

# **Palo Alto Strategic Transportation Plan**

## **Technical Memorandum #4**

### **Transportation Division Peer Review**

This Technical Memorandum reviews the organization and staffing levels of transportation divisions within five “peer” cities. The objective is help Palo Alto policy makers assess the appropriate Transportation Division staffing levels to implement the projects and programs of the Strategic Transportation Plan.

#### **Methodology**

In consultation with the Transportation Division, we selected peer cities using two broad criteria:

- Similar context: This includes somewhat similar size, the presence of a university, and regional context (i.e. a smaller city within a major metropolitan area)
- Reputation for good multi-modal transportation planning

The cities selected for review are: Berkeley, CA; Boulder, CO; Cambridge, MA; Davis, CA; and Santa Monica, CA. Note that similar to Palo Alto, the cities of Berkeley, Santa Monica and Cambridge are considered “built-out.” Boulder and Davis are cities whose growth is predominantly on their edges.

The peer review was conducted by first reviewing U.S. Census and other data. Second we reviewed city websites for organizational background and responsibilities. Finally, telephone interviews were conducted with one or more senior members of city staff at the appropriate division(s). The telephone interviews were primarily aimed at ascertaining the responsibilities and staffing levels within each city for the equivalent responsibilities of the Palo Alto Transportation Division. In some cases, these responsibilities were spread among multiple divisions and departments. In other cases, a department or division had greater responsibilities than Palo Alto’s

Transportation Division. The telephone interviews were used to create as is best possible, the staffing comparison summarized in Table 1.

## **Primary Findings**

The findings are summarized in tabular form below and presented by city following the section. Here we present key observations and conclusions. First, Berkeley is the only city where the head of transportation planning activities is at “department level.” In Berkeley, the head of the Office of Transportation is an assistant city manager. This is a recent organizational change at the City of Berkeley and it reflects the high priority of transportation issues at the city. At each other city, including Palo Alto, the primary division managing transportation is a level below department level. Cambridge and Santa Monica mirror Palo Alto in that transportation planning is primarily conducted within a division of the Planning/Community Development Departments. Transportation planning in Boulder and Davis takes place in the Public Works Departments.

Palo Alto’s Transportation Division is responsible for both traffic engineering and planning for alternative modes. To varying degrees, each peer city other than Cambridge has also consolidated these activities. However, Boulder and Santa Monica have separate offices within their transportation divisions for dealing with traffic engineering and multi-modal planning.

As can be seen in Table 1, four of the five peer cities have staffing levels for transportation planning and traffic engineering that are greater than Palo Alto’s. The margin is significant in that staffing levels at these cities exceed Palo Alto by between 25 to over 100 percent. Of course it is difficult to easily compare activities and responsibilities to staffing levels. Some cities have made a stronger commitment to certain areas than others. For example, in Santa Monica, enforcement and operation of its innovative TDM ordinance includes the commitment of three FTEs. Boulder’s very aggressive approach to alternative modes is reflected in the eleven FTEs dedicated to its “GO (Great Options) Boulder” program. Further tasks in the Transportation Division Strategic Plan will explore Palo Alto’s program demands versus staff capacity and provide recommendations for gap closure, including possible

recommendations for additional staffing, reallocation of responsibilities and organizational structure changes.

