations during such an event. A communications tower is considered an

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 essential feature of Public Safety facilities. Our neighboring jurisdictions of Mountain View, Los
2 Altos, and Menlo Park all have similar towers at their locations. The architect is aware of the
3 aesthetic challenges that the tower presents and has designed some mitigating features to the
4 building. I ask that you approve the height variance for this important component that
5 supports police and fire operations and I'm happy to answer any questions.

6

7 Chair Lauing: Any questions that we'd like to direct to him? That was certainly one of my
8 exclamation points when I read that.

9

10 Mr. Cullen: Sure. Understandably.

11

12 Chair Lauing: 135 feet [unintelligible]. Let's see, was there another light on there?
13 Commissioner Alcheck.

14

15 Commissioner Alcheck: I'll be even briefer. Just quickly what's the take on the earthquake
16 safety comment that we got tonight? Either of you.

17

18 Mr. Cullen: I think having an essential building standard for this facility would, will be a good.
19 Base isolation was ruled out because of the cost. Certainly if it was if cost was no issue we'd

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 like to see base isolation on that building, but it's prohibitively expensive. We'll have most of
2 the protection we need I think with the design of the building now.

3

4 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok, thank you. As promised.

5

6 Chair Lauing: I just want to make comment that I think I mean we need to maximize parking
7 there. We just have to and I think this was pretty much a done deal on the way in because
8 when we when they when Council approved the PSB itself and the lots I mean this was by
9 definition pretty much had to happen within some order of magnitude here. As I read it I said
10 that was one my exclamation points, but I think they're quite reasonable given the project
11 necessities both for safety and traffic and everything else. So it seems quite reasonable me.
12 Are there any other comments on it?

13

14 Ms. French: Can I finish answering the earlier question?

15

16 Chair Lauing: I'm sorry.

17

18 Ms. French: That's alright. So the question was two part, the commercial zone next door which
19 I said was CC it's actually CC-2 and it still is zero setback, but it was in order to allow for 8 to 12
20 foot wide sidewalks. So it's all about the sidewalks in the CC-2. Then the RM-40 which is across

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Sherman that also has a 0 to 25 foot front yard and again it's determined by the architecture
2 review based on criteria. It's like context based criteria. There is a street side setback of 16
3 feet so that so that's the side yard/street yard side across the street. I hope that answers the
4 question.

5

6 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, it does. So thank you for researching this. So my question is like
7 this: with and I will go to this Birch example with this 11.2 a setback above the grade on Birch
8 for the Sherman garage what's going to be the effective sidewalk?

9

10 Ms. French: It's definitely going to be the 12 feet.

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: So it's going to be 12 feet plus (interrupted)

13

14 Ms. French: Yes, yes.

15

16 Commissioner Gardias: Some overage because...

17

18 Ms. French: Yes, yet.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Gardias: So my question is like this, right? And I understand that this dimensions
2 follow the project. I think that the setbacks should be at least as they were proposed here, but
3 then it should be I think that you should ask for more to align with the setbacks on the other
4 properties. Is it clear what I'm proposing? That pretty much I would propose that this that the
5 setbacks that would be within this ordinance would be no farther set than the setbacks of the
6 adjacent properties. Unless you're already encroaching, right? Because there may be a reason
7 why you were encroaching, but then if you are not encroaching just to pretty much to for the
8 peace of mind if you are asking today about setback of 20 let's say, but the adjacent properties
9 have 0 I would propose that pretty much you align with the adjacent properties and then you
10 request 0. So if there is a modification of the project you pretty much don't have to come back
11 to us. Does it make sense?

12
13 Ms. French: Yes, I think so. And I think we're all thinking of specific projects. I mean this is a
14 this is the ordinance itself so when we were talking about that specific project everything else is
15 not adjacent. It's across a roadway, but there could be a project some day in the future. But
16 we're always going to be looking at that project specifically and deciding for that project what
17 makes sense.

