



# Historic Resources Board

## Staff Report (ID # 10749)

---

|                       |  |                                 |
|-----------------------|--|---------------------------------|
| <b>Report Type:</b>   | Study Session  | <b>Meeting Date:</b> 12/12/2019 |
| <b>Summary Title:</b> | Informational Report on Nominations, Upgrades, and Historic Resource Evaluations   |                                 |
| <b>Title:</b>         | Informational Report: Processes for Nominations to the City's Historic Resources Inventory, Inventory Category Upgrades, and Implementation of the Palo Alto Comprehensive Plan Policies for Historic Preservation |                                 |
| <b>From:</b>          | Jonathan Lait  |                                 |

### Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Historic Resources Board (HRB) review this report and receive staff's presentation; input from board members is welcomed, but no board action is requested or required.

### Report Summary

This report provides excerpts from the Palo Alto Municipal Code to support an HRB discussion of several processes related to the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The report provides summaries of the current processes for:

- (1) Nominating properties to the City's Historic Resources Inventory
- (2) Upgrading inventoried properties from one category to another
- (3) Preparing Historic Resource Evaluations for single family residential properties previously shown on study lists and noted in the City's database as "potentially eligible" for California Register.

The report also provides an update of historic status of properties evaluated after Council adopted Comprehensive Plan Policy 7.2 in December 2017. The attached spreadsheet (Attachment A) reflects the results of Historic Resource Evaluations (HRE) performed to implement this policy over the last two years following policy adoption.

### Background and Discussion

#### 1. Nominating Properties to the Inventory

City of Palo Alto  
 Planning & Development Services  
 250 Hamilton Avenue  
 Palo Alto, CA 94301  
 (650) 329-2442

There have been public inquiries recently to learn who can nominate a property to the City's Inventory, and how the process unfolds. Some owners are interested in exploring the City's preservation incentives, such as the subdivision incentive for preservation. These incentives are reflected on the City's historic preservation webpages, here: [https://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/depts/pln/historic\\_preservation/preservation\\_incentives.a.sp](https://www.cityofpaloalto.org/gov/depts/pln/historic_preservation/preservation_incentives.a.sp). Any person may nominate a property for designation as a historic structure/site or district. A nomination to the inventory that leads to inventory listing can qualify properties for incentives and other benefits.

#### *Historic Inventory Categories Defined*

The City's Historic Preservation Ordinance (Palo Alto Municipal Code Chapter 16.49) includes a definitions section (Section 16.49 020), which describes the Inventory categories:

**Category 1:** "Exceptional building" means any building or group of buildings of preeminent national or state importance, meritorious work of the best architects or an outstanding example of the stylistic development of architecture in the United States. An exceptional building has had either no exterior modifications or such minor ones that the overall appearance of the building is in its original character.

**Category 2:** "Major building" means any building or group of buildings of major regional importance, meritorious works of the best architects or an outstanding example of an architectural style or the stylistic development of architecture in the state or region. A major building may have some exterior modifications, but the original character is retained.

**Category 3 or 4:** "Contributing building" means any building or group of buildings which are good local examples of architectural styles and which relate to the character of a neighborhood grouping in scale, materials, proportion or other factors. A contributing building may have had extensive or permanent changes made to the original design, such as inappropriate additions, extensive removal of architectural details, or wooden facades resurfaced in asbestos or stucco.

#### 2. Rehabilitation of Historic Inventory Resources and Category Upgrades

Recently, several property owners have expressed interest in rehabilitating their inventoried buildings in the Downtown. One advantage to upgrading a historic resource located in the Downtown to 'Major Building' or 'Exceptional Building' is that the property can become eligible for bonus floor area following the historic rehabilitation, to use on site or transfer off site.

