TO: HONORABLE CITY COUNCIL
FROM: CITY MANAGER
DEPARTMENT: PLANNING AND COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT
DATE: OCTOBER 23, 2000
CMR:384:00

SUBJECT: REQUEST FOR CITY COUNCIL TO APPROVE THE DESIGNATION OF A SILVER MAPLE LOCATED AT 1872 EDGECWOOD DRIVE AS HERITAGE TREE NO. 5 AND AN AMERICAN ELM AT 4226 PONCE DRIVE AS HERITAGE TREE NO. 6.

RECOMMENDATION
Staff recommends that Council approve the designation of two trees for heritage status: a Silver Maple located at 1872 Edgewood Drive as Heritage Tree No. 5 (see Attachment A); and an American Elm located in the center of the San Ane Homeowners Association housing complex, at 4226 Ponce Drive, as Heritage Tree No. 5 (see Attachment B).

BACKGROUND
Chapter 8.10.090 of the Palo Alto Municipal Code, entitled “Designation of Heritage Trees,” provides for persons to nominate a tree on their property as a heritage tree. After City Council approval of such designation, the tree will be included in a listing maintained by the Planning and Community Environment Department. This listing includes information such as specific location, overall size and canopy spread. Once designated, a heritage tree will be subject to the provisions of the Tree Preservation and Management Regulations, unless removed from the list by subsequent action of the City Council. These regulations include guidelines and restrictions regarding pruning, removal and development that impact the tree.

DISCUSSION
Heritage Tree No. 5.
Mr. Donald Starner and Ms. Mary Starner, owners of the property at 1872 Edgewood Drive, filed an application for heritage tree status for the Silver Maple located in the back yard of their property. The tree is an outstanding example of its kind and perhaps the oldest and biggest Silver Maple in the City. It provides aesthetic quality and shade to the surrounding area.
The Silver Maple meets the standards for heritage tree designation set forth in Chapter 8.10.090 and the Heritage Tree Checklist, which was developed by staff (see Attachment C). Written request, consent, and photographs have been received from the Stariners. In addition, a written analysis of the tree's specific location, size, dimensions and qualities was conducted by arborist Kenneth D. Meyer, of Mayney Tree Expert Company, Inc. (The letter of request/consent and arborist report are included as Attachment A). According to the arborist report, the appraised valuation of the tree contributes $16,900 to the value of this property.

Staff recommends that this tree be designated as Heritage Tree No. 3, based upon the finding that it is unique and of importance to the property owner and community because it meets criteria 1, 3 and 4 of the following criteria set forth in the Tree Preservation Ordinance.

(1) It satisfies PAMC Section 8.10.090 requirements;
(2) It is an outstanding specimen of a desirable species;
(3) It is one of the largest and oldest trees in Palo Alto, and
(4) It possesses distinctive form, size, age, location and/or historical significance.

Heritage Tree No. 6.
The San Alma Homeowners Association, owner of the complex of homes at 4226 Ponce Drive, filed an application for heritage tree status for the American Elm located at the center of this complex. The tree has historical significance in that it is a significant tree located on the site where Don Secundo Robles, once the owner of all of the land that is now Palo Alto, built his adobe home in 1840. The tree is an outstanding example of its kind. It is 60 feet tall and is a landmark for the housing complex and the surrounding community.

The American Elm meets the standards for heritage tree designation set forth in Chapter 8.10.090 and the Heritage Tree Checklist. Written request, consent, and photographs have been received from the San Alma Homeowners Association, along with a written analysis of the tree's specific location, size, dimensions and qualities by arborist John H. McElhanan, of S. P. McElhanan Co., Inc. (The request/consent letter and arborist report are included as Attachment B). According to the arborist report, the appraised valuation of the tree contributes $10,900 to the value of this property.

Staff recommends that this tree be designated as Heritage Tree No. 6, based upon the finding that it is unique and of importance to the property owner and community because it meets criteria 1, 3 and 4 set forth in the Tree Protection Ordinance.

(1) It satisfies PAMC Section 8.10.090 requirements;
(2) It is an outstanding specimen of a desirable species;
(3) It is one of the largest or oldest trees in Palo Alto and;
(4) It possesses distinctive form, size, age, location and/or historical significance

RESOURCE IMPACT
There is no resource impact expected as a result of these designations.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS
The recommended action would continue to promote the process of heritage tree designation and is consistent with existing City policies and urban forest goals and objectives.

