



Architectural Review Board

Staff Report (ID # 13409)

Report Type: Action Items **Meeting Date:** 10/21/2021

Summary Title: ARB Awards: Second Discussion

Title: ARB Awards: Consider the List of Eligible Projects and Associated Photographs Taken by Board Members, and Develop a List of Award Categories

From: Jonathan Lait

Recommendation

Staff recommends the Architectural Review Board (ARB):

1. Discuss the ARB Design Awards, including evaluation criteria and possible awards categories, timeline for awards, and award-eligibility period,
2. Discuss how the public may be involved in the process,
3. Review photographs of eligible/completed projects, and
4. Decide on award winners or continue this portion to another hearing.

Report Summary

As mentioned at the ARB's September 9, 2021 retreat, given the shelter in place orders related to the Covid 19 pandemic, staff postponed the 2020 awards to 2021. For the "kick off" meeting, staff compiled a list of addresses for the ARB's consideration. The initial list was consolidated into one shorter list of projects that were thought to be complete (Attachment A) between 2014 and the first half of 2021. Projects that have not completed construction by this time will be moved to a list of projects eligible for the ARB awards in 2025, as was done in 2015.

The ARB is requested to consider ways the public can participate in this process. As done for the past awards, the ARB may wish to use this second meeting to whittle down the list of potential winning projects. The ARB Bylaws cite the City Hall Lobby as the location to display the awards for one month following the awards proclamation at Council. With hybrid Council meetings beginning in November, staff would recommend targeting a November/December 2021 Council meeting and display the projects through the end of 2021 or January 2022. The awards could also happen in early 2022, when the ARB will begin hybrid meetings.

Background

City of Palo Alto
 Planning & Development Services
 250 Hamilton Avenue
 Palo Alto, CA 94301
 (650) 329-2442

Comprehensive Plan Program L6.1.1

The ARB awards program implements the 2030 Palo Alto Comprehensive Plan Program L6.1.1, which states, "Promote awards programs and other forms of public recognition for projects of architectural merit that contribute positively to the community."

ARB Bylaws

The ARB bylaws Article 8, Design Awards, sets forth the following:

- Design Awards for outstanding built projects may be awarded every five years beginning in 2005. Award-winning projects shall be selected from those reviewed by the ARB and completed since the last awards were made.
- Criteria and number of awards shall be determined by the awarding board.
- Winning projects may be displayed in the City Hall lobby for one month following the presentation of awards. The ARB shall request that the Mayor of the City of Palo Alto issue an appropriate proclamation.

Purpose

The Architectural Review Board (ARB) awards were established to express appreciation for architects' efforts to help create and maintain Palo Alto's unique visual character through their creative and responsive designs of public and private spaces, which contribute to the well-being and healthy environment of our city.

Timing of Awards

The awards were initially presented during "Architecture Month", recognized as such in years past by the Santa Clara Valley (SCV) Chapter of the AIA (American Institute of Architects). The ARB awards in 2000, 2005 and 2010 were presented in April or May. The 2015 ARB awards were presented in October 2015.

AIA SCV Awards

The AIA SCV Chapter presented the 2020 awards virtually, via youtube, viewable here: <https://aiasiliconvalley.org/page/2020Honorees> For that program, Santa Clara Valley architects submit built and unbuilt projects for consideration by the jury and categories for consideration included Architecture, Interior Architecture, Residential, Unbuilt, and Special Awards. Projects are judged generally based on a variety of features, including unique design, originality, extended use attributes, sustainability, budget, and use of environmental surroundings. The Palo Alto projects named in the 2020 AIA SCV Design Awards were:

- Honor award for Architecture to Palo Alto Fire Station #3 (Shah Kawasaki Architects)
- Merit award for Architecture to 2555 Park (Heather Young Architects)

Also of interest, Ken Hayes was awarded the Birge Clark lifetime achievement award. This award honors the quality of the body of architectural work, consistently designed, over the career of an architect. Mr. Hayes has designed many commercial and mixed-use buildings in Palo Alto during the past several decades.