**Table 1: Summary of Peer Review Findings**

	Palo Alto	Berkeley, CA	Boulder, CO	Cambridge, MA	Davis, CA <sup>1</sup>	Santa Monica, CA
<b>Background</b>						
Population of City, 2000	58,598	102,743	102,659	101,355	61,363	84,084
Percent Change 1990-2000	5%	0%	23%	6%	27%	(3%)
Undergraduate Students <sup>2</sup>	6,637	22,677	22,224	10,880 <sup>2</sup>	21,294	25,328
Number of Jobs	139,032	<b>77,200</b>	104,850 <sup>3</sup>	115,604 <sup>4</sup>	<b>28,500</b>	70,070 <sup>5</sup>
Land Area	23.7	10.5	25.4	6.4	9.9	8.3
Persons per Square Mile	2,472	9,785	4,056	14,899	6,198	10,131
Median Household Income	\$90,377	\$44,485	\$44,748	33,140	\$41,299	\$50,714
Median Family Income	\$117,574	\$70,434	\$70,257	39,990	\$65,513	\$75,989
Commute to work (Drive Alone – 2000 (City Residents))	74.5%	43.2%	59.8%	35.0%	60.7%	75.4%
<b>Transportation Division Profile</b>						
Primary Transportation Planning Division/Department	Transportation Division	Office of Transportation	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	Environmental and Transportation Planning Division	Public Works Department	Transportation Management Division
Primary Organizational “Location” of Transportation Planning Engineering Activities	Division of Planning and Community Environment Dept.	Department Level -- Director is an assistant City Manager	Division within Public Works Department	Division of Community Development Department	Staff in Public Works Department	Division of Planning and Community Development Department
Transportation Planning and Traffic Engineering Consolidated?	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Somewhat	Yes
Full Time Equivalents w/Responsibilities of Palo Alto Transportation Division:						
Total FTE	8	10.5	17	12.5	7 <sup>6</sup>	13.25
FTE per 10,000 residents	1.4	1.0	1.7	1.2	1.1	1.6
FTE per 10,000 jobs	0.6	1.4	1.6	1.1	2.5	1.9
FTE per 10,000 residents and jobs:	0.4	0.6	0.8	0.6	0.8	0.9

1 Figures for Davis Area Primary Market which is Davis and El Macero

2 Undergraduate students rather than entire student body is used because the data is more readily available and comparable. Figures for Cambridge represent Harvard and MIT combined.

3 Figures for 2002. Includes area expected to be annexed by the City of Boulder. Excluding area to be annexed jobs are 101,294.

4 Year 2000. Source: Massachusetts Division of Employment & Training

CITY OF PALO ALTO

5 Figures for 2001. Source: State of California Employment Development Department Labor Market Information, 2001. 2001 value is estimate based on final figures for first three quarters of 2001.

## City by City Summary

The following section examines each of the five peer cities in detail and compares program and staffing levels to Palo Alto.

### Palo Alto

---

Palo Alto's **Transportation Division** is set within the Department of Planning and Community Environment along with the Planning Division. The Transportation Division is responsible for traffic operation in the city, the bicycle system, neighborhood traffic calming, area transportation studies, public transit service, travel demand management, analysis of traffic impacts of land proposed development/redevelopment, school traffic safety and regional transportation activities.

Specifically, the Transportation Division performs the following for Palo Alto:

- Manages traffic operations, including engineering for traffic signals, roadway striping and signage; roadway capacity analysis; truck routing; vehicle speed surveys; and roadway safety engineering
- Manages public parking program supply, including authorizing issuance of permits for use of public parking lots and structures, parking usage surveys, valet parking, special event parking and review of parking lot and structure design
- Responds to citizen complaints about traffic including reviewing requests for stop signs, traffic signals, red curb (prohibited parking) zones, crosswalks, etc.
- Implements traffic calming throughout the city through a neighborhood petition program, including liaison with residents' working groups, traffic analysis, and preparation of plans and specifications.
- Completes area-wide travel management studies and projects
- Manages transportation data collection effort, including motor vehicle volumes and speeds, intersection levels-of-service, Shuttle bus ridership, and cycling volumes

- Reviews land development/redevelopment and proposals and develops supply mitigations (turn-pockets, signals, etc.) and demand mitigations (transit programs, carpool, etc.); establishes traffic impact fees required; reviews and comments on transportation section of land development/redevelopment environmental impact reports; recommends transportation significance thresholds under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)
- Reviews and helps develop travel demand management (TDM) programs for area employers
- Reviews and approves traffic control plans for work on street rights of way
- Issues oversize vehicle permits for time and route limited travel
- Administers alternative commute incentive program for city employees and manages City-owned bicycle lockers
- Manages city interest in privately operated, city subsidized downtown bicycle station (valet parking)
- Manages a shuttle bus system. Operations are contracted out, but the transportation division does planning, marketing, and fields customer complaints
- Planning for bicycles and pedestrians
- Manages traffic safety education programs
- Manages school commute safety efforts, including liaison with City-School traffic safety committee, both school site and school commute corridor traffic safety studies, and bicycle/pedestrian safety training for children
- Promotes transportation alternatives through the “Way 2 Go” program
- Serves on numerous city and regional transportation and infrastructure planning committees
- Occasionally oversees design and construction of infrastructure projects
- Multi-modal transportation planning

While Palo Alto contracts out its small local transit service, the Transportation Division is responsible for its oversight. An example of a recent Transportation

Division project is managing the study and implementation of changes to the entire traffic signal system. The table below summarizes the staffing level at the Transportation Division.

