

REVISED



1 Planning & Transportation Commission
2 Special Action Meeting Agenda:
3 September 27, 2017

4 Council Chambers
5 250 Hamilton Avenue
6 5:00 PM
7

8 **Call to Order / Roll Call**

9 5:05pm

10
11 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: [tape starts with meeting in progress] Running a few minutes late and to
12 get started so why don't we? Ok, so why don't we get moving? We'll get the see if we get the
13 video turned on. Great, so let's call to order the September 27th meeting of the Planning and
14 Transportation Commission (PTC). Start with roll call.

15
16 Yolanda Cervantes, Administrative Assistant: Commissioner Gardias, Commissioner Lauing,
17 Commissioner Monk, Commissioner Rosenblum, Commissioner Summa, Commissioner [Note
18 Vice-Chair] Waldfogel. Six present.

19
20 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great. Six present, we have quorum.

21
22 **Oral Communications**

23 The public may speak to any item not on the agenda. Three (3) minutes per speaker.^{1,2}

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Let's see so I guess we'll start with Oral Communications. We have three cards, three minutes each for Oral Communications. We're going to get the Directors Report after Oral Communications. So we will start with Stephen Levy followed by Terry Holzmer, so three minutes please. [break in audio]

Commissioner Monk: Can we check the microphone? I can't really hear him very well. Just wait a moment we'll reset the timer. [break in audio]

Hillary Gitelman, Planning Director: OK thank you Commissioners, just a few things; there's no City Council meeting this week so nothing to report on that score. Next week and the week after actually there's no meeting on the 10th either so it's the 2nd and the 16th. There are just a few small Planning items, one of the meetings has a couple requests for retail preservation waivers so those are very fact specific. The other agenda has a couple requests, small requests for prescreening so zoning rezoning requests from individual property owners. Again, really small fact specific affecting very small parcels in these cases so those aren't things that have come to the Commission, but you might be interested in the Council's discussion and deliberation on those matters because they do relate to items that come before you in general.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Also I just wanted you to be aware that the next agenda of the Planning Commission will
2 include a pretty significant discussion of parking management strategies for Downtown. You
3 had one discussion of that report and recommendations earlier. We want to bring that back to
4 you for more in-depth discussion and actual recommendations from the Commission on a
5 number of aspects of that program so that will be the focus of your next meeting. That
6 concludes our report.

7

8 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great, thank you. It doesn't look like we have that microphone working.

9 Is there another microphone available? Ok, why don't we do that? Actually just one second
10 see if we have it... Actually the little red light came on when you grabbed it so it looks like it's a
11 loose wire. Ok, well let's just use this microphone over here if you don't mind.

12

13 Yolanda Cervantes, Administrative Assistant: You can come have a seat right here. It doesn't
14 stretch. This is as far as it goes. If you'd like to have a seat right here?

15

16 Stephen Levy: Ok. One, thank you; I watch you all every Wednesday on cable at home and I
17 appreciate the civility. I came tonight because I spent the day in San Francisco on the big
18 housing Regional Housing Committee and there are about 50 people in the room. I was the
19 only one who was not a stakeholder. I was the only one who was not on the committee. I was
20 the only one who was not a paid advocate. I was the only one who was not a builder or a

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 developer. And I spoke twice as I'll speak here and later about how these things are structured
2 so the general public is not there. We talk a lot about stakeholder committees. Why am I not a
3 stakeholder? I have lived in this City for 50 years. Do I have to live near a project to be a
4 stakeholder? Do I have to have a financial interest? When [Reba Keddy] and Aggie Robinson
5 and others built this City that my family and my children benefited from they weren't
6 stakeholders, they did it for the public interest.

7

8 No blame, but we talk a lot about stakeholders and then we talk about neighbors. Well, I am a
9 neighbor of the two parking lots on Gilman between Forest and Hamilton and a neighbor of the
10 parking lot place where you're going to build Waverly and Hamilton. Now I know and you know
11 that what a neighbor means in the Planning Commission is someone who comes and complains,
12 someone who is decidedly not neighborly even though they live near the project. So I wonder
13 about that. There are 65,000 people in the City and at most 200 live near the First Baptist
14 Church, live near Castilleja, live near the project at Wilton where because my daughter was a
15 special needs student I have more in common with those people in that project I bet than the
16 neighbors. So how do we get the public interest into this process? Commissioner Gardias said
17 once no one comes I guess that means they approve it. Maybe it is, but how do we find out if
18 the only people that come are stakeholders advocating for it or neighbors complaining? How
19 do we get the public interest into the project?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Last point, when I applied for the Citizen Advisory Committee (CAC) and I think I'm the only
2 person in the City who served both on the infrastructure Commission and the CAC and they ask
3 you three reasons I wrote because I want to represent the people who are not in the room; the
4 people who do not live here, but for whom I want to build a great city. How do we do that?
5 Thanks.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, would Terry Holzmer come up and then followed by Sangho Yoon.

8

9 Terry Holzmer: Commissioners thank you tonight for the opportunity to come and speak to all
10 of you. My comment, my oral comments tonight will be very short, but they are important. It's
11 about a missed opportunity by our City leaders: our Mayor, our Vice-Mayor, and our City
12 Manager to clearly focus on the discussion surrounding the Comp Plan while we while we're
13 why we think our sister cities are important to us they don't realize I don't believe the huge
14 impact that this Comp Plan will have on the future of Palo Alto especially in the next 15 years.
15 While they are spending a relaxing trip overseas this Commission and other Palo Altans in
16 general are trying to deal with the everyday realities that this Comp Plan will present. This will
17 impact our lives severely over the next 15 years. We need to think about this every single day
18 until this plan is approved. How this plan will affect us in many different ways we're not even
19 clear on. I would hope that the time devoted by our City leaders and representatives that are
20 overseas at this moment will also bring the same level of attention and detail and time,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 especially time that to this issue of the Comp Plan and how this will impact the everyday
2 citizens of this City especially at this critical time. Thank you.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. Our next speaker is Sangho Yoon.

5

6 Sangho Yoon: Hi, thank you for giving me the opportunity to share my problems and
7 inconvenience. Currently I live on 133 Middlefield Road. Recently there was a big change in
8 northern part of Middlefield due to the major concerns about the accidents happening a lot at
9 the intersections, [but however the changes made on particular section of Hawthorne and
10 Middlefield created a problem for me because it installed new lines of separation and traffic
11 bars that prohibited me that prevents me from making a left turn to go to my property or
12 driveway. So therefore it created great inconvenience and problems in particular in the during
13 the commute time. Given that I have two young kids the commute time is really rush time, the
14 new changes the we have really significant problems. We've been discussing with the people in
15 the Transportation Department and then we came up with some simple resolution to put new
16 striping so that would allow us to make a left turn to our property, but however, it's been
17 delayed for a few months already and I'm seeking for your guidance in terms of what should be
18 done to accommodate our need. I understand that the changes are to address the concerns to
19 the many significant accidents on Middlefield, but however, that needs to be done in a way that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 the people who live on Middlefield would not be significantly affected in their daily lives. That's
2 it, thank you.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. Staff do you have any suggestion for the speaker?

5

6 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah, it sounds like this gentleman has been in touch with the Transportation
7 staff already. We did commit to the Council to do a one year review of the project and make
8 any adjustments needed after that review. So I know it's on our it's in a work program to
9 conduct that review and the speaker's input is important for that so we'll make sure that his
10 issue is day lighted in that report.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright thank you. Ok, that ends the items I have for Oral Communications.
13 Staff you were notified that somebody wanted to speak that couldn't be here tonight. You
14 mentioned that already?

15

16 Ms. Gitelman: Yes, if I'm not mistaken you just took Oral Communications for items not on the
17 agenda. We had a request from a speaker who wanted to speak on the Comprehensive Plan
18 item that you would take comments on that item later in the evening since you're starting early
19 this evening so maybe the Commission could start your deliberations and then take a break at
20 seven o'clock or so, 7:30 for any public comments unless there's someone who's here right now

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 to speak on that. You could hear from them and then open a second public comment period
2 later.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so do you want me to leave the, leave it open?

5

6 Ms. Gitelman: Ok, a recommendation is that you open the hearing on the Comprehensive Plan
7 item, take public comment, and then leave the public comment period open and later in the
8 evening (interrupted)

9

10 Chair Alcheck: On that, ok.

11

12 Ms. Gitelman: Invite others to speak.

13

14 **Agenda Changes, Additions, and Deletions**

15 The Chair or Commission majority may modify the agenda order to improve meeting management.

16 **City Official Reports**

17 1. Assistant Directors Report, Meeting Schedule and Assignments

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Thank you for clarifying. Ok then with that I turn it over to staff for their... did
20 you do your report already? Then why don't we start with that, the Assistant Directors Report
21 and then we can move straight into the action. Oh, you did do that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

Hillary Gitelman, Planning Director: We did the Directors Report. We have a staff report on the Comp Plan.

Study Session

Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

Action Items

Public Comment is Permitted. Applicants/Appellant Teams: Fifteen (15) minutes, plus three (3) minutes rebuttal. All others: Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

- 2. PUBLIC HEARING. Planning and Transportation Commission Recommendation to the City Council on the Draft Comprehensive Plan Update, with a focus on the Transportation and Land Use Element, and Recommendation Regarding the Final Environmental Impact Report

Chair Alcheck: Sorry. So then let's begin with Action Item 2. [Talking off microphone]. Sorry, I apologize for the confusion, let's begin with Action Item 2.

Elaine Costello, Management Partners: So my name is Elaine Costello. I've been working with the City on the Comp Plan update and now my, thank you. The microphone is on. This is the sixth hearing by the Planning Commission on the Comp Plan update. We can move to the next, can you do that? Elena move the slides? Ok. So what we have tonight I'm going to just really highlight physically what we have. The first item for you which is a big item is to take a look at the list of the consolidated Planning and Transportation Commission (PTC) comments for discussion. These are the comments that you voted on and so we gave you a hard copy and

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 there are hard copies available for the public too. And this is what you'll be spending a lot of
2 the meeting on discussing these and deciding which ones of these comments should be added
3 to the list of highest priority changes and forwarded to the Council as recommended changes.
4 We so there's 14 of them and if you spend 10 minutes on each one that's almost two and a half
5 hours. So we did at the pre-meeting with the Chair and the Vice-Chair talk about at least giving
6 you a notice after you've talked about an individual item for 10 minutes we're just going to
7 raise a little card just to kind of try and keep everything going. And there was also language in
8 the staff report about trying to start these with Motions and I think the Chair will probably go
9 over a little bit more of that.

10

11 And then so not everybody's comments will end up getting forwarded; there were a lot of
12 comments that were made and they're included in the staff report. And so the other thing that
13 we're asking you to decide tonight is whether to recommend the entire consolidate... all the
14 comments that were made and they're shown in the attached in an attachment to the staff
15 report which is Attachment B I think. And those include some consensus items which are listed
16 also in the staff report on Table 2. And when we get to each of these I can help point out where
17 they are. So we want you decide the idea was to give the Council the benefit of everyone's
18 comments and also to identify... throughout the staff made a stab at identifying where there
19 seemed to be consensus. We want you to take a quick look at that and decide whether in fact
20 there is consensus on those items and whether they should be forwarded to the City Council.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 And then this is your last meeting and there is a part of the land of the Comp Plan called the
3 Land Use Implementation Table which is quite large and complex. And it's on the agenda if you
4 want to discuss it. It will be part of what's recommended is that the Planning Commission
5 review that every year. So if we stay on schedule and the Council finishes up in November it
6 could be back to you as early as December. So we're saying you have the option of whether
7 you want to do it tonight or whether you'd rather look at it when it comes back to you in
8 December.

9

10 Then the next item to talk about is the certification of the final Environmental Impact Report
11 (EIR) which was sent to you. You've already seen the draft EIR and the supplement to the EIR.
12 At the pre-meeting the question was asked well what if the Commission, does the Commission
13 have to act on this? And we did talk to Sandy Lee, Albert and I think she has forwarded to you.
14 And you actually have to comment and your comment can be as simple as we don't want to
15 make a recommendation on this. You don't have to make a recommendation. And so you
16 don't have to recommend certification or recommend to not certify. You
17 to make comments which could be as simple as we don't want to do this, we'll just let the
18 Council make a determination on this. The thing that you that did get clarified by Sandy was
19 that this recommendation on the EIR is being asked for in support of your recommendation to
20 the Council on your report on the Comp Plan update. So you can't defer, you can't say let's do

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 the Comp Plan update tonight and then do the EIR later. You need to make some comment on
2 the EIR whether it be we don't want to do it, we want to certify it, whatever before you take
3 action on your report to the Council. I hope that's clear. So you don't have to say that you
4 want to certify or not certify it, you just can't... you need to make whatever decision you want
5 to make about that tonight.

6
7 So you have a number of decisions which we will help guide you through. We have a Motion at
8 the front of the staff report that's really says what the report to the Council would be. It would
9 be your highest priority changes, the entire consolidated list, we say including the consensus
10 comments that's up to you, the minutes of all six meetings, the and then you make a decision
11 about what you want to do about the Implementation Plan Table and about the Comp Plan EIR.
12 And once you're done with all of that it will conclude the PTC review of the Comp Plan and the
13 final EIR. Your recommendations will be forwarded to the Council who have tentatively
14 scheduled two hearings on October 23rd and November 13th. That concludes the staff report.

15
16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. Would you recommend that I accept public comment now? Ok.
17 At this time we'll open up for public comment. I don't have any speaker card. Oh, here we go.
18 You're hiding them from me. I have two speaker cards. I have Terry Holzmer followed by
19 Stephen Levy. You each will have five minutes.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Terry Holzmer: Thank you again Commissioners for the time. I appreciate that greatly. As I've
2 already stated I'm here tonight to voice my great concerns over the proposed City
3 Comprehensive Plan. If implemented as is with no changes this plan envisions Palo Alto as a
4 commuter center for very large office developments and not the balanced community of parks,
5 small businesses, and residential neighborhoods that I and many of us who are residents of Palo
6 Alto have come to Palo Alto to enjoy and love about this City. Over the next 15 years this plan
7 outlines an additional million and a half, more than a million and a half square feet of
8 commercial and office development which really translates to a growth rate which is twice
9 what it has been in the last 30 years.

10

11 If such a growth rate is allowed what will happen to our already severely impacted streets and
12 roads? I travel those roads every day to the schools in Palo Alto. I'm a school teacher by the
13 way. Remember Palo Alto has said for many years that they have wanted to do something
14 about traffic and they've wanted to do about congestion. In fact two thirds of our residents
15 have said in the annual survey that this is something of one of their top priorities; however, the
16 traffic mitigation in the plan are really the traffic mitigations of the plan are really the same old
17 ones that have been identified over the last 30 years. Many of them didn't work; still it's worth
18 a try to try them if strict enforcement is included. Unfortunately strict enforcement is often not
19 included. Traffic mitigation will is impossible also without a clear identified funding resource.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 People talk about resources, but there are no resources in this plan to mitigate the traffic and
2 the congestion.

3

4 We need to have a more balanced community, more balance in our community. Adding just as
5 much park space, water supply, new schools space that the city can adequately handle. Our
6 infrastructure is already stretched. Why keep stretching it without a clear plan to go forward? I

7 suggest for this Commission that they tell the truth to the Council about what this new Comp

8 Plan includes and what it will change and how it will change the character and focus of our
9 community from one of a residential based to a largely commuter business type environment.

10 If we wish to do that that's fine, our vote our residents should have that say, but they aren't

11 given that say and it's about time they are. I would like for this Commission to send a

12 recommendation of several things maybe a moratorium on office building space would be the

13 first step and then working toward a more community based residential community. I would

14 encourage you to look into those areas and make those changes. Thank you.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Stephen Levy. Stephen Levy.

17

18 Stephen Levy: Do you all remember six meetings ago when you struggled as to whether you

19 could pull this off in six meetings? I want to thank all of you and especially Doria who I think

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 was the deciding vote for giving it a try. I think you did really well. I want to thank Elena and
2 Joanna and Elaine and Hillary who worked tirelessly on this.

3
4 If I were sitting there in response to the questions posed to you I would forward all comments
5 on which there was a plurality of opinions. That's what we did with the Citizen Advisory
6 Committee (CAC) particularly on housing when there were a bunch of plurality votes, maybe
7 even a majority vote, but strong dissenting opinions. I've read most of what you wrote and I
8 think you captured the breath of options on issues on which there is not consensus and I hope
9 you forward it all.

10
11 I hope you certify the EIR despite the comments that I'm going to make at the end that are less
12 than complimentary, but Joanne and I have gone over that before. I think it did its job and the
13 Comp Plan is in good hands. I have to process things. One, if there had been an EIR on a Comp
14 Plan in the 1990's it would have told you that we're going to build X thousand new units and
15 those new units would bring X thousand more children into the district. What it would not
16 have told you because it's not within the scope of the program is that in 2017 there would be
17 thousands fewer students in the district because despite Joanna's effort and the staff effort the
18 mandate of the EIR is to assess the impacts of the project which means the added jobs, the
19 added people, the added homes. It does not require that they look at what happens to the 80
20 to 90 percent of the homes that are here. And so they would not have noticed or been asked

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 to look at the fact that the birth rate was going to fall from 3 to 1.7 and that the existing homes
2 would have 4,000 new students.

3

4 That same EIR in the 1990's would have told you that those new homes were going to add
5 water, but yet in 2017 we use less water. And all of you I assume have changed your toilets,
6 changed your shower heads, gotten appliances that use water more efficiently, and done a little
7 conservation. It's not the drought. We use less water, Los Angeles uses less water,
8 conservation and technology work. And that would have been missed because they would
9 have said well they're new houses and each new house would add some water. They would
10 have said each new house will add some traffic so the air's got to be worse, but the air is better.
11 We keep meeting more federal standards each year because the existing homes and the
12 existing cars are better. We use less fuel. We have smog reduction devices. The only thing
13 they would have gotten right 20 years ago is that there would be more traffic and there is
14 indeed more traffic.

15

16 It's not to say the EIR is bad; it's to say that if you're asking what this Comp Plan will do to the
17 city in a city that has a very aggressive sustainability action plan to reduce water use, to reduce
18 electricity use, hopefully to reduce transportation use the EIR is only a very partial document.
19 And I don't know what to do about it. Joanne and I went back and back and back and it is what

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 it is. It uses the mandate to tell you the impact of the units and jobs added by the project, but
2 not what's going to happen in the other areas. I don't know what to do about it.

3

4 The second process issue is I work in this stuff professionally and I do not know how to get into
5 anybody's mind that this is a Comp Plan for 2030 not 2018. And to think about who will be
6 here, who will who we want to be here so we're not only older like me or affluent, but we have
7 a place for young families to think about what they might want not just what the older
8 residents might want. I don't know how to do that, but I know that this is a Comp Plan to 2030,
9 not 2018 or 2020 and there's going to be a lot of change. I may not be here, most of the people
10 that speak to you or speak to the Council may not be here, and we will be populated hopefully
11 by young families and what will they want?

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Thank you, Stephen.

14

15 Mr. Levy: So those are two dilemmas. I don't know how to solve them, but they are real.

16 Thanks.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Thank you, Stephen Levy. I appreciate it. Can we please have Greg Schmid
19 followed by Nielsen Buchanan? You each will have five minutes and change.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Greg Schmid: Pleasure to have an opportunity to speak to you tonight. It's an important night;
2 you're going to certify the Comp Plan update and the EIR. I just want to make five simple
3 points. The overarching thing is your vote tonight is how do these elements fit together? How
4 do the specific points you're making fit into a hole? And let me make five points about it.

5

6 Growth, nonresidential growth, is going to double in this plan compared to the last 27 years
7 whether you're looking at monitored growth or citywide growth there is a doubling in the
8 numbers. Now that has an impact on life in the City. Certainly we know traffic and parking and
9 congestion is an issue. If you look at the Citizens' Survey over the last decade two-thirds of
10 residents are concerned, deeply concerned about traffic and parking. And that number has
11 gone up dramatically in the last decade. So if we're having trouble before we double the rate of
12 nonresidential growth what's going to happen to those concerns? Well they'll get worse, but
13 the Comp Plan talks about mitigations on the traffic side. As someone has already pointed out
14 in the 1980's all those mitigations that are mentioned Transportation Management
15 Associations (TMA), transit, alternate vehicles, parking garages were identified of ways of
16 mitigating it yet here we are today with the residents saying it's not working and also we're
17 going to double the rate of growth that's been experienced over the last two years. That
18 means that the mitigations to be effective have to be strictly defined, enforced with penalties,
19 and most important of all have to be funded.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 There is one mitigation that seems to be a model, the Stanford University Medical Center. They
2 have agreed to pay \$2.5 million for the next 50 years. That's 2010 dollars they've guaranteed in
3 order to get one-third of their workers out of Single Occupancy Vehicles (SOV). That could be a
4 standard, but there's nothing in the Transportation Element that defines standards and who
5 pays to the same extent that they do. Business that benefits from the business growth should
6 be the one to pay for the mitigations of what takes place.

7

8 One last element has been made that sustainability is an important part of that certification.
9 The plan the final EIR gives numbers about water use in 2030. They have an increase in
10 population of between 6,000 and 14,000 people, increase in jobs between 9,000 and 15,000,
11 and the number amount of water that will be increased across that range it's one acre foot, one
12 one-thousands of the water we're using now. That doesn't seem to me to be dealing with the
13 issue of sustainability that's a critical part of our future. Thank you.

14

15 Chair Alcheck: And our last speaker is Greg, excuse me, Nielsen Buchanan.

16

17 Neilsen Buchanan: I'm thinking of all the times I've had the opportunity to speak to the people
18 up on the dias that always wondered how we could shorten the distance between the people
19 and you and tonight thanks to the microphone I feel much closer to you. I purposefully did not
20 get involved in the details of the all the work that's been brought forward to you over the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 months and then culminating today. That was a very deliberate decision on my part because I
2 felt other people had to really work out the details. I think I spoke twice to the CAC and one
3 issue doesn't really make any difference now and I'm going to come back to one that I did make
4 to them during the process.

5

6 I'm thinking about my professional experience when I was involved in a team of people to bring
7 a major decision to an organization and what we went through to try to come up with that final
8 recommendation. And I've been thinking about the time it's when I was a Chief Executive
9 Officer (CEO) I had to I was going be presented with the a big decision and in each of those
10 cases the process that I've been through professionally there was always a strengths and
11 weaknesses of what was going to be decided upon. The strengths are really important because
12 those are the things that are probably going to always go ok on a big decision. The advantage
13 of having the weaknesses presented to you is that that gives you a real signal about what to
14 watch out for and how the organization be wary about how we want to make it go well because
15 no big decision ever goes well, but it was sort be forewarned is to be forearmed. And I don't
16 see any process that's going to give the Council a real grasp of all the wisdom of people done
17 details. I did a little informal survey turning to people and say can you tell me the strengths and
18 weaknesses of the Comp Plan is that it's coming together and I've got a scatter of stuff. And I
19 didn't spend an exhaustive time trying to come to that. I turned to people I sort of trusted and I
20 turned to some people about the element that you're working on today and I got the same

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 scatter that there was not any strong consensus where the strengths and weaknesses are. I
2 don't know how you do that Hillary and to the... we have nine CEO's I guess of the City and
3 they're going to all ponder the stuff, but for a legacy I would hope you talk about somehow
4 what are the strengths and weaknesses so that future Councils as Steve Levy pointed about this
5 is something that's going to linger around a while. And I don't think you're going to be as well
6 run city without knowing what you're stumbling into positively and negative.

7

8 It also comes at a time that I look at the flux in government at all levels and flux of government
9 here in this wonderful well-endowed incredibly rich city of every sort. You can't understand
10 how I look at the City because I look at it through my Mississippi eyes and there's nothing that I
11 had growing up in Mississippi that resembles Palo Alto in terms of opportunity, University,
12 mixture of people and whatnot. So that's the reason that my tension is there is that so much is
13 at stake. Just look at the recent track record of the City government being able to manage
14 conflict. Look at the stress that I think Jim Keene constantly warns about is how fragile the City
15 finances are. More recently was in the paper, but the unfunded liabilities of the pension are
16 just one component. But it's one thing I've seen Jim consistently talking about and I did sit
17 through an awful lot of Finance Committee to get a gestalt of that. That this is really a fragile
18 time to do an ambitious execution on plans and I have great empathy on this the burden that's
19 put on the very stressed City Council.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Let me close back on asking you to think about how can you present strengths and weaknesses
2 to the City Council who is basically our city's CEO. Finally I'm going to just one thing that I did
3 asked the CAC to think about when they're doing all they're deliberative things there's a phrase
4 or a sentence or two that in the current Comp Plan is very dear to my heart and I'll paraphrase
5 it. It says the City will be promoting commerce, but not at the expense of the residential
6 neighborhoods. I haven't taken time to go through the documents to see if something like that
7 sentiment is still in the Comp Plan, but I strongly, strongly urge you to go back to that value
8 statement about promoting commerce, but not at the expense of the residential
9 neighborhoods. Thank you very much. Good luck on winding this thing up.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. All right at this time I'm going to leave the public comment open
12 in case we want to entertain some more public comments later in the meeting. Ok, quick note
13 about process... Well, first let me say that this is our sixth meeting. We had 90 days to review
14 this. This is a proud moment, but we're not yet done. I think most of you are familiar with the
15 email we got from the Director about preparing for this meeting. What I would like to suggest
16 unless there is any sort of strong opposition to this, what I would like to do tonight is begin
17 immediately with Items 1 through 14. There are various individuals who have nominated these
18 items to be discussed. I would like to hear from an individual who is a member of the
19 nominated or voting group on each item with... at the start of our discussion with a Motion
20 right away language for what they would propose we build consensus on. And then discuss

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 that Motion and attempt to resolve it within the 10 to 15 minutes time frame. I believe some
2 of these items should take less than five minutes. Some of these items are already written as a
3 Motion and I think we could potentially discuss them very quickly and they could receive a vote.

4
5 Before we begin I want you to all take a, make a note to yourselves that on Page 10, Packet
6 Page 10 we have the PTC consensus comments. At the second half of our meeting when we
7 will discuss, when we will make our sort of broad Motion and have a discussion about how we
8 communicate this to City Council and potentially touch upon the EIR as well as potentially the
9 implementation plan I'd like to revisit this and quickly determine how we want to include this.

10 But not yet, so just keep in your mind that at some point we'll come back to this table and it
11 would be good to have an idea of how you would like us to process that table. Ok, so with that
12 what I would like to do is invite Commissioners to light up my board. I have a light. We're going
13 to start with one. I would I'm just going to say it one more time I'd really encourage us to be
14 very thoughtful with our time because all of these items are items are issues that we wanted to
15 discuss and it would be particularly impressive if everybody that had an issue got a chance to
16 discuss it.

17
18 And then lastly and this came from a number of different places. There's been a suggestion
19 that we resist this is the respectful request. That we resist the effort to make substantive
20 Motions tonight, Substitute Motions tonight to give the individuals who have nominated these

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 items and have come forward the opportunity to make their Motion and be heard. And if a
2 Motion fails the alternative could be raised right away. So just keep that in mind. It's not a
3 requirement. It's just a request. Ok, I have my first light, Commissioner Rosenblum beginning
4 with Com... with Item Number 1.

5

6 Commissioner Rosenblum: Thank you, Chair. So I nominated this one in addition to several
7 others it seems to be discussed. I think this is a fairly big item because it's around our
8 philosophy around parking management and it affects a lot of other things. So specifically I've
9 raised concerns before that our philosophy of parking leads to every building having captive
10 parking with that building. Ideally we have parking that's better shared and utilized so parking
11 should be liquid so there's enough capacity that we can manage it. And it should be priced
12 properly. And I think that's all going to be addressed in the parking strategy meeting that we're
13 about to have. Currently the language which I think is relatively good says "all new
14 developments should manage parking demand generated by the project without the use of on
15 street parking consistent with the established parking regulations," which basically says every
16 building will have to build their own parking in that building. And that's what we do and people
17 come and try to measure the spaces and argue that they don't have enough spaces or do have
18 enough spaces. And I believe what it's resulted in is a City that has lots and lots of buildings
19 with captive parking under them that are not fully utilized.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 So my suggestion and I'm happy to do this for a process standpoint and make a Motion to move
2 forward is that we express a preference for paying in lieu fees and that the City better report on
3 it and monitor the use of those fees. And to explain the last bit of that I think there's a
4 suspicion that when buildings pay fees instead of building their parking that are supposed to go
5 to building central parking that the centralized parking never gets built. And I will express as a
6 Commissioner I also have trouble finding the 1:1 relationship between in lieu fees paid and
7 parking spaces built. And so this sort of thing is a major source of public concern and it should
8 be I think a number of speakers referred to enforcement, I would add transparency. It's not
9 just enforcement, but we should know what we've paid for. So when if appropriate to make a
10 Motion which I will, but I want to make sure others have their chance to speak it will be to
11 indicate a preference for shared parking facilities funded through in lieu fees with adequate
12 transparency and enforcement so that those fees get put into parking.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'd like you to make that Motion so that we can second it or somebody if
15 they want to can second it and then we can open it up for comments related to it and then
16 immediately once those comments, a round of comment is done we'll put it to a vote and if it
17 and looking to see where it goes from there if you don't mind.

18

19 MOTION #1

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: Ok, my Motion is that in T-5 the introduction of the Transportation
2 Element Goal T-5 that the current language that we add a sentence that the City expresses a
3 preference for shared parking facilities funded by in lieu fees... strictly monitored and reported
4 to the public. I don't know exactly how again I'm not going to word craft from here, but the
5 intention is that we have preference to share park and that the City do a better job of reporting
6 on that those facilities, the construction and utilization of those facilities.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I have lights here, but first do I have a second for this Motion?