Past ARB Awards Background

- 1998: five awards went to five projects built prior to mid-1997.
- 2005: five awards went to five projects constructed between mid-1997 and mid-2004. The eligible projects list was comprised of 70 major projects constructed prior to 2005; with criteria as follows: (1) Innovative, creative and authentic, (2) Enriches the quality of the built environment in Palo Alto, (3) Respectful of its context and the environment, (4) Well-built, well-detailed and durable.
- 2010: ten awards went to ten projects from an eligible list of over 100 projects constructed prior to 2010. The ARB determined the number of awards could be increased to ten, to include 'honorable mention' awards for a variety of projects.
- 2015: five awards went to five projects from an eligible list of over 34 projects constructed prior to 2015. The awards were presented in November 2015 and followed the same criteria set in 2005. The five main projects included the Hoover Pavilion on Quarry Road, Rinconada Library, Apple Store on University Ave, and Magical Bridge Playground; the Mitchell Park Library also received a special sustainability award, and Paris Baguette Remodel on University received a small project category award.

Discussion

Eligible Projects Documentation and Followup

The list of constructed projects is a starting point toward selection of award winning project. The project list was grouped into five different areas of the city to allow the current board members to conduct site or "drive by" visits of properties prior to this discussion.

Staff suggests boardmembers review the revised list and photos that were taken to determine what projects are award winning and what categories of awards should be given out. The ARB may also wish to consult past ARB members to assist in the selection and write-ups of award winners. Staff typically contacts the award winners with an official letter, and prepares the proclamation for Council.

Display of Winning Projects

The bank of televisions in the City Hall lobby will again be an option to display the winning projects, as well as the City's webpages. In previous years, a reception was held in the lobby and community meeting room of City Hall prior to the Council meeting where the awards were presented to the winning teams.

Next Steps

The ARB members may be ready to decide on award categories and/or winners, or another round of review may be needed.

ARB¹ Liaison & Contact Information

¹ Emails may be sent directly to the ARB using the following address: arb@cityofpaloalto.org

Jodie Gerhardt, AICP, Planning Manager
(650) 329-2575
jodie.gerhardt@cityofpaloalto.org

Attachments:

- Attachment A: 2020 ARB Award Eligibility List 10-12-21 (PDF)