**Table 2: Palo Alto Transportation Staffing by Responsibility**

Responsibility	FTE Staffing
Director – Oversight and Management	1
Traffic Engineering and Parking Program	2
Traffic Calming and Development Review	2
Travel Demand Management (TDM) Program and Traffic Safety Education	1
Public Transit and Bicycle Planning	1
General Administration (clerical and customer service)	1
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>	<b>8</b>

The Public Works Department is responsible for maintenance and rehabilitation of streets. At times, the Transportation Division shares responsibility with Public Works managing infrastructure projects, aiding in design and overseeing contracting. Parking enforcement is handled by the city’s Police Department.

## **Berkeley**

---

The City of Berkeley is home to the University of California at Berkeley, which is the dominant force in its economy. Berkeley and its university are far more tightly interdependent than Palo Alto and Stanford. Berkeley is also a popular place to live for workers both in San Francisco and throughout the region.

In January 2002, the city created the **Office of Transportation**, consolidating a number of transportation planning and management activities. Within the City of Berkeley’s management structure, the Office of Transportation is department-level, reporting directly to the city manager. (The Director of the office is an Assistant City Manager position.) The Office of Transportation has responsibilities similar to those of Palo Alto’s Transportation Division. The department oversees citywide transportation planning, traffic engineering, and alternative transportation programs. In the near future, the Office of Transportation will assume responsibility for managing parking, including off-

street parking (garages and surface), the residential parking permit program, and parking policy. Related changes in staffing are not yet determined. Current staffing levels by responsibility are shown below.

**Table 3: Berkeley Staffing with Responsibility (Equivalents to Palo Alto Transportation Division):**

Responsibility	Department / Division	FTE Staffing
Oversight and Management	Office of Transportation	1
Senior Planning	Office of Transportation	1
Bicycle and Pedestrian Planning	Office of Transportation	1
Public Transportation	Office of Transportation	1
Planning Assistance	Office of Transportation	.5*
Transportation Demand Management	Office of Transportation	1
Traffic Engineering and Operations	Office of Transportation	4
General Administration	Office of Transportation	1
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>		<b>10.5</b>

\* Two interns considered .5 FTE in this case.

The Office of Transportation has a limited oversight role in the mitigations related to development/redevelopment, which is mostly handled by the Current Planning division of Planning and Development Department. The Advance Planning division manages plan development with some input from the Office of Transportation.

Transit related activities at the Office of Transportation are limited to working with AC Transit to provide planning support on the bus shelter program and Bus Rapid Transit initiatives. The City of Berkeley does not operate transit services other than some limited paratransit services provided by the Department of Health and Human Services.

Consultants are used mostly for the purpose of obtaining special expertise, however consultants are also used to provide additional capacity for activities that could be accomplished by staff. Examples of consultant use are implementing bike boulevard signage and stenciling, administering a commuter check program, and on-call traffic counting services.

Compared to Palo Alto's Transportation Division, Berkeley's Office of Transportation has a higher level of staffing with equivalent to slightly lower

levels of responsibility (limited data collection responsibility, smaller role in transit and currently less responsibility in parking management.)

## **Boulder**

---

The City of Boulder is located approximately 40 miles northwest of Denver. The metropolitan region has a population of approximately 2.3 million. The rapidly growing city of 100,000 is home to the University of Colorado and a host of national scientific centers. Boulder is the hub for research and development in a number of advanced technology disciplines.

The **Transportation Division** at the City of Boulder is one of three divisions within the Public Works Department. The other two are the Utilities Division and Planning and Development Services. The Transportation Division has 67 FTEs divided into three primary areas of responsibility: engineering/capital projects, maintenance, and transportation planning/operations. There are 25 FTEs devoted to transportation planning and operations. Eleven of these staff members are dedicated to transportation planning activities under the banner of GO Boulder. GO Boulder consists of staff dedicated to providing alternatives to the private automobile, “Great Options” in transportation. The transportation planning and operations group is responsible for traffic signal operations and other traffic engineering. Two engineers and two field technicians manage this section.