9

10 SECOND

11

12 Commissioner Monk: I'd like to second the Motion. Does that Motion fully encompass
13 everything that you stated prior to making the Motion?

14

15 Commissioner Rosenblum: I believe so unless you're they seconder would like to ask
16 specifically.

17

18 Commissioner Monk: We don't have it typed up, but so long as it incorporates the key details
19 then I'd like to second it.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

2

3 Commissioner Monk: If staff can just take a look and make sure that it incorporates other
4 pieces of what you had mentioned prior to.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Commissioner Monk. I'm going to go down the list now. I have
7 Commissioner [Note-Vice-Chair] Waldfogel, Commissioner Gardias, and then light from
8 Commissioner Monk and now Commissioner Lauing. So let's start with Commissioner [Note
9 Vice-Chair] Waldfogel.

10

11 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great. I don't support this Motion. I think it's redundant. Program T-
12 5.1.4 already covers this topic, study the feasibility of unbundled parking for office. I don't
13 think that Policy T-5.1 actually mandates that the parking is in a building. I think it right now
14 the language says should manage, doesn't say must build. So I think this Motion is unnecessary
15 and therefore I don't support it.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Gardias.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Gardias: So I disagree with the process and then specifically that a Motion is
2 being proposed before any discussion occurs. I don't believe that this is the formula that we
3 should follow at any of our meetings.

4

5 Now trying to support you the best of the way I can I'd like to talk about Number 1. So I believe
6 that there is my vote in there and the reason that I voted for this item was that because of the
7 discussion that we had with Eric the other day that I was proposing that all the building
8 structures are fully parked which means that pretty much that we would require that all the
9 buildings would have underground garages to the full extent of feasibility as it should be
10 without any credits. There is a second part of this which is the management of this how it
11 would be done and that pretty much would it be funded by in lieu fees or some other ways of
12 reason I totally agree that there should be some program that would address those. But my
13 interest was to make sure that there was an adequate supply of the parking spaces and
14 regardless that developers may get the credit for providing/offering Transportation Demand
15 Management (TDM) or TMA programs.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. The next light I have is from Commissioner Monk. No? Ok,
18 Commissioner Lauing.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: Just a couple questions. I don't understand why this would be at the
2 policy level as opposed to listed as one of the programs. Basically it sounds like if it's at the
3 policy level it's being mandated or being almost the exclusive way of doing things whereas I
4 think the tone of this whole goal is we need to have some options based on various areas of the
5 City and a number of options are listed here. So if that was suggested as a possible program to
6 be considered for some areas that would kind of make it more logical to me to be in a program
7 area because there are I don't know how many alternatives there are, there are probably eight.
8 So it seems to me like putting that one in here is kind of forcing everything into one square. I
9 don't know if the maker would like to address that?

10

11 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, I'd like to address two items. So first Vice-Chair Waldfogel if
12 you don't mind can you tell me that the item number that you say is redundant with this?

13

14 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Program T-5.1.4.

15

16 Commissioner Rosenblum: Ok, great. So first I'll talk about Commissioner Lauing's question.
17 This is a philosophy so I think it's at the policy level, it's not a program. It's to say that and I've
18 said this many times, you read studies about effective parking systems the principles they have
19 are that you should properly price parking which I'm not addressing, but also there should be
20 liquidity of parking so that there's a supply that is shared so that for different times different

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 users you can have adequate supply to meet the adequate demand. What we do in this City is
2 the opposite. We don't price parking so it's over utilized and we sub segment it under every
3 building so it's captive. So we are exactly the opposite of any modern so anyone who reads
4 Donald Shoup would come away with the opposite impression. And so I'm saying that this is
5 from the policy level which is philosophically we prefer to try to have more liquid parking. So
6 that's how I reconcile that. It's not to say you have to, it says a city where possible we should
7 prefer this as a means. It brings us in the modern age of parking versus having every building
8 underutilized, but have to build expensive parking underneath. I'd still like them to pay that
9 money, but I'd like it to be centrally managed.

10

11 With regard to Vice-Chair Waldfogel's contention 5.1.4 study the feasibility of unbundled
12 parking for office, commercial, and multi-family residential developments including senior
13 housing developments that are well served by transit and demonstrating walking and bicycle
14 connections. So I believe the unbundling refers to the fact that under a building you can
15 separately you can make that available or separately price it. That's separate from having
16 centrally managed resources and shared resources so it doesn't address the liquidity issue. It
17 may address part of the captive space issue, but it's something that I would say is suboptimal so
18 every individual building would then have to have a program to be able to sell or rent parking
19 spaces to outsiders and it's a complex I'd say it's a much more complex and suboptimal solution
20 although I do support unbundling. So.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Rosenblum.

3

4 Commissioner Rosenblum: Process wise though we have a we do have a Motion and a second
5 so how do we proceed?

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so what I intend on doing is we've just been advised that we're 10 minutes
8 into this. I have three lights on the board I'm going to... as of this moment. I'm going to allow
9 each of those individuals to speak and then I'm going to call a vote. Ok, so the three speakers in
10 order are Summa, Waldfogel, and then Gardias.

11

12 Commissioner Summa: Ok, I will also not be supporting this Motion. I think that Goal T-5 is all
13 about ways we can when appropriate reduce onsite parking. Currently I think that's
14 aspirational, but I'm glad that we have so many things in here about that might address this in
15 the future when people own and drive cars in a different manner. I also think it's redundant
16 with T-5.1.1. There is a Program T-5.2.2 for studying and implementing pricing strategies. So I
17 and T-5.4 encourage shared parking where complimentary demand is demonstrated in order to
18 optimize and then the Program under that Policy T-5.4.1 I think that most of this whole goal is
19 about reducing when appropriate the amount of parking that we require for new buildings.
20 And at the very last there's a policy that mentions trying to minimize the need for employees to

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 park in and adjacent to commercial centers so I think we have more than covered what we
2 need to do to address your concerns and I think it's impractical for private property owners to
3 have a pool a citywide pool of spots available because many private property owners will not
4 want to make their private garages for reasons of safety especially in mixed-use residential and
5 commercial buildings available to other users that they don't know. So I will not be supporting
6 the Motion.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. Commissioner Gardias.

9

10 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. Yeah so I understand the concerns that Commissioner
11 Summa has. Those are valid concerns and I was thinking about them as well. And of course if
12 we, we should have I totally supports Commissioner Rosenblum's desire for policy. I believe
13 that there should be policy. There should be a program underneath that would allow us to pilot
14 such a solution because it may be a innovative solution. I'm not sure if it's available in some
15 other cities. It may be, but I have not seen myself one. So there should be a program
16 underneath that would allow us to pilot it and prove it that we can unbundle, that we can share
17 the space, and then also that the space, parking space underneath would be fully built at the
18 time when construction proceeds. So if you would agree with this language I would totally
19 support this as a policy level.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: I'm sorry, could you repeat the language? I didn't, I'm not sure I
2 completely appreciate it, but others may understand it. Could you repeat the language that
3 you're asking if I support?

4

5 Commissioner Gardias: If well I didn't specify language. I was talking only about the elements
6 of this policy where which would have the fully parked construction despite of any credits that
7 would be used for the shared parking facilities. That would be either sold or to the residents or
8 sold to the outsiders. Underneath there would have to be a program and then of course it
9 would have to be a citywide monitoring program that would allow us to share those spaces
10 with others. And then underneath there would have to be a program that would allow us to
11 pilot it because we can speak us much as we want, but we need to just see if market would
12 react positively to this.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Would you like to comment?

15

16 Commissioner Rosenblum: So I feel you're talking about a different program. So I think what
17 you are talking about is also the same as the Vice-Chair mentioned which is the unbundling
18 program. I would agree also with Commissioner Summa that unbundling I think is a really
19 interesting idea, but I think it has a lot of barriers to working including individual property
20 owners having to manage non-tenants coming in and out of the garage.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2 I think that there's quite a few things that have to be done and I've read about cities where this
3 has been successfully done. I just don't know exactly how it works. And I'm talk about
4 something a little different which is not that groundbreaking. It's like Redwood City, San
5 Mateo, like building a larger centralized garage that's paid for by in lieu fees instead of each
6 property having to build a giant garage that then you hope could be someday unbundled, that
7 we pool our resources and make a better more liquid parking inventory. So again, not
8 groundbreaking; this is something that people realized 20 to 30 years ago, we just haven't done
9 it. But it is something that has been recognized as municipal best practice is to stop having
10 captive inventory.

11
12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I will because it sounds like this is a close one I will suggest that I
13 would support this Motion. I would I share Commissioner Rosenblum's view here and I would
14 support communicating this consideration to Council. I have one more light from
15 Commissioner Gardias, but I want to immediately take a vote after your comment.

16
17 Commissioner Gardias: So as much as attractive this Motion is to me because it meets some of
18 the items that I proposed I will not support it because of the simple reason that with the
19 current parking infrastructure I believe there is not much to share, that all the spaces are taken.
20 There may be of course there may be sharing of those spacing during the day, but besides of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 this it would I think that this program logistically would fail because this parking spaces are
2 designed per the demand of the current owner. In order to succeed the this program like this
3 or policy you'd need to increase the supply of the parking spaces and that for this reason I was
4 proposing that we fully that we build fully under parked garages under all the buildings and
5 then this would allow your program to succeed. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Monk did you ask me if you could make a comment? Did you
8 want to speak to your second? Is that what you're asking me?

9

10 Commissioner Monk: I'm just hearing mixed commentary from Commissioner Gardias in that he
11 was supporting it and then he's not. So if there's something that could be amended to this
12 proposal in order to garner your support I think looking forward and asking Council to consider
13 this concept of shared resources to support more liquidity in parking is something that we
14 should be doing. We should be asking for innovative solutions to the parking problems. So I
15 just wanted to see if there was any piece of it that changed your mind or that we could include
16 to get your support on it?

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Ok, well what I'd like I appreciate that there's an effort here to kind of build
19 consensus, but I want to be respectful of the time. I think this is likely going to happen in a
20 number of items that we deal with tonight because all of the items that we're going to be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 dealing with tonight have either received in this case four nominations to be discussed or less.
2 So to some extent everything we're going to discuss tonight will require some level of
3 coordination if it's going to if we're going to communicate it.

4
5 Well let me put it to the maker of this Motion since I think the sort of it's been indicated that
6 maybe there isn't enough support for this. Do you want to make a any changes to your Motion
7 in an effort to build consensus or should we move on?

8
9 Commissioner Rosenblum: No, but I'd like to speak to it and then put it to a vote.

10
11 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

12
13 Commissioner Rosenblum: And I'm happy again from a process standpoint if it gets voted down
14 so be it. Let's we have a lot of items let's move through. We'll say our peace. So speaking to
15 this Motion again it is a little stunning to me that Palo Alto really does practice worst practices
16 in parking. And again we we're Commissioners for Planning and Transportation. We should be
17 reading Shoup on parking. We should be reading the latest studies of what cities are doing
18 about parking. And this is this isn't groundbreaking. A number of people mentioned that 20
19 years ago we talked about various TDM measures and I'm sure 20 years ago they also talked
20 about the benefits of shared inventory versus captive inventory. I don't know why the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 decisions were made that were so I'm proposing is not particularly groundbreaking it's what
2 many well managed cities do that they express a preference. It's not a set, not a hard and fast
3 rule, just where possible. If you're building 100 spaces and you have a choice between paying
4 that money into in lieu fees that were used essentially to manage inventory verses captive
5 under your building that we prefer to fund citywide resources that can be used locally.

6

7 I also agree with Commissioner Gardias' viewpoint which I think is already captured in the
8 unbundling under a 5.1.4. So I think that your view is actually already in this plan. I'm saying
9 that we're expressing a preference for shared parking where possible and so currently we
10 express a preference I think for parking under each building or full when we say or the
11 understanding I think we say you have to fully park your building is that it is in your building.
12 And so I'm saying that as a City that that leads to some perverse incentives and some bad
13 outcomes and so we should be smarter than that. So my pitch is that we express that there's a
14 preference for this liquidity and that that would help when people are deciding on projects of
15 the future.

16

17 VOTE

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, at this time I'd like to take a vote on the Motion on the floor. All of those
2 Commissioners in favor of supporting the Motion please raise your hand and say I. We have
3 three. All those opposed? Four. Ok, alright that concludes Item Number 1.

4

5 MOTION #1 FAILED (3 (Alcheck, Monk, Rosenblum)-4(Gardias, Lauing, Summa, Waldfogel)

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Let's move on to Item Number 2. I have three nominations for this item. Would
8 anybody like to kick it off with a Motion that we can discuss with respect to this item? I have
9 Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel.

10

11 MOTION #2

12

13 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I'll just start with a simple Motion. That I'll move to continue using Level
14 of Service (LOS) to measure quality of life impacts from new development.

15

16 Hillary Gitelman, Planning Director: I'm sorry we couldn't quite hear you.

17

18 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I'm sorry, is the microphone on?

19

20 Ms. Gitelman: It is on.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, it is on. So move to continue using LOS to measure quality of life
3 impacts from new development.

4

5 SECOND

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a second from Commissioner Summa and I have lights from
8 Rosenblum, Summa, and Monk. Go ahead Commissioner Rosenblum.

9

10 Commissioner Rosenblum: So we've had this discussion before, but just to repeat for the record
11 I support reporting the second delay in LOS, but not using the grades. And the reason is and
12 again this is something that all of us get articles about what LOS has done to our cities. You get
13 a better grade when you wind the street and more cars get through. You get a worse grade if
14 you narrow the street and design it around pedestrians. And it is a natural human tendency to
15 want to get an A grade or a B grade. I think that the damage that LOS has done to our cities is
16 enormous. So the best example that I can give is the Embarcadero in San Francisco. When they
17 made the decision not to rebuild the highway in front of the water every street got an F around
18 there, I'm sure of it. They took a high throughput highway and replaced it by saying nope, all
19 these it's going to be very hard to drive through San Francisco, but it was 100 percent the right
20 decision. And so to me grading ourselves on the throughput of cars often leads to bad

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 outcomes. I am still in support of reporting that information if it's going to cause delays, but
2 not grading it in A through F scale which I think leads to pervert results.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Rosenblum. Commissioner Summa.

5

6 Commissioner Summa: I was just going to speak to my second. There were numerous
7 conversations about this throughout the CAC process and at City Council and it was really the
8 preference for most people to retain it. And I think it's a simple one and we should just retain it
9 and I know the Council wants to.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Monk.

12

13 Commissioner Monk: So the issue that I take with the Motion is that it seems to not support
14 what's written in the Comp Plan on Pages T-33 in this area. So if the maker of the Motion is just
15 looking to advocate what's already there that's fine, but the Motion doesn't take into
16 consideration the fact that California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) is already requiring
17 movement towards Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT). So I would just want to acknowledge that
18 there is a transition period that we're going through and that LOS should be sunsetted in once
19 the staff is more familiar with implementing that new metric. So I guess I'm asking for
20 clarification if you're changing what's already in there, Vice-Chair.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel would you like to respond?

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Policy T-2.3, I'm sorry it's refers to LOS. I think that this, I'm sorry, let me just cross reference this... T... yeah, T-2.3 refers to motor vehicle LOS of signalized intersections. I think that the intent of this discussion was whether to retain LOS per T-2.3 or not. The Motion is just to retain the language as it's expressed here and to not remove LOS as a metric.

Commissioner Monk: Then in that case would you consider making the Motion to not advance this to Council instead.

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I'm sorry, what's the question?

Commissioner Monk: Maybe your Motion should just be to not advance this agenda item to Council because it would be (interrupted)

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Well, I think we should just go through the process. If you want to make a Motion to lay it on the table you can do so and if you get a second and the votes then we can do that.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll chime in here since there are no other lights. So I was and there's only
2 three, but I was one of the individuals who nominated this item and the reason why is because I
3 found this discussion interesting that the that CEQA is making process to is making progress
4 eliminating LOS and that the CAC and Council expressed some support for retaining both
5 measures. And then there was this discussion that we had last time about potentially
6 encouraging the use of LOS, but with caveats.

7

8 I think my position here is that is well, let me start by saying I find it very persuasive what
9 Commissioner Rosenblum is saying. If we use a metric that encourages a result that can be
10 problematic or potentially lead to results that are not appealing then maybe we shouldn't be
11 using that metric in a vacuum. And so when I nominated this item for discussion my hope
12 would was that there would be a Motion that would encourage the City Council to look into
13 placing more weight into the VMT measure so as to avoid some of the costs or some of the
14 drawbacks of the LOS measure. That's I stand behind that position so I wouldn't support this
15 Motion from the from that premise because I don't think we're communicating to Council that
16 sort of higher or more broad goal of encouraging potentially adopting a broader perspective
17 when evaluating intersections. So if this Motion does fail then I would support a Motion
18 Commissioner Monk if you make it that encourages adoption or anybody, adoption or
19 encourages Council to consider both metrics in light of the potential drawbacks of LOS. Ok, I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 have a light coming from Commissioner Summa and no other and a light from Commissioner
2 Monk.

3

4 Commissioner Summa: So I think it's unnecessary to ask Council to give Council advice that they
5 also look at VMT because they're already doing that. So it just sounds kind of silly. I think the
6 Council have the benefit of hearing Commissioner Rosenblum's idea about the grade system.
7 Which I appreciate the comments, but I mean we it's not as if we close streets because they're
8 a grade E or F. We just rate them. It doesn't mean we hate that street or hate that intersection
9 and we don't want to use it. So I don't really see the harm exactly. So and so I think we should
10 go, I think it's very straightforward. I think we should just go ahead and vote.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok. If you intend to speak why don't you light up the board? My last two lights
13 are for Commissioner Monk and Commissioner Rosenblum and seeing no other takers we'll
14 take a vote. Go ahead Commissioner Monk and then Commissioner Rosenblum.

15

16 Commissioner Monk: So I just wanted to confirm we're voting on still advancing this to Council
17 to tell them to do what they've already told us to do on this issue?

18

19 Chair Alcheck: That is correct.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Monk: Ok, thank you.

2

3 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Rosenblum:

4

5 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, I wanted to address the no harm that Commissioner Summa
6 just mentioned. So the whole reason that CEQA is moving towards VMT is because LOS was
7 found to do harm. Specifically when we look at certain roads and they get they're downgraded
8 from a C to a D the natural thing to do is add a lane, add capacity. And that's what cities have
9 always done to try to get their grade up. Similarly if a project goes up and it's expected to add
10 traffic then the project either has to get downsized or they need to add a turning lane.
11 Sometimes appropriately, but sometimes inappropriately because again no one likes to go from
12 a D to an E or and E to an F. And it's a natural human inclination to start to widen the streets.
13 And so the studies around why move to VMT versus LOS do have to do with this harm that it
14 makes streets turn into big thoroughfares that we try to increase throughput and so that to me
15 is the harm. I'm not against showing the data, but I think that the grades are inflammatory in a
16 community where we're grade obsessed. Again, from process standpoint happy to have the
17 votes, happy to... not happy, but I'm willing to be voted down. But this is again it flies in the
18 face of what kind of modern planning systems are trying to accomplish to make people
19 centered versus traffic centered cities. And so this is a move back towards, not back towards
20 it's to retain kind of the traffic centric city design model.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

VOTE

Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Rosenblum. At this time we'll take a vote on the Motion. Does anybody need clarity on what you're voting for? Ok, alright. All those in favor of supporting the Motion on the floor please raise your hand. I have three. All those opposed to supporting the Motion on the floor? Four.

MOTION #2 FAILED (3 (Lauing, Summa, Waldfogel)-4, (Alcheck, Gardias, Monk, Rosenblum)

Chair Alcheck: Ok, before we move on does anybody want to make a different Motion?

Commissioner Rosenblum: I would make a Substitution Motion or a new Motion.

Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Rosenblum.

MOTION #3

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: So the new Motion is what's stated that we Council consider both
2 LOS and VMT, but LOS in Palo Alto is now reported without letter grades only seconds delayed.
3 So LOS information is captured, but that we get rid of the arbitrary letter grade distinctions.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok, can I get a second of this Motion?

6

7 SECOND

8

9 Commissioner Monk: I'll second the Motion.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Monk seconds. Considering that we've sort of discussed this topic
12 unless anybody feels the need to speak? Ok, I'll have Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]**
13 Waldfogel then we'll take a vote.

14

15 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great, thank you. The problem with this is that VMT and LOS are
16 measuring different things. VMT is measuring some regional attributes. It's a proxy for
17 greenhouse gases although electrification is actually the principal way of greenhouse gas
18 reduction that the State policy has adopted. LOS is measuring local user experience so the
19 letter grades do mean something because what they report is the user experience of our
20 residents moving through our streets. So I think that it's a little disingenuous to say that LOS

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 causes harms. There are situations where it causes harms; those are not the situations that we
2 have in Palo Alto.

3

4 VOTE

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Does anybody need clarity on the Motion? Ok then all those in favor of
7 supporting the Motion on the floor please raise your hand. I have three in favor. All those
8 opposed? You have four opposed. Ok, this item is not going to be communicated to City
9 Council.

10

11 MOTION #3 FAILED (3 Alcheck, Monk, Rosenblum)-4(Gardias, Lauing, Summa, Waldfoegel)

12

13 MOTION #4

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Let's move on to our next item. We have Items 3, 4, and 5 next. I do feel like
16 these are pretty straightforward so I'm going to attempt to get through them quickly and then
17 we will break for a moment to eat. And I'll do the public comments right before we break and
18 then we'll eat and then return.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ok, Item Number 3 it's I'm going to just read this one out loud because I think it's in Motion
2 form, but if anybody would like to adjust it I'll let I'll entertain that. It says include stronger
3 emphasis on taking on the responsibility for dramatically increasing housing supply in Palo Alto
4 both Below Market Rate (BMR) housing and housing that is affordable including housing for the
5 middle class. So I will for the purposes of this discussion make a Motion that we recommend
6 that Council consider this language in their review. Is there a second?

7

8 SECOND

9

10 Commissioner Rosenblum: Second.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a second from Commissioner Rosenblum. Would anybody like to
13 speak on this item before we take a vote? I have Commissioner Summa and then
14 Commissioner Lauing.

15

16 Commissioner Summa: So what is dramatically increase housing supply mean in the context of
17 this being a Motion to direct growth?

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so I'll answer your question by suggesting that we have a tool, our Housing
20 Element, which encourages us to identify sites and for housing. And one and we often when

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 we have to update our Housing Element there is a process that the City goes through. It's a
2 painful process where there seems to be this energy that is concerned about ugh, how are you
3 going to incorporate this? And then the City says, well we're not act we don't actually have to
4 do it we just have to identify the sites that are that would be potentially available and then
5 developers could move forward on those private sites and encourage and bring potential for
6 development. We're not suggesting that over the next time period of this Housing Element for
7 example that all of these 22,000 sites are going to... residential units are going to get built.

8

9 So what I would suggest is that if you take a look for example at the number of housing units
10 that we've developed in the last year or two years or three years or four years I would suggest
11 that number is very low. Very, very low and what I would suggest is that our Comp Plan adopt
12 that when City Council is reviewing our Comp Plan they include language that would encourage
13 the us to consider development of housing units at all sort of at all levels of review. So for
14 example we had a project on Lytton. I think it was the Survey Monkey building and when it first
15 came forward I believe it had housing. And I can't remember if it was a Planned Community
16 (PC) or if it was a tradeoff. I wasn't even on this Commission at the time, but I remember that
17 in the in conclusion somehow the housing got lost. Somehow they were going to incur they
18 were going to have some units up there and then the tradeoff or there was a issue and for
19 whatever reason we eliminated those units. And what I would hope is that if our Comp Plan
20 said to dramatically increase housing that we believe we have a responsibility to dramatically

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 increase housing so we wouldn't let an opportunity like that go. That any time a developer
2 came before us with a housing site we would encourage him to develop more units not less.
3 And so that's sort of the premise here. I think it that this definitely is in the hands of the
4 Council and it's sort of global idea, but it's about the nuance of are we making room for housing
5 or are we really welcoming it?

6
7 Commissioner Summa: So my problems lie still in the fact that this would we are not
8 contemplating the Housing Element because it was required, it is required element on a regular
9 schedule and it has already been submitted and this would be a comment for the Housing
10 Element. And regional agencies provide us the numbers they think we need for those and then
11 we identify the sites. So I don't know what the purpose of this is and I also think there is a
12 blurring of what affordable housing is in this community and maybe regionally affordable
13 housing traditionally has been subsidized housing of all levels and now we're using it to mean
14 smaller units that are very expensive market rate units, but they cost a little less because
15 they're smaller. So I think this has I don't think this even has any business in this discussion
16 since we're not discussing the Housing Element.

17
18 So and I believe the housing loss on the top of the Survey Monkey building was because the
19 there was a last minute change and the developer really wanted more office. And we have also
20 addressed that problem by changing the number of units in a mixed-use building that requires

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 review so by the by these bodies. So I just don't think this... I don't know where it would belong
2 except in the Housing Element and I think it's confusing and I don't think dramatically is a word
3 that when we look over the years of the life of this Comp Plan it will mean much.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Commissioner Summa. I'm going to go down the order,
6 Commissioner Lauing followed by Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]** Waldfogel.

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, thanks. Commissioner Summa's comments were very helpful
9 terms of quantifying the source of the numbers and so on. In addition I just want to underscore
10 that there's no question on the part of the Council that there is a strong commitment to
11 building more housing than we have in this City. It's very strong. And secondly I think that
12 some of the wording that's already in the plan which talks about and we're going to get to some
13 of those tonight more BMR, more diversity of housing, last time we talked about family
14 housing, we've talked about small units. So I think the commitment is there and that the
15 wording is essentially there relative to the points in these elements of the Comp Plan. So I'm
16 concerned that this one is just a little bit redundant and I don't see it tied to any policy so it's
17 unclear to me as Commissioner Summa said exactly where it would fit. So I just don't think it's
18 necessary. Thanks.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]** Waldfogel.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, thank you. I appreciate everyone's comments on this. So a couple
3 things; I agree with Commissioner Lauing. I think Policy L-2.4, use a variety of strategies to
4 stimulate housing covers some of this. What I would support in this is language to prioritize
5 housing over other uses in mixed-use districts. I think it achieves some of the same goals, but
6 and I think it's also much clearer if it's a matter of prioritization. I agree with I think it was
7 Commissioner Summa's comment. It's not really clear what dramatically increased means. I
8 think we've added what 10,000 housing units in the last decade or 15 years. I don't know the
9 exact number. So we have been developing housing, but I would support prioritization rather
10 than the words dramatically, what are the words here? Dramatically increased. So I'll ask is
11 that a substitute that the let's see, who moved this one? I think it was...

12

13 Chair Alcheck: I moved it. What, I will... why don't we do this? I have three more lights let's... I
14 will, let me let those three speakers speak and then I'll (interrupted)

15

16 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Ok.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: I can respond to that comment, ok?

19

20 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Fair enough.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Alcheck: Do you have anything else to add?

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: No, I do not.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Rosenblum then Commissioner Gardias.

Commissioner Rosenblum: So I do understand the intent of this and I do want to link this to several comments that the that our community speakers made earlier that I think was talking about the intent of this plan so tying it to a higher purpose. What are we trying to do? What kind of city are we trying to become? In the in our Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) from 2007 to 2014 we achieved 38 percent of our goal. In Santa Clara County we were the second worst. Saratoga was the worst. Other cities around us many of them did not achieve their goal, but no one was as bad as Palo Alto. We achieved 23 percent of our low/very low income, 2 percent of our low income housing goal, 20 percent of our moderate, and 80 percent of our above moderate. So on our BMR or for truly low income housing what was traditionally defined as affordable housing and I agree with Commissioner Summa, there's two different things that we're talking about here, we have been abysmal. For our market rate housing we also have not hit the mark. So even for housing for people of greater means we've also not hit our mark.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

So we're trying regional planning to put housing where jobs are. We have a lot of jobs. We haven't built the housing. Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel for your information the number of units that or permits issued between 2007 and 2014 is 1,080 tracked by RHNA not 10,000. So it's I think that we've fallen short and so a statement in our Comp Plan to say we don't intend to fall short if we really don't, if we really do intend to try to meet our Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG)/RHNA commitments then I think that we should be making a statement. I don't know how the language should go. I do agree with Vice-Chair Waldfogel that perhaps just expressing a strong preference for housing for developments may be what we want to do, but I also think that as a statement we should be trying to actually achieve what we set out to do. And in the past achieving 38 percent is unacceptable and achieving 2 percent and 20 percent of our low income and very low income housing I think is also some really unacceptable. So I don't know where that statement goes though. I just think if this is a statement around what kind of community are we trying to build it should probably be there.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Rosenblum. I have Commissioner Gardias followed by Commissioner Monk.

Commissioner Gardias: So there are two statements in this verbiage and I think that this was really unfortunate that they were separated. I believe that the intention although it was not

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 mine of this comment was to prioritize the BMR housing not to talk about it dramatically which
2 means pretty much nothing and some other items that were not related. So I'd like to propose
3 to change the verbiage of the statement to prioritize below market housing BMR housing.

4
5 Chair Alcheck: Well let me do this I'll... I have, we have two sort of suggestions on changing
6 language. Let me at least hit the lights that were up when I made when we had the last
7 comment and then we can respond to all changes that may be suggested. Do you have any
8 other comments? Ok, I have Commissioner Monk followed by Commissioner Summa.