#### *Request for Inventory Category Upgrade from 'Contributing Building' to 'Major Building'*

One pending example is the former Toy and Sport World building designed by Birge Clark, located at 526 Waverley Street. The HRB reviewed this category upgrade request from Inventory Category 3 (Contributing Building) to Category 2 (Major Building), associated with a façade restoration and rehabilitation. The owner recently completed construction and

requested to move forward to City Council for approval of the category upgrade. The City's consultant is now preparing a historic structure report to document the completed rehabilitation and provide further evaluation of this building. The owner is also exploring restoring the rear portion of the building to the original building footprint.

### 3. Policy 7.2 Implementation

Staff has previously described the current implementation of Comprehensive Plan Policy 7.2. For this report, staff has prepared a spreadsheet listing the Historic Resource Evaluations (HRE) performed following the December 2017 City Council adoption of Palo Alto Comprehensive Plan Policy 7.2. The implementation of Policy 7.2 is via case-by-case evaluations. Resulting determinations are noted on the attached document.

It is important that members of the public who own potentially historic properties are aware of this policy as well as the processes for upgrading their inventory category or requesting inclusion of their property or other property on the City's Historic Resources Inventory.

Prior to the Comprehensive Plan adoption, and to this day, non-residential properties and multi-family residential properties are evaluated whenever a property owner submits a major development application. Staff reviews significant projects for compliance with the City's codes and policies and evaluates such projects with respect to environmental impacts under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

The March 14, 2019 HRB Retreat staff report, viewable at this link, <https://www.cityofpaloalto.org/civicax/filebank/documents/69713>, included the Comp Plan's historic preservation policies and discussion about Policy 7.2 implementation outreach. Minutes are viewable here: <https://www.cityofpaloalto.org/civicax/filebank/documents/71609>. On February 14, 2019, staff had also presented this information to the HRB. Staff noted that, since January 2018, the implementation of Policy 7.2 included a focus on the residential properties still only showing on the City's Parcel Reports as "Potentially California Register Eligible" following completion of the 1998-2000 historic survey. Staff took this approach since the properties were all built before 1948, had not been evaluated beyond the 1998 'windshield survey', and had not been placed on the National Register Eligible properties list that resulted from the survey. The potentially eligible properties are evaluated for their eligibility for the California Register of Historic Resources, on a case by case basis. Staff has been tracking the outcomes of these evaluations.

Staff gives notice to proceed on these evaluations once the property owner contacts staff and provides funds for the analysis. Typically, this is done when the owner is contemplating an application for discretionary, Individual Review or other residential entitlement process.

### **PAMC**

An excerpted section from Palo Alto Municipal Code (PAMC) Chapter 16.49 should be helpful for any discussion regarding the designation of historic structures, sites and districts:

16.49.040 Designation of historic structures/sites.

(a) Procedure for Designation of Historic Structures/Sites or Districts. Any individual or group may propose designation as a historic structure/site or district. Such proposals shall be reviewed by the historic resources board, which will make its recommendation to the council. Designation of a historic structure/site or district must be approved by the city council. The procedure for such designation is as follows:

(1) Any proposal for designation shall be filed with the department of planning and community environment and shall include the following data:

(A) The address and assessor's parcel number of the site or boundaries of the proposed district;

(B) A description detailing the structure/site or district's special aesthetic, cultural, architectural, or engineering interest or value of a historic nature;

(C) A description of the historical value of the structure/site or district;

(D) A description of the current condition of and any known threats to the structure/site or district;

(E) What restoration, if any, would be necessary to return the structure/site or district to its original appearance;

(F) Sketches, drawings, photographs or other descriptive material;

(G) Other supporting information.

(2) Each proposal shall be considered by the historic resources board at a public hearing within sixty days of the receipt of the proposal. In any case where an application for a planning or building permit affecting the exterior of a building is pending concurrently with a proposal for designation, the recommendation of the historic resources board shall be made within twenty days of receipt of the proposal.

(3) Notice of the time, place and purpose of the hearing shall be given at least twelve days prior to the date of the hearing by publication at least once in a newspaper of general circulation, or by mail to the applicant, to the owner or owners of the property, and to the owners of property within three hundred feet of the site.