This staffing level for transportation far exceeds Palo Alto and reflects Boulder’s dedication for providing quality alternatives to the automobile. The remaining staff of the transportation planning and operations group is dedicated to traffic engineering, traffic signals, signs and markings, etc.

Augmenting the work of GO Boulder is a current planner in the Planning and Development Services Division of Public Works whose responsibility is to coordinate transportation requirements in conjunction with development review.

The City of Boulder also has two General Improvement Districts which are administrative units organized under the city manager. Currently, two staff

members are devoted to transportation issues at the GIDs doing outreach and coordination, distributing transportation related materials, and administering the city’s Eco-Pass program. The GIDs are also responsible for parking structure management, parking enforcement, and the Neighborhood Parking Permit program.

The table below summarizes the staffing by department of activities that are the general responsibility of Palo Alto’s Transportation Division.

**Table 4: Boulder Staffing with Responsibility (Equivalents to Palo Alto Transportation Division):**

Responsibility	Department / Division	FTE Staffing
Oversight and Management	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Senior Planning	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	3
Transit Planner / Transit Village Planning	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Pedestrian and Bicycle Projects	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Transportation Demand Management	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Long Range Planning	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Corridor Planning / Public Process Support	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Transit Coordination with RTD	Transportation Division / GO Boulder	1
Traffic Engineering and Operations	Transportation Division	4
Development Review / Mitigations	Planning and Development Services	1
Promotion of Alternatives / Eco-Pass	General Improvement District	1
Public Parking Management; Parking Permits	General Improvement District	1
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>		<b>17</b>

The Denver Regional Transit District provides transit services, although Boulder has had a large role in planning and implementing local fixed route services.

Consultants are used by the city to facilitate specific projects and plans. While Boulder is a larger city than Palo Alto with a larger university, its staffing levels and therefore depth of programs well exceeds those of Palo Alto. Boulder has

made a strong commitment to alternative transportation as evidenced by its staffing of the GO Boulder program.

## **Cambridge**

---

Cambridge is set in the Boston metropolitan region. It is a city of over 100,000 people and is famous as being the home of Harvard University and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. One-fourth of its residents are college students and one-sixth of its jobs are in higher education. Outside of education, the Cambridge economy has evolved from a manufacturing center to a desired location for firms in biotechnology, computer software and other emerging technology.

Transportation in Cambridge is managed and planned in two primary areas:

- The **Environmental and Transportation Planning Division** of the Community Development Department
- The **Traffic, Parking and Transportation Department** organized under Public Safety

The **Environmental and Transportation Planning Division** of the Community Development Department is responsible for improving the city's quality of life, by working to protect and improve the city's environment and natural resources and by planning improvements to the city's transportation system. The division primary activities are:

- Managing the design of the transportation system to improve travel for all transportation modes, particularly high occupancy and non-motorized modes;
- Promoting walking, bicycling, ridesharing, and public transit;
- Implementing the city's Vehicle Trip Reduction Ordinance and Parking and Transportation Demand Management Ordinance to reduce congestion and improve air quality;

- Planning transportation infrastructure projects including traffic calming projects;
- Reviewing development proposals to ensure that natural resources are protected and that mitigation strategies are implemented;
- Promoting energy efficiency, reduced use of toxic products, and other environmentally sound practices;
- Preventing childhood lead poisoning; and
- Answering general questions about environmental issues.

The division does not operate transit services but is a funding conduit for a shuttle operated by the local Transportation Management Agency. The division assists in the planning of the service. The division does not have its own administrator; it relies on the wider Community Development Department.

Cambridge's **Traffic, Parking and Transportation Department** is responsible for managing public right-of-ways for vehicular and non-vehicular use; for allocating curb space through regulation, curb uses and for enforcing and adjudicating the regulations. More specifically, the department has the following responsibilities:

**Traffic Engineering**

- Signals
- Curb regulations
- Permits to close/ occupy a street
- Signs and pavement markings
- Development reviews
- Traffic studies
- Curb cuts and access/egress
- Safety

**Parking**

- Meters
- Resident permit parking
- Ticketing and vehicle impoundment
- Parking ticket processing and adjudication
- Facilities (Garages and Lots)

The Traffic, Parking and Transportation Department is separate from the Department of Public Works, which is responsible for roadway and sidewalk construction and maintenance throughout the city. In the table below, responsibilities of the Environmental and Transportation Planning Division and the Traffic, Parking and Transportation Department comparable to those of Palo Alto’s Transportation Division are listed with staffing commitment levels to these activities.