9
10 Commissioner Monk: Just a warning here that I might end up on a soapbox. Before a do I
11 wanted to explore the language that Vice-Chair Waldfogel would suggest in lieu of the word
12 dramatically.

13
14 Chair Alcheck: I well, why don't you answer? I think he said according to preference, but why
15 don't you... why don't you take an opportunity (interrupted)

16
17 Commissioner Monk: If you have a good word then I won't get up on my soapbox.

18
19 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: My prefer, my desire is to have a policy that expresses we prioritize
20 housing over other uses in mixed-use districts.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Monk: And your position on the including housing for middle class all of that, that would remain or no?

Vice-Chair Waldfoegel: I have a well, relative to Commissioner Rosenblum's comments and I appreciate the numbers. I think the total number I think the 10,000 number is total number of units built, but that may not be net new. The 1,080 may be net new. The what I'm struggling over a little bit is the conflict between my actual desires and what the market will deliver for us. Given the performance on BMR housing very low income we haven't done a great job in that. I think that there are market reasons for that, question is what can we do if we were to prioritize BMR what could we do to actually increase the production of BMR relative to other categories?

Commissioner Monk: Ok so my view of comment number three was something that I would think would have garnered unanimous support here so I'm actually really surprised to hear that there's going to be discussion on this issue. We are facing a state housing crisis here in California as declared by the governor and enacted much legislation around this issue. So this is a very important issue. I do not disagree with what Commissioner Summa said. The problem that I have with our current Comp Plan is that I do not believe that it goes far enough to address this true housing crisis.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 I might be speculating here, but I believe everyone here on the Commission might own a home.
2 I'm a renter here. My rent goes up every year. I pay close to \$5,300 a month for a tiny two
3 bedroom home and it just went up, it's going up next month. That's what happens every year
4 here. So and with all due respect to Commissioner Summa I believe her seat was vacated
5 because the prior Commissioner who and her husband who are both professionals and who in
6 my opinion probably were what might be considered middle class. I don't even know. I'm
7 guessing a lawyer and a software engineer combined income is \$400,000. I have no idea, but to
8 me for folks like that that-- can't afford to live in Palo Alto, can't even afford to get a basic
9 starter home or whatever was the allegations, this is truly a crisis here.

10

11 We have to look at what the middle class means and we do need to address this issue in some
12 capacity. Whether or not we can do that tonight I agree that the market is going to dictate and
13 there will be a lot of problems with it, but if we don't do something aggressive in this existing
14 plan then we're not going to have a problem with school enrollment because you're not going
15 to have young professionals moving here. You're not going to have young families here. So I
16 really would like to encourage this Commission to reevaluate their position on this in pushing
17 our Council to consider a more aggressive stance on building housing units for the middle class
18 whatever that is defined as, as well as BMR.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Monk. Commissioner Summa.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Summa: Yeah I think maybe staff could give an opinion on this, but if you look at
3 Goal L-2 nearly every program and policy under that goal at least 10 are about prioritizing
4 mixed-use residential over commercial and mixed-use, providing a wide range, smaller units. I
5 just think it's redundant actually. And changing it from prioritizing subsidized housing BMR is
6 fine with me. I just don't think we need it and it's that's a very different statement than the one
7 that we first came out with. So I think you should all look at I mean what does staff think? I
8 think Goal L-2 is all about providing diversity, smaller units, prioritizing BMR... it's...

9

10 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah, I think... Hillary Gitelman, the Director. I think Commissioner Summa right.
11 Goal 2 has a lot in it about encouraging the supply of housing, but I would also encourage you
12 to think that this is your report to the Council. If you want to reiterate the Commission's
13 position that the plan should have this emphasis on both housing for the middle class and
14 affordable housing I don't think it's a problem necessarily in this context to be redundant.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. Alright, I'll chime in here. I appreciate some of the suggestions
17 that my fellow Commissioners have made. Let me sort of think out loud for a minute. I think
18 Commissioner Lauing is looking for a little bit more specificity and as usual I think Commissioner
19 Rosenblum articulated this perspective that I share very well. If there is one thing out of these
20 90 days that I could communicate to the City Council it wouldn't be that if there was one thing

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 it wouldn't be that I'm concerned about the amount of office development that's possible
2 under this plan. That would not be my one comment. My one comment would be it should be
3 unacceptable to us that we are in the bottom half of Santa Clara cities when it comes to
4 meeting our RHNA requirement. And I think from a land use perspective we should be
5 evaluating every opportunity to increase our housing supply particularly for those individuals
6 who are unlike us with the exception of maybe... unlike us homeowners.

7

8 So we have a dramatic problem and if we don't want to dramatically address it because that
9 word is too vague then maybe and I would let my seconder sort of address this because frankly
10 he does such a good job, but maybe that's what we should say. Maybe we should say Council,
11 after reviewing this document on this item we would encourage you to take a very strong
12 position regarding the goal of being a land use leader in Santa Clara County with respect to the
13 development of BMR units and low income and very low income units. And maybe that is the
14 better tactic here. I don't know, but what I'm essentially trying to convey to them is that and
15 this came up in a lot of places for example, Town & Country. Town & Country currently doesn't
16 have a designation for residential. Town & Country is a great shopping center, don't get me
17 wrong. One day it might get redeveloped. Maybe it'll be mixed-use. To me that could be in
18 the next 30 years, I don't know. And if it does why wouldn't we accommodate residential units
19 there?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 So in this, so that's a separate issue, but my idea is that if we have a global policy, if we have a
2 global vision statement that suggests that we want to achieve a leadership status in addressing
3 a crisis that I think all of us are aware of I think this is our opportunity to tell Council like don't
4 miss this opportunity. Don't miss the opportunity to add it to our Land Use Element a
5 statement that bold and visionary and hard, hard for us to achieve, but important. I think it's a
6 matter of it's a moral imperative to be perfectly honest is how I feel about it. So that's where
7 I'm at. I'm open to language suggestions. I would defer to Commissioner Rosenblum to see if
8 he has any and then I have lights. Go ahead.

9

10 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1

11

12 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah just to suggest language as the seconder maybe to make it
13 more specific this whole area is within the general it's I viewed this Chair as part of the
14 introduction to this whole section. And so it would be a statement saying Palo Alto intends to
15 meet our ABAG/RHNA commitment for the over the course of this plan and will implement
16 policies and zoning in accordance with that desire. So it would essentially say we do intend to
17 meet this. In the past we failed. This time we're serious. It all these things are statements of
18 vision. And again Council Member Schmid implored us to think about what does this all mean?
19 What is the kind of statement we're trying to make versus the line by line editing?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 And I think this is the statement that at least I would like to make is that we do intend to meet
2 our regional commitments. We want to fulfill the intention of locating housing near jobs. We
3 are a mid-size job center, but we don't allow much housing construction so we want that to
4 change. So to say the specific language it would be in an upfront section Palo Alto intends to
5 meet our commitment through ABAG over the course of this plan and will favor zoning and
6 policy to meet that commitment.

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: Of the Land Use section? Up front of the Land Use section?

9

10 Commissioner Rosenblum: Correct.

11

12 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 ACCEPTED

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Commissioner Rosenblum. I accept that language change and
15 procedurally we can amend the we can adjust the language of this Motion to more to reflect
16 that language. Ok so I'm going to go down the list of lights. I have Commissioner Gardias,
17 Waldfogel, Monk, then Summa.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: So we supported... yes, thank you. So we supported family housing the
20 other day and we agreed on this. I think this is the second piece of the puzzle and I be

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 supporting a prioritization of the BMR housing. I think that this is outstanding element and as
2 an example we can just recall recent discussion on the rental housing that was proposed for the
3 corner of El Camino and Oregon which in my mind it should be proposed as a BMR unit housing
4 and that's the example that we should be prioritizing in place like this specifically that this was
5 city owned land. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Commissioner Gardias; Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]** Waldfogel
8 and Monk then Summa.

9

10 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great, I think we're getting closer. I don't support language that binds us
11 to something that's outside of our jurisdiction. So I think that's fine if some if the language is
12 aspirational relative to goals that are set elsewhere. But I think the more important thing is
13 that the devil's in the details with this. I mean for example if there were conversation about
14 should we pivot the Stanford Research Park (SRP) into being a housing district, an opportunity
15 to build thousands of units, that would be one thing because then I'd have a vision of how we
16 intend to implement this kind of a policy. As it is I'm just scratching my head because what's
17 really prevented housing development have been economics. It's been that office development
18 has been more lucrative in most of the districts where it's possible to build higher density
19 housing and until we change that we won't see more production. So as I say I think we're
20 getting closer. I don't want to I don't want to definitively delegate a goal upward to another

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 agency, but I really think this is something we need to take up within some of the land use and
2 district definitions so we understand what we're talking about.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Monk, Summa, and then I'll speak again.

5

6 Commissioner Monk: I just want to mention that increasing housing supply doesn't always
7 mean building more. We have a lot of homes that are here that are sitting vacant that can be
8 looked at. So I just think encouraging Council to look at what's here, what can be done to
9 address this true crisis? I'm telling you it's a crisis. You've got professionals, surgeons having
10 families living in tiny little condos here in Palo Alto and it's just not sustainable. This community
11 will not continue to thrive in what you've all known and loved about Palo Alto if we don't
12 address this head on meaning that you will not have younger generations living here if we don't
13 do something about this.

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. Commissioner Summa.

16

17 Commissioner Summa: So I would agree with Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfoegel that
18 we don't want to delegate to a different agency. And those relationships and how the cities
19 respond to them are already formed so I think we are getting closer, but I would much prefer a
20 clear statement that we prioritize smaller units. If you guys want to emphasize this; it's already

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 in Goal L-2 and but if you want to make it really clear to the Council how we feel and what we
2 prioritize and most specifically BMR units because just saying build a lot of housing is not going
3 to address Commissioner Monk's concerns because it isn't going to reduce the cost of housing.
4 If you want to reduce the cost of housing outside of a general catastrophe which nobody wants
5 you have to build subsidized housing until something drastically changes in the market around
6 here. So I think what we should do is prioritize smaller units and subsidized housing.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok so I'll, I just want to respond real quick. I think there's I in my mind there's a
9 fundamental problem with why we don't have housing. We talk a lot about the idea of housing
10 Downtown, housing near transit. The reason why we're not seeing housing is not because it
11 wouldn't be supported in the marketplace. The reason why we don't see housing is because
12 under current zoning it can't be supported in the marketplace. And what do I mean by that?
13 It's no one's going to be... not many are going to like this comment, but our 50 foot height limit
14 is the only reason we have no housing development in Downtown. You can go and you can poll
15 developers all over the Bay Area; we had a conference call with one of them. She's an
16 affordable housing developer in Oakland and we went through almost every parcel in
17 Downtown as an exercise to demonstrate that she can't build housing unless she can build over
18 50,000 square feet (sq. ft.) of it to make it affordable. She can't finance an affordable housing
19 development unless she can put together 50,000 sq. ft. of housing and the only way to do that
20 is if you had a massive block, a massive number of parcels that were only 50 feet high.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 However, we don't have that sort of set up in Downtown Palo Alto. We have a lot of little
2 parcels and so the only solution would be to go up.

3

4 Now we're all familiar with the development on the corner of San Antonio and El Camino?
5 Certainly higher than 50 feet; it is across the street from our City. If you look at the Palo Alto
6 side of that street you will see nothing over 50 feet and you will never see anything over 50
7 feet. And I am not suggesting that that corner is where we should go over 50 feet, but what I
8 am suggesting is that if we say in our Land Use Element that we want to very seriously address
9 this housing issue then the how then this element, this Comp Plan will provide the vision
10 required for us to have a debate about how to do that.

11

12 If we don't we don't and just so we're clear here, I get it. We're getting closer to the topic, the
13 language isn't right, we don't want to commit ourselves to some number that comes from an
14 outside agency. I don't disagree with any of that to be perfectly honest. And we're not
15 authors. We've talked about this for 90 days now. We are not authoring this document; we're
16 making some recommendations to the City Council about how we feel about how it's been
17 authored. And my feeling about how it's been authored is that there is an opportunity here to
18 place a lot more emphasis on housing to make the debate that will ensue about the 50 foot
19 height limit, about the specific area plan for the North... what's the name of the site? It's the
20 Fry's site for this yeah, Ventura, the specific area plan for Downtown these are those

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 opportunities for us to say you know one time they built housing in Downtown that was over 50
2 stories. Some of us may know people that live in those buildings.

3

4 Anyways that opportunity is one I'd like encouraged by the plan. So I have two more lights. I'm
5 going to take a vote after we hear from those two lights. Rosenblum then Waldfogel; no,
6 excuse me, Rosenblum then Lauing.

7

8 Commissioner Rosenblum: Ok, so just real quickly on this the I like the language of preference
9 both for housing as suggested by Waldfogel and for BMR suggested by Gardias and Summa.
10 The only problem with that is that it doesn't have a preference for just volume. We want more
11 housing and often BMR is sometimes used I'm a huge proponent of investing more in BMR, but
12 they'll be a limit. And it's sometimes used as a weapon against housing more generally to say
13 but these units will be expensive. I looked online and it's \$2,500 for a studio. That's ridiculous,
14 you can't build housing. You have to build a lot more housing before it gets cheaper that's just
15 a fact. You can't just build one apartment compound and look at it. It certainly will be
16 expensive until you build a lot more. As we just saw we've only built a small portion of what at
17 least one economic planning agency believes that was empowered by our governor to look at
18 these things believe that we should be building.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 So I'm fairly flexible on language except that people were concerned this was too vague. I
2 pulled a number that is actually the number that we're supposed to be beholden to which is the
3 ABAG regional allocation. So that's trying to make it this feels like that's too specific or we don't
4 like the fact that it's outside agency, but it's certainly a number. I'm happy to listen to other
5 numbers. I object to just preference because then it doesn't address the issue of just we need
6 more. And so there are two issues and then the final thing I agree with Chair Alcheck that it's a
7 combine it's economics as determined by zoning. So Vice-Chair is correct that there's an
8 economic issue, but our economics are often considered by zoning so not just height though,
9 parking requirements, density, Floor Area Ratio (FAR) so there's a number of things that make
10 building in Palo Alto quite expensive. And so these realities have to do that's why I said that the
11 second part of this is that we intend to make the changes to zoning that would help us hit that
12 number. It's not just to say well, we can't do anything about it, Palo Alto is expensive. These
13 tools are in our control.

14

15 So at any rate this is an aspirational statement. I view this is trying to listen to some of the
16 speakers here and say what is our higher aspiration? And I would say our higher aspiration
17 should be that we do attempt to build the housing that allows us to do all the things that we
18 say in this plan: become a diverse city, an affordable city, etcetera.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have Commissioner Lauing and then Summa and then we'll take a vote.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, just briefly in that regard Commissioner Rosenblum is that I think there are some objections to taking something that's sort of implanted from outside. So what if we just use something simple like goals, I won't be able to get the exact wording here, but goals as determined by City Council every 5 years or every 10 years. Because they're going to be looking at the same data including ABAG, but that's at least a deliberative body that's going to because consider everything. And put that in there with the other language. I like the positioning where you're suggesting that it go as opposed to try to fit it into these because I also think that a lot of that is fit into these. And I would just make an obvious comment that last meeting we actually approved unanimously a very strong commitment to BMR housing. So again the tone and the commitment I feel is there. So if you would accept that sort of measurement because I agree it should be measured then we might be there.

Chair Alcheck: I would. Commissioner Rosenblum?

Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, sure.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have Commissioner Summa and then we'll take a vote.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Summa: So I just wanted to remind my colleagues that the 50 foot height limit is
2 not in the Comp Plan because the Council actually prefer to keep it in the municipal code. And
3 that is likely a conversation our community is going to be having again and again especially with
4 regards to actual pro-formas and that show that you cannot build certain kinds of subsidized
5 housing in small doses. So I just think that we're being... I think we're this conversation is
6 morphing into a more general idea of what kind of growth we want in Palo Alto and I'm not
7 sure that's what we meant to do from the beginning here. And as Commissioner Lauing points
8 out we already had a very strong statement about this sort of housing. So that's kind of where I
9 am.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you Commissioner Summa. At this time I'm going to take a vote. Does
12 anybody need me to get clarity on the Motion? Ok. Commissioner Rosenblum would you like
13 to try?

14

15 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, it I would like we're accepting Commissioner Lauing's
16 language. So I'd like him to give formal language.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: So you were ok with the preference language Commissioner Rosenblum
19 as long as it was measured?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: Has to be both preference and volume that there's a commitment to
2 increase the rate of housing construction and with preference to housing in general. So those
3 are two issues. One is (interrupted)

4

5 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, they are.

6

7 Commissioner Rosenblum: If you have a choice between office/commercial or residential that
8 prefer residential. That's a separate issue from we do intend to increase our rate of housing
9 construction. The word dramatically was opposed by people. I suggested a number which
10 we're getting from outside agency. That seems to be overly specific or directional or what it is.
11 I would I support preference. I also support increase of volume.

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Right, but given that Council and the City is committed to more volume
14 that's going to be there, we just don't know the numbers because they have to opine on that.
15 And I do think that's a better measurement than ABAG or an external resource.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: How, would you be supportive of encouraging (interrupted)

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: I'm just trying to get the language right how.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Right. Would you be supportive of encouraging City Council to adopt language
2 into the Land Use Element that would significantly favor increases in residential housing
3 development and volume?
4

5 Commissioner Lauing: I like the original thing of prioritize housing development and give it
6 preference. If we've got the numbers that are set by Council it's going to go up.
7

8 Ms. Gitelman: Can I make a suggestion?
9

10 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, go ahead.
11

12 Ms. Gitelman: I mean it sounds like there are two things here preference and some kind of
13 measurable of something related to volume. So if you could it sounds like you're saying that
14 your direction or your recommendation to Council would be to include a strong preference for
15 BMR housing and a commitment to increasing the housing supply over time consistent with
16 goals established by the City Council in the Housing Element.
17

18 Chair Alcheck: Let me ask you another question.
19

20 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, that's good.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Would you be in favor of language that suggested that we want Council to adopt language encouraging Palo Alto to be a leader in the County of Santa Clara as opposed to being in second to last place?

Commissioner Lauing: No because that puts more undefined language in here. So I really think that we need to have measurements all throughout this.

Chair Alcheck: Ok.

Commissioner Lauing: And have a quantitative measurement by what Council decides and then measure that and make sure we meet it and be committed to that because that's where we've fallen short.

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Director Gitelman can you repeat what you said because I was that where the Motion is going?

Commissioner Lauing: What she said, yeah.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: It's entirely up to you, but I think what I heard is that you would recommend that
2 the Council indicate a strong preference for and this is the question for you was it BMR housing
3 or BMR and middle class housing and a commitment to increasing the supply of housing
4 consistent with goals set by the City Council in the Housing Element. Something like that.

5

6 Commissioner Lauing: Yep, good.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Yeah, we're comfortable with that. So does everybody does anybody need
9 any more clarity on the Motion on the floor as stated?

10

11 Ms. Gitelman: And is it middle class and BMR?

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: It's not just BMR. We're not talking about just BMR.

14

15 Chair Alcheck: No. The original language was not just BMR.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: I don't think it has to have any modifiers BMR or middle class.

18

19 Ms. Gitelman: Ok, we don't have to specify. Ok.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: Right.

2

3 Chair Alcheck: No, not subsidized.

4

5 Commissioner Lauing: Just more housing.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: No, there were modifiers. Affordable, housing that's affordable and BMR was
8 sort of the original intent, was the idea.

9

10 Commissioner Lauing: Ok.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: We're not just encouraging luxury condos. The idea is that if we really want to
13 encourage BMR housing then Council really needs, the City needs to really take seriously the
14 idea of creating opportunities for larger developments because as Commissioner Summa
15 acknowledged and other people have stated it's not going to happen in small little projects.
16 Small little projects are expensive condos.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: So the modifiers stay in. That's fine.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Yeah that's I would hope that the modifier would stay in. I don't know that
2 middle class (interrupted)

3

4 Commissioner Rosenblum: I think the modifier that was here is affordable housing and housing
5 that is affordable.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Yeah.

8

9 Commissioner Rosenblum: So that is the language trick there is referring to what Commissioner
10 Summa said which is expanding the definition. It's not just subsidized for BMR that you're also
11 going for diversity of housing. That is redundant with much of the language that's already in
12 here. The thing that I want to get across is similar actually to several people talked about we've
13 had TDM measures forever, but they don't seem to be working. Well we've had housing
14 commitments forever, but we don't build it. And so are we actually going to say we do actually
15 intend to build more housing? And so when we get to the TDM or other TDM language people
16 may want to put in more enforcement as several commentators brought up. I'm sure they
17 would not be satisfied with the answer well, we say we want TDM. Similarly we always say we
18 want housing so I think that the intent of this is to say this time we're serious, we really do
19 intend to build more housing in line with the Housing Element. So the language the modifier
20 was affordable housing and housing that is affordable.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Ok. That's where we're at. Yeah, why don't you read it one more time?

Ms. Gitelman: Ok.

Chair Alcheck: Just for clarity's sake I'm accepting this language and our seconder is accepting this language and I intend to call it for a vote immediately after our Director reads the language.

Ms. Gitelman: So the recommendation to Council is that the Comp Plan include a strong preference for affordable housing and housing that is affordable and a commitment to producing additional housing or housing production consistent with goals set by the Council periodically through the Housing Element process.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'm prepared to make, to call for a vote so (interrupted)

Commissioner Gardias: Just with the whole respect, but I just need clarity, right? Because it's not clear to me is the second part of the Motion related to the BMR housing as well? Because it read to me as pretty much it was just addressing again the global issue of the housing shortage.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: You're right, there are two parts. The first is a preference for affordable housing
2 and housing that is affordable and the second is a commitment to housing production
3 consistent with the goals set by the City Council through the Housing Element process. Those
4 goals could be about BMR, could be about all housing, but it's a commitment to meeting to
5 setting and meeting goals for housing production.

6

7 VOTE

8

9 Chair Alcheck: I'll just add really quickly again I don't consider us to be authors of this
10 document. I think what we're really trying to do is convey a message and I don't I really don't
11 think it's easy when we have seven sort of diverse perspectives to communicate a message to
12 Council and I think we're going to see that as we go through the remainder of the number
13 threes which mean less than the majority of people found this a compelling issue. So the
14 question is: is it's not whether this is perfectly articulated the way you would like to see it read
15 in the Comp Plan, the question is is the message, can you support the message that the
16 Commission is recommending Council hear? I don't know if that helps, but that's how I'm
17 voting tonight and I would encourage all of you to look at these Motions as recommendations
18 of consideration as opposed to authoring changes in the document itself.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ok, with that I'd like to call for a vote. All those in favor of the Motion on the floor please raise
2 your hand. Ok, we have five in favor. All those opposed? We have one opposed and
3 abstentions? I have one abstention. Ok, would you like to speak to your opposition
4 Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]** Waldfogel?

5

6 MOTION #4 PASSED (5 (Alcheck, Lauing, Monk, Summa)-1 (Vice-Chair Waldfogel) opposed, 1
7 (Gardias) abstained)

8

9 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yes, I would have supported, I'm sorry, let's turn the light on. I would
10 support this with the language of BMR and middle class housing, but we don't have a shortage
11 of housing that's affordable. Every house that goes on the market in this city sells, 100 percent
12 of them sell. They typically sell in about 10 days. So we don't have a shortage of housing that's
13 affordable, but we do have a shortage of middle class housing. So I would like to be clear that
14 that's where our problem is.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. Alright at this time what I do is I'm going to adjourn the meeting
17 for a short break so that the Commissioners can eat since we started this meeting early. There
18 are some speaker cards that are related to this item and we held the public comment open
19 when we started this meeting so that individuals can comment later in the evening. I think
20 there was a specific request for us there was one individual who wanted to show up that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 couldn't come and he's here. So when we return in 20 minutes what we will do is begin with
2 the public comment and then move straight into Item Number 4. Thank you.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: You don't want to do the speakers first? They're sitting here patiently.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Well let me ask you this, did... I'll poll you all really quickly. Do you intend to
7 continue to remain here for the remainder of our conversation on the items that follow or are
8 you interested in making your comments and leaving? If anybody is interested in making their
9 comments and leaving I would encourage you to come up and speak. I have four which could
10 be 20 minutes. So I would encourage you if you were planning on staying anyways for a little
11 longer that you wait till we return, but if you have to leave I would invite you up now to speak.
12 Anybody? Go ahead. This is Greer Stone? You have five minutes.

13

14 Greer Stone: [All off mic - Good evening members of the Palo Alto PTC. My name is Greer
15 Stone and unintelligible about speaking to you tonight in my individual capacity as a Palo Alto
16 resident that my views don't represent that as my capacity as a Commissioner with the County
17 of Santa Clara or as a member of the Midtown Residents Association. First want to thank you
18 for your many long hours of dedicated] (interrupted)

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, I'm sorry. I'm sorry to interrupt you. I think actually we're having a
2 problem with that microphone tonight and I forgot when I first invited you up to remind you
3 that we need you to speak at the first chair.

4

5 Mr. Stone: Got you. Not a problem. [off mic - Well I will since that's mere introduction I won't
6 repeat myself].

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Go ahead.

9

10 Mr. Stone: So I want to thank you for the many long hours you've dedicated to this critical
11 document. I know working on a Commission is difficult. Oftentimes it's thankless work, but we
12 all know that the work that you do that we all do is so critical to the prosperity of this City. I
13 want to just one of the key issues I believe is most critical in the draft and urge this Commission
14 and City Council to continue to work on language that will provide for smart, measured, and
15 strategic growth and mere platitudes which occur all too often especially around the term
16 growth.

17

18 One of the main, the greatest concerns that I have is the vague and ill-defined aspirations for
19 BMR housing and affordable housing. I'm really glad to hear that have been talked about so
20 much tonight. As the former chair of the Palo Alto Human Relations Commission (HRC) I've

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 heard countless times, time and time again, heartbreaking stories from residents of Palo Alto
2 who are struggling every single month to be able to pay rent, to be able to live here just so that
3 their children can go to some of the most world class schools that we do have. I'm a renter just
4 like you Commissioner Monk. I understand the struggles, Lord knows I wish my rent was lower,
5 but I recognize the sacrifice that my wife and I make to pay that high price rent to be able to
6 have the privilege to live in such an incredible city.

7

8 Just today Palo Alto Online posted a disturbing story of chronic homelessness amongst youth
9 and it has become a true epidemic in Santa Clara County. I believe today that you have the
10 opportunity and I would argue the duty to take leadership on this issue. I strongly believe it is a
11 farce to be able to say that we can increase the supply of housing to the point where we can
12 actually meet the demand to live in the most desire, one of the most desirable cities on this
13 planet. There is no proven model for a city like ours to show that we can increase that supply
14 to meet that demand. And I believe that if we were to increase the supply to meet that
15 insatiable demand then we will have truly have turned Palo Alto from a place that we do not
16 recognize. The amount of housing, the amount of new housing would be astronomical clogging
17 our streets, overrunning our schools. Palo Alto would cease to be the suburban town that we
18 all know, that we all love.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 I believe that we need to instead make a focused and measured housing policy to increase our
2 supply of BMR units, affordable housing alternative for renters and owners alike, make an
3 asserted effort to help those who we can actually help; people of low income backgrounds,
4 service workers of this community, teachers, police officers, firefighters, the people who are
5 giving so much to our community and yet have to commute sometimes two/three hours to get
6 here to serve us. Let us instead why I think our asserted effort should look into creating a blue
7 ribbon committee possibly composed of three to five housing affordability experts who could
8 be tasked with tangible affordable housing goals, scheduled completion dates, and have them
9 consult with market experts, policy gurus, neighborhood leaders to make affordable housing for
10 those who are truly low income a reality not merely a pipe dream.

11

12 Finally let us not repeat the mistakes of our past that continue to haunt us today. This
13 document appears too focused on job creation and less focused on families, communities,
14 neighborhoods, the things that truly make Palo Alto great. The jobs imbalance over the past
15 decade is one of the key catalysts to today's housing crisis. Let's not repeat it. Let's focus on
16 housing affordability, retail preservation, expanding parks, promoting policies that are focused
17 truly on families first rather than just money. Thank you so much for your time.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. At this time we're going to take a little break to eat some dinner
20 and then we will return in 20 minutes thank you.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

[The Commission took a break]

Chair Alcheck: Call our meeting back to order. Thank you for your patience, it's really appreciated and I thank you to the Commissioners for eating quickly. I have three speaker cards. I am going to invite Suzanne Keehn followed by Rita Vrhil and then Robert Moss. You each will have five minutes. Oh, I'm so sorry. Here it is, Hamilton Hitchings. Thank you.

Suzanne Keehn: So good evening. I certainly agree with what Greer Stone said about housing. It seems to me with the way you want to increase business building that there's no way that we as a City would ever catch up with our housing imbalance. It doesn't make sense. I think we need a moratorium on building more businesses for business and really focus on the housing. And as far as going above 50 making it them taller well if we want to live in San Francisco let's move to San Francisco otherwise you're creating a mini San Francisco.

I think you have to look at the overall picture of what everything when you make one decision how it affects everything else the environment, water, schools, parks, etcetera and I don't believe that this from what I've read this Comp Plan does that. Everything affects everything and it might be wise to look at before you decide on any building to see what you can figure out with traffic and with transportation because just saying oh well, we're going to take care that,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 everybody's going to ride their bike or the train or whatever just doesn't make it. I think that to
2 really understand what's going on those things have to be taken into account of and with
3 before so that's what I feel and I think the only way you're going to go make more housing is to
4 get more and more density. A lot of us do not want to live that way and it's not that I guess I
5 also feel that everybody cannot live in one spot. It would be nice and I feel that about the
6 whole Bay Area; I'd like to see some of these businesses go to other states like Michigan or
7 wherever that needs more jobs and they could do that. I know that some businesses have done
8 that rather than having and the only way that Amazon and Google and Facebook are getting
9 their housing is there through gentrification. And I would like to recommend a book called *How*
10 *to Kill a City* it very much explains how government and business causes a lot of these
11 problems. So I really recommend that book and that's what I have to say.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. Yes. No, I'm sorry we need you to come sit at that first chair and
14 speak into that microphone. Would you say your name before you start too?