(4) The historic resources board shall recommend to the city council approval, disapproval or modification of an application for designation.

(5) The city council may approve, disapprove or modify a recommendation for designation and, in any case where an application for a planning or building permit is pending concurrently with the proposal for designation, such decision shall be made within thirty days of the recommendation, if any, of the historic resources board.

(6) After approval of the designation of a structure/site or district, the city clerk shall send to the owners of the property so designated, by mail, a letter outlining the basis for such designation and the regulations which result from such designation. Notice of this designation shall also be filed in the building department and the department of planning and community environment files.

(b) Criteria for Designation. The following criteria, along with the definitions of historic categories and districts in Section [16.49.020](#), shall be used as criteria for designating additional historic structures/sites or districts to the historic inventory:

- (1) The structure or site is identified with the lives of historic people or with important events in the city, state or nation;
  - (2) The structure or site is particularly representative of an architectural style or way of life important to the city, state or nation;
  - (3) The structure or site is an example of a type of building which was once common, but is now rare;
  - (4) The structure or site is connected with a business or use which was once common, but is now rare;
  - (5) The architect or building was important;
  - (6) The structure or site contains elements demonstrating outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, materials or craftsmanship.
- (Ord. 3721 § 1 (part), 1986)

**Report Author & Contact Information**

Amy French, AICP, Chief Planning Official  
 (650) 329-2336  
[amy.french@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:amy.french@cityofpaloalto.org)

**HRB<sup>1</sup> Liaison & Contact Information**

Amy French, AICP, Chief Planning Official  
 (650) 329-2336  
[amy.french@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:amy.french@cityofpaloalto.org)

**Attachments:**

- Attachment A- October 25, 2019 - HRE Status Tracking (DOCX)

---

<sup>1</sup> Emails may be sent directly to the HRB using the following address: [hrb@cityofpaloalto.org](mailto:hrb@cityofpaloalto.org)

Last Updated: October 25, 2019

**HRE Status Evaluations 2018-2019**

**Includes residential sites previously identified on Priority 1 and 2 lists as potentially eligible for California Register of Historic Resources which were not found eligible for the National Register**

| <b>ELIGIBLE for California Register of Historic Resources</b>                      |   |                         |                             |
|--|---|-------------------------|-----------------------------|
| <b>Address</b>   | <b>GIST status</b>  | <b>Determined by</b>    | <b>HRE Received by City</b> |
| 1145 Lincoln Ave<br>003-19-059<br>(Single-family)                                  | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20180726  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 7/26/18                     |
| 518-526 Bryant St<br>120-26-061<br>(commercial/<br>residential)                    | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20180807  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 8/7/18                      |
| 1027 Waverley St<br>120-18-027<br>(Single-family)                                  | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20180926  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 9/26/18                     |
| 885 College Ave<br>137-02-002<br>(Single-family)<br>Stanford                       | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20181121  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 11/21/18                    |
| 2140 Yale St<br>137-01-133<br>(Single-family)<br>Stanford                          | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20190116  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 1/16/19                     |
| 980 Middlefield Rd<br>120-05-077<br>(commercial)                                   | Found CRHR Eligible by<br>Page Turnbull;<br>20190116  | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 1/16/19                     |
| 340 Portage Ave<br>132-38-071<br>(Multi-family)<br>(Fry's/old cannery &<br>office) | No update in GIST   | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 2/26/19                     |
| 788 San Antonio Rd<br>147-03-041<br>(commercial/<br>residential)                   | No update in GIST   | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 3/15/19                     |
| 235 Hamilton Ave<br>120-26-073<br>(commercial)                                     | Category 3; Ramona St<br>District (Cardinal Hotel<br>building considering<br>modifications) | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 10/24/2019                  |

