



City of Palo Alto

Architectural Review Board Staff Report

(ID # 6056)

Report Type: Study Session

Meeting Date: 9/3/2015

Summary Title: ARB Design Awards

Title: Retreat to Review Eligible Projects for the ARB 2015 Design Awards

From: City Manager

Lead Department: Architectural Review Board

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the ARB consider the projects on the list and make nominations.

Background

April 2, 2015

On April 2, 2015, staff presented a staff report (which can be viewed by going to this URL: <https://www.cityofpaloalto.org/civicax/filebank/documents/46653>) to the ARB. The report provided background and discussion items regarding the ARB awards program, and a list of projects eligible for consideration.

The ARB discussed the awards selection process with the following comments:

- Board member Kyu suggested that each of the four board members could choose five projects to reduce the list and suggested a 'people's choice' award.
- Vice Chair Lew noted that there is a story to tell, and that the award process can be a great communication tool.
- Past Board member (then Chair) Popp noted that there could be a merit award and special awards such as "best design on an alley" and "best landscape". Popp noted it would be of interest to survey the public to see what is preferred, after the list of contenders is reduced. Popp asked that staff explore allowing electronic input on award candidates via the city website, and noted it would be great if the winning projects were those that went "above and beyond".
- Chair Gooyer noted there could be a 'Council Choice' award.

July 2, 2015

On July 2, 2015, staff provided a brief report (Attachment B) reiterating the purpose of the ARB Design Awards, citing phrases from the ARB bylaws, noting possible criteria/categories, and targeting July 30, 2015 as a retreat date, along with a revised project list. In the report, staff noted photos would be helpful in the selection, as in previous years.

To pare down the list of built projects for the 2015 awards, the ARB decided that:

- The board will not consider signs and storefronts other than major downtown storefronts.
- The ARB would like nominations to tie into the Comprehensive Plan, and would like to consider green building in the mix of project attributes.

Discussion

Revised List

Attachment A is the revised list, which was reduced from the July 2, 2015 list.

Photos

Staff is exploring and will discuss options with the board to have photos accompany the finalists.

Awards Timeline

Staff notes that on February 5, 2015, the ARB Bylaws Article VIII was amended to replace “shall” with “may” in two sections. Section 8.0 now states “Design awards for outstanding built projects may be awarded every five years beginning in 2005. Section 8.2 now states, “Winning projects may be displayed in the City Hall lobby for one month following the presentation of the awards...” The amended bylaws provide more flexibility; it can be interpreted that the ARB may defer the awards to the following year (if necessary or otherwise preferred).

Selection

Regarding who selects the projects, the bylaws still state, “Award winning projects shall be selected from those reviewed by the ARB and completed since the last awards were made” and “Criteria and number of awards shall be determined by the awarding board.”

One approach other awards programs have used to obtain photographs is to alert the architects and owners of the eligible projects about the awards, and request that they submit photos to staff by a certain deadline. Staff would share these photos with the board in a follow-up public meeting. Those project architects that do not submit photos would then be removed from the list (which would reduce the list). This is an approach the ARB may wish to consider.

Prepared by: Amy French, AICP, Chief Planning Official

Reviewed by: Jonathan Lait, AICP, Assistant Director
Cara Silver, Senior Assistant City Attorney

Attachments:

- Attachment A: 2015 ARB awards list for 9 3 15 ARB Meeting (DOC)
- Attachment B: July 2 2015 Memo to ARB (DOC)

2015 ARB Awards Eligibility Project List: 74 projects ARB Reviewed/Construction Completed After 2010 Awards

NEW BUILDINGS (3 New Building groups, 44 in total):