15

16 Rita Vrhali: So I'm Rita Vrhali. It's interesting listening to the conversation because I think you're
17 debate basically reflects what's going on in this City. There are a group that want to densify the
18 City and another group that would really want to leave it the way it is with modest growth that
19 will retain the special character of Palo Alto. I'm definitely in the second group. I think that
20 with the Comp Plan the way the City Council altered it where the allowed office space growth

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 will essentially be double what it is now with the understanding that any of the space that is not
2 used from one year will be carried over to the next year will create a situation that is so much
3 worse than it is now. We cannot build our way out of overdeveloping office space. I think all of
4 you Commissioners as well as the City Council have a responsibility and I think it's a moral
5 responsibility and a duty to the people in Palo Alto to say to developers you have to add BMR
6 housing to your development. You are the people who approve the developments and you are
7 the people who can set the standard. I think the idea of simply building more housing and
8 making Palo Alto into a dense city goes against what the residents have stated in the annual
9 surveys of the very of the several last years. There is a growing concern in Palo Alto about
10 whose city this is. Now we know that two members of the City Council were investigated for
11 improprieties in their campaign funds. I think this isn't an accident. It seems that developers
12 have taken over our fair city and I think that you as a board would be best to listen to all the
13 citizens rather than just developers.

14

15 And on Elizabeth Downing or Dowling [Note-Kate Downing], whatever her name is, this is a was
16 a very is a very well paid woman and her husband and my personal feeling is that since they left
17 I have looked at the paper numerous times for all the houses that have been for sale in this
18 area and I could have found her multiple houses, but I don't think that I could have found her
19 exactly what she wanted at this moment right now. Most of us who own homes in Palo Alto
20 and I will speak only for myself here started small, built up equity, we saved, bought clothes at

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 secondhand stores and non-brand foods so that we could pay for our mortgage and now we're
2 being rewarded, but I think that people if people want something right now then that isn't
3 going to work and I don't think that she should be used as any representation of people not
4 being able to afford something in Palo Alto. She could have afforded something if she just
5 would've settled for a little less in the beginning.

6

7 So I hope that as this moves forward and I would like to remind this Commission that the City
8 Council decreased developer fees for below market housing and I'm not quite sure how this
9 jives with wanting below market housing in Palo Alto. I think there's plenty of expensive
10 housing, but I think we would be better served to build housing for the people who serve our
11 community. Thank you.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. Our next speaker is Robert Moss.

14

15 Robert Moss: Thank you, Chair Alcheck and Commissioners. I assume you were able to get my
16 the letter that I sent out this morning even though it bounced the first couple times I sent it. I
17 don't know what happened, but anyway just a couple of points.

18

19 The current status of allowing up to 3 million sq. ft. of additional commercial development is
20 excessive. And since Stanford is already taken almost half of that I would like to see the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 maximum including the Stanford development reduced to no more than 2 million or perhaps
2 1.8 million sq. ft. because we don't need an awful lot of commercial development. You did a lot
3 of talking about the need for housing and the reason is of course that we have our jobs/housing
4 imbalance; however, putting in perspective the jobs/housing imbalance now is much better
5 than it was in the past. In 1978 the jobs/housing ratio was 3:1 and now it's less than 2.8:1 so
6 we have brought it down and that's despite the fact that we're cramming more people into an
7 office space than we used to. The standard used to be 250 sq. ft. per worker, but in reality it's
8 been closer to 175 or 180 sq. ft. and it's going to keep on reducing. And the reason is office
9 rents are very high and so the building, pardon me, the property is going to cram in as much as
10 they can because it's expensive.

11

12 So what do we do about housing? Well one of the options obviously is to build housing on the
13 upper floors of commercial space, but if you look along El Camino the vast majority of the
14 existing buildings are one or two stories. They are not building a third floor with housing. In
15 some of the developments I've seen come in lately the upper floors are for offices, not for
16 housing. The housing they have is minimal that's because the money is in the offices. I don't
17 know if you're aware of it, but the office rents in Palo Alto 20 years ago were the highest in the
18 entire world. Higher than Tokyo, higher than Manhattan and they're still extremely high
19 compared to other cities.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Another point that you should keep in mind is when you talk about small units that doesn't
2 mean fewer people. At one time before Stanford expanded their housing Stanford students
3 were living in several neighborhoods in Palo Alto with as many as seven people in a one and
4 two bedroom apartment. They just jammed them in. So when rents are high and in Palo Alto
5 rents are high there's a real incentive to jam as many people in as possible. Building small units
6 does not necessarily create any benefits. The units should be whatever it takes to supply
7 demand for the entire community and that means a range of sizes.

8

9 And the last point I want to make is about BMR units and affordable housing. Palo Alto if you
10 only talk about cities that have both commercial and residential not just residential like Los
11 Altos Hills and Atherton Palo, Alto has the highest median cost of housing in the entire country.
12 Getting lower income people in requires significant subsidies and there's a limit to how much
13 you can subsidize. The City can't put tens of millions of dollars into subsidizing these housing
14 unfortunately. I don't know if you're aware of it, but Palo Alto was the first city in this in the
15 country, one of the first in the state and one of the first in the country that required BMR units
16 in new developments. The original ordinance which was passed in the mid-Seventy's required
17 40 percent BMR units for twenty units or more of a development. And it took developers
18 almost four months before they came up with a solution, the housing project on Forest kitty-
19 corner from City Hall 19 units, no BMRs. About six months later housing project in the other
20 corner across from City Hall 19 units, no BMR's. So the City then reduced the threshold and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 reduced the percentage required and we've been getting some BMR units ever since then, but
2 solving the BMR problem is going to be extremely difficult and I don't frankly think we're ever
3 going to do it. Do what we can, but don't be too hopeful.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Robert. Our next speaker is, our next and final speaker is
6 Hamilton Hitchings. You'll have five minutes.

7

8 Hamilton Hitchings: Thank you. Currently Palo Alto is a great place to live with its family
9 neighborhoods and to work with its leading technology companies like Tesla. I hope it will be
10 like that in 15 years; however, Palo Alto faces several major challenges due to its popularity.
11 The National Citizen Survey is conducted every year in Palo Alto for the City government to
12 provide statistically sound measure and solid data on how its residents feel about Palo Alto.
13 These areas have recently been declining sharply in key areas of livability. In 2012 residents
14 rated the quality of life as good or excellent for 94 percent of respondents by 2016 it had
15 dropped to 85 percent. As a place to raise children it fell from 92 percent in 2012 to 84 percent
16 in 2016. As a place to work it fell from 88 percent in 2012 to 82 percent in 2016. Why? Well
17 according to the survey the following areas highlight the major concerns: availability of
18 affordable quality housing was rated as good or excellent by only 6 percent of the residents,
19 cost of living 7 percent, ease of travel by public transportation in Palo Alto 28 percent, traffic
20 flow on major streets 30 percent, ease of parking only 33 percent, and land use planning and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 zoning only 37 percent. In summary affordable housing, traffic, and parking are major areas of
2 dissatisfaction for Palo Alto residents and should be effectively addressed in the Comp Plan.
3 That wasn't the end of my comments.

4
5 This has been caused by the office boom were recently about 20 buildings have been built in
6 Downtown and only a couple of small multi-unit apartments in part because office is more
7 profitable. The recent office building boom can be quantified with data. According to the City
8 of Palo Alto's 2014 Existing Conditions Report, Page 833 the average annual nonresidential
9 square footage growth from 1989 to 2008 was approximately 38,000 sq. ft. per year, but its
10 rate tripled from 2008 to 2014 to an average of approximately 112,000 sq. ft. in the nine
11 monitored areas.

12
13 In terms of housing San Antonio Shopping Center's new apartments called Carmel the Village
14 offers apartments between 547 and 638 sq. ft. and the rent is \$3,000 to \$5,000 per month. I
15 have heard many folks say that small units are affordable, but without subsidized or BMR in
16 your language you are potentially endorsing luxury one bedroom apartments like Carmel the
17 Village.

18
19 In terms of massive housing building to enable affordability we do not have the infrastructure,
20 the transportation infrastructure to support that and Caltrain trenching will absorb are

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 available dollars over the next 15 years. Traffic congestion and poor LOS at intersections result
2 in not only a longer commute times, but shorter employee retention and increased difficulty to
3 attract top talent. For retail they hurt the ability to attract customers and retain employees.
4 Traffic and parking problems hurt all Palo Alto businesses. In terms of parking as long as we are
5 using residential neighborhoods to park office employees unlike almost all other cities in the
6 Bay Area we should require new buildings to be fully parked for the parking demand it creates
7 and it's loading zone usage.

8

9 Lastly I'd like to address one of the high priority changes recommended by the PTC and that is
10 to study to convert parts of University Ave. to pedestrian only. I think introducing a major
11 change this late in the process is too radical and was not discussed as a program during the CAC
12 which is where would have been the time to bring it up and discuss it and build community
13 consensus around it. University Ave. connects 101 and Stanford and until we have solved our
14 parking and traffic problems and dealt with the Caltrain separation it's premature to study this.
15 Thus, in summary our parking traffic and affordability housing problems will continue to grow
16 unless we limit office development, refocus on housing with an emphasis on affordability
17 including BMR, and make meaningful progress on transportation. Let's make Palo Alto a great
18 place to live and work 15 years from now. Thank you.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank. We're going to jump right back into our review. So the next item I
2 want to just I'm confident this one can be quick as well, but I'm going to... maybe I shouldn't
3 have said that. It strikes software development this is Number 4. We're going to the three
4 individuals nominated this issue for conversation about striking software development from the
5 regional community commercial definition would anybody like to make, would any of those
6 individuals who nominated this item, the three of you, like to make a Motion for us to discuss
7 and potentially adopt a very effective efficiently? Ok, why don't you light up the board and I'll
8 call on you in order. Commissioner Rosenblum.

9

10 Commissioner Rosenblum: I think I voted to discuss this one, but because I strongly oppose it. I
11 don't see and I'm not sure where it came from wanting to strike software from the definition of
12 allowable activities within these areas.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

15

16 Ms. Gitelman: Mr. Chair if I could just interject just a clarification here? We I think we talked
17 about this at our one of our last meetings or in the staff report... or in the staff report?

18

19 Ms. Costello: It was in the staff report.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah. We actually made a mistake based on Council direction and included
2 software development in a paragraph in the Land Use Element that applied to all of the areas
3 indicated here when the Council's intention was to make that software development only apply
4 to Downtown. And so we have committed in a list of corrections that was a clear mistake on
5 our part.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Are you saying this is a moot?

8

9 Ms. Gitelman: Well that part of this issue is moot. So we're going to make forward that
10 recommendation for that correction to Council as from staff because we made the mistake.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'm turning up all the lights real quick and I would like to suggest we move
13 on, but if anybody it would like to object to that or would like to speak on this topic instead of
14 moving on I will entertain it just light the board. Ok, I have two lights. I have Summa and
15 Waldfogel.

16

17 Commissioner Summa: Just a couple questions for staff for clarification. Is it going to be in the
18 definitions section of regional and community centers still?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah. We were going to leave it in there, but clarify that it's only about
2 Downtown.

3

4 Commissioner Summa: Ok. So it also because California Avenue was never added here, but
5 that's another regional community center so it will clearly not... Ok.

6

7 Ms. Gitelman: Yes.

8

9 Commissioner Summa: That was what I wanted to ask.

10

11 Ms. Gitelman: Yep.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel.

14

15 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, I'd just like to point out and appreciate the clarification. I'd like to
16 point out Policy L-4.5 regional centers University Ave. Downtown, maintain an enhanced
17 University Avenue Downtown area as major commercial center of the City with a mix of
18 commercial, civic, culture, recreational, and residential use. So there is there's actually an
19 inconsistency in software which is an office use with these other enumerated uses and you can
20 see this in if you contrast it to California Avenue Policy L-4.8 that actually lists office center

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 bizarrely as a characteristic of California Avenue and that doesn't get mentioned in University
2 Ave. Downtown. So there's some I don't whether these are clerical errors or whether these are
3 thinking errors I can't really tell, but I think we somehow need to capture this, clarify what our
4 intent is across this point that's raised in the box, and across these definitions in these districts.

5
6 Ms. Gitelman: Thank you for pointing that out to us. We will take a look at that and make sure
7 these are correct. It looks to me like this may be a little bit of a legacy because both of these
8 policies cite previous policies and so it may be that the previous policies had those different
9 terminology or that we carried them over incorrectly. So we'll take a look at that.

10
11 Chair Alcheck: Great, thank you. Ok seeing no lights we're going to move on. Item Number 5,
12 strengthen Policy L-1.3 about infill development to indicate not just that infill should be
13 compatible, but that infill development should be preferred or promoted. Ok, I have a light
14 from Commissioner Rosenblum.

15
16 Commissioner Rosenblum: So this is just a matter of emphasis on the words. So Palo Alto is
17 fully built out so to speak and some places are more favorable for development than others,
18 but because it's often easier to build in a place that doesn't have many neighbors we end up
19 building in SRP or other places and that causes worse traffic. The best place to build
20 developments is often those supported by current transportation infrastructure. So the current

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 language here says “work with neighbors, neighborhood associations, property owners,
2 developers to identify various infill development of BMR and more affordable market rate
3 housing and remove those barriers as appropriate” which I completely agree with. “Work with
4 these same stakeholders identify sites and facilitate opportunities for BMR housing and housing
5 that’s affordable,” so all that I think I personally think is great. The suggestion here is to state
6 that infill development is preferred in our community development plans. So similar to other
7 times where for example in I believe when discussing BMR units it’s I think that the City has a
8 policy that says on site or inclusive BMR is preferred versus in lieu. So other places where we
9 say something is preferred to others that infill is preferred. It's implied by this language in the
10 sense that barriers shall be removed etcetera, etcetera, but is not as explicit as I would like to
11 see it.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Ok, will you do me a favor will you move that language?

14

15 MOTION #5

16

17 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, so my Motion is that an additional sentence be added that
18 says Palo Alto has preference for infill development where possible.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Can I get a second?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson’s presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

SECOND

Commissioner Monk: I second it.

Chair Alcheck: Ok. Do you want to speak to it now or do you want me to go to the lights? I'll go to the lights, Commissioner Lauing and then Commissioner Gardias.

Commissioner Lauing: I said I strongly support the intent here and I'd like to see it changed. First, second, third, and fifth time I went through there I kept underlying it, underlining it. I'm wondering if you should actually add the wording up in the Policy of L-1.3? Words such as infill development in the urban service area should be encouraged and be compatible with its surroundings. When we get to the policy level is my issue.

Chair Alcheck: Yeah. For sake of clarity that's what I thought we were talking about it.

Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, that was my intention.

Commissioner Lauing: Oh, into the policy?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Yeah.

2

3 Commissioner Lauing: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought your talking about the program. I thought you
4 were talking about 1.31.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, no. I thought we were talking about 1.3.

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: Ok, great.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Alright, I have Commissioner Gardias and then Commissioner Note Vice-Chair
11 Waldfogel.

12

13 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. So I'd like to propose something different. I think that this
14 may not resonate in the specific development. I would like to propose the changed language of
15 this and just say that research opportunities of providing infill development over City properties
16 specifically alleys. Alleys.

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Alleys?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Gardias: And we had this discussion this was the first time when I came here
2 when we joined this Commission with Eric four... it's been four years, right? My gosh. Time
3 flies. So with Steve was here when he moved out to Redwood City later on and when I
4 proposed this first time he objected said no we're not going to build any development in the
5 alleys because they have a specific purpose and that's not what I'm proposing. I'm proposing to
6 consider the infill development over the alleys, to use the air space that's pretty much sitting
7 there unused for infill development. Alleys may be preserved they have their purpose, but
8 there is a bunch of the floors over the alleys that can be used. Thank you.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I have Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel.

11

12 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, I'd like a point of clarification because infill development in the
13 urban service area where the urban service area is defined in Policy L-1.1 so I'm not sure that I
14 understand Commissioner Rosenblum's example because residential development in the office
15 park is certainly within the urban service area so that would count as infill development. So I'm
16 looking for some clarification on what we mean by infill.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Rosenblum.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah. I may need help from staff on definitional issue and so let me
2 get to the intent first and then see what the language is. So what I had meant was
3 redeveloping or in essence densifying places that are close to transit. So these places that
4 already have something on it so it's a redevelopment. It's easier to take an empty plot or a very
5 un-dense plot so go out towards an area that is currently underutilized and build a larger
6 development there and that's the reason that we ended up with something like Maybell where
7 there's an orchard so, but it was the only available land and therefore there's a proposal that
8 was controversial in our community to build a fairly dense development there and it met with
9 resistance. But a lot of the resistance was it's just the wrong place, but the reason that Palo
10 Alto Housing had to build there is because there was it's sometimes easier to build where
11 things are emptier.

12
13 So the intent of this is to prefer development in the corridor areas. So as I'm speaking through
14 this I'm wondering if it is redundant with already existing policy? And so if we could point to
15 the right one then that could be the one that we emphasize, but the intent is essentially that
16 we have a preference. So if there is a development that is being proposed for the denser parts
17 of town that Council will view that with a kinder eye than larger developments in the un-dense
18 parts of town.

19

20 Commissioner Monk: I do have a comment.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Rosenblum: But first does that the answer for Vice-Chair Waldfogel does that intent... I know the language might be an issue, but is the intent clear?

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah and what you're pointing to is something that I think I could support in a targeted way if we're talking about specific districts. I think that when we talk about it generically as a citywide policy I just have some trouble imagining what the consequences are and that's why I asked for the clarification.

Commissioner Rosenblum: Ok, got it.

Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Monk.

Commissioner Monk: So looking at my notes here on Page L-27 where the policy is discussed 1.3. I actually think I might have been the one to have made this request for the change in policy given my notes that basically when I reviewed this policy and I saw the language talking about infill development in the urban area should be compatible with its surroundings and the overall scale and character, etcetera to me the words "should be compatible with" did not really take that much action in this policy and so I was trying to make it more action oriented. And so my thought process in making that suggestion was to put in some sort of language to

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 the extent it's hard because we're not looking at this together, but infill development in the
2 urban surface area should be "preferred" or "promoted" within the surroundings or something
3 like that. It was really just more of a way of making it come across as a little bit stronger
4 language than just be "compatible with" which to me didn't really do anything. If you're going
5 to have a policy either have the policy direct some sort of action otherwise I don't see the
6 purpose that having the policy. So that was my thought process of making that
7 recommendation. It really wasn't anything more than that.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you, Commissioner Monk. I'll chime in here. So I look at this
10 differently than you Commissioner Rosenblum. I actually think Maybell is the classic example
11 of an infill development opportunity missed. So in my land use experience which is we in that
12 field we typically refer to infill development as opportunities to develop vacant land inside of
13 already developed urban centers. And one of the things we often hear in this chamber is
14 people say look, there's only so many people can live in Palo Alto or the... and people other you
15 know can't pay, you can't make the sacrifices or then you have to look for housing elsewhere
16 and what that has led to is the development of 680. So all the housing development that we
17 see between here and Stockton is the develop... is the result of rules that we have in place that
18 limit growth all over the Peninsula.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 And so when we say we're not going to support development on Maybell even though it's we
2 had a person tonight a very eloquently say everything affects everything. When we don't let a
3 development happen on Maybell we are making that development happen outside of our City.
4 And Robert Moss today talked about how in the 1980's or 70's we had a housing/jobs
5 imbalance the problem is that in the 1980's you only had to go to Los Altos to find an orchard to
6 build your house on today you have to go to Vacaville. Vacaville is a bad example because
7 actually very built out, but Roseville, I can think of other cities. I know people that commute
8 over two hours and those housing developments they live in are examples of what happens
9 when you don't build an infill.

10

11 And so when I believe I made a comment along these lines and when I and I believe I
12 nominated this item. And when I did what I was suggesting was our Comp Plan should
13 acknowledge the responsibility we have to develop the areas that are underdeveloped whether
14 they're one-story footlockers in the middle of El Camino that are underutilized or there are
15 vacant parcels in the off Arastradero next to another eight story building. My suggestion was
16 our Comp Plan as a vision document should acknowledge that when we don't build infill we are
17 pushing housing development to the outskirts of the Bay Area. And my biggest point is so every
18 time someone comes in here and tells us well, think about the water and think about the
19 energy, think about the traffic, when you when you don't allow infill development in your own
20 City the development that you're doing out in Fresno is using a lot more water, a lot more

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 energy, and creating a lot more traffic and a lot more smog and pollution. And so this is sort of
2 environmental concept in my mind and what I was suggesting is that we create a preference for
3 infill that we acknowledge that we should...

4
5 It's not about whether we should develop the golf course as opposed to the Fry's site, it's
6 whether we should develop both as opposed to encouraging development two hours away. It's
7 about whether we should encourage greater infill development so that we can house our
8 teachers, our police officers, our staff, our service workers and this all goes to this idea that the
9 jobs/housing imbalance this idea that our retailers and our restaurants are not complaining
10 about parking they're complaining about they can't find employees. And so anyways so I would
11 support this change simply because it conveys again the vision statements that will in the future
12 support code changes that might encourage housing. I have two lights, Commissioner Lauing
13 and then Commissioner Summa.

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: Two points in (interrupted)

16

17 Chair Alcheck: I'm sorry. So sorry. I have Commissioner Gardias then Commissioner Lauing
18 then Commissioner Summa.

19

20 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #5

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Gardias: I'd like to propose a Substantive **[Note-Substitute]** Motion and change the language. So the Motion would be to add to the Program L-1.3.1 verbiage to work with the City to identify opportunities for infill development on the City owned properties. That would include parking lots, alleys, and some other City properties and it would be really actionable.

Chair Alcheck: Can I get a second? There's a Substitute Motion on the floor regarding I guess it would be encouraging Council to consider adopting language that would encourage infill development on top of City owned parcels.

Commissioner Gardias: Correct.

Chair Alcheck: This is a Substantive Motion if I (interrupted)

Commissioner Monk: Substitute.

Chair Alcheck: A substitute, it's a Substitute Motion. I need a second in order for it to in order for us to stop the vote on the current Motion on the floor. If you decide to second it then we will deal with this Motion.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Monk: As the seconder of the prior Motion I view these as two very different
2 (interrupted)

3

4 Chair Alcheck: They are.

5

6 Commissioner Monk: Items so I don't really think it's appropriate for I mean...

7

8 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #5 FAILED

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Let me just see if... Ok, I don't have a second so what I'm going to do is I'm going
11 to continue and Commissioner Gardias if you wish to make a Motion after this you could and
12 maybe there would be a second because it's a little different. So I would encourage you to
13 make that Motion again. Ok, I have Commissioner Lauing and then Commissioner Summa and
14 then we'll take a vote.

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: Just For Your Information (FYI) infill is defined in the glossary.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: In the what?

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: In the glossary of this document pretty much as you stated it. So that's
2 in there so we know we have that definition. Words matter. The other word here is the
3 discussion about compatible that whole paragraph there is definitely a discussion about any
4 infill should be compatible and that means architecturally and environmentally. So that can't
5 be, we can't pull off of that which I think is what Commissioner Monk was talking about. We
6 don't want some weird building that doesn't match on top of other buildings in there. And
7 we're still talking about not Program 1.3.1, but Policy 1.3 so if the maker can give us the
8 clarification on that language where we are right now that might move us along.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a light from Summa, but before she begins Commissioner Rosenblum
11 would you like to... would you guys restate your Motion just so we have clarity for
12 Commissioner Lauing?

13

14 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so the Policy L-1.3 currently reading "infill development in the
15 urban service areas should be compatible with its surroundings and the overall scale and
16 character of the City to ensure a compact efficient development pattern." So it would be
17 adding a sentence before which is that Palo Alto has a preference for infill development period
18 followed by so it's expressing preference. And recognizing Vice-Chair Waldfogel's assertion that
19 all development in Palo Alto could be characterized as infill, but recognizing that we are
20 expressing a preference for infill development in our community.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Summa last comment and then we vote.

Commissioner Summa: I just I don't think it's really necessary and I think the distinction that's being made here is between infill and open space and park basically. So I think I just don't think it's necessary because any because what we're doing here is making that distinction saying we're not going to retain, we're going to retain open space. I just I actually never really liked the way there was this... I always thought it was strange that anybody thought there was a barrier to infill development on the CAC during the CAC process and no one ever could tell me what barrier there is because we have zoning that allows you to replace buildings and maximize the space. So I just I don't think I would support it and because I just I actually don't think it's necessary and I don't think it adds much. That's all.

VOTE

Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. At this time I'm going to call for a vote. All those in favor of the Motion on the floor please raise your hand. Ok, we have four. All those opposed? We have two opposed and one abstention.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 MOTION #5 PASSED (4 (Alcheck, Lauing, Monk, Rosenblum)-2 (Summa, Waldfogel),-1 abstained
2 (Gardias),

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Before I ask any other commenters to make a comment do those in opposition
5 care to speak? Ok, Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel.

6

7 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah let me just go back to the glossary page. I'm really confused by
8 what this would do because we have a glossary definition that infill is development of individual
9 vacant lots or left over vacant properties within areas that are already developed. So given that
10 definition I'm not sure that what we just voted on captures the intent. I think that there's a
11 noble intent buried in there, but we just we didn't just do it.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Ok, that's noted. Hold on. Commissioner Gardias I would invite you to make a
14 Motion on this topic since you've expressed sort of an ancillary idea and if you get seconded we
15 can put it to a vote as well.

16

17 MOTION #6

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: Sure. Thank you. So pretty much the proposal is as you heard is to
20 identify infill opportunities on the City grounds. And I talked specifically about the alleys,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 parking lots, if anybody is going to tell me that we don't have a big lot to house BMR units of a
2 sizable size I will show you a couple of the City parking lots and I will tell you there those are.
3 So for this reason I would like to propose the following Motion: identify development
4 opportunities of BMR and more affordable market rate housing on the City owned properties
5 like alleys, parking lots, and others.

6

7 SECOND

8

9 Commissioner Rosenblum: I'll second that.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a second for the Motion. What I would like to do is encourage
12 Commissioners who don't feel like a Motion is worth voting for to just vote no when that
13 opportunity arises. If you have some questions about this Motion or you want to discuss it and
14 get clarity then I'll allow it, light up the board. If not let's vote. I have a question from I have a
15 comment from Lauing. Commissioner Lauing, please.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I just wondered why is this necessary? We could do this anyway it
18 doesn't have to be put in here as a specific program. So it's not being left off and it's kind of
19 radical to be targeting City land for development.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you for that comment. I don't see any other lights. I have
2 Commissioner Summa.

3

4 Commissioner Summa: Just I can't support this. I think it's very broad and far ranging and could
5 have negative effects. I mean City own property is parks. I don't know if you really want to
6 open that can of worms.

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: No it was not my intention (interrupted)

9

10 Commissioner Summa: So but I think you've done (interrupted)

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: I gave specific buildable examples, right? It's not to build BMR units in
13 the middle of the park, specifically dog parks.

14

15 Commissioner Summa: But I thought that, I thought it was broadly as City owned property. Did
16 I hear that incorrectly?

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Let, hold on. So let me make a quick suggestion. I think all of our comments
19 tonight are going to be delivered to Council as things we would recommend they consider. I
20 think it's dangerous to treat I know words are words and I know that we have some strong

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 opinions about being articulate, but these are concepts and I think that for example if you for
2 example felt like look, this is an interesting idea to explore development over City owned
3 parking lots, to encourage the City to utilize its own land for some of their BMR housing then
4 just simply saying that and then adding, but I don't know that I would be interested in seeing
5 that in parks or libraries then I would support this in that regard. Our minutes are going with
6 this. I want us to sort of avoid the authorship because honestly I don't think the Council is
7 going to read this and go great, Council wanted us to do this we'll just write in just the way it is.
8 I think these are sort of bigger statements so I'm just encouraging everyone to discuss these
9 items like that. I have a few more lights. Commissioner Summa I'll (interrupted)

10

11 Commissioner Summa: I wasn't finished.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: I know. Commissioner Summa I'll let you finish and then after you I have
14 Commissioner Monk, Rosenblum.

15

16 Commissioner Summa: I believe the way the Motion was stated it said City owned property and
17 an example you gave was like a garage, but the Motion I believe was City owned property. Is
18 that the way it was stated? Then I think it I don't I think it's way too broad and could have... we
19 haven't discussed this at all. I'd be happy to discuss it in certain locations such as over garage
20 parking structures, but to say City owned property in general is to me way too broad.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Gardias: I readily agree with your comment. I'd be open to any modification that
3 you wish to propose. I can also modify it myself and say this would be within the urban service
4 area. So we precisely know that certain areas are out of the limits and certain areas are within
5 the limit.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: Well that would include City own parks. I mean it's your Motion so you
8 can make it different if you want, but I don't support it.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Let me ask that we just what I'd like to sort of give me a chance to call on you.
11 Let's light up the board so that at least our minute takers can sort of follow along. I have
12 Commissioner Monk and then Commissioner Rosenblum then we'll come back to
13 Commissioner Gardias.