Last Updated: October 25, 2019

**HRE Status****Includes some properties previously identified as potentially CRHR eligible****NON-ELIGIBLE for California Register of Historic Resources**

| <b>Address</b>   | <b>GIST status</b>  | <b>Determined by</b>             | <b>HRE Received by City</b> |
|--|---|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 2348 South Court<br>124-14-008<br>(Single-family)            | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180202                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 2/2/18                      |
| 1849 Middlefield Rd<br>003-58-060<br>(Single-family)         | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Historic Planner<br>Emily Vance; 20180214     | Emily Vance Historic<br>Planner  | 2/14/18                     |
| 1940 Webster St<br>124-06-057<br>(Single-family)             | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180323                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 3/23/2018                   |
| 1750 University Ave<br>003-10-003<br>(Single-family)         | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180507                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 5/7/18                      |
| 1445 Tasso St<br>120-08-049<br>(Single-family)               | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Garavaglia<br>Architecture, Inc.;<br>20180622 | Garavaglia Architecture,<br>Inc. | 6/22/18                     |
| 2251 Bowdoin St<br>137-05-073<br>(Single-family)             | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180712                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 7/12/18                     |
| 3707-3709 El Camino<br>Real<br>132-41-085<br>(Commercial)    | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180914                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 9/14/2018                   |
| 2342-2344 Yale St<br>137-01-110<br>(Single-family)           | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180917                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 9/17/18                     |
| 2050 Dartmouth St<br>137-06-043<br>(Single-family)           | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20180924                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 9/24/2018                   |
| 327 Tennyson Ave<br>124-08-049<br>(Single-family)            | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>By Page Turnbull;<br>20181121                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 11/21/18                    |
| 853 Alma St<br>120-28-046<br>(SOFA II CAP)<br>(Multi-family) | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20181214                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 12/14/18                    |
| 846 Lytton Ave<br>003-03-027<br>(Single-family)              | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>201801221                   | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 12/21/2018                  |
| 2080 Cornell St<br>137-03-022<br>(Single-family)             | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190116                    | Page and Turnbull, Inc.          | 1/16/19                     |

Last Updated: October 25, 2019

| <b>Continued, not CRHR</b>                                       |  |                         |            |
|--|--|-------------------------|------------|
| 181 Addison Ave<br>120-28-088<br>(Multi-family)<br>(SOFA II CAP) | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190123 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 1/23/19    |
| 1828 Middlefield Rd<br>120-08-049<br>(Single-family)             | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190208 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 2/8/19     |
| 2050 Princeton St<br>137-03-051<br>(Single-family)               | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190228 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 2/28/2019  |
| 796 San Antonio Rd<br>147-03-042<br>(Commercial/<br>residential) | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190315 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 3/15/19    |
| 1012 High St<br>120-30-030<br>(Single-family)                    | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190329 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 3/29/2019  |
| 716 San Antonio Rd<br>147-05-087<br>(commercial/<br>residential) | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190501 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 5/1/19     |
| 2135 Emerson St<br>124-19-086<br>(Single-family)                 | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull,<br>20190701 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 7/1/2019   |
| 436 Waverley St<br>120-15-040<br>(Single-family)                 | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190815 | Page and Turnbull, Inc. | 8/15/2019  |
| 567-569 Homer Ave<br>120-04-074<br>(Two-Family)                  | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190826 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 8/26/2019  |
| 922 College Ave<br>137-03-030<br>(Single-family)<br>Stanford     | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190828 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 8/28/19    |
| 2151 Princeton St<br>137-03-004<br>(Single-family)<br>Stanford   | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190828 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 8/28/19    |
| 1307 University Ave<br>003-06-035<br>(Single- family)            | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20190904 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 9/4/2019   |
| 1630 Castilleja Ave<br>124-23-028<br>(Single-family)             | Found Not CRHR Eligible<br>by Page Turnbull;<br>20191010 | Page and Turnbull, Inc  | 10/10/2019 |