



Architectural Review Board

Staff Report (ID # 13705)

Report Type: Action Items **Meeting Date:** 11/18/2021

Summary Title: ARB Awards: Third Discussion

Title: ARB Awards: Consider the Reduced List of Eligible Projects and Associated Photographs Taken by Board Members, and Develop a List of Award Categories

From: Jonathan Lait

Recommendation

Staff recommends the Architectural Review Board (ARB):

1. Discuss the ARB Design Awards, including evaluation criteria and possible awards categories, timeline for awards, and award-eligibility period,
2. Discuss how the public may be involved in the process,
3. Review photographs of eligible/completed projects, and
4. Decide on award winners or continue this portion to another hearing.

Report Summary

As mentioned at the ARB's September 9, 2021 retreat, given the shelter in place orders related to the Covid 19 pandemic, staff postponed the 2020 awards to 2021. For the "kick off" meeting, staff compiled a list of addresses for the ARB's consideration. The initial list was consolidated into one shorter list of projects that were thought to be complete (Attachment A) between 2014 and the first half of 2021. Projects that have not completed construction by this time will be moved to a list of projects eligible for the ARB awards in 2025, as was done in 2015.

The ARB is requested to consider ways the public may participate in this process. As done for the past awards, the ARB may wish to use this second meeting to whittle down the list of potential winning projects. The ARB Bylaws cite the City Hall Lobby as the location to display the awards for one month following the awards proclamation at Council. Hybrid Council meetings began November 1, 2021; however, boards and commissions are not meeting in person until January 2022. The ARB may wish to target an early 2022 Council meeting and timeframe to display the projects.

Background

City of Palo Alto
 Planning & Development Services
 250 Hamilton Avenue
 Palo Alto, CA 94301
 (650) 329-2442

Comprehensive Plan Program L6.1.1

The ARB awards program implements the 2030 Palo Alto Comprehensive Plan Program L6.1.1, which states, "Promote awards programs and other forms of public recognition for projects of architectural merit that contribute positively to the community."

ARB Bylaws

The ARB bylaws Article 8, Design Awards, sets forth the following:

- Design Awards for outstanding built projects may be awarded every five years beginning in 2005. Award-winning projects shall be selected from those reviewed by the ARB and completed since the last awards were made.
- Criteria and number of awards shall be determined by the awarding board.
- Winning projects may be displayed in the City Hall lobby for one month following the presentation of awards. The ARB shall request that the Mayor of the City of Palo Alto issue an appropriate proclamation.

Purpose

The Architectural Review Board (ARB) awards were established to express appreciation for architects' efforts to help create and maintain Palo Alto's unique visual character through their creative and responsive designs of public and private spaces, which contribute to the well-being and healthy environment of our city.

Timing of Awards

The awards were initially presented during "Architecture Month", recognized as such in years past by the Santa Clara Valley (SCV) Chapter of the AIA (American Institute of Architects). The ARB awards in 2000, 2005 and 2010 were presented in April or May. The 2015 ARB awards were presented in October 2015. Given the shelter in place orders related to the Covid 19 pandemic, staff postponed the 2020 awards to 2021.

AIA SCV Awards

The AIA SCV Chapter presented the 2020 awards virtually, via YouTube, viewable here: <https://aiasiliconvalley.org/page/2020Honorees> For that program, Santa Clara Valley architects submit built and unbuilt projects for consideration by the jury and categories for consideration included Architecture, Interior Architecture, Residential, Unbuilt, and Special Awards. Projects are judged generally based on a variety of features, including unique design, originality, extended use attributes, sustainability, budget, and use of environmental surroundings. The Palo Alto projects named in the 2020 AIA SCV Design Awards were:

- Honor award for Architecture to Palo Alto Fire Station #3 (Shah Kawasaki Architects)
- Merit award for Architecture to 2555 Park (Heather Young Architects)

Also of interest, Ken Hayes was awarded the Birge Clark lifetime achievement award. This award honors the quality of the body of architectural work, consistently designed, over the career of an architect. Mr. Hayes has designed many commercial and mixed-use buildings in

Palo Alto during the past several decades. These Design Awards are a biennial event that will happen next in the fall of 2022.

Past ARB Awards Background

- 1998: five awards went to five projects built prior to mid-1997.
- 2005: five awards went to five projects constructed between mid-1997 and mid-2004. The eligible projects list was comprised of 70 major projects constructed prior to 2005; with criteria as follows: (1) Innovative, creative and authentic, (2) Enriches the quality of the built environment in Palo Alto, (3) Respectful of its context and the environment, (4) Well-built, well-detailed and durable.
- 2010: ten awards went to ten projects from an eligible list of over 100 projects constructed prior to 2010. The ARB determined the number of awards could be increased to ten, to include 'honorable mention' awards for a variety of projects.
- 2015: five awards went to five projects from an eligible list of over 34 projects constructed prior to 2015. The awards were presented in November 2015 and followed the same criteria set in 2005. The five main projects included the Hoover Pavilion on Quarry Road, Rinconada Library, Apple Store on University Ave, and Magical Bridge Playground; the Mitchell Park Library also received a special sustainability award, and Paris Baguette Remodel on University received a small project category award.