14

15 Commissioner Monk: I'm inclined to support the Motion. I agree with Commissioner Summa
16 that it is vague, but it's not something that needs to be finely tailored. I think we have plenty of
17 zoning requirements that would prevent us from building apartment buildings for BMR in parks
18 so I'm not really worried about the implementation. I think it's a good idea and concept and I
19 think we just push it along to the City Council to take it for consideration. I know that there's
20 othe advocacy efforts to do a similar type of project in Menlo Park with regards to building

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 above libraries adding some housing above their libraries. So I think there are some creative
2 places that the Council could look to increasing our housing stock and I would support the
3 Motion.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Rosenblum.

6

7 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so I just wanted to speak to my support of the Motion. So I
8 understand Commissioner Gardias' intent and I think you made the intent fairly clear. I also
9 agree with the Chair that this isn't necessarily the right place to wordsmith. The intent is in the
10 section this whole section is about finding ways to essentially densify certain parts of the City to
11 allow for more affordable housing. And Commissioner Gardias is saying that one way of doing
12 that would be on pieces of land that are owned by the City specifically parking garages. And so
13 I think that his intent is clear and recognizing Commissioner Summa's concern that if this
14 language were to go just like this then people would say wait a minute, doesn't that mean that
15 we could have a park developed? And this clearly would be something that Council could
16 certainly say yes, actually we should emphasize in our Comp Plan that we are looking for
17 opportunities even above our parking garage directing staff to draft appropriate language. So
18 recognizing the intent of this which is the City does own land many of our surface parking
19 garages or surface parking areas for example I would consider underutilized. You have one
20 layer of parking in the most expensive City in the world owned by the City. That gives us

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 opportunity for both increased parking and increased housing. I believe that is Commissioner
2 Gardias' intent and I fully support that.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Gardias.

5

6 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. Just a quick question to staff just to if I may ask about help
7 about some common name of those buildable areas that City owns that would include parking
8 lots, alleys, and some other lots where we can build. Is there some common name that we can
9 assign to this to this places?

10

11 Ms. Gitelman: I think you've effectively expressed your objectives by listing examples and
12 maybe you could just also exclude public open space.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Gardias I actually think that your Motion is standing well on its
15 own. So I have two more lights, Commissioner Lauing and Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair]
16 Waldfogel and Commissioner... Three more and Commissioner Monk. As soon as we're you've
17 made your comments we'll put it to a vote. Commissioner Lauing.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah this is a totally new issue. It's never come up in the 90 days. It
20 doesn't fit the process that we agreed to that we have a vote on a certain number of things.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 We're struggling to get through 14 items and we're introducing stuff that I think is radical, that
2 we've had no preparation on, that we have no particular knowledge about; so I don't see how
3 we can give an informed decision one way or another because I don't think we're informed on
4 what it takes to buy City land.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: So I'll just (interrupted)

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: And there's no restriction on the City doing that in the future regardless
9 of what we do tonight.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: So I'll just share with you my perspective on the issue. I agree with you that this
12 wasn't a topic that we had entertained before, but however I think that the reason why I'm
13 entertaining this Motion is because we're talking about infill development and we're talking
14 about promoting infill development and to some extent when we talk about infill we're talking
15 about density and increasing the density utilization of areas that are already built or in areas
16 surrounded by developed areas. And I think what Commissioner Gardias is suggesting is I don't
17 think it's as radical as you think. A week or two ago we had a conversation where
18 Commissioner Rosenblum suggested that for many Europe has sort of followed this model
19 where you live where you work and America adopted a model very early on that you live in one
20 place and you work in another. And one of the things that we keep circling around is this idea

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 of creating more housing opportunities Downtown and I think what Commissioner Gardias has
2 sort of articulated is this idea of using areas that while not vacant you could describe them as
3 underutilized for our purposes.

4
5 So I know that we're exploring these opportunities right now for new parking garages and I
6 don't know if there's an active Request for Proposal (RFP) or if we're preparing an RFP. Imagine
7 that those sites also incorporated BMR housing and I guess my point is I could support this
8 Motion because even if he entertained 20 units on top of a 12,000 or I should say 18,000
9 square foot parcel that's currently owned by the City in Cal Ave. it's going to be maybe a
10 parking lot like the idea of just considering opportunities to also incorporate housing in those
11 areas is like mixed-use. So all I'm suggesting to you is that while this doesn't necessarily isn't a
12 specific idea it does sort of fall in line with this concept.

13
14 And I'm entertaining the Motion because we have support for it. So we have there was a
15 Substitute Motion made and then later not adopted and then a Motion offered and a second
16 and it sounds like there's more support. And so what I'd like to do I appreciate your concern
17 about not having enough time to sort of understand the ramifications my suggestion would be
18 that we're not authoring a policy or even a program we're suggesting the Council consider
19 incorporating it into their policies. And if [Unintelligible speaker off mic]. Right, they can, but
20 what I'm trying to make the point is is that we have a Commission we have potentially more

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 than three Commissioners interested in suggesting that Council do it. And I understand that we
2 keep coming back to these comments about well, I don't know why we're doing this, we're
3 doing this because there are some Commissioners that care. So that's why we're doing it and
4 some of these issues we may not care about, some of these individually we may care about.

5
6 In this particular case we're just trying to communicate certain messages about the Comp Plan
7 review and what I would like to do is to allow that. I want to encourage this sort of discussion
8 because it represents a consensus building effort. Ok, Waldfogel and then Commissioner Monk
9 and then we'll vote.

10
11 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great, thank you. So I agree with Commissioner Lauing that this is late in
12 the game to entertain this; however, I will support it partially because I hope that the ship
13 hasn't sailed on the projects that Commissioner Note-Chair Alcheck just mentioned, the
14 parking structures in Downtown and Cal Ave. and those are great opportunities if we can target
15 some other uses for those.

16
17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Monk? Ok. Commissioner Summa, the last comment then we
18 vote.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Summa: Comment and question. I believe we have a quite extensive program
2 underway putting solar on top of parking garages so I don't think you can build above the solar
3 and have the solar work. So and the other thing is did your Motion specify that this was for
4 subsidized housing or just did you just say housing? Did it say BMR or low, low rate?

5

6 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, yes correct. So I included I followed the language from the
7 Program 1.3.1 which was saying of BMR and more affordable market rate housing.

8

9 Commissioner Summa: Ok, so we are putting solar on top of the parking garages, right? So isn't
10 this sort of inconsistent at a very basic level with that? We're going to put it on and then take it
11 off? I mean.

12

13 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah, but I think Commissioner Gardias I think many people have said parking
14 garages, but I think the original Motion was about parking lots and alleys so undeveloped land.
15 Although of course it could relate to parking garages also there are some parking decks that
16 might lend themselves to redevelopment.

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Ok.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok and who is to say they couldn't put solar panels on top of the housing on top
2 of the parking lot? Ok so let's do it. Let's vote. I have a Motion on the floor. All those in favor
3 of the Motion please raise your hand. I have five in favor. All those opposed? I have two
4 opposed. Would any of you like to add anything to your opposition? Go ahead Commissioner
5 Summa.

6
7 MOTION #6 PASSED : 5(Alcheck, Gardias, Lauing, Monk, Rosenblum)-2 (Summa and Lauing)

8
9 Commissioner Summa: Yeah I think it's kind of unfair to add this into the process at this point. I
10 mean we did a lot of work to hone this down to try to create a process that was understandable
11 and fair to everybody. Who knows if this would have even got to have risen to the top of the
12 17 things we had to look at. So from a procedural point I object to it. And I also think it's
13 unnecessary and has the potential to be detrimental to some of our dearly held public
14 resources in the City.

15
16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you for that comment. Alright, the next item we have is Item Number
17 6. Some PTC Members support identifying specific locations where heights above 50 foot
18 height limit which is a separate ordinance not in the Comp Plan could be exceeded particularly
19 to enable construction of housing that is affordable. However, others were not comfortable
20 exceeding the 50 foot height limit even for affordable or subsidized housing.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2 This was I think an item that I nominated. I would suggest to you that my idea here and I don't
3 know that I have a specific language for it as a Motion in order to add a program, but what I
4 would suggest that I saw was this notion of encouraging flexibility within our zoning ordinances
5 to accommodate greater development of BMR housing. So I wouldn't even suggest that I
6 would call out specifically the 50 foot height limit, but what I would suggest is that we could
7 have a policy of encouraging flexibility in the honorable effort of developing BMR housing. I see
8 a lot of lights so actually that's a good sign; Commissioner Rosenblum, Commissioner Monk
9 then Commissioner Summa.

10
11 Commissioner Rosenblum: So I pulled the CAC notes on this on the discussion from Goal L-1. So
12 they had a extensive discussion and so I'm sure that Commissioner Summa was part of this.
13 They used approval voting. They had Option 1, keep the current building height limit; Option 2,
14 incorporate flexibility in building requirements to foster better design; Option 3, allow the
15 possibility of building heights up to 65 feet in certain areas to encourage a more diverse and
16 affordable range of housing options; and Option 4, allow the possibility of higher building
17 heights in specific areas to encourage a more diverse and affordable range of housing options.
18 The highest vote getter was an Option 4, allow the possibility of higher building heights with 11
19 votes, Option 1 which is keep the current building height garnered eight votes. So there was a
20 split on the CAC with more favorability towards the basically what Chair Alcheck is suggesting

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 which is that in order to allow for the economics of housing to be more favorable that we
2 should consider that the 50 foot height limit should not be a hard limit. As it's been pointed out
3 this is not in the Comp Plan. I guess the suggestion is that maybe it should be that there is
4 some language in the Comp Plan around promotion of affordability that there may be some
5 language to say including tools such as increasing the height limit in certain areas as was
6 suggested I believe by the CAC majority vote.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have Commissioner Monk then Commissioner Summa.

9

10 MOTION #7

11

12 Commissioner Monk: I agree that there should be some flexibility to allow for housing
13 construction that would exceed the current 50 foot height limit. I don't know that the Comp
14 Plan is where it needs to be covered. I'm fine with it where it is right now in an ordinance and I
15 would like to move or propose to move that we do not advance this agenda item to Council at
16 this time. If anyone wants to second that then it's a Motion, if not we continue the discussion;
17 to not advance this item to Council.

18

19 SECOND

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I would second that.

2

3 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a Motion on the floor. I have comments from Summa, Waldfogel,
4 Gardias.

5

6 Commissioner Summa: Yeah and might clarify things for you guys a little bit. It, the idea of
7 having flexibility in the 50 foot height limit is already in the Comp Plan because it's in the
8 Housing Element. So and I don't think Council showed any interest in putting it anywhere else
9 in the Comp Plan. And so I would support Commissioner Monk's Motion. I don't...

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel.

12

13 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Thank you. I support Commissioner Monk's Motion. I would like to come
14 back to I'd like to propose a study session that we hold sometime in the future on the
15 economics of affordable housing. I don't think we've really done a good job of that. I don't
16 know that we all collectively share the understanding about whether height limits or other
17 factors, other zoning factors are decisive so I think we should come back to this, but for the
18 time being I support Commissioner Monk's Motion.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Gardias.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Gardias: So I when I turn my light on I was hoping that this would change into a
3 discussion of the available tools that we have to fulfill the BMR mandates, but I was hoping that
4 pretty much we could resurrect at some point of time PC ordinance that was never pursued by
5 the City Council. As you remember we talked about this two years ago and at the time I was
6 supporting implementation of that specific ordinance to certain strategic areas where we would
7 be where we which we may indicate on our City map where we would support higher than 50
8 feet height limit. So that was the intention of the of my light, but in this case if there is no
9 interest of the other fellow Commissioners I just will support the intention of Commissioner
10 [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel to discuss that on some other occasion. Thank you.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll chime in. I think I would have supported a Motion in encouraging
13 flexibility of our zoning ordinance to further BMR development. And I think the Land Use
14 Element is a good place for that because we don't really get to opine tonight about our Housing
15 Element. And well to some extent this all these topics related BMRs as are discussed in our
16 Housing Element. I think so the principle notion of flexibility that I'm talking about is among
17 other things the 50 foot height limit which is if we're talking about specific areas of our
18 community where we would consider increases of height I think that that very much would fit
19 inside of this Element. So I would oppose this Motion and in theory support a Motion that if
20 this fails to encourage City Council to formalize the idea so that when we come to the debate

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 on the 50 foot height limit potentially being exceeded in some areas we can point to our Comp
2 Plan and say look, we adopted a Comp Plan that encourages flexibility to develop BMR housing
3 so I think we should adjust the ordinance which is not in the Comp Plan to accomplish that
4 policy. So that would be the idea here. That's sort of what I'm lobbying for. Ok, I have one
5 comment from Commissioner Monk and then we'll take a vote.

6

7 Commissioner Monk: I just wanted to remind the Commission that what we're looking at is
8 what the Council has sent to us. And I was actually at the Council meeting where they debated
9 this and it was I believe a unanimous decision to not have this height limit included in the Comp
10 Plan and to keep it in as an ordinance. So it would just be very circular for us to do anything
11 other than to support the Motion that's on the floor.

12

13 VOTE

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so let's put it to a vote. This would be vote to not further this issue to
16 Council. All those in favor of the Motion on the floor please raise your hand. Ok, we have five
17 in favor. All those opposed? Two. Would you like to speak to your dissent?

18

19 MOTION #7 PASSED :5 (Gardias, Lauing, Monk, Summa, Waldfogel), 2 (Alcheck and Rosenblum
20 opposed)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Rosenblum: Very briefly. I appreciate Commissioner Monk's attention. I also
3 appreciate Vice-Chair's suggestion that we do a study session on the economics of affordable
4 housing. I wholeheartedly endorse that. I feel like this 50 foot height limit is often kind of a
5 third rail and I am happy to touch that rail and say this is something that the CAC discussed
6 favorably. I think that the Land Use section is the right place to bring up specifically this item,
7 but I also appreciate that it's already Housing Element, that the process can be followed, and
8 that what we really want to do is study the economics of affordable housing. But so I disagree
9 with the Motion, but respectfully.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: I'll just add that I really like the idea of Vice-Chair Waldfogel. I'll add that and
12 maybe this is of interest to some of you I did have a conference call with Elizabeth Brady of Oak
13 Brook Modular. She is a developer of workforce housing. That's a new term. That the idea
14 there is work... lower income workers, not necessarily BMR housing and that she has a project
15 in play in Oakland and the idea was that we could somehow include her in a sort of broader
16 presentation because she's got some serious analysis of how to make it work and I was hoping
17 she would sort of share that info with us so that we could better understand how to make use
18 of some of our options. But anyways so I really like that idea and I hope we pursue it and
19 maybe we could entertain that at a later date.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Alright, so next issue we have is Number 7. Several PTC Members had comments on Program L-
2 2.4.4 regarding conversion of non-residential development potential FAR to residential FAR.
3 And the idea here is to revise Program L-2.4.4 so it does not prohibit housing as a potential
4 future use of Town & Country Village. This may become a feasible or desired use over the life
5 of the Comp Plan. You can light up the board. I can entertain any Motions on this item.
6 Commissioner **[Note Vice-Chair]** Waldfogel.

7

8 MOTION # 8

9

10 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, I'll make a Motion to skip this one.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Ok, can I get a second?

13

14 SECOND

15

16 Commissioner Summa: I'll second.

17

18 VOTE

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: That's a second from Commissioner Summa. If there aren't any other lights we'll
2 vote. Ok, seeing no other lights all those in favor of skipping this topic please raise your hand.
3 Ok, it's unanimous. You can communicate to Council that we had consensus on not
4 communicating something to them.

5

6 MOTION #8 PASSED (7-0)

7

8 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Let the record show that I moved the one that was unanimous.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: No it can't because we won't be communicating it to them. Alright, Number 8,
11 Land Use Element, Goal L-2, preserving retail. Lip service, not a single program to support a
12 policy, wants a program to be flexible, want a program to be flexible to respond to trends away
13 from brick and mortar, restaurant imbalance will continue to grow, look at what other cities are
14 doing to actually have retail otherwise market will dictate and we will lose retail space. I'm not
15 sure who nominated this, but can I get a light? Commissioner Monk.

16

17 Commissioner Monk: I believe I nominated this and I think the reason was around the time that
18 I had attended a meeting called Brick and Mortality where we heard from a lot of local business
19 owners about the trends and reasons as to why we're seeing a proliferation of restaurants and
20 a decline in retail in our Downtown areas. And so when I read through the Comp Plan I didn't

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 feel as though we had language or programs that were strong enough to really do more to
2 protect retail and to help retail actually come back to Palo Alto. I'm seeing a lot of empty
3 storefronts as a result of the retail protection ordinance so that's not sufficient and I think we
4 need to do more.

5
6 I haven't crafted an exact Motion. I could use some help with it in the event people would like
7 to... I guess could we an informal polling to see if people would want to advance some more
8 aggressive language around preserving retail to Council or not? Is this something that's an
9 important issue to folks?

10

11 Chair Alcheck: I have a light from Commissioner Rosenblum and Commissioner [Note Vice-
12 Chair] Waldfogel. Actually it's Waldfogel and Rosenblum. No, it's Commissioner Gardias then
13 Rosenblum then Waldfogel.

14

15 Commissioner Monk: So just to finish my last sentence on this. A Motion that I would propose
16 in this regard would be something to the effect of moving to include or add programs that
17 would conduct a regular review of retail, conduct a study to evaluate the reasons behind the
18 proliferation of restaurants and trends away from brick and mortar, something along those
19 lines. Also if you want to look at Program L-4.1.2 that program kind of touches on it so we
20 might want to just make the recommendation to beef up that program and maybe move it

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 under this policy because there's new programs that support Policy on Page L-32, the one that
2 we're referring to.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Rosenblum and then Commissioner, excuse me,
5 Commissioner Gardias then Commissioner Rosenblum then Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair]
6 Waldfogel.

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: I'm going to skip my line for a moment because I'm searching for
9 something.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, that's fine; Commissioner Rosenblum then Waldfogel.

12

13 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so I've talked on this issue before. I think our Retail
14 Preservation Ordinance which is what's called out here is not well done and I think it will go
15 down as one of the more destructive things actions that our Council has taken. It leads to
16 empty storefronts and it assumes that the problem with retail is that there's not enough space
17 for retail. And the problem with retail is there's many problems with retail these days including
18 problems with online competition, but the biggest are of course getting their employees,
19 getting their customers. Having access to ground floors across the City is not really the issue.
20 So I don't like this whole item and so if the if Commissioner Monk's suggestion is to craft

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 language around how do you support retail I think it's premature. I don't think we've ever
2 studied this. If her intention is just remove this as a program I just think it was a wrong-headed
3 program. That the one thing we're going to put in here about retail is to preserve ground floors
4 throughout the City. I'm strongly in support of preserving ground floor retail in our Downtown
5 corridors. I think that's absolutely crucial, but I think that the determination to do it throughout
6 the City was wrong headed. So my view is Commissioner Monk is on to something, but I just
7 don't see us tonight coming up with anything around retail preservation that's sensible.

8
9 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I have Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel next and then
10 Commissioner Lauing and I would suggest if that if we can't get a Motion that we can get
11 behind then...

12

13 MOTION #9

14

15 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, I agree with Commissioner Rosenblum. I think we need to study
16 this. In fact I'd like to I'd like us to take up a study session on retail sometime in the next six
17 months. And since we haven't done that I'll make a Motion to skip this one.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 SECOND

2

3 Commissioner Lauing: Second.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Second Commissioner Lauing. Lauing I have you as the next light. Would you

6 like to speak?

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: I was just going to suggest that we skip this Motion.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Because we just need more detail and to be able be informed on it.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Gardias.

15

16 Commissioner Monk: Are we in a position to request that a study be undertaken or is that not

17 an appropriate?

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Let me just suggest the following; I think that there is probably broad support for

20 that. What I want to avoid doing tonight is muddling this, the minutes. So let's stay on course,

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 let's get through these numbers. We're kind of we're pushing through. We've only got a few
2 more left on this page so let's keep going and then what I would suggest is at the next meeting
3 probably during our discussion among Commissioners at the tail end maybe it would be a
4 worthwhile exercise to make a list of items we would like to study. So we'll get to that at the
5 end. I'll make that I'll make a reminder at the end of this meeting to do, prepare for that and
6 we can discuss those items then. Ok, Commissioner Gardias and then Commissioner Summa
7 and then we'll vote.

8

9 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, actually I had the I preferred Motion language for retail
10 preservation. This was not for this this item because my vote fell somewhere else on a similar
11 item, but the spirit was pretty much the same. I have already language for the retail
12 preservation. I know that you may consider this along the same area what Commissioner
13 Summa was talking about this on the other topic that it may not be on this schedule, but this
14 was something that we reviewed. If you're open to hearing this language I can introduce to
15 you.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Well what I would suggest is if you have a Motion and you want to make it even I
18 really... I really dislike the idea of Substitute Motions in this particular case the Motion is to not
19 talk about anything so I would encourage you to make your Substitute Motion in this unique
20 circumstance. And if you get a second then we'll discuss it, but if you don't I think we should

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 put a vote because it sounds like other people want to move on and talk about this at a later
2 date. But I don't want to discourage you from bringing up a topic and if other people agree
3 with you then we can talk about it

4

5 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #9

6

7 Commissioner Gardias: So my Motion would be to discuss this line item.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Ok is there a second for this Substitute Motion?

10

11 Commissioner Summa: I'm sorry, I didn't quite hear. Discuss it now?

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Yes. There's a Substitute Motion. I'm just looking if there is no second then the
14 Motion on the floor remains.

15

16 SECOND

17

18 Commissioner Summa: I will second it for one specific reason, but I'll second.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Gardias: And what's the reason?

Chair Alcheck: So hold on a second. I just want to make a quick point real quick, procedural point. If this Motion fails we're moving on it's the same as the other Motion in reverse, ok? So it's fine if you want to do this it seems unnecessary to me, but we have a Substitute Motion on the floor with a second to discuss this topic. Commissioner Summa you may speak to your second and then we will vote.

Commissioner Summa: So I want to point out that the two areas that Commissioner Monk pointed out were under Goal L-2, sustainable community and under Goal L-4 about commercial centers. So it's very appropriate to want to support retail in both of those areas. If you don't want to have the whole discussion tonight then that's fine, but I just wanted to express support for Commissioner Gardias and Commissioner Monk. They it's absolutely appropriate that we support retail in those areas. I mean it's part of our sustainable life to have walkable or short drivable retail available to us and it's absolutely the point of a commercial center.

VOTE

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. At this time we're going to vote. The Motion on the floor is to
2 continue a discussion on this item and if it fails we will terminate the discussion on this item.
3 All those in favor of continuing the discussion on this item please raise your hand. We have two
4 people. All those opposed? Ok unless you have something to add do you need to speak to
5 your or excuse me your no in this particular case we're the dissent wins, never mind.

6
7 SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #9 FAILED (2 (Gardias, Summa), 5, (Alcheck, Lauding,
8 Monk, Rosenblum, Waldfogel))

9
10 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Next item Number 9, Transportation Element, Goal T-1, have policy to open
11 routes along creeks to pedestrians and bikers if routes are safe in addition to other possible
12 routes. It's almost hard to believe this received three nominations, but if anybody has a Motion
13 to make about this particular item bring it, Commissioner Gardias?

14
15 MOTION #10

16
17 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, so actually this was one of the items that I was working to
18 construct. So before we proceed I was hoping that we can have Director Gitelman just to speak
19 to us about this because we already have some studies which are part of the Comprehensive
20 Plan that do the same along Matadero Creek if very remember correctly, but I don't know if the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 same studies were done for the other creeks. So if that is not the case I suggest to pretty much
2 to keep the language as is and propose it as a policy.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I don't we don't have Director Gitelman in the hall right now so I think we
5 should move with your second option which was that you're I think you're making a Motion to
6 adopt the language as written?

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: Correct.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, do I have a second?

11

12 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Just could you just clarifying in your Motion where would this policy go?

13

14 Commissioner Gardias: This would be I think it's listed under Transportation Element. I'm not
15 sure if it's going to go under Transportation to be honest. I'm not prepared to answer this. The
16 objective was to allow those that were natural routes that if we opened to pedestrians and to
17 bikes that would allow them to those pedestrians and bikers to take shortcuts to reach their
18 destinations.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Let me just say I mean directionally I support this. I'm just having a little
2 trouble about knowing exactly where it fits. We've discussed some of this in other realms and
3 I'd like to see this move forward. I just don't know exactly how to (interrupted)

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Actually when I, what I suggest is that if any of the other individuals that
6 nominated this item wish to second this? We have a Motion floor and I just want to
7 understand if there's a second. Yeah, of course; I have you are my next speaker anyway so
8 Commissioner Summa and then I have Commissioner Lauing.

9

10 Commissioner Lauing: But we don't have a second (interrupted)

11

12 Chair Alcheck: I don't have a second, but I'm going to allow her the question and then go ahead.

13

14 Commissioner Summa: I seem to remember and maybe staff can help with this that there is a
15 lot of discussion about this for the Parks and Rec Master Plan and that there is some plan to do
16 it along San Francisco, San Francisquito Creek and that it may not be appropriate in the
17 channelized creeks because of all the problems and Ed would probably know about this.

18

19 Ms. Costello: There this issue has come up and you're right in the Master Plan it's in the Natural
20 Environment Section, it's in the Transportation Section. So it says it here already "increase

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 cooperation with surrounding communities and other agencies to establish and maintain off
2 road bicycle and pedestrian paths and trails that are integrated with creek, utility, railroad. So
3 there's a lot in here, in the plan already and there is some guidance in the Natural Environment
4 Section about where a trail may not be appropriate. I think it's pretty covered by both existing
5 plans and what's already in the Transportation Element.

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: And some of it requires administrative staff discretion outside of the
8 policy range, the judgment of safety and so on. So I don't see this rising to a policy issue at all.

9

10 Ms. Costello: Right.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: I agree with you, it's covered.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Ok, do I have a light from you Commissioner Rosenblum?

15

16 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, I just I concur. The Bike Master Plan considered a lot of creeks
17 as potential routes and when they didn't include it it was because of various issues around
18 safety and maintenance, etcetera. So (interrupted)

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: I let me just cut you off for a second because I if don't have a second we don't
2 even need to do around. So seeing no second we're going to move on.

3

4 MOTION #10 FAILED

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Alright comments on Goal L-1. I'm not going to read this one out, but I would ask
7 this ok so just I want to make a quick note here. We are moving into territory of two votes
8 which means that there would have to be a pretty compelling Motion because only two of the
9 seven found this a top 10 priority. So of the two individuals that I'm going to click off the lights
10 for a minute just to make sure that we're clear here. The two individuals that nominated this
11 would either one of you like to begin? Ok, Commissioner Lauing.

12

13 MOTION #11

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: Yes, this was the example I used originally to discuss the process that
16 we're undertaking which is why it's long, but it's also very specific. And the whole intent here is
17 to just underscore what we are committed to which is diversity in demographic groups and
18 neighborhoods is being prioritized. So it's very simple language the Motion is actually those
19 two Items 1 and 2, just slight changing to the wording that I have there on compact and
20 resilient City prioritizing diverse and vibrant neighborhoods and then just swapping L-1 and L-2

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 we get prioritize instead of strengthen. And to me consistent with what we've been talking
2 about this is another one that's kind of apple pie, but it just didn't really have the right tone as I
3 read it. So that's my Motion.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok, do I have a second?

6

7 SECOND

8

9 Commissioner Summa: I'll second.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Would you like to speak your second?

12

13 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, I think it is kind of apple pie. I think it's just it's already here, but
14 Commissioner Lauing just had stronger language and I think it makes a lot of sense. And he
15 talked about this a lot so before at our last meeting so I won't go into more detail.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I don't have any other lights. I'm happy to put it to a vote. Would you like us
18 to restate the Motion? Yes, ok. Why don't you restate (interrupted)

19

20 Commissioner Lauing: It's basically on Page 17 there.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Ms. Costello: It's just the second half. It's says (interrupted)

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Correct.

5

6 Ms. Costello: For Goal L-1 and Goal 1 and L-1.2, right?

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: It's those two points.

9

10 Ms. Costello: The language as written here.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Right, exactly. There's two points.

13

14 VOTE

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'm going to put to a vote. All those in favor? Ok, we have four. All those

17 opposed? All those abstaining? Two abstentions. I'll speak to my dissent real quick it's not

18 that I don't. Think these are even appealing changes I'm just not sure that I would suggest that

19 I didn't want us a 7-0 consensus to suggest that this is like the one thing that we really all could

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 get behind. Frankly it's sort of low, very low on my list these changes and so that's sort of
2 where I stood. Not to suggest that it's not important.

3

4 MOTION #11 PASSED (4 (Gardias, Lauing, Summa, Waldfogel) ,1 (Alcheck), 2 abstained (Monk,
5 Rosenblum)

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, next Transportation Element, Goal T-5. We had two individuals nominate
8 this instead of paying to construct parking spots allow applicants to one, put money instead of
9 in lieu put money instead in in lieu fees that could build central shared parking by zone with
10 some parking onsite and/or provide transit parking passes, free bikes, etcetera for residents
11 and tenants. Ok, I have a light from Commissioner Rosenblum.

12

13 MOTION #12

14

15 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah I would suggest that this has already been covered so this is a
16 kind of a subcategory of one of our first discussions. So I would move to forgo this discussion
17 and go to the next item.

18

19 SECOND

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Summa: Second.

2

3 Chair Alcheck: So I'm just to be clear this is part of which item?

4

5 Commissioner Summa: One.

6

7 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah from tonight I would I think it's Item 1.

8

9 [Woman]: Item 1, right.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: And did I, just so I'm clear Item 1 did not receive enough votes? It failed. Ok.