**Table 5: Cambridge Staffing with Responsibility (Equivalents to Palo Alto Transportation Division):**

Responsibility	Department / Division	FTE Staffing
Oversight and Management	Environmental and Transportation Planning	1
Transportation Demand Management	Environmental and Transportation Planning	2
Pedestrian and Bicycle Projects	Environmental and Transportation Planning	1.5
Traffic Calming	Environmental and Transportation Planning	1
Infrastructure Projects	Environmental and Transportation Planning	2
Environmental Programs*	Environmental and Transportation Planning	1.5
Traffic Engineering	Traffic, Parking and Transportation	1
Traffic Signal Issues	Traffic, Parking and Transportation	1
Off-Street Parking Registration	Traffic, Parking and Transportation	1
Support and Administration	Traffic, Parking and Transportation	.5**
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>		<b>12.5</b>

\* Environmental programs includes introducing alternative fuel vehicles

\*\* Partial assignment of Director of Traffic, Parking and Transportation who oversees other activities as well as those listed above.

On the planning side, Cambridge’s 9 FTEs far exceeds the staffing level in planning at Palo Alto’s Transportation Division. The extent of Cambridge’s commitment to transportation alternatives is similar to what Palo Alto wishes to accomplish as set forth in the Comprehensive Plan and Transportation Implementation Plan.

## Davis

---

Davis, a city of nearly 61,000, has a less urban character than Palo Alto, as does the Sacramento region in which it sits. The rural Central Valley and the University of California Davis are the main defining characteristics of the city. Davis has been rapidly growing due to easily developable land; however, it is nearing build-out. Despite its size and relatively low density, the city has very high rates of alternative mode usage and is considered one of the best places for everyday cycling in the country.

The **Public Works Department** maintains the city's streets and bikeways and is responsible for traffic engineering. It is the primary transportation planning entity in the city. Staff includes a full-time bicycle/pedestrian coordinator. The city engineer estimates that one-half of an FTE is dedicated to traditional transportation planning activities. The traffic engineers (2.5 FTE) handle issues such as traffic calming.

The **Planning and Building Department** coordinates the general plan and area plans which serve as the main transportation planning tools. It guides transportation decisions regarding street classifications, bike lanes and ways and key projects for incorporation into capital improvement projects. There is no single staff member devoted solely to transportation planning. The senior planner estimates that transportation planning activities aggregate to less than one full-time equivalent employee.

Consultant use is limited to traffic impact analysis, traffic engineering, pedestrian and bicycle system impact analysis related to development projects.

The Davis **Parks & Community Services Department** is responsible for a number of transportation planning activities. Its **Social Services Division** is responsible for Davis Community Transit, which provides door-to-door demand response service to the general public, seniors and the disabled. Two administrators manage this service. The **Neighborhood & Community Services Division** provides education on environmental planning policies such as electric vehicles and trip reduction.

The city does not run transit services in Davis other than the demand response system. UC Davis operates Unitrans, connecting the University with various points in the city. Yolobus provides route service and special charters between Davis, Woodland, West Sacramento and Sacramento.

Parking enforcement is handled by the city's Police Department. The police department also handles applications for residential and employer parking permits.

**Table 6: Davis Staffing with Responsibility (Equivalents to Palo Alto Transportation Division):**

Responsibility	Department / Division	FTE Staffing
Traffic Engineering and Traffic Calming	Public Works Department	2.5
Transportation Planning	Public Works Department	.5
Transportation Development Mitigations	Planning and Building Dept.	~1
Oversight of Transit Services	Social Services Division	2
Promotion of Alternatives	Neighborhood & Community Services	1
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>		<b>7</b>

While Davis is successful at encouraging bicycling and incorporating bicycles into its infrastructure, the city has less extensive programs than Palo Alto and the other peer cities. This is partially a result of its size and a less urban character. However, it is also do the fact that UC Davis has such an extensive role in transportation planning even beyond the campus. The University’s **Transportation and Parking Services Department** has a broad set of multi-modal programs. This includes an FTE for an Alternative Transportation Coordinator, and three FTEs for the University’s Bicycle Program.