18
19 Chair Lauing: Ok. Commissioner Summa.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Summa: No, I just wanted to thank everyone for being here so late and I think
2 the public is very excited about especially the garage projects. And I was happy to see although
3 I didn't see the whole ARB Meeting ARB was very happy with the improvements proposed. So
4 this is I think something we should be happy to recommend. So.

5

6 Chair Lauing: So are you moving the that?

7

8 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, I'll move that.

9

10 Chair Lauing: Move adoption of this?

11

12 Commissioner Summa: Pardon me?

13

14 Chair Lauing: Move adoption of this recommendation?

15

16 MOTION

17

18 Commissioner Summa: I would, yes.

19

20 Chair Lauing: Ok and a second please?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

SECOND

Commissioner Riggs: I'll second since I actually have my light on anyway.

Chair Lauing: That's right. That's right. Make it very efficient that way.

Commissioner Riggs: I will just suggest and emphasize to staff and the ARB that I believe Policy T-5.10 is very important in considering adaptive reuse strategies in the long term for this parking facility. So happy to second and unless there's dialogue I would propose we (interrupted)

VOTE

Chair Lauing: Yeah. [Unintelligible] covered the comments. So moved, seconded. Let's vote. All in favor? Any, ok, great. Unanimous, thank you. Thanks for staying up late with us.

MOTION PASSED (7-0)

Commission Action: Approve the staff report; Motion made by Commissioner Summa, seconded by Commissioner Riggs; motion PASSES 7-0

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 4. PUBLIC HEARING: Recommend that the City Council Adopt an Ordinance Amending
2 Palo Alto Municipal Code (PAMC) Chapter 18.40 (General Standards and Exceptions)
3 of Title 18 (Zoning) to Add a New Section Imposing an Annual Office Limit and Setting
4 Forth Related Regulations, and to Repeal the Respective Regulations from Chapter
5 18.85 (Interim Zoning Ordinances). The Proposed Ordinance will perpetuate the
6 existing annual limit of 50,000 square feet of new office/R&D development per year
7 with modifications regarding the review process, unallocated area rollover
8 provisions, and exemptions as discussed by the City Council on September 5, 2017.
9 CEQA: This Ordinance is within the scope of the Comprehensive Plan Environmental
10 Impact Report (EIR) certified and adopted on November 13, 2017 by Council
11 Resolution Nos. 9720 and 9721. For More Information, Please Contact Clare
12 Campbell at clare.campbell@cityofpaloalto.org.

13 **Commission Action:** Continued to February 14, 2018

14 **Approval of Minutes**

15 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

16 5. December 13, 2017 Draft Planning & Transportation Commission Meeting Minutes
17

18 Chair Lauing: Ok, so we have postponed the next item and so we just have a few little quick
19 items here at the end. We need an approval for the minutes of December 13th.

20

21 MOTION

22

23 Commissioner Alcheck: Moved.

24

25 SECOND

26

27 Commissioner Riggs: Second again.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 VOTE

3

4 Chair Lauing: No discussion. Unless there was somebody absent please vote; December 13th
5 meeting.

6

7 MOTION PASSED (7-0)

8

9 Commissioner Alcheck: If weren't here you can abstain and majority will carry you.

10

11 Chair Lauing: Right. Yeah, we'll cover for you.

12

13 **Commission Action:** Motion to approve minutes from December 13, 2017 made by
14 Commissioner Alcheck, Seconded by Commissioner Riggs. Motion passes 7-0.

15 **Committee Items**

16 **Commissioner Questions, Comments, Announcements or Future Agenda Items**

17

18 Chair Lauing: I don't think there are any committee items tonight. And looking ahead I don't
19 think there are any changes yet to the agenda except we're going to probably have to add back
20 this item which we agreed to do whether we have to pull something off the 14th we can just
21 talk to Jonathan about that later on.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Jonathan Lait, Assistant Director: You have on your Item 1 tab the meeting schedule I think that needs to adjust a little bit so...

Chair Lauing: It's what?