TIMELINE
After designation as a heritage tree by Council, the heritage tree will be recognized as such immediately.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
The designation of heritage trees is exempt from provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act, Section 15061 (b)(3) because it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the designation will have a significant effect on the environment.

ATTACHMENTS
Attachment A: Donald and Mary Stamer's Request, Photographs, and Arborist Report
Attachment B: The San Alma Homeowners Association’s Request, Photographs, and Arborist Report
Attachment C: Tree Preservation and Management Regulations, Ordinance #4568 and Heritage Tree Checklist

PREPARED BY: Dave Dockter, Managing Arborist, Planning Division

DEPARTMENT HEAD REVIEW:  G. EDWARD GAWF
Director of Planning and Community Environment

CITY MANAGER APPROVAL: AUDREY SEYMOUR
Assistant to the City Manager
Mayne Tree Expert Company, Inc.

KENNETH D. MEYER
PRESIDENT

RICHARD L. HUNTINGTON
PRESIDENT

Ms. Mary Starner
1372 Edgewood Drive
Palo Alto CA 94303

Re: Status of your Norway maple

Dear Ms. Starner,

On Wednesday, April 26, 2000, I inspected a large Norway maple (Acer platanoides) located on your property four feet west of your house. The purpose of the inspection was to assess the size, condition and value of the tree in an effort to obtain Heritage Tree recognition by the City of Palo Alto.

The tree is 55.2 inches in diameter with a measured height (crownmeter) of 72 feet. The foliage extends 45 feet in radius or 95 feet in diameter, including the trunk. The canopy overhangs your roof as well as the neighbor’s garden to the west and a small portion of the neighbor’s garden to the south. The age of the tree is estimated to be 55 years, or slightly more than half the estimated life span of 100 years.

Two large lower limbs of about 14 inches in diameter, one on the southwest side and the other on the northeast side, have been removed. This gives the four major upright limbs a more sweeping upward appearance. These four uprights come from a central crotch that shows no evidence of decay, but has been strengthened by the installation of cables further up the tree. The overall shape of the tree is good. The structural integrity appears to be good and the condition is excellent.

I appraised the value of the tree as $30,400. This was done using the International Society of Arboriculture formular method as described in the “Guide for Plant Appraisal”, 6th Edition, 1992. The guide takes into account the size (diameter at 4.5 feet = 55.2”), species (Norway maple = 30%), condition (90%) and location (80%) of the tree. The location is a composite of the site (100%), function (90%) and the placement (50%). The latter is low as the tree was planted approximately 6 feet from you home and has a potential to cause damage to your slab foundation. I understand you have not experienced any problems to date.

It is my opinion, after inspection you maple, that the tree should obtain Heritage Tree status based on the very large size, excellent condition and good form.

Very truly yours,

Kenneth D Meyer
Certified Arborist
KDM: pap
TRUNK FORMULA METHOD FORM FOR NORTHERN CALIFORNIA, 1992
Established by the International Society of Arboriculture, 1992

Species: Acer campestris, silver maple

Basic Value = Replacement Cost + (Basic Price X [TAA - TA]/X X Species)

1. Replacement Cost:
Cost of largest commonly available transplantable tree, as installed in an average location,
(as established for Northern California, by the Western Chapter), if the appraised tree is in
a location which will make installation of a replacement especially difficult or expensive,
you should increase this line to account for costs above the average.

2. Replacement tree Basic (per square inch) Price Group # __ $ .31 per inch²
(from Table 11-1992)

3. Determine difference in trunk areas
If diameter = 30" or more, determine ATAA DBH, in.

4. Multiply Basic Price by area difference $ .31 per in² X .05
(2)

5. Adjust step 4 by Species rating

6. Basic Value = $1,605 + $ .21,224
(line 1)
(line 5)

7. Adjust Line 6 by Condition

8. Adjust for Location:
Location = (Site + Contribution + Placement) = 3

9. Appraised Value (before damage, if applicable) = Round Line 8 to nearest $100

10. For Partial Loss: ____% of loss X $ = $ value of loss

11. Removal/Reconstruction Cost, if applicable

Prepared for: Mary Starnes
Address: 1812 Argwood Drive, Petaluma Valley
Date: 9/30/92 Job #: 

Failure Date:

$18,650