**Santa Monica**

---

Santa Monica is situated at the Western edge of Los Angeles County at the Pacific Ocean. The city attracts both tourists and regional shoppers. Santa Monica is also the home of many businesses specializing in information technology, film and television production, e-commerce, and other hi-tech businesses. It is less associated with its neighbor university, UCLA, than the other cities in this review, however, the relationship is important nonetheless.

Santa Monica’s transportation planning and traffic engineering activities take place in the **Transportation Management Division** of the Planning & Community Development Department. There are a number of groups within the division with distinct responsibilities. These include the Transportation Planning Office, the Transportation Management Office, the Traffic Operations Office, and the Parking Office.

The Transportation Planning Office, consisting of a senior planner and three transportation planning associates, is responsible for:

- Project management for many capital improvement projects that provide pedestrian amenities and infrastructure
- Fielding pedestrian comments and complaints
- Working with the Planning Division to review transportation elements for Environmental Impact Reports
- Consulting on building permit application with respect to physical transportation requirements (e.g. circulation, access, parking)
- Managing the process of adding new residential permit parking areas
- Consulting with city staff at the Big Blue Bus (Santa Monica's transit system) on planning issues particularly those related to street operations, stop locations and bus shelters.

The Transportation Management Office, known as the TMO, is responsible for the implementation and administration of Santa Monica's unique city TDM ordinance. The ordinance requires employers to undertake TDM measures such as parking cash out and implement trip management plans. The TMO enforces the ordinance by reviewing employer plans and reports and performing audits. In bi-monthly meetings with employers, staff members promote transportation alternatives and programs, and answer questions. The office is also involved in planning for bicycles and pedestrians. Three FTEs staff the TMO. One staff member is focused on encouraging alternatives among city employees.

Traffic engineering responsibilities are not handled out of a particular office within the Transportation Management Division. These responsibilities are handled by two transportation engineers, a special projects engineer and a transportation planning technician.

The Traffic Operations Office, consisting of nine FTEs, is responsible for the physical operations of traffic infrastructure including traffic signals and parking meters. In Palo Alto, the Transportation Division provides only oversight of this

activity; therefore, we have included only one FTE from this office in the comparison between offices.

The Parking Office is funded for four FTEs. The office manages and oversees the private operating contracts for the city’s six downtown parking structures, surface lots and beach parking. The office also manages capital improvements to city parking facilities. This staffing is not included in the comparison with Palo Alto’s Transportation Division.

The entire Transportation Management Division is led by a manager with the support of an administrative analyst and two administrative assistants. The assistants are responsible for the issuance of residential parking permits. Only the division manager is included in the comparison between offices because of the number of responsibilities of the division outside of the scope of Palo Alto’s Transportation Division.

The table below summarizes the staffing of Santa Monica’s Transportation Management Division in roles comparable to the responsibilities to Palo Alto’s Transportation Division.

**Table 7: Santa Monica Staffing with Responsibility (Equivalents to Palo Alto Transportation Division):**

Responsibility	Department / Division	FTE Staffing
Oversight and Management	Transportation Management Division (TMD)	1
Transportation Planning	Transportation Planning Office of TMD	4
Traffic Engineering	Transportation Management Division	4
Traffic Operations	Traffic Operations Office	1
Transportation Demand Management	Transportation Management Office of TMD	3
<b>Transit Management*</b>	<b>Big Blue Bus</b>	<b>[.25]</b>
<b>Total Department Staffing</b>		<b>13.25</b>

\*Santa Monica’s Big Blue Bus has a larger management staff (approximately 17 FTE) however we are only including the equivalent to Palo Alto staffing. This is to aid in the comparison and adjust for the large locally run transit system in Santa Monica versus the more modest system in Palo Alto.

A separate city division is responsible for managing The Big Blue Bus, a moderately sized and well-regarded transit system operated by the city. While Palo Alto’s Transportation Division does oversee its contracted shuttle transit

system, we have only included the staffing at the Big Blue Bus equivalent to Palo Alto's transit service staffing in the comparison because of the extent of the service and to remain conservative.

The city uses consultants on a project-by-project basis, primarily for transportation engineering.

In comparing Santa Monica with Palo Alto's Transportation Division, Santa Monica's programs are more extensive in some areas, like TDM, but are less extensive in others like bicycle planning and traffic calming. Santa Monica's programs are being accomplished with a much higher staffing level than Palo Alto's Transportation Division.