Mr. Lait: The tentative agenda that we have on your in your packet it's going to modify a little bit.

Chair Lauing: Including adding the thing that we postponed?

Mr. Lait: Yeah, we're going to add, but we're also going to pull off the North Ventura one. That's not ready yet for...

Chair Lauing: Well that's the 28th though. No, the 14th.

Mr. Lait: Oh, that's true. Yeah, like the that ordinance.

Chair Lauing: Ok.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Mr. Lait: Yeah, I think that study session is moving to the 28th.

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: Quick question for Chair.

4

5 Chair Lauing: And then we did have the a document here on its disappeared now, but it looks
6 like is it a preliminary item that you gave us on housing study? I'm sorry. It's buried now, but it
7 was... work plan.

8

9 Mr. Lait: That's the work plan that's going to the City Council on the 5th.

10

11 Chair Lauing: So it's kind of like a pre-packet for us? An early packet?

12

13 Mr. Lait: Yeah, it's the work plan.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Ok, great.

16

17 Commissioner Alcheck: Quick question?

18

19 Chair Lauing: Ok, yep.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Commissioner Alcheck: What is I we left I left our last meeting thinking that we were going to
2 see some discussion of bylaw amendment.

3

4 Chair Lauing: Yeah. It just didn't fit. And so it's going to come back.

5

6 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

7

8 Chair Lauing: Yep. Hasn't been lost.

9

10 Commissioner Alcheck: Ok.

11

12 Chair Lauing: Yeah. Ok, anything else or are we ready to adjourn?

13

14 Vice-Chair Monk: Hi, on Packet Page 5 I was given March. I'm going to be traveling in March so
15 I might want to propose February.

16

17 Chair Lauing: You and Commissioner Gardias are consecutively. Maybe you could swap who's
18 the lead and who's the backup?

19

20 Vice-Chair Monk: Well, I'm really going to be gone a lot of March so (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Lauing: Right, so I'm saying just take April and if Commissioner Gardias and take March.

Vice-Chair Monk: I would prefer to take February because I do have travel that...

Commissioner Summa: Alright, I'll swap with you.

Vice-Chair Monk: Do you mind swapping those two?

Commissioner Summa: Ok.

Vice-Chair Monk: You and I are usually there at the same time anyway.

Commissioner Alcheck: A quick plug?

Chair Lauing: Ok. So you guys have swapped? That's taken care of? Ok.

Commissioner Alcheck: Just a quick plug you have 49 minutes register for Housing the Bay Summit and you get \$100 off.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1 Chair Lauing: Oh, really?

2

3 Commissioner Alcheck: If you were interested in Housing the Bay Summit (interrupted)

4

5 Chair Lauing: I'm very interested in that (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Alcheck: Then consider the link. There's \$100 off as of the 31st, so.

8

9 Chair Lauing: Let's adjourn quick.

10

11 Vice-Chair Monk: And then sorry, just going back to the schedule. I notice that Doria and I are
12 both scheduled for October. We're both usually at the same meetings so I don't know if you
13 wanted to put us as separate backup.

14

15 Chair Lauing: Well let's just wait till we get the closer to it.

16

17 Vice-Chair Monk: Ok, because I'm here in the summer time if someone wants to swap.

18

19 Commissioner Riggs: Yeah, I'm going to probably have to negotiate some summer
20 **[unintelligible]** with you **[unintelligible]**

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1

2 Vice-Chair Monk: Yeah, I can swap this summer.

3

4 Commissioner Riggs: [Unintelligible].

5

6 Chair Lauing: It gives you more time to work on the Commission. Ok, we stand adjourned.

7

8 **Adjournment**

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas and Reports are available online: <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

Chair Ed Lauing

Vice Chair Susan Monk

Commissioner Michael Alcheck

Commissioner Przemek Gardias

Commissioner William Riggs

Commissioner Doria Summa

Commissioner Asher Waldfogel

Get Informed and Be Engaged!

View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto/> or on Channel 26.

Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs, or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.