12 Alright, so I have a Motion to skip it and I have a second. Any other comments before we take a

13 vote? Seeing none all those in favor of skipping this item? It's unanimous.

14

15 MOTION #12 PASSED (7-0)

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Item Number 12, God, you guys are doing so well. Item Number 12 the

18 introduction to the Comp Plan describes a different City than the Land Use Element. The

19 introduction describes a walkable suburb oriented around residential neighborhoods. The Land

20 Use Element describes a mini-city office park and is largely silent on neighborhoods and

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 neighborhood services. Either the introduction is wrong or the Land Use Element is wrong.

2 How do we reconcile different views?

3

4 I would suggest I don't see any lights, but I would I didn't nominate this item, but I would

5 suggest that a Motion highlighting this inconsistency might be passable. I don't know if

6 anybody, I mean I don't see the lights so if there is not a Motion; ok, Commissioner [Note Vice-

7 Chair] Waldfogel.

8

9 MOTION #13

10

11 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: It's getting late. Let's see, I think broadly there's a gap between the

12 narrative and descriptions and programs and policies in the Comp Plan. It's interesting that the

13 narratives and introductions talk a lot about walkable neighborhoods, but in Section L-3,

14 distinct neighborhoods pretty much the only things we come up with are negative impacts of

15 basement construction. I mean we it just seem to me that there's a gap in what was done. We

16 had a good discussion at the last meeting and passed Item 2 and Table 3 in our packet, Packet

17 Page 12, that I think covers some of this ground, but I would like to make a Motion that the... I

18 don't know how to put this. That we'd like to see the narratives and descriptions reconciled

19 with programs and policies.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 SECOND

2

3 Commissioner Summa: I'll second that.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a second for the Motion on the floor. I have a comment from

6 Commissioner Rosenblum.

7

8 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so I am reading the Comp Plan I think quite differently

9 Commissioner or Vice-Chair Waldfoegel. I think that the he said the introduction describes a

10 different city from the Land Use Element. I don't at all agree that we are describing a mini-city

11 office park largely silent on neighborhoods and neighborhood services. I in fact yeah I went

12 through to look if you look at the map of the City that is included by land use the vast majority

13 of our land use proposed both currently and in the future is R-1 residential. We're not

14 proposing expanding non R-1 residential in this. The description of the City development also

15 describes what we want as Palo Alto has been a world class and of knowledge and innovation.

16 It's not described anywhere as a sleepy suburb or otherwise. The City was incorporated in 1894

17 with land with a specific intent of serving a newly established Stanford University. I'm not going

18 to read this entire thing. The next section, Compact Development, Palo Alto was an early

19 adopter of compact development principles as embodied in the urban and service area design

20 to match growth in the current Comprehensive Plan.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

So I would say both the introduction in the Comprehensive Plan and the content of the Comprehensive Plan anticipate this being an important regional city that has jobs, research, etcetera. So I don't read this as having this one kind of introduction of bucolic kind of sleepy suburbia and then programs that suggest that it's an office park. I think neither are true. We describe as a compact important mid-sized city and the programs are those of a important compact mid-sized city. So I don't view the tension between the two personally, but I took a reading to see if I felt that, but I couldn't find it. Oh the map I referred to by the way is L-6.

Chair Alcheck: I'm sorry, are you asking a question to the maker of the Motion?

Commissioner Rosenblum: No.

Chair Alcheck: Are you asking the maker of the Motion (interrupted)

Commissioner Rosenblum: You mean me?

Chair Alcheck: Yeah.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: Oh, sorry. So I, sorry about that, I'm not supporting a Motion for
2 those reasons.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, got it.

5

6 Commissioner Rosenblum: I don't think the characterization is accurate.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok. I have Commissioner Summa and then Commissioner Note Vice-Chair
9 Waldfogel.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: Yeah so to put it in Commissioner Rosenblum's words I do see the
12 tension and I think the tension exists. I think an example of the tension is jobs/housing
13 imbalance itself and I think that this Comp Plan many of the speakers from members of the
14 public said it tonight enables a massive amount of office growth. And so I don't see how that's
15 consistent with not that kind of office growth to me is not consistent with in some way
16 diminishing the quality of life for residential neighborhoods. I just don't see how both can
17 happen. So I do think there's a tension and I not only see it for the future, it's now and it will
18 get worse. So and I really appreciate that technologies are going to change and some of these
19 problems will go away or change in and of themselves, but I do think we need to be mindful

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 that the there is a tension between the sort of visionary description and then what the Land
2 Use Element would sort of allow in way of massive office growth. Thanks.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel.

5

6 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Great. So I'll point out Goal L-4 for commercial centers describes them as
7 inviting pedestrian scale centers that offer a variety of retail and commercial services and
8 provide focal points and community gathering places for the City's residential neighborhoods
9 and employment districts. And what I see in this Comp Plan is that we've had called a drift or
10 erosion away from this single use of commercial centers into commercial centers that have
11 become somewhat more mixed-use. Now I would love for us to actually have a study session
12 on mixed-use versus commercial use, but what bothers me about this Comp Plan is that the top
13 level language about neighborhoods talks about compact walkable neighborhoods, the top
14 level language about commercial centers talks about them as retail and commercial services in
15 contrast to employment centers. It doesn't talk about the drift that's happened toward mixed-
16 use, toward combination of commercial, employment, and in the future perhaps residential in
17 the commercial centers.

18

19 These are great discussions to have, but we haven't had them and I'm really disturbed that
20 we're forwarding a Comp Plan that is so schizophrenic about top level language that sounds

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 very traditional. And I believe I don't know whether it's explicit or buried intent to continue
2 shifting commercial districts into mixed-use districts. That'd be a fine thing to do if we actually
3 decided to do that, but we haven't decided to do that in any explicit way except hidden in
4 programs and policies. So that's what I'm really getting at here. That's where I think the
5 problem is.

6
7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so I'll chime in. I just saw Commissioner Lauing's light. I don't know that it's
8 hidden. I think that's what we've been talking about for a while now this idea of incorporating...
9 It's anytime we talk about housing in commercial areas it inevitably leads to a mixed-use
10 because unfortunately I think our zoning requires some sort of mixed-use development in order
11 to satisfy; so for example, if there is any retail in like a one-story shop in Downtown Palo Alto, a
12 commercial center for example, right? Then there would have to be this mixed-use
13 development to have housing. So I don't know... yeah, absolutely. I just don't know that we're
14 hiding it. I think we have been talking about it and so that's just my short response.

15
16 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah. And I would just say that I would be comfortable with that if the
17 goal language reflected that, but the goal language seems to me to contradict the policy and
18 program language underneath it and to me that's worrisome. I think that in a corporate setting
19 if somebody gave me a goal that was completely contradicted by what's beneath it I would be
20 rather disturbed by the work product.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Lauing.

Commissioner Lauing: I was just going to ask the maker what are the ways to fix that? I mean one is we could just be aware of it. Others we as we could change some of the goals to match the policies. I don't see a big scribe thing here. We're going to be doing a lot of rewriting. So what will be the ways that we could address that?

Chair Alcheck: Actually if you don't mind I'd like to respond that. I actually don't know that we need to solve that problem. I think to some extent the Motion is really just communicating if it carries the Commission's support this notion that the Commission feels like there could be more. And maybe that would mean in theory that could lead to the Council suggesting that they might agree with this comment from the Commission and encourage staff between the two meetings to tidy it, tighten it up a little bit. I mean my I'll let the maker make respond, but I would suggest to you that I would prefer we avoid jumping into the details of re-authoring this and (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: I was just asking for the options not the details.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Oh, ok. Alright, well go ahead Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel if
2 you'd like to respond.

3

4 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah I would agree with Chair Alcheck. I don't think that we can fix this
5 tonight because I think that this is these contradictions permeate the plan that the goals and
6 the throughout the Land Use at least the goals, the policies, and programs are internally
7 inconsistent and I think it would be a bigger job than we can take on tonight to reconcile those
8 things. But it's something that does need to be taken up before this plan is approved by the
9 Council.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a Motion and we have a second so let's put it to a vote.

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Can we get the Motion read again?

14

15 Ms. Costello: I have a confusion here; is it because the language in a Number 12 is that the
16 introduction is in conflict with, seems to be in conflict with the policy.

17

18 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Ok, so the let me clarify that.

19

20 Ms. Costello: Yeah.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

[RESTATED FRIENDLY AMENDMENT TO MOTION #13]

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: The Motion is to reconcile the narrative's description and goals with the policies and programs that they're appear to be contradictions between the high level goals and the lower level policies and programs throughout the Land Use Element. Commissioner Summa do you accept that as a?

[FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 TO MOTION 13 ACCEPTED]

Commissioner Summa: Yes.

Chair Alcheck: And we talked about this at the pre-Commission meeting the hierarchy in terms of what dominates. I believe its goals then policies then programs then narratives. So in the event of a conflict you've got a hierarchy with goals, policies, programs or and then narratives. And so in light of that hierarchy we have this Motion encouraging consistency.

Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I mean if the goals dominate then I'll just withdraw the Motion because the goals are great. But it's just that that would put policies and programs in conflict with goals in many places.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Ms. Costello: Excuse me, through the Chair? The narrative is essentially background. It is not
3 what's going to... this you are going to be using this to decide consistency with future projects
4 and you would be using the policies primarily. And that's really where the heart of the how this
5 is implemented is through the policies. Just to be clear that's really the, the goals are useful
6 and provide a context and a sense of intention.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so we've got a Motion on the floor. We have a second. All those in favor
9 supporting the Motion on the floor please raise your hand. I have four in favor. All those
10 opposed? I have two opposed and one abstention. Would the opposition like to speak to their
11 Motion? I mean to their opposition? Go ahead Commissioner Rosenblum.

12

13 MOTION #13 PASSED (4 (Gardias, Lauing, Summa, Waldfogel)-2 (Rosenblum, Monk)-1
14 Abstained (Alcheck)

15

16 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah like I said I don't really even understand the Motion in some
17 ways. I guess we're just telling Council that we as a body think that there's a mismatch
18 between the aspirations and the programs, something like that. And in reading it I just first
19 disagree with the content. I also disagree with this is a Motion. I just don't think it's in the
20 keeping of what we're now doing. It's basically saying the whole thing is pretty bad; that you're

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 describing one city, but you've actually implemented put in policies and programs that are
2 something else. But I also think that that tension of course there are tensions always, but to
3 characterize it as completely out of step and also the wording of this to say that what we've
4 described is an office park I find deeply objectionable. We haven't described an office park.
5 We've described what I think is quite a nice city with a vision. So I really object to language, but
6 I also just and I don't understand purpose the Motion. I also disagree with the thrust of the
7 comment that there is this great out of stepness in this plan.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Monk.

10

11 Commissioner Monk: I think the reason that I took a little bit of an issue with this is that this
12 only came to our attention I believe in an email from the Vice-Chair just prior to last meeting.
13 This wasn't something that was brought up at the time that we were first discussing the Land
14 Use Element and I just think it was out of place for it to be thrown in last minute. I think it's
15 something that we could have discussed and just made a record of as we were doing our
16 general review rather than it getting put here as a super high priority item given the fact that
17 we have over 100 other pretty important items that we had to choose from that didn't make it
18 to this list. So that was the reason why I didn't choose to advance this to Council.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank. Alright we are moving on. Item Number 13 starting with the very
2 words in this draft Comp Plan L-1 I find it incredible in a unifying vision statement for the next
3 couple decades that it states in the first two sentences that we all disagree. Of course we do on
4 specific policies, but hopefully not in our vision. So on so I'm not going to continue reading this.
5 There are two people who found this to be important enough to discuss tonight and so would
6 one of those individuals (interrupted)

7

8 Commissioner Lauing: My light's on.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Please begin our conversation and hopefully with a Motion. Commissioner
11 Lauing.

12

13 MOTION #14

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, very simple. This is on the very first page of Comp Plan and I'm just
16 suggesting that we are all kind of heading for the same place, not on policies, not on some of
17 the goals, but it doesn't make any sense to start out in the first two sentences and say our goals
18 are different or whatever the exact wording here. Our visions are different, but they share
19 common qualities. I mean our vision should be the same because it's the City's Comprehensive
20 Plan. So I'm just suggesting for clarity that we drop those two sentences.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Chair Alcheck: Ok, there are no lights so I'll respond. Look, I think that I don't consider us authors of this document. I think the CAC put this together and I would suggest to you that it's the same way I feel about the last item. I don't know that we need to re-author these narratives or even this vision statement. And I think one of our commenters tonight said there are two groups in this City, one that believes in increasing density and one that wants to not make changes. I don't know that our visions are unified. I don't think our visions are unified on this dais for what this document should do. So I don't know that acknowledging it in the very beginning is necessarily a bad thing, but more than that the reason why I'll probably abstain from this vote is because I don't see us as authors of the document and I think I sort of respect the CACs development of this element. We have one light, it's Commissioner Gardias. I would encourage anybody who wishes to second this item to do so otherwise we'll move on. Commissioner Gardias.

Commissioner Gardias: Yes, thank you. I would suggest that if you... if my colleague doesn't mind just dropping this. I considered this of the same breed as the one that we just voted on. I believe that we already with the prior vote we already are sending a signal to the City Council that there are some discrepancies between the goals and the visions and I think that this Number 13 it just falls into this category.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, let me quickly poll; does anybody want to second this Motion?

2

3 SECOND

4

5 Commissioner Monk: I would like to second the Motion.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a second. I have Commissioner Summa's light.

8

9 Commissioner Monk: And to speak to my second?

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Would you like to, well would you like to speak to your second now?

12

13 Commissioner Monk: The Motion meaning to strike the first two sentences? So again I do have
14 an issue with the fact that this was brought to our attention in a letter that was just given to us
15 from one of our fellow Commissioners prior to last meeting. Nonetheless I feel because this is
16 the very first sentence that anyone would read and it's just such a negative start to our Comp
17 Plan that I have no issue in stepping in and wordsmithing it in the extent of removing these first
18 two sentences. I think it's a horrible way to start our Comp Plan and I am more than happy to
19 second it.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you for that comment. I have Commissioner Summa's light and I have
2 Commissioner Gardias again or is that a, did you mean to light up again? Ok.

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: Just a quick comment. If you (interrupted)

5

6 Chair Alcheck: No, no. Hold on. Commissioner Summa and then we'll be back to Commissioner
7 Gardias.

8

9 Commissioner Summa: Well the CAC didn't have didn't write this part. We didn't have anything
10 to do with this and I think this is from the old Comp Plan. So the CAC just worked on policies
11 and programs and I am very neutral on this. I think in general I'm very neutral on it. I would
12 tend toward sort of skipping it with all due respect from my colleagues I just I don't see it quite
13 as negatively and it's from the old plan, but I don't have super strong feelings either way.

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Ok, great. Commissioner Gardias, last comment then we'll vote.

16

17 Commissioner Gardias: I will stay with the comment that I said before. Thank you.

18

19 VOTE

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Great, alright all those in favor of striking the first two lines of our vision
2 statement please raise your hands; three. All those opposed to that edit raise your hands. All
3 those abstaining from this vote? Great so we have four abstentions. What was that? Yeah, it
4 fails.

5
6 MOTION #14 FAILED 3 (Lauing, Monk, Waldfogel), 0 opposed , 4 abstained (Alcheck, Gardias,
7 Rosenblum, Summa)

8
9 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Number 14. I want there to be a lot... Ok, Number 14, our last item on our
10 list tonight is comments on other components. In other realms a plan like this would discuss
11 revenue models to pay for our vision. We know that companies are willing to pay higher rents
12 to locate in Palo Alto, but we haven't worked out how to monetize this for community. Can the
13 Comp Plan recommend the development of a new revenue such as a payroll tax, a business
14 license tax, or a third party asset management. Well it's nice to end on a really easy topic. We
15 have two people who elevated this. I have one light, Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair]
16 Waldfogel. Would you like to kick us off and hopefully get a Motion?

17
18 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: So I guess the question for staff is whether revenue models are
19 something that are an appropriate aspect of a Comprehensive Plan. I mean elsewhere in other

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 realms I would absolutely expect to have some discussion about who will pay for what, things
2 like transportation or TMA or parking and all these things, but is it appropriate?

3

4 Ms. Gitelman: Well we don't usually see revenue models per se developed as part of general
5 plans, but we did and I think it is something that some jurisdictions do, we developed we had a
6 fiscal study done in companion with the EIR that looked at a number of different scenarios for
7 the future and talked about basically the health of the General Fund, the City's General Fund
8 under various different future scenarios. The end result I mean the big picture conclusion was
9 that all of the scenarios we were studying ended up with a kind of neutral or incrementally
10 positive impact on General Fund revenue on the General Fund, but nothing more fine grained
11 or informative than that.

12

13 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Right and what about things like I mean grade crossings are something
14 that could potentially run into the hundreds of millions of dollars; is it appropriate to discuss
15 revenue models for paying for those?

16

17 Ms. Gitelman: That's not usually something that's done in a Comprehensive Plan. A
18 Comprehensive Plan would I would it have a program calling on that to be kind of an important
19 next step, an implementation plan or a financing strategy plan.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Ok, I mean if we can take this to the implementation phase then I am
2 satisfied. I mean we don't if we don't have to incorporate language, but I think it's important to
3 get to revenue and I'm disappointed that there's nothing about revenue in the Comprehensive
4 Plan.

5

6 MOTION #15

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have no Motion so I'll make a Motion that we move on off this topic. Any
9 seconds?

10

11 SECOND

12

13 Commissioner Rosenblum: Second.

14

15 VOTE

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Great, Commissioner Rosenblum. Seeing no lights we'll put it to a vote. All those
18 in favor of moving on raise your hand; another unanimous vote.

19

20 MOTION #15 PASSED (7-0)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Ok, first of all I want to make a quick acknowledgment. We this is a process
3 we began 90 days ago. I know that it was a leap of faith. I know that over the course of our
4 work we have adjusted the process and what we did tonight was conclude a adjustment
5 strategy that we had made in the beginning, a change in the strategy that we approached from
6 the beginning and I think we've effectively executed that adjustment. That I think
7 Commissioner Lauing really promoted which was this idea of consolidating and voting and then
8 discussing in a very efficient way. And I actually think tonight's... oh, it was your idea. Ok,
9 Commissioner Monk and potentially Commissioner Lauing.

10

11 So I just want to say two things; I think tonight's meeting was sort of our best example. I think
12 we were sort of most efficient tonight and so now we have to do "heavy lifting" although I think
13 it's quite easy. What I would like to do is before we make a Motion that recommends these
14 highest priority changes. I want to suggest that we do incorporate the table on Page 10 with
15 the caveat that the table on Page 10 represents a loose majority of consensus. I don't want to
16 suggest that this is a unanimous, that these items on this page for example, I really I'm just not
17 even familiar with the Geng Road improvement to be perfectly honest, but what I would
18 suggest is that during our discussions over the last 90 days these items were identified as items
19 that a number of Commissioners sort of agreed on. And I would suggest that in the section of
20 our report that we pass on that we list these as non-controversial items of general consensus.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Unless anybody has a problem with that, light me up. And if you do have a problem and it's
2 related to one item then let's talk about it, eliminate it, and see if there's a way we can keep
3 some of this table together and then we'll move on to the Motion that and then as soon as
4 we're done with this topic we'll move on to the Motion of the EIR and then we'll come back to
5 make our broader Motion.

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: Well why don't we make a broader Motion?

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Well I believe we have to... so before we suggest our recommendation that we
10 incorporate these changes I think we have to address the EIR. Is there an order requirement?
11 So before we can say we're passing on these recommendations for the high level changes that
12 represent our work over the last nine days we have to discuss our position on the EIR. So I
13 want to get to this table since it involves potentially a debate before we get to the EIR which is
14 a different discussion. So let's quickly talk about (interrupted)

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: Is it before or is it same night? Just interested.

17

18 Ms. Gitelman: I think what we want is to make sure you talk about the EIR before you make a
19 final decision on the plan. In reality what we've recommended is kind of a Motion that
20 encompasses everything all at once. So...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so if your comment is about a specific element identify it on this page and we
3 can determine if we want to delete it. I have lights from Commissioner Monk and then
4 Commissioner Lauing.

5

6 Commissioner Monk: So Commissioner Monk here; I'm not inclined to advance this to Council.
7 If they do go then to me the only one that's important would be the ones in regard to high
8 speed rail and think it's the last one that we have. Also with regards to the building the plan
9 around specific technologies I don't remember that kind of being how the conversation went
10 and I certainly don't agree with it. If anything I think that because there was one that
11 supported this and one that did not so that's to me not a consensus in regards to TNCs.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Ok, let me poll you guys real quick. Would you like me to go down the list one by
14 one? We can vote these up and down?

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: No.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Alright, so I have one Commissioner who's suggesting we don't advance this
19 list and particularly the issue of transportation is problematic to her and if she was going to
20 advance any of it she would advance just the rail part. Anybody else? Commissioner Lauing.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I have a few comments on that. There I don't know how many there were. There were like 5 last time now there's about 8 or 10, but my concern is that these are just very minor areas. They're not substantive at all and so kind of what's the point? I mean our substantive (interrupted)

Chair Alcheck: Would you prefer to not include it at all?

Commissioner Lauing: I would prefer not to include it all because (interrupted)

Chair Alcheck: Ok.

Commissioner Lauing: Not only is it not our substantive work, but we actually are in more agreement than I think these things show. So it could actually send the wrong message (interrupted)

Chair Alcheck: Ok so that's so there are two Commissioners suggesting we not advance this at all. Commissioner Summa then Gardias.

Commissioner Summa: I'll pass for now.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Gardias.

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: I agree. They seem redundant.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Redundant.

7

8 Commissioner Gardias: [Unintelligible]

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, anybody else? Commissioner Rosenblum.

11

12 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah, I don't see why we would not advance this to Council. This is

13 the output, the more substantive output is a the full transmission of the notes and the minutes

14 of these meetings. I think that if people want to send their own impressions of what were the

15 most important items to them they are free to publish memos and Council Members may

16 decide to read that, but this is the consolidated output that accompanies a very long transcript.

17 So I would I think it would be strange not to transmit this.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Yeah I'll sort of follow along. I am surprised by this desire because the effort that

20 we made over the last two meetings was we had so many topics to discuss and the process of

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 building consensus was too long. This represents items that we actually didn't have on our
2 table to vote up because we treated them as already consensus built. And so if for example any
3 of... I'll tell you right now it may not I... so two things; I would consider it very problematic to
4 suggest that this is not accurate because we've had it now with us for at least three meetings.
5 And at every meeting I encouraged Commissioners to raise an issue if they felt there was one
6 with this. So this is essentially the work product of our first two and a half meetings. The work
7 product of our last three meetings is completely unrelated to some of these topics. And so I
8 think it would be a mistake to not pass this on because to rely on the minutes of our first couple
9 meetings for what consensus there was is a task I would sort of encourage no one to take on.

10

11 So at least and I appreciate that maybe these are things that you don't necessarily support and
12 there may be items here that I don't necessarily support, but during our discussion the staff
13 heard from more than four or more individuals on these items and was able to create
14 consensus. That was a very hard task, that's why there's only eight. So my vote would be to
15 not abandon these. I have lights from Rosenblum did you relight? No. Ok, Summa did you
16 relight?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Yes.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: I have Summa and Gardias.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Summa: So I wanted to hear what my colleagues had to say, but I'm inclined to
3 agree with Commissioner Rosenblum and Alcheck and I don't know why we wouldn't advance
4 this. And I believe that we were as a body we were able to tell you, to correct you basically if
5 we thought you hadn't made the right decision about consensus. And I think there were two
6 that I disagree that I didn't think we had consensus on and they were taken off the list. So in as
7 much as we want to make things as simple for Council as we can I think it does represent our
8 work and I don't see why it would hurt them and I think we already vetted it and approved it.
9 So I don't have any reason to not send it to them.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Gardias.

12

13 Commissioner Gardias: So my stance is like this I mean I'm indifferent. If majority wants to
14 include them I go with majority, if majority doesn't want too. But there is a, but above all there
15 is an art of communication. So I think that what we should do next we should communicate
16 simple message to the Council and I think that if we just include number of the policies and
17 some of those are pretty much obvious on this sheet so I think that they would just bring
18 nothing new to the table, those are known and then the way we would be saying them to
19 pretty much to our strong message. If I was when I was listening to us tonight I pulled out one
20 strong item from numerous discussions that we had and that topic was about below market

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 rental units, BMR units. So I think that if there was a common denominator of numerous votes
2 that we had today it was about BMR units and that should be a single message to the Council.
3 It looks like to me that we agreed on this topic above everything else. So for giving this reason I
4 would just formulate one sentence to the Council that priority of this of this board is to support
5 BMR units throughout.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'm sorry. I was distracted for a minute. Are you making a Motion?

8

9 Commissioner Gardias: I'm proposing how to communicate this to the Council.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

12

13 Commissioner Gardias: Because there is a difference between just giving the Council the sheet
14 with numerous policies they will go through and they will ask themselves questions, what do I
15 do with this? As opposed to sending a strong message of some agreement that we have among
16 us. And I thought that when we talked tonight there was an agreement about the low income
17 housing.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so I'm going to try to refocus the discussion. I think the only time we had a
20 full consensus was on items that we were going to skip. And what I would suggest is this is an

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 incredibly sort of big picture thing. I think how many items of the 14 did we advance? Not
2 failed. Now many I know.

3

4 Ms. Gitelman: But we had seven from the prior discussion.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Right.

7

8 Ms. Gitelman: So on Packet Page 12 you'll see the seven from our prior discussion (interrupted)

9

10 Chair Alcheck: No, I've got that number in my head.

11

12 Ms. Gitelman: Including a commitment on BMR. So that is among the (interrupted)

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Including the tonight. I know.

15

16 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah.

17

18 MOTION #16

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: So we have seven plus how many from tonight? Seven, seven? It's six, sorry, I
2 don't know what... Ok, we have 13 items that will be in a report to Council that we felt were
3 high priority. This these comments are an additional eight that represent topics that were not
4 on our table to vote up. So, but let me why don't we just put to a vote?

5
6 I'm going to make a Motion that we forward this table as a table of items that represents a
7 general consensus among Commissioners during our discussion and deliberation. Do I have a
8 second?

9
10 SECOND

11
12 Commissioner Monk: I second the Motion.

13
14 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a second. I have a few lights. Lauing did you re... no. Did you relight?

15
16 Commissioner Monk: I did.

17
18 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I did.

19

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have every light. Ok, Monk speak to your second and then we'll go to
2 Lauing, I believe Summa, Rosenblum, and then Waldfogel. Commissioner Monk.

3

4 Commissioner Monk: So initially in reviewing this I did not feel that it was so pertinent that it
5 had to go before Council. I don't know that it will really impact anything for it to go to Council,
6 but the fact that we did put so much effort into it and were able to distill these messages down
7 I don't have a problem with advancing it to Council and I see no harm in moving it forward. And
8 for that reason I seconded the Motion to advance it towards Council.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Lauing.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, Chair Alcheck you said sort of will do any harm? No, it won't do
13 any harm. So if everybody wants to send it along that's fine. My point was it's not material
14 relative to our substantive debate that we had so.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Summa.

17

18 Commissioner Summa: Nope, I'm fine.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Summa, Commissioner Rosenblum, did you relight?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah.

Chair Alcheck: Go ahead.

Commissioner Rosenblum: So I support this. I think that people are struggling with the tables perceived triviality for some the items and so the way I would express it is we picked several items that we thought were of importance to discuss in depth and here is that table. And in addition prior to formulating that table there were a number of items that did not cause any controversy. Those items are represented below. It's just a report and I think that that's information for Council to note that those items all of us agreed and did not rise to the level of needing a separate discussion.

Chair Alcheck: And still represent changes?

Commissioner Rosenblum: Yes.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: I agree with Commissioner Rosenblum. I just want to add some
2 nomenclature like PTC preliminary consensus comments or working comments.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Love that. Ok, so let's put it to a vote. All those in favor of forwarding these
5 comments with the nomenclature that Commissioner Asher, Commissioner Waldfogel just
6 suggested, about preliminary PTC...

7

8 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: PTC preliminary consensus comments.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Preliminary PTC consensus comments. And I also like the language you had
11 about the first list represents items we went to great debate and the second represents items
12 that we didn't find controversial. And ok, so all those in favor of the Motion on the floor please
13 raise your hand. Ok, all those opposed? All those abstentions? For the record I just want to
14 suggest that you said you would go with the majority. You said it. You said it!

15

16 MOTION #16 __6 (Alcheck, Lauing, Monk, Summa, Rosenblum, Waldfogel), 0 opposed, 1
17 abstained (Gardias)

18 Commissioner Alcheck: I just want to state for the record you said you would go with the
19 majority (interrupted)

20 Commissioner Gardias: That's what I did with my abstension.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: We got a flip flopper.

3

4 Commissioner Gardias: My abstention would be (interrupted)

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Nothing you say, we can't take anything you say seriously anymore. Ok,

7 Commissioner Monk I see your light and then I want to move on to the EIR.

8

9 Commissioner Monk: So I don't mean to be out of line here and if I am just let me know staff. I

10 don't know what the parameters on this one, but we've had extensive debate on many items

11 and I'm just curious Commissioner Gardias there's been three times where you've weighed in

12 heavily on some topics here and this is the third abstention you've had. And I feel that your

13 votes are important to show whether you support or don't support things. I'd like to hear why

14 you abstained maybe going forward and I'm just curious about that and I don't know if it's

15 inappropriate, but I feel that with the amount of commentary that you have on these topics to

16 then abstain is just leaves a question mark in my mind as to what the whole point of the

17 discussion was.