#	ADDRESS	PROJECT	ARCHITECT	YEAR APPROVED/BUILT	RANK
Group 1: New Major Private Projects along El Camino Real/Visible from ECR					
1	4249 ECR	Elks Lodge	Hoover Associates	2009/Completed post 2010 awards	_____
2	4249 ECR	Summerhill Homes	KTCY Architects	2008/Completed “ “	_____
3	2051 ECR	PC mix use	Carrasco Associates	2002/Completed “ “	_____
4	3981 ECR	Keys School	Starkweather Bondy	2008/Completed “ “	_____
5	2805 ECR	ATT store	Hayes Group	2009/Completed “ “	_____
6	4301 ECR/4329	Hilton Homewood+homes	Hotel/Homes: Steinberg (1 st), 2009/Completed “ “	_____	_____
			(Brick, revision, Summerhill, minor changes)		
7	4041 ECW ^y	Palo Alto Commons	Steinberg	2010/Completed	_____
8	4073 ECR	Eton Capital mixed use	Hayes Group	2011/Completed 2015	_____
9	2875 ECR	One-story office building	Hayes Group	2011/Completed 2014	_____
10	4214 ECR	Hilton Garden Hotel	OTO	2012/Completed	_____
Group 2: New Major Private Buildings Downtown and Adjacent					
11	657 Alma/101 Forest	Retail/Office	Hayes Group	2009/Completed post awards	_____
12	102 University	Mixed Use	Bellomo Architects	2006/Completed post awards	_____
13	49 Wells	PAMF office	Hawley Peterson Snyder	2007/Completed post awards	_____
14	653 Homer	Multi Family	Amir Shamirza	2008/Completed post awards	_____
15	278 University	Retail/Office redevelopment	Hayes Group	2008/2013 Final	_____
16	639 Homer	Happy homes	David Solnick	2009/Completed post 2010	_____
17	801 Alma	Affordable Housing	R. Wellington Quigley	2009/Completed (AIASV Award)	_____
18	524 Hamilton	Mixed Use	Hayes Group (Reller)	2011/built	_____
19	101 Lytton	PC (‘Lytton Gateway’)	Sunsery Korh Hagey	2011/built	_____
20	559 Lytton	Four townhomes	(Lytton Park LP)	2011/built	_____

21	145 Hawthorne	3 units	(Zac Trailer)	2013/built	
22	537 Hamilton	Office	Korth Sunsery Hagey	2013/TCO issued	
#	ADDRESS	PROJECT	ARCHITECT	YEAR APPROVED/BUILT	RANK
Group 3: Other New Buildings (including City Buildings (3), Stanford Center (2), Housing and Non-residential)					
<i>City</i>					
23	3700 Middlefield	Mitchell Park Library	Group 4	2010/built	
24	2500 Embarcadero	Greenhouse	(for Save the Bay)	2010/built	
25	2501 Embarcadero	UV treatment facility	RMC	2008/built78	
<i>Stanford</i>					
26	180 ECR	Fleming's	Geno Yun	2012/built	
27	180 ECR	Bloomington	Kevin Kennon & Gensler	2012/built	
<i>Mixed Use and Housing</i>					
28	3445 Alma	Alma Plaza PC retail/DUs	Hayes Group (commercial)	2009/2013	
29	797 Matadero	4 homes	Mark Gross	2010/	
30	488 W Charleston	Trehouse	Pyatok Architects	2009/Completed 2011	
31	420 Cambridge	PTOD Mixed Use	Stuart Welte	2009/Completed 2012	
32	195 PMR/2865 Park	Park Plaza Mixed Use	Hoover	2011/near completion	
33	2650 Birch	PTOD Mixed Use	Solnick & Hoover Assoc.	2011/near completion	
<i>Research Park</i>					
34	3251 Hanover	Lockheed Adv. Mat'l's Ctr	DGA	2011/Completed 2014	
35	3130 Hanson	Varian new building	Hoover Assoc.	2011/built	
36	3431 Hillview	VMware expansion/garage	Form 4	2012/built	
37	1701 Page Mill	Theranos	Studios	2012/	
<i>Hospital Area</i>					
38	780 Welch	Office	WRNS	2013/built	
39	800 Welch	New 3-story office	WRNS	2011/built	

#	ADDRESS	PROJECT	ARCHITECT	YEAR APPROVED/BUILT	RANK
<i>South of Embarcadero East of El Camino Real</i>					
40	260 California	3 story building/ICON	Hayes	2012/built	_____
41	490 San Antonio	Gideon Hausner Gym	Starkweather Bondy	2013/built	_____
42	998 San Antonio	Mosque	Carrasco/Barton	2009/Completed 2014	_____
43	3750 Fabian	Gymnasium	Hoover Associates	2008/Completed 2010	_____
44	2995 Middlefield	Yoga center building	Hayes Group/Eric Corrigan	2009/Completed AIASV Award	_____

REMODELS/ADDITIONS (4 groups, 30 in total):

ADDRESS PROJECT ARCHITECT YEAR APPROVED/BUILT/TTYPE RANK

Group 4: Remodels with Historic Component including City buildings

<i>City</i>					
45	1213 Newell	City Main Library	Group 4	2010/built 2014/addition	_____
46	Newell/Embarcadero	Art Center	Mark Cavanero	2010/built/addition	_____