| 2020 ARB Awards Eligibility - 10/12/21 | | | | | | |
|--|--|---|-----------------------------|------------------|----------|------------|
| | Projects must have completed construction to be eligible | | grey = move to 2025 list | | | |
| Order | Address | Project | Year Approved/2021 Status | Type | Planner | Researcher |
| 1 | 1545 Alma Street | Multi-Family Project | 2017 | Housing | Sheldon | Osma |
| 2 | 639 Arastradero Road | Three single family homes | 2016 | Housing | Margaret | Osma |
| 3 | 689-693 Arastradero Road | Bowman School Annex | 2017/Complete | School | Claire | Osma |
| 4 | 695 Arastradero | Mortuary Building at Alta Mesa Cemetery | 2019/Under Construction | | Claire | Osma |
| 5 | 450 Bryant Street | Avenidas Expansion Project | 2016 | | Amy | David |
| 6 | 260 California Avenue | Protege Restaurant outdoor seating | 2017 | Commercial | Graham | Grace |
| 7 | 392 California Ave | Summit Bicycles Facade Changes | 2018 | Commercial | Scott | Grace |
| 8 | 900 N California Ave | Replacement of three homes | 2016 | Housing | Adam | Osma |
| 9 | 1451-1601 Cal Ave | Residential subdivision | 2014/Complete | New Housing | Jodie | Grace |
| 10 | 190 Channing Avenue | Mixed Use Residential and Office in SOFA 2 CAP | 2019/Approved | Mixed Use | Claire | Peter |
| 11 | 400 Channing Avenue | Four Units in SOFA I CAP | 2017/Complete | Housing | Phillip | Peter |
| 12 | 702 Clara Drive | Three Detached Units | 2019 | Housing | Sheldon | Osma |
| 13 | 611 Cowper | Four story mixed use. Hayes Group. 2013 ARB. | 2013/Construction 2016 | New | Clare | David |
| 14 | 405 Curtner | Six DUs | 2013 | New | Russ | Grace |
| 15 | 50 El Camino Real | Ronald McDonald House 52K | 2013 | New | Russ | Alex |
| 16 | 180 El Camino Real | Phase III - North Face, Victoria Secrets, etc | 2014/Complete | New | Rebecca | Alex |
| 17 | 180 El Camino Real | Vineyard Vines | Complete | Commercial | | Alex |
| 18 | 180 El Camino Real | L'Occitane Facade Remodel | 2019/Approved | Commercial | Samuel | Alex |
| 19 | 180 El Camino Real | Market Plaza and Tenant Facade Update | 2019/Complete | Commercial | Samuel | Alex |
| 20 | 180 El Camino Real | Pacific Catch | 2019/Complete | Commercial | Samuel | Alex |
| 21 | 180 El Camino Real | Shake Shack Storefront in Building W | 2018/Complete | Commercial | Samuel | Alex |
| 22 | 711 El Camino Real | Clemente Hotel | 2013/underway | New | Marg | Peter |
| 23 | 855 El Camino Real | Major Architectural Review/Sign Exceptions | 2017 | AR & Sign | Rebecca | Peter |
| 24 | 1845 El Camino Real | Mixed Use | 2013/underway | New | Marg | Peter |
| 25 | 2209 El Camino Real | Three story, mixed use development | 2014/not yet issued | Mixed Use | Marg | Peter |
| 26 | 2500 El Camino Real | Mayfield Mixed Use | 2013 | New | Clare | Peter |
| 27 | 2515-2585 El Camino Real | Three story, mixed use development | 2016/Almost Done | Mixed Use | Margaret | Peter |
| 28 | 2600 El Camino Real | New Commercial Building | 2017/Complete | Commercial | Sheldon | Alex |
| 29 | 2755 El Camino Real | Windy Hill Housing on Former VTA Site | 2018/Almost Done/Sept final | Housing | Claire | Alex |
| 30 | 3128 El Camino Real | Minor Board Level Review of Exterior Modifications | 2018 | | Adam | Alex |
| 31 | 3159 El Camino Real | Mixed Use S&D | 2013 | New | Russ | Alex |
| 32 | 3265 El Camino Real | Mixed Use project | 2018/Approved | Mixed Use | Adam | Alex |
| 33 | 3585 El Camino Real | Mixed Use | 2019 | Mixed Use | Sheldon | Alex |
| 34 | 3705 El Camino Real | 59 Affordable Units at Wilton Court | 2018/Under Construction | Housing | Graham | Osma |
| 35 | 3877 El Camino Real | Compadres Mixed Use Project | 2017 / Under Construction | Mixed Use | Sheldon | Osma |
| 36 | 3945 El Camino Real | Comfort Inn Hotel Renovation | 2018 | Hotel | Phillip | Osma |
| 37 | 4115 El Camino Real | 7 Unit Mixed-Use | 2018/ Under Construction | Mixed Use | Sheldon | Osma |
| 38 | 799 Embarcadero Road | Fire Station #3 Replacement Project | 2017/Complete | Public Facility | Amy | Osma |
| 39 | 1730 Embarcadero Road | Audi Showroom expansion | 2014/Mostly Complete | Commercial | Jodie | Osma |
| 40 | 2501 Embarcadero | Sludge Facility at Regional Water Quality Control Plant | 2016 | Public Facility | Amy | Osma |
| 41 | 2775 Embarcadero Road | Baylands Boardwalk | 2017/Complete | Public Facility | Claire | Osma |
| 42 | 620 Emerson Street | Nobu Restaurant (Revision) | Under Construction | Commercial | Samuel | Peter |
| 43 | 620 Emerson Street | Nobu Restaurant Annex | Under Construction | Commercial | Samuel | Peter |
| 44 | 930 Emerson Street | Auto to Office | 2014 | Remodel | Marg | Peter |
| 45 | 203 Forest Avenue | Mixed-Use Building | 2016 | Mixed Use | Adam | Peter |
| 46 | 135 Hamilton Avenue | Mixed Use | 2012 | New | Clare | Peter |
| 47 | 180 Hamilton Avenue | Hotel / Nobu Facade Change | 2017/Complete | Hotel | Samuel | David |
| 48 | 240 Hamilton | 15,000 sf mixed use. Hayes Group. 2013 ARB, appeal. | 2013/Construction 2016 | New | Jason | David |
| 49 | 250 Hamilton Avenue | Bus Shelters in the Stanford Research Park | | | Garrett | Alex |
| 50 | 261 Hamilton | Remodel U Arts | 2014/appealed | Historic remodel | Clare | David |
| 51 | 486 Hamilton | Mixed Use with Four Units | pending project | Mixed Use | | David |
| 52 | 3223-3251 Hanover Street | R&D Building 2 | 2018/Complete | R&D | Graham | Grace |
| 53 | 3251-3223 Hanover Street | R&D Building 1 | Complete | R&D | Graham | Grace |
| 54 | 356 Hawthorne Avenue | Three Residential Units | 2018 | Housing | Phillip | David |
| 55 | 301 High Street | Remodel/Addition | 2013/underway | Remodel | Elena | David |
| 56 | 3406 Hillview Avenue | New R&D Building | 7/10/1905 | R&D | Graham | Grace |
| 57 | 411-437 Lytton Avenue | Three story mixed use building | 2016 | Mixed Use | Sheldon | David |
| 58 | 480 Lytton Avenue | Facade Modifications | 2017 | | Adam | David |
| 59 | 656 Lytton Avenue | Facade Modifications and Other Minor Site Revisions | Approved | | | David |
| 60 | 4175 Manuela Avenue | Congregation Kol Emeth | 2016 | Assembly Use | Ranu | Osma |
| 61 | 567 Maybell Avenue | 16 Single Family Residential Units | 2017/Under Construction | Housing | Sheldon | Osma |
| 62 | 636 Middlefield | Adding residential | 2014 | Addition | Clare | David |
| 63 | 1451 Middlefield Road | Junior Museum and Zoo | 2018/Complete | Public Facility | Amy | David |
| 64 | 1451 Middlefield Road | Junior Museum and Zoo: Gable End Resolution Review | Complete | Public Facility | Amy | David |
| 65 | 240 Pasteur Drive | Biomedical Innovations Building | 2017/Complete | | Rebecca | Alex |
| 66 | 500 Pasteur Drive | Stanford Hospital Entry Plaza Site Modifications Review | 2018 | | Amy | Alex |
| 67 | 500 Pasteur Drive | Stanford Hospital | Opening 2019 | | Rebecca | Alex |
| 68 | 2555 Park Boulevard | Exterior Design Changes | 2017 | | Phillip | Grace |
| 69 | 2747 Park Blvd | R&D Building | 2016 | | Clare | Grace |
| 70 | 3045 Park Blvd | New R&D Building | 2018 | R&D | Graham | Grace |
| 71 | 3181 Porter Drive | New Office Building | 2017/Complete | Office / R&D | Graham | Grace |
| 72 | 3215 Porter Drive | New Office/R&D Building (Stanford transit hub) | Under Construction | Office / R&D | | Grace |
| 73 | 441 Page Mill Road | Three story mixed use building | 2014 | Mixed Use | Russ | Grace |
| 74 | 1400 Page Mill | Office | 2013/Complete | New | Clare | Grace |
| 75 | 1050 Page Mill Road | 287,000sf R&D/Office, Sand Hill Prop, Form 4 | 2014/Construction 2019 | R&D | Jodie | Grace |
| 76 | 1450 Page Mill Road | 75,000 sf R&D, Studios Architecture | 2015/Construction 2017 | R&D | Jodie | Grace |
| 77 | 252 Ramona Street | Two residential units in the NP | 2016 | | Ranu | David |
| 78 | 2120 Staunton | New Duplex | 2017 | Housing | Adam | |