18

19 Commissioner Gardias: For the record the abstention was about the message, was not about I

20 expressed myself clearly. I said go with the with the majority (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Commissioner Monk: I don't mean on this, I meant really one of the substantive ones. There
3 were two issues earlier that were you really weighed in heavy, heavily on. You had strong
4 feelings on a lot of substantive issues that we discussed earlier this evening and then when the
5 vote came you abstained and I was just curious as to why. Not really on I'm less concerned
6 about this one.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: You know what maybe that's a good conversation for an offline topic. I don't
9 want the minutes I don't know that the minutes need to reflect this rationale and I really do
10 appreciate it. I think what she's really trying to say is that your voice is an important one and
11 sometimes abstentions indicate sort of a lack of strong feelings and you seem to have strong
12 feelings. So but I don't know that we need to really get into this. So I think what I'd rather do is
13 look, we've been here five hours. We've got a little bit left to do maybe five hours and...

14

15 Commissioner Monk: Might I propose that the Chair offer people that abstain an opportunity to
16 speak to their abstention going forward if they wish?

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Ok, you know what? I'll entertain that. If we have abstentions we will allow
19 people to speak their abstentions. Ok at this time I want to make good progress here. We've
20 got an EIR. We've had it now since I think August 1st, is that correct? August 30th, excuse me.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Would staff please identify exactly the finding that we need to make related to the EIR? Is it up
2 there?

3

4 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah, thank you Commissioners. I think our hope is that you've had an
5 opportunity to read through the final EIR. In the past you've had opportunities to read through
6 the draft and the supplement to the draft so all three of these volumes combined constitute
7 the final EIR. And our hope is that you would advance a recommendation to the Council that
8 they certify the final EIR.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I just want to acknowledge two things and maybe you can help me. There
11 were how many comments made?

12

13 Ms. Gitelman: There were approximately 29 substantive comments that came in that are
14 responded to in the final EIR. So you'll see it's a document mostly made up of comments and
15 responses.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, can I get a Motion to recommend certification of the EIR?

18

19 MOTION # 17

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Monk: I'd like to move that we certify the Comp Plan and I don't have
2 (interrupted)

3

4 Chair Alcheck: EIR.

5

6 Commissioner Monk: The Comp Plan update EIR which is located in my bag that I'd have to pull
7 out so I can read.

8

9 SECOND

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a Motion to recommend sort of to recommend the City Council
12 certify the Comp Plan EIR. Can I get a second? I will second that Motion for purposes of this
13 discussion. I have a light from Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfoegel.

14

15 Commissioner Monk: I just want to state that I... I'm just getting a little tired so I apologize, but I
16 just I do believe that staff has contracted with the appropriate research group or whoever,
17 however this is produced and that it meets the State requirements and it sufficiently assesses
18 the impacts on the projects and that is the reason that I would like to recommend moving
19 forward with certifying this final EIR.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Well I'll second, I second the Motion and I'll suggest that my, I'll speak to in
2 that sense I think that this EIR serves its purpose well. We heard tonight from some members
3 of the public that it wasn't perfect and I think I am I was interested to hear that point of view
4 and I wouldn't disagree with it, but I do think that it serves its purpose and I would recommend
5 that City Council certify it. And so that's why I seconded this Motion. We have a light from
6 Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel and then I have a light from Commissioner Summa.

7
8 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah I'd just like clarification. I think earlier we had a short discussion
9 about what we actually need to do, whether we need to certify or whether we just need to
10 discuss. I mean what is our actual obligation right now?

11
12 Albert Yang, Senior Deputy City Attorney: The Commission just needs to consider or discuss the
13 EIR. It doesn't need to make a firm recommendation.

14
15 Ms. Gitelman: I think (interrupted)

16
17 Chair Alcheck: For example if this Motion failed we could still then move on the next item.

18
19 Ms. Gitelman: Right, although I think I'd like to articulate staff's recommendation or request
20 that you do consider recommending certification of this EIR. It took a lot of time and energy to

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 prepare. We've circulated it for a lot of public comment. We've responded to those
2 comments. We got good comments from the Commissioners, a lot of interest at the draft and
3 the supplement to the draft stage from Commissioners, and so it's been for a long process.
4 We're at the end of that process. I think we would appreciate your recommendations to the
5 Council.

6
7 Chair Alcheck: No I appreciate that, thank you, Director Gitelman. I it's for those exact reasons
8 that I support this recommendation. I think the process that we followed was textbook and it's
9 sort of no different than any project EIR that we review. We've had our opportunity to make
10 comments and so has the public and those comments have been addressed and to the extent
11 that someone may have some concerns about it I would encourage you guys to make some
12 comments, but I would encourage us to vote on this item. So I have a light from Commissioner
13 Summa and then Commissioner Gardias on this topic. Oh, I'm so sorry. Commissioner [Note
14 Vice-Chair] Waldfoegel I didn't realize you still had something to say. Go ahead.

15
16 Vice-Chair Waldfoegel: Yeah so I'm a little uncomfortable certifying it just because we haven't
17 had any hearing or presentation on the final document. We haven't talked about changes. It's
18 been several months since we've looked at this and honestly going through this document has
19 been a higher priority for most of us through the month of September. So I think if there was
20 an expectation that we would read the final EIR in addition to doing the work that we are that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 we've been doing I think that was a little unreasonable. So I'm uncomfortable certifying it at
2 this moment. I'm perfectly happy to say that we received it, but that's about as far as I'm
3 willing to go tonight.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Summa.

6

7 Commissioner Summa: So I really appreciate the work that went into it and the tremendous
8 amount of work that went into by staff and consultants, but I also feel a little bit unsure about
9 certifying it right now. I think we almost haven't had enough discussion of about the final EIR
10 and given that we don't have to certify it I almost would prefer to leave that decision up to the
11 City Council. It just doesn't quite feel like we've really had enough discussion about it.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: I'm just curious would you support a Motion that said we would recommend
14 certification if the City Council sees fit?

15

16 Commissioner Summa: No because I think that's...

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Didn't you just suggest that you would leave it up to City Council?

19

20 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, I don't have to make it's up to the City Council. We (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: I know. What I'm trying to do is I'm trying to address it and what I would like to
3 do is if we don't address the idea of moving it up and it sounds like you want to review it, but
4 you don't really want to review it.

5

6 Commissioner Summa: I think I just said that I thought we should review it.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Oh, I thought you just said you wanted to... sorry, I misunderstood,

9

10 Commissioner Summa: Sorry. And also I throughout the CAC because of just time constraints
11 and through no ill will or anything, but we never had a chance to correlate the elements across
12 the elements. And I so do Land Use and Transportation for instance are they correlated, do
13 they work well together, do they contradict each other? And that was something staff was
14 going to do and I don't think we should, I don't personally feel like I can certify the this the EIR
15 because of the reasons Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel stated and because we
16 haven't had any correlation across the elements which I had also always understood was
17 something that had to be done. And it is also I looked at it really, really carefully and I have to
18 be honest there's only things that can't be mitigated SU and things that are fully mitigated and
19 it's very difficult in a general sense and I'm not an expert on EIRs, it's very difficult for me to
20 believe that that much office growth and the other growth and changes in the City aren't going

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 to have any negative impacts. It's just it's I'm sorry, but it's counterintuitive. So since we do
2 not have to make a decision to certify it, just have to discuss it I'm more comfortable with not
3 certifying it.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok. I if it's ok with you I just want to parse this out a little bit. We have a Motion
6 on the floor it's recommending the Council certify the EIR with the second. I have
7 Commissioner Note Vice-Chair Waldfogel who I believe feels like we haven't really had an
8 ample opportunity to review it, which I can appreciate. I have Commissioner Summa who I
9 actually believe is saying she's reviewed it at great length, but is not satisfied with it. And then I
10 have a light from Commissioner Gardias and Commissioner Rosenblum. So we have a Motion
11 on the floor, it's going to get a vote. So Commissioner Gardias then Commissioner Rosenblum.

12

13 Ms. Gitelman: Mr. Chair could I offer just a few thoughts at this juncture? I just I want to be
14 very sensitive to the Commissioners that don't want to make a recommendation this evening. I
15 hope you've had an opportunity to at least flip through the document and understand kind of
16 the scope of the work that's gone into it and maybe I can just say a few things about the high
17 level conclusions.

18

19 First of all the final EIR as I said mostly contains comments and responses to comments
20 received in the prior documents. The most important sections or the most important

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 responses are gathered at the front of the book in what we call master responses. So we got a
2 lot of comments during the draft and the supplement phase on kind of cumulative
3 development, things other things that are happening in the region, and Stanford General Use
4 Permit (GUP) and things like that and we consolidated all those comments and responded to
5 those in one section. Similarly we got a lot of comments about school district, impacts on the
6 schools, the Council added a specific policy to the plan to address those concerns, and we
7 consolidated all those comments and responded to those in a master response. So hopefully
8 you've had a chance to at least look through there. None of them are super long, but we spent
9 a lot of time and energy kind of thinking about what the important comments were that we had
10 received, how to best respond to those, and providing those responses.

11

12 With regard to the issue that Commissioner Summa raised about the conclusions of the EIR it
13 does end up concluding that there are a handful of significant unmitigatable impacts, but that
14 conclusion was reached basically with all of the scenarios we analyzed. And it's a function of
15 basically the thresholds that we're using for our analysis and the nature of this plan as a
16 programmatic document looking out over 15 years in a region that's has a lot going on besides
17 the additional births and deaths and growth and change that's going to happen in in Palo Alto.
18 And so those are very predictable. There's an impact related to air quality because of a
19 contribution to air emissions that are considered what's the terminology? Nonattainment.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Constituents that we are not [unintelligible] for as a region. So very predictable, almost any EIR
2 you look at for a plan of this kind is going to reach that conclusion.

3

4 Similarly there were significant unavoidable impacts related to traffic congestion on at local
5 intersections and at freeway on ramps. Similarly if you look at any programmatic document like
6 this and any of the scenarios we analyzed you're going to end up with very similar significant
7 impacts. So none of these I mean I know this is hard to take that we can't solve every problem
8 because here in Palo Alto we like identifying and solving problems, but these are conclusions
9 that are not surprising for this kind of analysis. And I think they are defensible in terms of
10 having met the requirements in the law.

11

12 So I can talk about this stuff for hours and I won't go further. I completely understand. If you
13 want to recommend a certification to the Council that's terrific, we would very much like that.
14 If you feel like you can't at this point I think it sufficient to understand that the Commissioners
15 have at least cracked this open and looked through the EIR document a little bit in the course of
16 their consideration of the elements of the plan. And the elements and the interaction between
17 the elements is really quite distinct from the EIR itself. That's a question about the policy
18 document and we hope you've been able to do a little bit of that in your review of Land Use and
19 Transportation. Anyway I'll stop there.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, you guys know where we are right now. We have a Motion on the floor to
2 recommend certification. I have a light from Commissioner Gardias and a light from
3 Commissioner Rosenblum. Would you like to speak Commissioner Gardias?

4

5 Commissioner Gardias: Yes, please.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: So where do you stand?

8

9 Commissioner Gardias: So do we need to certify? Is there a statutory requirement for us to
10 certify EIR?

11

12 Ms. Gitelman: No. The City Attorney has stated that you just have to review it and you can
13 decline to make a recommendation on certification to the Council.

14

15 Commissioner Gardias: Exactly. I mean that's what I thought because the reason why we I'd
16 prefer just to follow that language is because it falls into the same area of the leadership has
17 the Comprehensive Plan. So a few months ago we discussed the different options when we
18 met together with City Council, if you remember when City Attorney just told us that we're
19 going to follow the process that's Council led. And then for this reason Council led the
20 Comprehensive Plan and I think that EIR because of the same reason falls into the same

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 category and pretty much that only our acknowledgment of the receipt is satisfactory for this
2 process. So I would suggest a change of the language to follow the overall process that we
3 pretty much the PTC acknowledge receipt and reviewed Comprehensive Plan EIR, what we did
4 on a couple of occasions. I wouldn't should not say, we should not say this is final because we
5 apparently haven't reviewed, but we had two sessions when we reviewed the EIR and then
6 pretty much one session was fruitful the other one was lukewarm interest in the EIR and that's
7 how we proceeded back then. So I think this is my recommendation to change the language.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Ok, Commissioner Rosenblum.

10

11 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so we have had this EIR come front of us a couple of times so I
12 feel like and part of the issue is fatigue which is that between that point and this point we've
13 had meeting after meeting on the Comp Planet all of us have obviously been focused on that.
14 And so sometimes it's just hard to dredge up the memory of was this really a substantive
15 discussion, did we fully vet this, and so I had to remind myself oh, yes [unintelligible]. And
16 there are still some issues that I have with the EIR. So for example, Steve Levy brought up
17 tonight, but it's also a longstanding issue of mine around decreasing water use and assumptions
18 around water use. Projections of increasing student population when the students per existing
19 household has been declining. So there are some individual issues that I have, but I agree with
20 Commissioner Monk that to the extent that we are not necessarily experts in some of the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 technical aspects of EIRs reviewing the major areas and the competency of the company that is
2 investigating this I do feel comfortable with this EIR. But it's been a little while since we had
3 these discussions so it feels like this vote is just uncomfortable to me because often it comes at
4 the end of a discussion and your comfort level is already set over the course of that discussion.

5
6 So having said all of that I went back to my notes for from when we had our meetings on this
7 issue. And I was comfortable at that time. I am still comfortable and so I would support the
8 Motion, but I understand my colleagues' hesitancy because I also feel like it feels very remote
9 at this point. And it feels like perhaps we would have new questions. So I am a weak supporter
10 of the Motion, I'll put it that way. I understand my colleagues. I feel like if we had this vote at
11 the end of our previous discussion that this I'd feel much stronger.

12
13 Chair Alcheck: Thank you, Commissioner Rosenblum. Commissioner Lauing you're the only one
14 we haven't heard from. Your light is on. There's three Commissioners who support this
15 Motion.

16
17 Commissioner Lauing: I know.

18
19 Chair Alcheck: So it really will fall down to you. Where do you stand?
20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: Well I think basically by not certifying it tonight it has no impact on
2 delaying any kind of evaluation of the Comp Plan at the Council level and the dates that we've
3 been given for their probable evaluation after they get our recommendations is out a few
4 weeks as well; actually maybe in a month or six weeks. So ideally what I would think many of
5 us are saying is that we should get a summary of this at our next meeting from you, just an
6 executive summary. I would be very confident that I mean from what I've read it looks very
7 good. I'm not a specialist there, but I think we would all have a lot more of a comfort level if we
8 could just go through one more round for 45 minutes with your executive summary. So in
9 terms of process Chair that could mean either that you vote with a number of abstentions or
10 you vote with "weak" votes from Commissioner Rosenblum or you withdraw the Motion and
11 we pick it up later.

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Yeah.

14

15 Commissioner Monk: From what I understand we either decided it tonight or not at all is that
16 correct?

17

18 Chair Alcheck: So staff, yeah why don't you (Interrupted)

19

20 Commissioner Monk: Director (interrupted)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, that's the good question. I don't think that (interrupted)

Commissioner Monk: Director Gitelman?

Commissioner Lauing: That's not what I heard.

Commissioner Monk: Is I'm under the impression that if we don't decide this tonight it's not going back to us. Is that correct?

Ms. Gitelman: That's right. We were really hoping that the Commission would either take an action or not, but consider the EIR and make a final recommendation this evening because we're up against that 90 day limit. I think the City Attorney is talking about the fact that we could bring it back, but it would have lost its currency. It will already be on the way to the Planning Commission **[Note-Council?]**, you will have already made your recommendation on the Comp Plan itself. So this is really your opportunity and I apologize maybe we should have scheduled an extra session to give you more background and kind of a summary of the conclusions. There is a pretty good executive summary in here, but we could have certainly given a presentation on how we got to the conclusions.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so I'm going to we are going to take this vote. I'll make one last comment
2 which is that I can appreciate if someone there's sort of two issues here. There's a disk... I think
3 we have one Commissioner who isn't satisfied with the document which is different and I think
4 what I'm hearing from you and even Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel and to some
5 extent Commissioner Gardias is sort of lack of familiarity on the item because it's been a few
6 weeks.

7
8 I am not entirely sure that, I guess my first point would be if for some reason you felt we when
9 we first met on this we had an opportunity to comment it and our second meeting was the
10 result of those comments. So I mean I guess it's hard to remember, but if there was.... I guess I
11 would encourage you not to I would encourage you to support the recommendation simply to
12 move it if you don't recall having some serious issue with the EIR. Because what we did was a
13 very textbook process here with respect to the EIR. So it's not as if this followed a very
14 different process from all the other EIRs that we work with. And the idea of having another
15 session is sort of difficult even if we did another session if you had questions about impacts that
16 would still require another session for our consultant to provide feedback to you at which point
17 really it would be moot because I believe City Council is going to take it up.

18
19 So the real question is and I guess to some extent you might have to rely on your memory or
20 even staff's recommendation is: is there some reason to think that the process was flawed or

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 that the EIR document is in is somehow inadequate. And I don't share either of those opinions.
2 I don't believe that we've that the process was flawed or that the document is somehow not
3 adequate enough to be certified. So that's where I'm going to vote. I think what will happen
4 right now is that either the vote will, the Motion will move or it won't and either way we will
5 deal with it. So it's fine if there are four abstentions from my perspective because we have
6 discussed it and Council will have that.

7

8 So with that I would call for a vote. All those in favor of supporting the Motion on the floor
9 which is to recommend that the Council certify the EIR, please raise your hand. Ok, we have
10 three in... oh, four. I don't look over there anymore. Four. Alright, we had four (interrupted)

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: I can I could explain my vote if...

13

14 Commissioner Monk: Would you?

15

16 Chair Alcheck: All those opposed? It was a he was a late raise. All those opposed to the
17 Motion? We have one and abstentions? Ok. I'm going to invite the opposition of the Motion
18 to speak to her opposition and then I will invite the abstainers if they would like to add
19 commentary to speak to their abstentions.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 MOTION #16 PASSED :4 (Alcheck, Gardias, Monk, Rosenblum), 1 (Summa), 2 abstained (Lauing,
2 Waldfogel)

3

4 Commissioner Summa: Well first of all just to reiterate I don't mean to disrespect the very hard
5 work that went into it. I think I know that, but I am just not comfortable certifying it and I don't
6 think we have to because the our legal advice was that we have to discuss it and if it won't
7 ultimately hold the process up. And that's not my intention so that's good. I just am not
8 comfortable certifying it and I don't think there's any value in getting into a lengthy discussion
9 of the details of the mitigations.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you for that comment. Would either of you like to speak to your
12 abstentions?

13

14 Commissioner Lauing: I will.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Ok, please Commissioner Lauing.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: Somewhat like Commission Rosenblum I'm a weak non-vote, borderline,
19 and I don't have any reason at all to believe that any sentence is wrong. Again I've read, I read
20 it before and now, but I just feel like we're not in the way of any progress so rather than saying I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 get it, I love it, I don't have any questions I'd rather just ask some questions. So that's why I
2 abstained.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel would you like to speak to your
5 abstention or?

6

7 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: No, I agree with Commissioner Lauing's points.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Ok. Ok, alright I'm going to make another Motion right now. That Motion is that
10 (interrupted)

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: You're going to make Motions? Why don't we ask us if we want to make
13 Motions?

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Well I, I'm going to, I don't know. I don't see any lights so I'm going to make a
16 Motion.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: You didn't say what was next.

19

20 MOTION #17

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: I'm going to make a Motion to move that we include all of the items on Page 7
3 under the word recommendation and bullets, excuse me, under the third bullet, the white
4 bullets. Excuse me, I'm talking about the white bullets on Page 7. I'm going to make a Motion
5 that we report to Council the recommendations that received consensus tonight of the highest
6 priorities. That we also include the consolidated list of PTC comments which we discussed a
7 short while ago with the language that we modified it with, and also the minutes which I
8 believe Council will ultimately ask for regardless from our last 90 days of meetings. And that
9 report obviously would include the last Motion we just made which was a recommendation to
10 certify the EIR.

11

12 So essentially what I'm suggesting in our effort here to conclude our meeting is that we now
13 make a Motion to communicate all of the things we've worked so hard on the last 90 days
14 which essentially includes a list of the items that we've completed tonight, the 13 items that we
15 debated, and the table of items that we discussed earlier tonight that represent general
16 consensus on non-controversial items that are PTC... what was that language? Anyways
17 preliminary consensus items and including our recommendation to certify the EIR. So all I
18 would like to make a Motion that our report include all of those items and be communicated to
19 staff, communicated to the City Council as they requested at the conclusion of this 90 day
20 period. I have two lights, but do I have a second?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 SECOND

3

4 Commissioner Rosenblum: Second.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a second from Commissioner Rosenblum. I'll entertain the lights first
7 and then you can speak to your Motion or your second ok, Commissioner Rosenblum? I have
8 Commissioner Lauing, Gardias, and then Monk.

9

10 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 TO MOTION #17

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: Yes, I was actually going to make a Motion so I won't put it in the form of
13 a Substitute Motion at this point. Perhaps I can do this with an amendment, but I'm interested
14 in definitely forwarding the about 13 which is now been our substantive policy where we've
15 had a chance to debate those. And I agree that we should forward those to Council as being
16 substantive and they're going to have their discussion. At some point they're going to say yay
17 or nay to some of those things. So I would like to add a step which is that those Motions that
18 we sent forward that are subsequently agreed to by Council be returned to us for the next step
19 after that. Because we have to kind of figure out where that goes in the Comp Plan. Some of
20 the items are not that specific and clearly it's our bailiwick to help out with that. So I would

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 suggest that whatever they can get back to us that we have about 60-75 days, I'll say 75 days to
2 kind of work those back into the policy language. So for example if you look at the one Item 2
3 from last week we were talking Land Use Element narratives and maps that was about walkable
4 neighborhoods and professional and personal services 7-0. Obviously that has to work back
5 from almost a philosophical Motion back into specific language in the policies or that other one
6 where we talked about BMR housing that we're all very supportive of at some point it has to be
7 beyond the language that is in that Motion which is very long.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: I think I appreciate the amendment.

10

11 Commissioner Lauing: Right,

12

13 Chair Alcheck: Let me ask you a question before I move on to the next speaker. Would you
14 support this Motion if I add at the end of it that report could include a statement to the effect
15 that if Council would like the Commission to investigate any of these recommendations further
16 we would be happy to. And the reason why I am suggesting that we invite them to invite us is
17 because well I certainly don't want to suggest that they have to and I'm sensitive to the notion
18 that they may, they likely won't. That they will likely have their own recommendations that
19 they will want adjustments and changes to and I guess what I'm trying to say is I would include
20 language to suggest that if they would like our help in investigating some of these issues more

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 deeply that obviously they're welcome to send it back to us. But I don't know that I would
2 suggest they need to because I don't know that that's going to happen.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: Well what basically what I'm saying is that we're sending them 13. To
5 pick a round number let's say they say hey, these ten are great, then what? Somebody has to
6 take those ten and incorporate them into actual where they fit with policies and I'm just
7 suggesting that we have the capability, the interest, the experience set to do that. There's no
8 CAC now. Council Tanaka and Schmid and others when we had our meeting said we want you
9 guys to work on the details and these are details. So I don't think they're going to pick it up in a
10 committee. So it pretty much has to come back to us to get integrated into these policies.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Are you comfortable with that language? Essentially if I suggest that if any of
13 these items they would like us to review in greater detail they...?

14

15 Commissioner Lauing: They, no because I mean...

16

17 Chair Alcheck: What language are you suggesting?

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: We're not really at the language at this point because what I'm saying is
2 that we're suggesting that not only here are the 13, but when you decide which ones you want
3 to incorporate we're happy to jump into it and integrate these into the policy of the Comp Plan.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok so (interrupted)

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: And would like some time that's reasonable because we'd like to get it
8 done by the end of the year to do that.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok so alright, I'll use the language that you just said. If I add language to my
11 Motion that suggests that we would be happy to spend further time on any of these issues...

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: But we're the thing I'm...

14

15 Chair Alcheck: I'm trying to understand your amendment.

16

17 Commissioner Lauing: I know and I'm trying to make a distinction here. They can say yes or no
18 to anything that we recommend. What I'm specifically recommending is that after they agree
19 to the Motions we're asking that they come back to PTC to be worked into the goals.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

2

3 Commissioner Lauing: And they can say yes or no.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Alright so here's what I'm trying to say to you I would be comfortable suggesting
6 that we're open to reviewing things further. I'm not comfortable asking them to send it back.
7 I'm not comfortable that our recommendation is asking them as if I recommend you send this
8 back to me because I don't believe that's what they asked of us. I think they asked us to do a 90
9 day high level review and our 90 days are up and I believe they're interested in doing their high
10 level review. I'm happy to say suggest that we would be delighted to work on this more if they
11 wish, but I'm not I'm not inclined to ask them. So if your is amendment is suggesting language
12 where we are recommending that they send it back to us that's not language I'd like to accept.
13 If your amendment is that we include language that says we would be happy to continue to
14 work on this should they see fit I would include it. So if it's the former then no.

15

16 Commissioner Lauing: I guess not because I'm just they could say no either way.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: They could say no. I'm suggesting that I don't think it's necessary to have it come
19 back. So I wouldn't recommend having it come back. I am comfortable recommending that if

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 they'd like us to look into it I would, but I don't think it has to come back or even should come
2 back. So that's where the distinction is so I'm suggesting to you that (interrupted)

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: They could say no, we're going to do it ourselves. No, we're going to
5 restart CAC, whatever.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: I know. This is my Motion. This is my Motion. So you're suggesting amending
8 language. I'm suggesting to you that I would be comfortable adding this language. Is that ok
9 with you or does that not go far enough?

10

11 Commissioner Lauing: I don't think it goes far enough.

12

13 FRIENDLY AMENDMENT #1 REJECTED

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Ok. That's perfectly all right. In that case I don't accept the friendly language. I
16 have Commissioner Gardias. I was trying. I have Commissioner Gardias.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: So was I.

19

20 Chair Alcheck: I have Commissioner Monk and then Commissioner Rosenblum.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20

SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #17

Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. I'd like to propose a Substantive [Note-Substitute] Motion to have the language as you just expressed, but also adds one more element and that would say that PTC finds prioritization of family and BMR units as a common thread of all the proposed changes in the Comprehensive Plan. The reason why I'm just proposing to single of this out and put it as part of the recommended Motion is because when I was listening as I said before when I was listening to you or us discussing this I thought those were just two most important items to us. And I just want to make sure that there is a single unified message to the Council about all these different policies and if there is a message I think this would be it.

Chair Alcheck: Ok just before I call for a second because I know that I have to even though I sort of wish we didn't have a Substitute Motion on the floor right now. Would staff mind just taking one minute and identifying the item that we dealt with in our first meeting that addresses the BMR issue? And the reason why I am asking for that Commissioner Gardias is one of the 13 items that we are communicating to them is about BMR and I believe that item received a significant consensus and I just want clarity. Can you do me a favor can you read me that Motion and then tell me how many people supported it?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah it was a unanimous Motion that says the PTC supports a strong
2 commitment to creating BMR housing inventory for purchase and rental. It is too tentative
3 appearing at a program level. The PTC recommends the Council make Program L-1.3.1 into a
4 separate policy consistent with and in support of the quantified goals for Housing Element
5 housing production in the adopted Housing Element.

6
7 Chair Alcheck: Ok and a second question real quick just for the purpose of this discussion; how
8 many items on our list of 13 received unanimous consent? So there are only two items on our
9 list that are going to be at the top that received unanimous agreement. So I'm just, the reason
10 why I'm mentioning this is because I actually think this item is way up there. I think Council's
11 going to see right away that that was a topic and so I know you have a Substitute Motion on the
12 floor. I don't think we need to add more language that we would need the author right now.
13 So that's all my say, if you want to withdraw it or you want me to seek a second I will. I'm
14 turning to you now.

15
16 Commissioner Gardias: I hear you. I think that there was also another item when we talk about
17 the infill. It also talked exclusively about BMR units. So there are at least two and maybe there
18 was another one and then of course our discussions I heard lots of support about BMR. So
19 respecting that this would be at the top of the list I still that that there is at least what I heard
20 consensus within this Commission and for this reason I would like to clearly communicate this

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 to the Council. It's not going to overwrite anything that it's there. So I think it would be worth
2 the message. I'm looking for the second. Thank you.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll call for a second. I what I would suggest though is that for this Motion to
5 work we would need to understand exactly the statement that you would want to make
6 because essentially the report is going to reflect the conversations we've had in votes and
7 Motions and so if you want an overarching paragraph related to BMR housing I'm not entirely
8 sure it can be easily authored from this stage right now, but I do think that in order for this
9 Motion to work you need to have one. So I will let, I will allow the discussion for a second.

10 Does anybody wish to make a second on this Motion?

11

12 SECOND

13

14 Commissioner Summa: I'm sorry. Hitting the wrong button. I will second it and I would suggest
15 that it could be just the statement that Hillary read.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: That statement is already included in our report.

18

19 Commissioner Summa: I know it's in the report. I think that Commissioner (Interrupted)

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: You want us to list it twice?

2

3 Commissioner Summa: Gardias wanted to emphasize it in the Motion to give it the weight he
4 felt it deserved and I.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

7

8 Commissioner Summa: So I'll second it.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Alright. We have a Substitute Motion on the floor. It's it sounds like it's
11 substantially the same as my Motion except you'd like us to restate the one element with extra
12 emphasis. Ok.