Mixed Use

47	265 Lytton	Mixed office/residential	DES	2009/built 2012/historic/addition	_____
48	2080 Channing	Edgewood Plaza	Ken Rodrigues (commercial) KTGY (1 st submittal), Burton (2 nd submittal houses)	2012/built/historic/new homes	_____

Non-Residential

49	564 University	Historic rehab/addition	Ann Hawkinson	2008/2014 final/historic + addition	_____
50	630 Ramona	Blue Chalk to office	Brendan Koon	2011/built/historic remodel	_____
51	668 Ramona	Pacific Art League	William Bruner	2011/built/historic + addition	_____
52	456 University	Varsity Theater-Hana House	Hayes Group	2013/built/historic remodel	_____

Group 5: Minor Downtown Remodels not Historic

53	425 High PA	Palo Alto Hotel improve	Carrasco Associates	2009/built 2010/Remodel	_____
----	-------------	-------------------------	---------------------	-------------------------	-------

54	340 Univ.	Facade remodel	E Wong (owner)	2011/built/Remodel	
55	222 Univ.	Facade remodel (Vans, Toya) Steve McLeod	Topos Architects	2010/built/Remodel	
56	341 Ramona	Remodel of a PC, residential	Topos Architects	2010/built/Remodel	
#	ADDRESS	PROJECT	ARCHITECT	YEAR APPROVED/BUILT/TTYPE	RANK
57	305 Lytton	Reface	Hayes Group	2010/built/Remodel	
58	219 University	Verizon storefront	Joel Shulman	2010/built/Remodel	
59	575 High	Facade improvements	Bellomo	2011/built/Remodel	
60	167 Hamilton	Lyfe restaurant	Efrain Corona	2011/built/Remodel	
61	383 University	Paris Baguette	Jimmy Chang	2011/built/Remodel	
62	151 University	La Boulangerie plaza, facade	Hayes Group	2012/2013/built/Remodel	
63	210 Bryant	MFR addition	Young & Borlick	2013/built/Addition	
64	180 Hamilton	Epiphany Hotel	Steinberg	2012/TCO issued/Remodel	

Group 6: Other Major Additions/Remodels

65	3000 Hanover	HP Executive Center	Gensler	2011/Completed/Addition	
66	911 Hanson	Varian Addition	Hoover Associates	2013/built/Addition	
67	3000 Alexis Drive	Country Club	CAW/Arc-Tec CDS	2009/built 2011/Addition	

Group 7: City Landscaping and Water Well Projects

68	Mitchell Park	Magical Bridge	Verde/Barbara Butler/RHAA	2014/built/New	
69	Lytton Plaza	Park Remodel	Peter Jensen & Guzzardo	2009/built post 2010/Remodel	
70	Lytton	Cogswell Park	Peter Jensen	2012/built/Remodel	
71	San Antonio Medians	City project	Peter Jensen & Gates	2010/built/Remodel	
72	Cal Avenue	Streetscape	Gates	2013/built/Remodel	
73	Main Library	Emergency W. Well	Anderson Pacific	2010/built/New	
74	851 Center Drive	W.Well Pardee Park	Peter Jensen	2010/built/New	



City of Palo Alto
Memorandum

Attachment B

TO: ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

FROM: Amy French, Chief Planning Official **DEPARTMENT: PLANNING AND COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT**

DATE: July 2, 2015

SUBJECT: 2015 ARB Design Awards

Design Awards Purpose

The awards are intended to express appreciation for architects' efforts to help create and maintain Palo Alto's unique visual character through their creative and responsive designs of public and private spaces, which contribute to the well-being and healthy environment of our city.

Design Awards Selection

The ARB Bylaws state that award-winning projects shall be selected from those reviewed by the ARB, and completed since the last awards were made, and the criteria and number of awards are determined by the awarding board. Involvement by the public or former board members is not included in the bylaws; the extent and opportunities for such involvement has not been discussed.

For the 2015 Awards, criteria/categories could emphasize the links between architecture/design and other hot topic areas of planning. Winning projects could exemplify good design and good planning solutions in the area of the specific category.

Some potential criteria/categories could include:

- Green building/Sustainable development
- Transportation integration
- Economic development
- Historic rehabilitation/Adaptive reuse (not necessarily a "resource", just an old building)
- City/Public project

Properties reviewed by ARB and completed since 2010 ARB Awards

See attached list.

Next Steps

The July 30, 2015 date is targeted for a retreat to reduce the list/select the potential winners. Until then, board members and staff can discuss the best ways to gather photos to assist in selection.

AMY FRENCH
Chief Planning Official