Discussion

Eligible Projects Documentation and Followup

The list of constructed projects is a starting point toward selection of award winning project. The project list was grouped into five different areas of the city to allow the current board members to conduct site or "drive by" visits of properties prior to this discussion.

Staff suggests boardmembers review the revised list and photos that were taken to determine what projects are award winning and what categories of awards should be given out. The ARB may also wish to consult past ARB members to assist in the selection and write-ups of award winners. Staff typically contacts the award winners with an official letter, and prepares the proclamation for Council.

Display of Winning Projects

The bank of televisions in the City Hall lobby will again be an option to display the winning projects, as well as the City's webpages. In previous years, a reception was held in the lobby and community meeting room of City Hall prior to the Council meeting where the awards were presented to the winning teams.

Next Steps

The ARB members may be ready to decide on award categories and/or winners, or another round of review may be needed.

ARB¹ Liaison & Contact Information
Jodie Gerhardt, AICP, Planning Manager
(650) 329-2575
jodie.gerhardt@cityofpaloalto.org

Attachments:

- Attachment A: 2020 ARB Award Eligibility List 10-21-21 (PDF)

¹ Emails may be sent directly to the ARB using the following address: arb@cityofpaloalto.org

2020 ARB Awards Eligibility - 10/21/21						
Projects must have completed construction to be eligible						
Order	Address	Project	Year Approved/2021 Status	Type	Planner	Researcher
3	689-693 Arastradero Road	Bowman School Annex	2017/Complete	School	Claire	Osma
6	260 California Avenue	Protege Restaurant outdoor seating	2017	Commercial	Graham	Grace
9	1451-1601 Cal Ave	Residential subdivision	2014/Complete	New Housing	Jodie	Grace
11	400 Channing Avenue	Four Units in SOFA I CAP	2017/Complete	Housing	Phillip	Peter
13	611 Cowper	Four story mixed use. Hayes Group. 2013 ARB.	2013/Construction 2016	New	Clare	David
14	405 Curtner	Six DUs	2013	New	Russ	Grace
16	180 El Camino Real	Phase III - North Face, Victoria Secrets, etc	2014/Complete	New	Rebecca	Alex
17	180 El Camino Real	Vineyard Vines	Complete	Commercial		Alex
21	180 El Camino Real	Shake Shack Storefront in Building W	2018/Complete	Commercial	Samuel	Alex
27	2515-2585 El Camino Real	Three story, mixed use development	2016/Almost Done	Mixed Use	Margaret	Peter
38	799 Embarcadero Road	Fire Station #3 Replacement Project	2017/Complete	Public Facility	Amy	Osma
40	2501 Embarcadero	Sludge Facility at Regional Water Quality Control Plant	2016	Public Facility	Amy	Osma
41	2775 Embarcadero Road	Baylands Boardwalk	2017/Complete	Public Facility	Claire	Osma
46	135 Hamilton Avenue	Mixed Use	2012	New	Clare	Peter
47	180 Hamilton Avenue	Hotel / Nobu Facade Change	2017/Complete	Hotel	Samuel	David
50	261 Hamilton	Remodel U Arts	2014/appealed	Historic remodel	Clare	David
52	3223-3251 Hanover Street	R&D Building 2	2018/Complete	R&D	Graham	Grace
53	3251-3223 Hanover Street	R&D Building 1	Complete	R&D	Graham	Grace
56	3406 Hillview Avenue	New R&D Building	7/10/1905	R&D	Graham	Grace
58	480 Lytton Avenue	Facade Modifications	2017		Adam	David
60	4175 Manuela Avenue	Congregation Kol Emeth	2016	Assembly Use	Ranu	Osma
61	567 Maybell Avenue	16 Single Family Residential Units	2017/Under Construction	Housing	Sheldon	Osma
62	636 Middlefield	Adding residential	2014	Addition	Clare	David
63	1451 Middlefield Road	Junior Museum and Zoo	2018/Complete	Public Facility	Amy	David
64	1451 Middlefield Road	Junior Museum and Zoo: Gable End Resolution Review	Complete	Public Facility	Amy	David
68	2555 Park Boulevard	Exterior Design Changes	2017		Phillip	Grace
70	3045 Park Blvd	New R&D Building	2018	R&D	Graham	Grace
71	3181 Porter Drive	New Office Building	2017/Complete	Office / R&D	Graham	Grace
74	1400 Page Mill	Office	2013/Complete	New	Clare	Grace
75	1050 Page Mill Road	287,000sf R&D/Office, Sand Hill Prop, Form 4	2014/Construction 2019	R&D	Jodie	Grace
83	355 University	Design Within Reach	2016/Complete	Commercial	Rebecca	Peter
84	375 University Avenue	Exterior Renovations	2019		Emily	Peter
85	500 University	Retail/Office	2013/Complete	New Mixed Use	Clare	David
87	636 Waverley	Mixed Use	2012	New	Clare	Peter
88	701 Welch	Lucile Packard Children's Hospital		Medical		Alex