| | | | | | | |
|----|----------------------------|---|----------------------------|-----------------|-------------|-------|
| 79 | 250 and 350 Sherman Avenue | Public Safety Building and Parking Garage | 2018/Under Construction | | Amy | Grace |
| 80 | 385 Sherman Avenue | Three story mixed use building | 2014/Complete | Mixed Use | Russ | Grace |
| 81 | 744-750 San Antonio Road | Marriott Hotels | 2017/Under Construction | Hotel | Sheldon | Osma |
| 82 | 240-248 University | Mixed Use | 2013 | New | Jason | David |
| 83 | 355 University | Design Within Reach | 2016/Complete | Commercial | Rebecca | Peter |
| 84 | 375 University Avenue | Exterior Renovations | 2019 | | Emily | Peter |
| 85 | 500 University | Retail/Office | 2013/Complete | New Mixed Use | Clare | David |
| 86 | 2321 Wellesley Street | Two New Units & Zone Change from R-1 to RMD(NP) | 2018/Starting Construction | Housing | Samuel | Alex |
| 87 | 636 Waverley | Mixed Use | 2012 | New | Clare | Peter |
| 88 | 701 Welch | Lucile Packard Children's Hospital | | Medical | | Alex |
| 89 | 2342 Yale Street | Duplex with Detached Garage | 2019/Complete | Housing | Emily | Alex |
| 90 | Golf Course | S&D | 2013/? | Remodel | Clare/Jason | Osma |
| 91 | Highway 101 Overpass | Pedestrian/Bicycle Overpass & Adobe Creek Reach Trail | 2017/Under Construction | Public Facility | Claire | Osma |