



ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD DRAFT MINUTES

Thursday, October 1, 2015, Meeting
8:30 AM, Council Chambers

Call to Order

Roll Call

Present: Chair Robert Gooyer; Vice Chair Alexander Lew, Board Members Kyu Kim, Wynne Furth

Absent: None.

Staff Present: Amy French, Chief Planning Official; Jodie Gerhardt, Interim Current Planning Manager; Diana Tamale, Administrative Associate III; Sheldon Ah Sing, Contract Planner; Rebecca Atkinson, Planner; Jessica Sullivan, Planning and Transportation Manager

Oral Communications: None.

Agenda Changes, Additions and Deletions: None.

Minutes Approval: September 17, 2015

MOTION: Board Member Kim moved, seconded by Vice Chair Lew, to approve the minutes for September 17, 2015 as presented.

MOTION PASSED: 4-0-0-0

PUBLIC HEARINGS

New Business:

- 180 El Camino Real [15PLN-00123]:** Request by Andy Neilands, on behalf of Stanford University, for Major Architectural Review of the Anthropologie tenant facade, signage, interior improvements, cafe, and outdoor seating. The project site is the 33,520 square foot Building DD at Stanford Shopping Center. Zoning District: Community Commercial (CC). Environmental Assessment: Categorically Exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guideline Section 15301 and Section 15304.

Rebecca Atkinson noted this was the second formal hearing of the project. Staff recommended approval of the revised project with detailed conditions. Ms. Atkinson reviewed exceptions and requested feedback regarding storefront entries, façade detailing and need for visual permeability. Staff did not support the proposed design of the seating area and provided a list of recommended refinements.

Board Members discussed bicycle parking requirements.

Dillon Rhodes, Anthropologie, explained details of the revised project.

Board Members commented regarding wood siding; removal of the tree and planting strip; reducing the size of the stack sign for the café; storefront transparency; width of the sidewalk for café seating; awning and trees between the entrances to Buildings CC and DD; and outdoor seating.

Mr. Rhodes requested clarification of requirements for bird-friendly glazing; removal of the planting strip; and a storefront on the southwest corner.

MOTION: Board Member Furth moved, seconded by Vice Chair Lew, to recommend approval of the plans as submitted including Staff Recommendation Numbers 1-4 and to refer the issue of bird-friendly facades to the subcommittee.

MOTION PASSED: 4-0-0-0

2. **180 El Camino Real [15PLN-00085]**: Request by Eric Allen of SPG Center, LLC, on behalf of the Board of Trustees to the Leland Stanford Junior University, for Major Architectural Review of site improvements, tenant facade improvements, and new freestanding and directional signage visible from the public right-of-way for the Stanford Shopping Center. Zoning District: Community Commercial (CC). Environmental Assessment: Categorically Exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guideline Section 15301 and Section 15304.

Rebecca Atkinson reviewed proposed plans. Staff supported the proposed arcade and building façade changes and the site work plan. Urban Forestry supported tree thinning in general along Sand Hill Road and recommended some tree replacement. Proposed signage required review under the City's Sign Ordinance, but did not pertain to the recently approved tenant-oriented Master Sign Program. Some exceptions for signs were needed. Staff recommended continuance of the project to a date certain of November 5, 2015.

Board Member Furth asked which signs were and were not in compliance with sign requirements.

Mark Kelly, BAR Architects, spoke regarding the three primary components of architectural identity, signage, wayfinding identity and the landscape.

Gaylon Melton, Simon Property Group, explained proposed signage.

Board Members inquired about the height of the directory sign; the number and font of secondary monument signs; landscape changes to accommodate signage; signage along El Camino Real; location of light poles; proposed street furniture and perimeter seating; converting 550 signs to 500 signs; and size of signs.

Mr. Melton requested action by the Board at the current meeting rather than continuing the item. Ms. Atkinson explained staff's position with respect to conditions but felt signage would need to return to the Board because of requested exceptions. Board Members and staff discussed ways to handle the application in order to assist the applicant. Mr. Melton was willing to withdraw signage as part of the current application. Board Members noted they did not have Findings to approve aspects of the project excluding signage. Ms. Atkinson reported Findings for aspects other than signage could return to the Board on October 15 while signage would need to return on November 5.

MOTION: Board Member Furth moved, seconded by Board Member Kim, to continue aspects other than signage to October 15 and signage to November 5, 2015.

MOTION PASSED: 4-0-0-0

3. **Downtown Palo Alto Parking Wayfinding:** Request by City of Palo Alto Planning and Community Environment for formal review of the design concepts for the Downtown Palo Alto Parking Wayfinding project.

Sue-Ellen Atkinson, City of Palo Alto, reported on purposes of the project. Mock-ups of signs had been placed at three parking lots the previous week.

Wayne Hunt, Hunt Design, explained the types of signs and proposed designs of signs.

Board Members discussed mock-ups and existing signage at parking lots and public and permit parking.

Jessica Sullivan advised that the current configuration of permit and hourly parking would change.

Board Members preferred the blue color and Concept 3 for signs. Mr. Hunt noted signs would be individualized for each garage.

Board Member Furth suggested the Board hear Item 5 prior to Item 4. Chair Gooyer agreed.

4. **ARB Findings:** Discussion and Recommendation to the City Council regarding proposed changes to the ARB findings.