13

14 Commissioner Gardias: I just want to be clear, right? What I read it was just one sentence it
15 was talking about the PTC finds prioritization of family and BMR units as a common thread of
16 proposed changes in the Comprehensive Plan. So I singled out family and I think that there was
17 also agreement on this and BMR that's what I heard today.

18

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so family that's I didn't hear you the first time you said. Are you on board
2 with this? I really want this to be more efficient. We're in the last hour of the stretch. So I just
3 need to understand, are you seconding this Motion?

4

5 Commissioner Summa: A question for a Director Gitelman and I'm sorry I referred to you by
6 your first name, but the statement that you wrote earlier was about BMR housing, is that
7 correct?

8

9 Ms. Gitelman: That's correct.

10

11 Commissioner Summa: So I think we should stick to that because that is what we are basing it
12 on and I don't think we want to go beyond, add other things into that.

13

14 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Summa do you second the Motion? I have a Substitute Motion. I
15 have a Motion on the floor and I have a Substitute Motion. Are you seconding the Substitute
16 Motion?

17

18 Commissioner Summa: I am asking the maker of the Substitute Motion if he would revert back
19 to the original statement he made which was about BMR housing.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: So just so we're clear here are you willing to do that?

2

3 Commissioner Gardias: I believe no because the reason is that (interrupted)

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Ok. No, no, I'm cutting you off for a, I'm excuse me, I'm cutting you off. He's not
6 willing to do that so I'm taking that you're not seconding this Motion?

7

8 SECOND OF SUBSTITUTE MOTION #1 TO MOTION #17 REVOKED

9

10 Commissioner Summa: Yes.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. We have a Motion on the floor, the original Motion on the floor. We
13 don't have a second for the Substitute Motion so we have original Motion on the floor. I have
14 Commissioner, I have every Commissioner. I have Commissioner Rosenblum.

15

16 Commissioner Rosenblum: You have a second on your original Motion is that right?

17

18 Chair Alcheck: I do. You are my second.

19

20 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah so we still have that. We're not looking for any...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: No we have a Motion on the floor. Would you like to speak to it?

3

4 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yes, I would. So first I'm shocked at this hour that we're debating

5 this. This is just our work product. The Motion is to take our work product and pass it to

6 Council. So at 10:30 after we've gone through and we've gotten to the end we have a table

7 that says here's the things we didn't want to discuss we felt they were obvious and here the

8 ideas we discussed and here are the results. And so the Motion to me is non it's like

9 confirmation of minutes at the very end of all of this. The Motion is to take our work product

10 and pass it to Council. So I support that.

11

12 The reason why I don't suggest adding other causes for particular emphasis is honestly as much

13 as I appreciate Commissioner Gardias' wish to kind of make a compelling unifying statement I'm

14 not sure all of us necessarily agree in our heads that that was the strongest thing that we felt

15 even if it was a unanimous vote. It may not have been the one that any of us felt was the most

16 important and you're opening a can of worms. The wording around housing for example was

17 affordable and afford... it was both affordable housing and housing that is affordable. People

18 may take issue with that and may want to open a discussion about which of these phrases was

19 most important to them. So I suggest that we take the work product as suggested in the two

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 tables as suggested pass it to Council along with the full transcript which is I mean I think quite
2 a nice piece of work and to me the obvious conclusion of all of this. So I second it.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have Commissioner Monk, Commissioner Lauing, Commissioner Summa,
5 and Commissioner Gardias.

6

7 Commissioner Monk: So I support the Motion and the comments just set forth by the seconder
8 of the Motion Commissioner Rosenblum. I always say that wrong, don't I? Blum, my apologies.
9 Are we able to advance this to vote at this juncture? And I also had an original my light was lit
10 originally on a separate issue.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: In theory you could advance this, correct me if I'm wrong, could she advance this
13 to a vote with a call, call the question?

14

15 Mr. Yang: Yeah you would have to have a vote on whether or not you want to vote.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: [unintelligible - background noise] Not sure Siri knows the answer to that one.
18 Sorry, I don't know why that activated. Let me ask that question again. Could she advances to
19 a vote immediately if she calls the question?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Yeah and you'd have to have a vote on calling the question. So it would be a
2 vote to stop debate and vote on the Motion.

3

4 Commissioner Lauing: We just started debate.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Got it. So the answer is that you could advance this. It would require you to call
7 the question which would require that we quickly vote on whether we want to stop debate and
8 vote on this. So it's you're basically polling the group to whether or not we want to vote on this
9 right now.

10

11 MOTION TO CALL THE QUESTION

12

13 Commissioner Monk: Yes I'd like to advance, call the question.

14

15 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so all those... does that need a second?

16

17 SECOND

18

19 Commissioner Rosenblum: Second.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 VOTE TO CALL THE QUESTION

2

3 Chair Alcheck: Ok, we have a second. All those in favor of ending the debate on this Motion
4 and taking a vote on this Motion please raise your hand. Ok we only have three in favor. All
5 those opposed? Ok we have three opposed and one abstention. What do I do? I it just fails.

6

7 MOTION FAILED (3 (Alcheck, Monk. Rosenblum), 3 (Lauing, Summa, Waldfoegel), 1 abstension
8 (Gardias)

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright so I have a Motion on the floor. We have three individuals who would
11 like to vote on right away, but we can't so we are going to continue down the list.
12 Commissioner Lauing.

13

14 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah I totally agree with Commissioner Rosenblum, this is our work
15 product gladly and happily because on August 30th we didn't have any policy recommendations
16 to send to Council now we do, 13 of them. If any of them are accepted then in order for the
17 Comp Plan to be corrected/completed whatever word you want to use that has to be
18 integrated back in and so my preference is to recommend forwarding that work product and
19 secondly to recommend that those that are approved come back to the logical place to be
20 worked in.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Can I make a suggestion? Would you consider since it sounds like you actually support the Motion would you consider making a Motion after the Motion to make that and then we could vote on that separately as opposed to commingling them? So essentially we would make a Motion to pass on all of our work product as it's currently made and on the floor and then you could I would give you the floor to raise a Motion that would ask Council that should they accept any of these to send it back to us. And then you could see whether or not your fellow Commissioners support that?

Commissioner Lauing: Sure.

Chair Alcheck: Ok. Alright, well in that case would you like to call the question and take it (interrupted)

Commissioner Lauing: No. I want people to be able to debate.

Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright I have two lights left. I have Commissioner Lauing, uh Summa and Gardias and then Waldfogel.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Summa: My question was about whether or not I was interested in
2 Commissioner Lauing's amendment and I don't think he really got a chance to ask if there were
3 any other Commissioners that supported his amendment. I know that the maker and the
4 seconder has to accept it, but I thought it was sort of traditional to ask if there was support
5 from his from your colleagues.

6
7 Chair Alcheck: Typically somebody makes a Friendly Amendment. It's up to the maker to accept
8 it and then the seconder has to also accept it for it to be part of the current Motion. In lieu of
9 accepting his amendment I suggested that he consider making a separate Motion so as not to
10 comingle these two ideas and it sounds like he accepted that. It's not typical for the Chair to
11 ask other individuals not involved in the Motion to opine on whether they like the amendment
12 or not.

13
14 Commissioner Summa: Ok.

15
16 Ms. Gitelman: Can I just clarify? I mean it could be advanced as a Motion. Someone can make
17 an amendment to a Motion that's not a Friendly Amendment (interrupted)

18
19 Chair Alcheck: They can make this Unfriendly Amendment.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Ms. Gitelman: Yeah.

2

3 Chair Alcheck: Yeah.

4

5 Ms. Gitelman: I think the solution that you've come up with a another Motion after this Motion
6 is equally it gets to the same end.

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Right. I'm trying to sort of help everybody out here. Commissioner [Note Vice-
9 Chair] Waldfoegel, no. Yeah, Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfoegel. question waffle.

10

11 Vice-Chair Waldfoegel: Yeah just point of clarification on the Motion. So can we just clarify is
12 what we're doing now simply forwarding the tables that we've discussed? We're not
13 forwarding any other commentary per this Motion on our general outlook on this, it's just here
14 are our comments. Is that correct?

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Yeah. I think what we're suggesting right now is that Council is going to prepare
17 a packet for the next meeting that the excuse me, staff is going to prepare a packet for Council
18 for the meeting where they review the Comp Plan and what I'm suggesting is that that packet
19 include a report that communicates all of the items that we came that we discussed as high
20 level issues and had some level of consensus on in order of greatest consensus to least

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 consensus is how I would number it, but actually I don't particularly care how you do it and as
2 well as the table that we talked about earlier and as well as the recommendation that we
3 certify the EIR; so essentially the report is a summary of the items that are that we specifically
4 completed.

5

6 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Right and as point of clarification (interrupted)

7

8 Chair Alcheck: And it sorry, it would also include the minutes.

9

10 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Which I will just suggest to you that even if it didn't include the minutes staff
13 would have to include the minutes. So I'm including the minutes, but it's an irrelevant
14 component and if you would like me not to include it I will not include it in my Motion. But it
15 will get included no matter what in their packet.

16

17 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Yeah, I wouldn't include it in the Motion, but I don't I'm indifferent. But
18 the point is what we're saying is we've reviewed it and out of items we discussed here is our
19 commentary. We're not making any broader statement just to be perfectly clear.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: To be perfectly clear there was a moment when a Substitute Motion was on the
2 floor which included an additional statement.

3

4 Vice-Chair Waldfoegel: Right, right, but I'm saying but we're not making any broader statement
5 that we like everything except for this list of 13 items. We're just saying these are 13 things
6 we've identified?

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Yeah. I would suggest that there isn't even I think that the only context and
9 narrative likely to be a part of this will be an explanation of the process we chose to adopt
10 which will be that during the 90 day review period I imagine staff will have some summary
11 Commissioners decided to focus on the Land Use Element and the Transportation Element
12 exclusively, they began the process by discussing goals and policies, and then diverted into a
13 different process where they identified issues of greatest concern, and then had a more in
14 depth debate. I mean I imagine that's going to the extent of the commentary ahead of the
15 data.

16

17 Vice-Chair Waldfoegel: Ok, great I'm comfortable with that.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Ok. I have the Commissioner Rosenblum.

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Rosenblum: Yeah just to follow my earlier comments I am still a little mystified.
2 Again, this is it. Commissioner Laing I think what you're asking is that we suggest to Council
3 what their next step should be and they can and they may very well might after seeing all this
4 say well we prefer for this to go back to the PTC for them to suggest and they do that
5 sometimes. I don't I haven't seen a Motion that we've made in the past that says here's all of
6 our work and our recommendations and after you talk about this you should send it back to us.
7 For the purpose of just leaving and getting home I would support your Motion because I don't
8 think it's that relevant. I'm just sort of like mystified that we spent 30 minutes on this now
9 because I don't think it does anything one way or the other. And correct me if I'm wrong
10 Chairman if you if you're not accepting it just because it's doesn't do anything I would suggest
11 that you accept it and we just move forward.

12
13 Chair Alcheck: Well, no (Interrupted)

14
15 Commissioner Rosenblum: Or I guess I could just second yours and call this to vote, but
16 otherwise (interrupted)

17
18 Chair Alcheck: Hold on [unintelligible].

19
20 Commissioner Rosenblum: We're just not getting out of here.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Chair Alcheck: Just to be clear I think the I think you were comfortable with the idea of parsing these into two Motions and you can make your Motion immediately after, which is my preference.

Commissioner Lauing: I would rather have it grouped because it makes more sense there and as Commissioner Rosenblum said if it's sort of a no brainer then I'm not sure why we're debating it. I mean it's just the whole issue is (interrupted)

Chair Alcheck: [Unintelligible] hold on, I get it you want to go home, but I don't think suggesting a Motion that you actually don't think is a good idea that you would second it.

Commissioner Rosenblum: I mean it's a no brainer in that it doesn't do anything one way or the other. I don't think it's wise to be clear.

Chair Alcheck: So don't second it.

Commissioner Rosenblum: I don't think it helps, but I also don't think it does anything.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: This is the second time in two meetings where somebody was going to make a
2 Motion that they didn't support. I just don't think it's wise. We have a Motion on the floor it
3 has a second. I get that you want to make an amendment. I'm suggesting that if you want to
4 make a Substitute Motion I can't stop you, you're welcome to do it, but what I would like to do
5 is not have a Substitute Motion process and give us an opportunity.

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: I didn't offer one.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: If you want to make a Substitute Motion, do it. I would also encourage
10 individuals who don't think a Motion is worthy of their vote to not support it simply because
11 they want to leave the room. It's just not good practice. So with that let's put it to a vote. Let's
12 put this Motion to a vote and then I will give you the floor to make a second Motion which I
13 think is potentially supported. I just don't want to combine them if it's ok with you, but
14 ultimately it's your choice. So seeing no light I'm going to call this Motion.

15

16 Commissioner Gardias: Can we restate it was because (Interrupted)

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, the Motion is that we are going to have staff communicate to Council in a
19 report all of the work that we've done related to the discussion of consensus votes on these
20 high level priorities which are reflected in a Motions that we passed tonight and last week, the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 last meeting, as well as the table as modified by the language that we discussed earlier when
2 we discussed the table, as well as the recommendation that we certify the EIR. Excuse me, as
3 well as the recommendation that Council certify the EIR and as well as the minutes could be
4 linked to our work. The second was Commissioner Rosenblum. All those in favor of supporting
5 this... All those in favor of supporting this Motion on the floor please raise your hand. 7-0.

6

7 MOTION #17 PASSED (7-0)

8

9 Chair Alcheck: Ok, at this time I'm going to acknowledge Commissioner Lauing.

10

11 MOTION #18

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah, I just think the well ok, so the Motion is that if and when any of
14 the 13 recommendations are approved we will recommend that and welcome that they be
15 returned to us to work into the Comp Plan in the appropriate policy spaces, places, excuse me.
16 And that we recommend approximately 75 days for that process from the point at which they
17 refer those Motions back to us. Those agreed to Motions.

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Does anybody wish to second the Motion on the floor?

20

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Summa: I have a question; 75 days, when would that be?

2

3 Commissioner Lauing: Trying to get it into this year, but it depends on when they send it back.

4

5 Commissioner Summa: Ok, would that be in this year? I don't think it can be that many days.

6

7 Commissioner Lauing: 60.

8

9 Commissioner Summa: Why don't, can we just leave the number of days off of it and then I'll
10 second it.

11

12 Commissioner Lauing: I don't want to signal that it's going to go on for six months because
13 that's not the intent. The intent is to get ten things back, work them quickly, and say we're
14 done.

15

16 Commissioner Summa: So how many? 75 days I'm not comfortable with.

17

18 Commissioner Lauing: 60?

19

20 Commissioner Summa: I don't know does that get us into this year or next year? I mean...

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

Commissioner Lauing: It depends on when we get it back if we get it back.

Chair Alcheck: Ok just to be clear will you restate the Motion one more time?

Commissioner Lauing: Did you guys write it down? Ok. Motion is that of the 13 recommendations that we sent to Council those that are agreed to by Council we recommend that they return those to PTC for the coordination of those policy Motions with the specific policies in the Comp Plan.

Chair Alcheck: So just for the sake of clarity what you're suggesting is that we our Motion is asking City Council to direct the Planning Commission to author language for the Comp Plan should any of our recommendations be adopted.

Commissioner Lauing: That's not the wording of the Motion, but I think that's the intent.

Chair Alcheck: But that's what you want. You want us to you want it to come back so we can we can author it, is that what you're saying?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Commissioner Lauing: Well I think I wouldn't use the word author it, I'd say integrate the
2 policies from the generic policy of Motions that we have integrate them into the policies.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, alright.

5

6 Commissioner Lauing: Does it require writing, yes?

7

8 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, yeah. No I just want to make sure that's what you meant.

9

10 Commissioner Summa: And in restating it I notice you didn't specify any number of days. So I
11 was (interrupted)

12

13 Commissioner Lauing: I'm still at 60. I don't think we should send it over there without it, but if
14 I can't get a second without it then I'll, I mean with it then I'll take it without it.

15

16 Chair Alcheck: Ok.

17

18 Commissioner Summa: I would be more comfortable without it. I think it's a little prescriptive.

19

20 Commissioner Lauing: Fine.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Chair Alcheck: Alright so let me (interrupted)

3

4 SECOND

5

6 Commissioner Summa: So I will second it without it.

7

8 VOTE

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Let me just ask the Commission. Does anybody wishes to second this Motion
11 with the 60 day requirement? Ok. So I understand that there's a second without the 60 day
12 requirement? Alright. I don't see any lights. I'll put this to a vote. Ok, all those in favor of the
13 Motion on the floor please raise your hand. Ok there are four Commissioners who support the
14 Motion on the floor. All those opposed? Would any of you like to speak your dissent?

15

16 MOTION #18 PASSED: 4(Gardias, Lauing, Summa, Waldfogel) -3 (Alcheck, Monk, Rosenblum)

17

18 Commissioner Monk: Commissioner Monk would like to speak to her dissent. I think this
19 process has been belabored. I think that staff put a lot of effort into collecting our thoughts,
20 synthesizing it. I just think we've taken enough of their resources in this. I don't know that

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 there would be any meaningful change or outcome had this not passed and I'm just looking to
2 expedite at this juncture getting this back to Council, letting them do what they need to do to
3 move forward and adopt the Comp Plan in as close as the same format that it came to us in. I
4 don't think that there's much more that we can do with regard to swaying Council so.

5

6 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I'll make a comment real quick. It's not that I don't appreciate the desire. I
7 want you know that. It's that there are only two issues that received a unanimous consent on
8 our 13 which is to suggest and even those issues I don't know that if they came back to us that
9 we as a group could unite around necessarily the same suggested authorship. And that to me is
10 the problem, we are ultimately not the body where the buck doesn't stop here. So I think our
11 recommendations are suggesting that Council consider some changes, but we really need them
12 to make that decision because Number 1 that's they're the ultimate decision makers. And my
13 larger concern was even if it did come back to us a number of these issues we don't have
14 consensus on. So imagine what it would be like to author an item that you didn't even support.
15 It could be really problematic. I think sixty days probably wouldn't be enough.

16

17 I also think that we sort of resisted the idea of authorship throughout. This is an effort that the
18 CAC developed and I don't know that we really want to invite what I believe is an exceptionally
19 hard task which is to somehow build consensus around very controversial issues. I think the
20 question now is what does the Council think? Do they agree or disagree? Which side of the

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 table did they agree with on the 9 on the 11 things that we didn't get full votes on? So that's
2 where I stood on this. It's not a disinterest. I would love to author this, but chances are the
3 way I author things and the way you author things would be different and I don't know that we
4 really want to continue to grapple with these items considering that Council really has to make
5 the decision. So that's where I stood on that.

6
7 I'm going to ask us to relight your lights just in case they are old ones if anybody wants to make
8 any final comments? We have two Motions that passed. Staff I think that we've completed,
9 but we have maybe some final comments by Commissioner [Note Vice-Chair] Waldfogel and
10 Summa.

11
12 Vice-Chair Waldfogel: Just a point of clarification with the transmittal. You may have said this,
13 but it's getting late. Will the transmittal say that we will only considered the Land Use and
14 Transportation Elements that we did not consider other elements? Great, thank you.

15
16 Chair Alcheck: Commissioner Summa.

17
18 Commissioner Summa: Yeah, very quickly about the last Motion that passed I don't I didn't
19 really see it as us authoring it. I saw it as us helping because really staff and the consultant
20 authored with after input from the public and the CAC. I saw it as us finding a way to help staff

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 who knit it in after Council has decided they want these things knitted into the Comp Plan the
2 same way they did throughout the whole process. Thank you.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, any other lights?

5

6 Ms. Gitelman: Thank you Commissioners for all your hard work on this. I know it wasn't easy,
7 but we did it in the 90 days and I think we came up with some great ideas for the Council to
8 consider.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have two lights left. I have Commissioner Gardias and Commissioner Monk.

11

12 Commissioner Gardias: Thank you. So I was really surprised that Commissioner Lauing didn't go
13 farther than that. I believe that there is a really this group is a center of excellence and has a
14 deep expertise in the Comprehensive Plan and city planning and transportation overall. And
15 Council cannot match it because they are focused on different issues. And then I totally
16 appreciate this vote and then the way that it went although in my perception Council is still
17 taking the lead on the Comprehensive Plan because I think that they need to work on this. I
18 don't believe that they will spend time themselves on resolving those issues. I really hope that
19 they will just send those issues back to us and they will ask us to provide the concrete
20 recommendations for the changing the Comprehensive Plan. I also hope that they will read this

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 meeting minutes and maybe they will read even this comment. I hope that maybe they can
2 even go farther and then maybe they can read the rest of our items and then maybe they can
3 recommend that we go back and we spend another half a year to go through the rest of the
4 items that we did and we captured which I find very comprehensive, very professional in scope
5 and I wanted to put this on the minutes. Thank you.

6

7 Chair Alcheck: That's probably what it would take actually. Ok I have Commissioner Monk and I
8 have Commissioner Lauing.

9

10 Commissioner Monk: An agenda item tonight was to look at the implementation plan.

11

12 Chair Alcheck: Oh, right.

13

14 Commissioner Monk: And if we push that out to the end of this year does that have any impact
15 on wrapping us wrapping up on the Comp Plan?

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Yeah in our pre-meeting we discussed the idea that we would the
18 implementation has to come back to us probably within the year. And so one option was that
19 we could decide not to deal with it tonight because we're going to see it anyways and it doesn't
20 have to be dealt with ahead of this report. Is that right?

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1

2 Ms. Gitelman: It's right. It's envisioned as a chapter of the plan that's reviewed and updated
3 every year. So you'll have a chance to look at it in December.

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Thank you for actually thank you very much for reminding me about that. Do
6 you want us to formally decide not... Ok.

7

8 Commissioner Monk: And that was part one of my comment.

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Yeah, I'll come back to you. So unless anybody feels very strongly we are going
11 to defer review of the implementation plan. Please continue.

12

13 Commissioner Monk: Thank you. I would support deferring it since we have to do it anyway.
14 And the other issue that I wanted to talk about was this idea of asking staff to conduct a couple
15 studies. I was interested in requesting some studies to be done regarding the trends away from
16 brick and mortar and the proliferation of restaurants. I liked what the co-chair, Vice-Chair had
17 said about studying housing and also I think we do probably need to do some deeper study on
18 parking. On some of the types of parking ideas that Commissioner Rosenblum had advocated
19 earlier. So I don't know if this is the appropriate time to make those requests, I just wanted to
20 make a record that I'd like to see some studies done on those things that we didn't push

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 forward as policy items to go before Council. Does staff have any comment on that? How do
2 we go about that?

3

4 Ms. Gitelman: We'll have to have a conversation at some point about our work plan. In fact it
5 might be appropriate to do it when you review the implementation plan of the Comp Plan
6 because you'll see just how much we have on our plate and whether those things are already
7 reflected there or could be squeezed in somewhere.

8

9 Chair Alcheck: I just want to sort of draw attention; we have likely just five meetings left this
10 year. And on Page 6 there's a sort of a tentative future agenda. I don't is it staff's impression
11 that we will be doing Downtown parking management and the North Ventura Coordinated Area
12 Plan scoping session at our next meeting?

13

14 Ms. Gitelman: No, just the parking item will be on your next agenda. North Venture is going to
15 happen in November after the we have to ask the Council to accept the grant before we come
16 to the Commission on that.

17

18 Chair Alcheck: Ok, so just as a head's up our next meeting is actually the beginning of a big
19 study session if you will about parking. And so maybe what it would be maybe one sorry,
20 maybe one option if I think what you're hearing is there's a desire to have sort of a list of items

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 that we'd like to study or create a study session priority list. And maybe there is a way that you
2 could facilitate some means for the Commissioners to sort of opine so that over the next 12
3 months some of these study sessions could be scheduled. I don't see them happening in the
4 next five meetings probably, but I... we had a few Commissioners tonight suggest that they had
5 some specific ideas and I think we should actually create a list. I think at some point we had a
6 list of the prior Commission had a list of items. So that I think we could recreate that list.

7

8 Commissioner Monk: And if I can just interject?

9

10 Chair Alcheck: Go ahead.

11

12 Commissioner Monk: Also if there are studies, authors, books, things that you recommend. I
13 heard Shoup mentioned tonight. If there's any other resources that you think would be helpful
14 to us in developing policies around these issues if you can advance the information to us that
15 would be useful.

16

17 Chair Alcheck: Ok, I have a light from Commissioner Lauing and Commissioner Gardias.

18

19 Commissioner Lauing: Yeah I just wanted to add that I think that the staff reports on the Comp
20 Plan have just been consistently high quality. And this one this time if possible is even better. I

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 thought it was really well organized, very clear, easy to follow, and makes our prep work a lot
2 easier. So thank you.

3

4 Chair Alcheck: Ok, thank you. I have Commissioner Gardias and then the next thing we'll do is
5 we'll approve the minutes from August 30th. Commissioner Gardias?

6

7 Commissioner Gardias: So a quick question to Director Gitelman. So if you remember we
8 returned the grant on a prior occasion in 2014 or 13, I don't remember when. It was for the
9 same North Ventura because Fry's extended their lease. Is there a risk that they will may
10 extend their lease? Or we are already we know that they their lease will end in 2020?

11

12 Ms. Gitelman: I can't speak to the lease specifically, but in this case we have the full support of
13 the property owner of the Fry's site. They've actually agreed to pay the matching funds for the
14 grant. So what we need to do is go to Council to accept the grant and enter into an agreement
15 with the property owner and that will allow us to proceed to scope and start the planning
16 process. And this Commission will be involved in that effort.

17

18 Commissioner Gardias: Very good, thank you.

19

20 Commission Action:

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 **Approval of Minutes**

2 Public Comment is Permitted. Five (5) minutes per speaker.^{1,3}

3 3. August 30, 2017 Draft Planning & Transportation Commission Meeting Minutes

4

5 Chair Alcheck: Can I get a Motion to approve the minutes from August 30th?

6

7 MOTION

8

9 Commissioner Summa: I'll make that Motion.

10

11 Chair Alcheck: Seconds?

12

13 SECOND

14

15 Commissioner Monk: I'll second it.

16

17 VOTE

18

19 Chair Alcheck: Thank you. All those in favor of approving the minutes from August 30th please

20 raise your hand. Unanimous.

21

22 MOTION PASSED (7-0)

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

Commission Action:

Committee Items

Commissioner Questions, Comments or Announcements

Chair Alcheck: Ok, so did you just re-light? Any final comments from Commissioner Gardias.

Commissioner Gardias: Yes, it's not a final comment that should be (interrupted)

Chair Alcheck: No, it has to be the final comment for tonight.

Commissioner Gardias: Just alright so I don't want to pretend to have this right, but I just wanted to do take your attention to something else. We were at the recognition event with Commissioner Summa and Monk and then I had an opportunity to speak to the present Council Members and I pretty much challenge them upright to participate in the October the 6th moonlight walk and run and then of course Commissioner Monk already signed up and she's going to walk for 5,000 meters and I'm going to run for 5,000 meters as well. Commissioner Monk and Commissioner Summa accepted the challenge. Yes you did. So I understand that she's already been in training for this event, but I would like to invite you to also participate in this event. If you decide not to either walk and run just come and just have fun. Thank you.

1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Chair Alcheck: Thank you everyone. This meeting is adjourned at six minutes to eleven.

2

3 **Adjournment**

4

5 10:54 pm

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.

REVISED

1 Palo Alto Planning & Transportation Commission

2 Commissioner Biographies, Present and Archived Agendas and Reports are available online:
3 <http://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/boards/ptc/default.asp>. The PTC Commission members are:

4
5 Chair Michael Alcheck
6 Vice Chair Asher Waldfogel
7 Commissioner Przemek Gardias
8 Commissioner Ed Lauing
9 Commissioner Susan Monk
10 Commissioner Eric Rosenblum
11 Commissioner Doria Summa

12
13 Get Informed and Be Engaged!

14 View online: <http://midpenmedia.org/category/government/city-of-palo-alto> or on Channel 26.

15
16 Show up and speak. Public comment is encouraged. Please complete a speaker request card
17 located on the table at the entrance to the Council Chambers and deliver it to the Commission
18 Secretary prior to discussion of the item.

19
20 Write to us. Email the PTC at: Planning.Commission@CityofPaloAlto.org. Letters can be
21 delivered to the Planning & Community Environment Department, 5th floor, City Hall, 250
22 Hamilton Avenue, Palo Alto, CA 94301. Comments received by 2:00 PM two Tuesdays preceding
23 the meeting date will be included in the agenda packet. Comments received afterward through
24 2:00 PM the day of the meeting will be presented to the Commission at the dais.

25
26 Material related to an item on this agenda submitted to the PTC after distribution of the
27 agenda packet is available for public inspection at the address above.

28 Americans with Disability Act (ADA)

29 It is the policy of the City of Palo Alto to offer its public programs, services and meetings in a
30 manner that is readily accessible to all. Persons with disabilities who require materials in an
31 appropriate alternative format or who require auxiliary aids to access City meetings, programs,
32 or services may contact the City's ADA Coordinator at (650) 329-2550 (voice) or by emailing
33 ada@cityofpaloalto.org. Requests for assistance or accommodations must be submitted at least
34 24 hours in advance of the meeting, program, or service.

-
1. Spokespersons that are representing a group of five or more people who are identified as present at the meeting at the time of the spokesperson's presentation will be allowed up to fifteen (15) minutes at the discretion of the Chair, provided that the non-speaking members agree not to speak individually.
 2. The Chair may limit Oral Communications to 30 minutes for all combined speakers.
 3. The Chair may reduce the allowed time to speak to three minutes to accommodate a larger number of speakers.