[Heard after Item 5.]

Amy French presented revised ARB Findings for discussion.

Board Member Furth concurred with Findings 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6.

Herb Borock suggested Finding 1 include that the design was compatible with the Comprehensive Plan. From the initial language, delete "on appeal at the City Council." The proposed Findings did not guarantee incorporation of the various Findings regarding environmental review contained in the Municipal Code.

Ms. French clarified that the environmental review portion of the Code change would occur at the Planning and Transportation Commission. The Council would ultimately adopt the CEQA determination with Ordinances.

Board Member Furth expressed concern regarding possible loss of ARB powers and sustainability and environmental issues. She suggested dividing Section 1 into two sections regarding consistency or compliance and compatibility with the neighborhood. High aesthetic quality of design should be spelled out, possibly in Finding 3. "Harmonious transitions in scale and character to adjacent land uses and land use designations" could be included in Finding 2.

Vice Chair Lew requested existing surveys and more information regarding local context be included in applicant submissions.

Board Members discussed the need for more information regarding signage and landscaping.

Preliminary Item:

5. **3200 El Camino Real [15PLN-00305]:** A request by Joanne Park, of Architectural Dimensions, on behalf of the Prabhu Corporation for a Preliminary Architectural Review for the demolition of an existing hotel and the construction of a new four-story, 50'-0" tall hotel with 93 guestrooms and two-level underground garage. Zoning District: Commercial Service (CS) zoning district.

[Heard after Item 3.]

Sheldon Ah Sing provided the site plan and key issues. Requested exceptions concerned the 50-foot setback and the 50-foot height limit.

Board Members inquired about the 50-foot setback and whether the parcel was substandard within the zone.

Jeff Mac Adam, Architectural Dimensions, reviewed details of the proposed project.

Bob Moss felt the 65-foot tower was unjustified. The overhang at the corner of Hanson and El Camino violated design guidelines. He found no justification for violating the 50-foot setback. Landscaping was inadequate.

Board Members commented regarding the tower; signage on El Camino Real; the Public Art requirement; bicycle parking and traffic; stone on the corner suites; the entrance on Hanson Way; the garage ramp; the cornice; recessed windows; proposed coplanar stone and stucco; HVAC units underneath windows; stepping back the upper floor; the 50-foot setback; outdoor space; hardscape versus landscape; and mass of the building.

Board Item:

6. **ARB 2015 Design Awards:** ARB members will discuss projects eligible for the 2015 ARB Awards to arrive at a short list.

Amy French noted 34 projects were under consideration and presented photographs of projects.

Board Members discussed their choices for finalists. Finalists were Rinconada Library, Hoover Pavilion, 383 University, Apple store, Magical Bridge and Mitchell Park Community Center and Library.

Ms. French requested Board Members prepare information and descriptions for the final projects.

Board/Staff Announcements, Updates, Reports, and Comments:

Vice Chair Lew reported the Council was scheduled to select new ARB Members on October 19, 2015.

Subcommittee Members: Alex Lew and Wynne Furth

SUBCOMMITTEE ITEMS

None.

STAFF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW:

Project Description: Installation of two non-illuminated freestanding signs

Applicant: Laura Billings

Address: 1400 Page Mill Road [15PLN-00448]

Approval Date: 9/14/15

Request for hearing deadline: 9/28/15

Project Description: One non-illuminated multi-tenant free standing sign

Applicant: Jan Willey

Address: 2700 Middlefield Road [15PLN-00320]

Approval Date: 9/14/15

Request for hearing deadline: 9/28/15

Project Description: Installation of three halo-illuminated walls signs and three awning signs

*Applicant: David Ford
Address: 2305 El Camino Real [15PLN-00267]
Approval Date: 9/14/15
Request for hearing deadline: 9/28/15*

Project Description: Addition to the front elevation of the existing home expanding the master bedroom on the 2nd floor

*Applicant: Brian Anuskewics
Address: 4021 Villa Vista [15PLN-00317]
Approval Date: 9/15/15
Request for hearing deadline: 9/28/15*

Project Description: To allow the removal and replacement of several trees

*Applicant: Alexis Ochon
Address: 3251 Hanover Street [14PLN-00495]
Approval Date: 9/21/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/5/15*

Project Description: One non-illuminated wall sign

*Applicant: Leah Cernosek
Address: 209 Hamilton Avenue [15PLN-00374]
Approval Date: 9/21/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/5/15*

Project Description: To allow a 36" box Chinese Pistache tree as a replacement tree

*Applicant: Bernadette Soubirou
Address: 3165 Porter Drive [15PLN-00351]
Approval Date: 9/21/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/5/15*

Project Description: Removal and replacement of seven evergreen ash trees with six new water gum trees and one crepe myrtle

*Applicant: Jim Cartan
Address: 1290 Page Mill Road [14PLN-00458]
Approval Date: 9/21/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/5/15*

Project Description: Install two new halo illuminated wall signs

*Applicant: Ray Ochoa
Address: 431 Waverley Street [15PLN-000135]
Approval Date: 9/22/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/5/15*

Project Description: Minor alterations to doors, windows, and paving, and to alter the existing landscaping including remove two trees

*Applicant: Rietta McCain
Address: 1501 Page Mill Road [15PLN-00348]
Approval Date: 9/23/15
Request for hearing deadline: 10/6/15*